## Propositions attached to the thesis

## A political ecology of neoliberal multiculturalism Social inclusion and market-based conservation in indigenous Costa Rica

## Alonso Ramírez Cover

## International Institute of Social Studies Erasmus University Rotterdam

- 1. Market-based conservation instruments implemented in the Talamanca-Bribri and Talamanca-Cabécar Indigenous Reserves show that there is a great deal of effort being made by Costa Rican state conservation agencies and international NGOs to promote inclusivity of local indigenous peoples, ideas, practices, values and culture in environmental conservation (this thesis).
- 2. Despite these efforts, it is also clear that market-based conservation instruments in Costa Rica are mostly defined by project planning imperatives centered on disciplining resource uses through neoliberal mindsets of individualistic rationality, marginal optimization and environmental efficiency (this thesis).
- 3. Market-based conservation in the Talamanca-Bribri and Talamanca-Cabécar Indigenous Reserves has overwhelmingly recognized the importance of indigenous cultural practices and ideas in environmental conservation, but it has also entailed the disciplining of particular forms of indigenous culture to livelihoods considered more compatible to the economic and political practices and ideas of the green economy (this thesis).
- 4. Missing from market-based conservation practices is a true acknowledgement of Bribri and Cabécar demands for territorial autonomy. This reflects the essence of neoliberal multiculturalism, as conservation promotes new forms of governance that seek to recognize indigenous rights, but only those deemed compatible to wider ideas, interests and logics of neoliberal capitalism (this thesis).
- 5. Viewed in a historical perspective, the cases of the Talamanca-Bribri and Talamanca-Cabécar Indigenous Reserves show, the gap between recognition and implementation of indigenous rights in Costa Rica is being acknowledged, but not reduced through neoliberal conservation (*this thesis*).
- 6. Neoliberalism should be understood with a small "n" as a multiple set of interconnected, yet variegated historical processes happening in a manner contingent to other dynamics.
- 7. Under neoliberalism-with-a-small-n, claims about social inclusivity of neoliberal conservation must not be rejected easily as rhetorical strategies of little analytical importance, yet some nuance is required regarding what is included and excluded and how this process takes place.
- 8. Neoliberal multiculturalism does not concentrate that much in how state power is weakened by market reform, instead, it looks at how state regulation becomes more pervasive by consolidating new forms of disciplining through the inclusion and exclusion of identities and culture.
- New forms of neoliberal conservation have been drawn along market-based lines of efficiency, optimization and commodification despite being driven by the very same contradictions that spur their appearance.
- 10. While it is well known that modern conservation has been related to capitalism, the rise in dominance of neoliberalism has provoked a substantive increase in capitalist impingement on conservation projects.
- 11. Now that Costa Rica will go to the World Cup in Russia, it is expected that they will improve on their performance in 2014.