

INSTITUTE OF SOCIAL STUDIES

Working Paper Series No. 188

HOLDING MIRRORS OUT OF WINDOWS: A LABOUR BULLETIN, A FEMINIST AGENDA, AND THE CREATION OF A GLOBAL SOLIDARITY CULTURE IN THE NEW SOUTH AFRICA

Peter Waterman

March 1995

WORKING PAPERS

Comments are welcome and should be addressed to the author:
c/o Publications Office - Institute of Social Studies - P.O. Box 29776
2502LT The Hague - The Netherlands

HOLDING MIRRORS OUT OF WINDOWS:

A Labour Bulletin, a Feminist Agenda, and the

Creation of a Global Solidarity Culture in the New South Africa

Peter Waterman

Abstract: The new South Africa is attempting to create a sense of national identity at the very moment when cultural globalisation is questioning not only traditional identities and values but also those of the modern nation-state. Yet the major forces (labour, nationalist, women, democratic, church, liberal) for the creation of the new South Africa have for decades been engaged with the ideas and practices of international solidarity. Two of the more-intellectual radical journals in South Africa - one labour/socialist, one women's/feminist - have demonstrated their particular understandings of the international during the apartheid and transition period. These are examined in terms of 'approach' and 'style'. They reveal two advanced but also problematic models. Effective contribution to a global solidarity culture will require explicit theoretical reflection on both globalisation and communication. It will also require going beyond the two journals and their respective, separate, movements or constituencies.

The author: Peter Waterman teaches on (inter)national social movements and alternative communications, at the Institute of Social Studies in The Hague. Since 1984 he has been researching alternative international relations and communications, with special reference to labour. He edited the Newsletter of International Labour Studies (1978-90) and has published numerous academic and journalistic items in Europe, North America, Africa, Asia and Latin America. His academic papers have mostly appeared first as Institute of Social Studies Working Papers. This paper is a contribution to a project provisionally entitled 'Globalisation, Communication, Solidarity'.

Peter Waterman
Institute of Social Studies
POB 29776
2502LT The Hague
The Netherlands

Tel: +31-70-426-0579 (Work)
+31-70-363-1539 (Home)
Fax: +31-70-426-0799
Email: 100020.3354@compuserve.com

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A six-month stay in a new country inevitably implies debts to numerous guides, assistants, hosts and interpreters. So does three months research with limited resources. I will not list here again the many colleagues cited in my paper, hoping that my respect will have been sufficiently indicated. But I do want to specifically thank numerous people, most of them not otherwise mentioned. Firstly Len Suransky (plus Caroline and kids), whose idea it was to trade places. Then my colleagues at the Institute of Social Studies, who released, encouraged and assisted me with a novel form of academic exchange. My new colleagues, in the Politics Department at the 'Historically Black' University of Durban Westville, provided a welcoming, congenial, stimulating and supportive environment. My Honours' students at UDW reminded me that teaching is still worthwhile, and gave me hope for the future of their city, province and country. Felix Makhatini and Nester Luthuli provided me with an understanding of township life and struggle that I would otherwise have been deprived of - and revealed the human, intellectual and political resources that exist in this trying environment. So did Thamae and Willie, of the Transport and General Workers Union, for the Durban dockworkers. Amongst generous and stimulating hosts and guides were compañeros/as, old and new: Eddie Webster and Luli Calinicos, Keyan Tomaselli and Ruth Teer-Tomaselli, Belinda Yiangou, Jeremy Daphne, Ari Sitas, Michelle Williams and Nazima Mohamed. The editorial and technical staff of the Independent Magazines Group/Umanyano Publications, particularly Deanne Collins, showed interest and offered support at a time of crisis. Colleagues within the Sociology Department at the University of Witwatersrand revealed more interest in my work than I have met elsewhere. It is customary to end such expressions of appreciation with a denial of anybody else's responsibility for anything that follows. My inclination here is to blame all the shortcomings of my paper on those amongst the above - and there were many - who failed to respond to drafts I circulated, desperately begging for commentary and correction. However, I finished the bulk of this paper on Christmas Day, which in the New South Africa is now followed by the Day of Reconciliation. Moreover, Debbie Budlender, in Cape Town, both promised to comment and did so, pertinently and at length. As did former Shopsteward editor, Fiona Dove, when I tracked her down to my classroom in The Hague. So, I am going to let the others off - this time! Final thanks are due to the anonymous evaluator of the draft ISS Working Paper, whose speed of operation and brevity of approval was accompanied by such extensive, merciless - and regrettably convincing - criticism that I felt obliged to revise extensively. I would have liked to have thanked this person in the normal way rather than impersonally, in the form of a paper I hope will be found recognisably improved.

CONTENTS

1. Introduction: purposes, arguments, procedures	1
1.1. Purposes: making sense of international sense-making	1
1.2. Arguments: general and particular	2
1.3. Conceptualisation: 'approach' and 'style'	7
2. Background: the alternative media in South Africa	11
2.1. Bases for a global solidarity culture project	11
2.2. Periodicals: chronicle of a death foretold	11
2.3. In the streets and on the air	14
2.4. International labour culture and communication projects	15
2.5. Ironies of history	19
3. Analysis: The <u>South African Labour Bulletin</u>	20
3.1. Background	20
3.2. Foreign/international coverage	22
4. Analysis: <u>Agenda</u>	31
4.1. Background	31
4.2. Foreign/international coverage	34
5. Conclusion: toward a global solidarity culture	46
Endnotes	48
Classified bibliography	56
General bibliography	57
Table 1. Publication characteristics of alternative periodicals	13
Table 2a, b. Foreign and international coverage in the <u>Labour Bulletin</u>	23
Table 3. Foreign and international coverage in <u>Agenda</u>	35
Box 1. Contents of the 'most-international' issues of <u>Agenda</u>	37-8
Figure 1. A page of the <u>South African Labour Bulletin</u>	21
Figure 2. A cover of <u>Agenda</u>	32

MOTHO KE MOTHO KA BATHO BABANG

(A person is a person because of other people)

By holding my mirror out of the window I see

Clear to the end of the passage.

There's a person down there.

A prisoner polishing a doorhandle.

In the mirror I see him see

My face in the mirror,

I see the fingertips of his free hand

Bunch together, as if to make

An object the size of a badge

Which travels up to his forehead

The place of an imaginary cap.

(This means: A warder).

Two fingers are extended in a vee

And wiggle like two antennae.

(He's being watched.)

A finger of his free hand makes a watch-hand's arc

On the wrist of his polishing arm without

Disrupting the slow-slow rhythm of his work.

(Later. Maybe, later we can speak.)

Hey! Wat maak jy daar?

- a voice from around the corner.

No. Just polishing baas.

He turns his back to me, now watch

His free hand, the talkative one,

Slips quietly behind

- Strength, brother, it says,

In my mirror,

A black fist.

Jeremy Cronin¹

1. INTRODUCTION: PURPOSES, ARGUMENTS, PROCEDURES

1.1. Purposes: making sense of international sense-making

Jeremy Cronin's poem speaks powerfully to me, and in more than one place. If 'a person is a person because of other people', then one becomes more human by relating to more of them. An act of solidarity communication requires motivation and activity by both parties. The language of power may be comprehensible to subalterns but intended to prevent communication between them. The act of solidarity communication may require translation or interpretation, the effort made being itself a gesture of recognition (the three in the poem are Sotho, English and Afrikaans). Such communication does not necessarily require words, though it assumes language and requires this for precision and enrichment. Not all prisons have 'Robben Island' written above the gate. One which does not is the modern, liberal-democratic, nation-state.

A democratic and pluralistic sense of global community is necessary today for two interconnected reasons. Firstly as a counterweight to the prioritisation of the 'state-nation', or of ethnicity, race, locality or religion. Secondly in order to stimulate a humane, cooperative, peaceful and sustainable alternative to an increasingly globalised culture of commodity-fetishism, armed force, ecological despoliation and mutually-damaging worker competition. In so far as the world is increasingly dominated by a globalised information capitalism, such an alternative project needs to be thought out in terms of information and culture.

The new South Africa is engaged in creating a thoroughly modern sense of national identity (liberal-democratic? neo-liberal? social-democratic? radical-nationalist? an amalgam?) at the very moment when cultural globalisation is simultaneously threatening not only 'traditional' identities but also such modern ones. In the South African case, as in others, this is already leading to a) an open door to global market culture, b) cultural counter-assertions of nationalistic, ethnic or religious kinds. Both of these are likely to find increasingly energetic expression. However, some of the major forces struggling against apartheid and for the creation of the new South Africa have been deeply engaged for many decades with ideas and practices of international solidarity. South Africa thus presents us, in particularly dramatic form, with the possibilities/problems of creating a culture of global solidarity relevant to the period of a globalised information capitalism.

The 'alternative' media in South Africa demonstrated their understanding of internationalism during the apartheid and transition period. New understandings and practices would seem to be both possible and necessary under the current national and international dispensations. It would seem, in any case, important that this area be identified, its problems recognised and discussed. Given their particular past experiences and present resources, the new social movements and alternative media in South Africa could, hypothetically, make a significant contribution to a project that needs to be not only internationalist in orientation but global in extent.

Bearing in mind what I have read out of the Cronin poem above, why do I address myself specifically to the more wordy and intellectual of the alternative media in South Africa? Well, I have already suggested that we need words for the specification and

enrichment of images or feelings. But in the case of 'internationalism' we need more than words, we need new words. Indeed, what is needed in the age of globalisation is, in the literal meaning of the phrase, a new worldview. Intellectuals, whether of academia, the churches, political parties, unions, social movements, think-tanks or non-governmental organisations (NGOs), are the producers of such today. Moreover, intellectuals have been the primary bearers of internationalism, including 'proletarian internationalism'. So it makes some kind of sense to see what kind of sense South Africa's left intellectuals are making of the international.²

1.2. Arguments: general and particular

1.2.1. General

Let me begin with the general argument for the project of which this paper is intended to form a part:

The contemporary world can be increasingly understood as a complex, globalised, high-risk information capitalism. Global conflicts around communications and culture increasingly take centre stage, although without the disappearance of those around property, territory and military power (Waterman Forthcoming).

There have been many different local responses to globalisation. One increasingly international one has been the development of pluralistic global solidarity movements, NGOs and networks. These are in increasing dialogue and alliance, North and South, East and West. Given the above-specified nature of the contemporary world, the internationalism of such bodies can be increasingly characterised as a 'communication internationalism'. Borrowing from an argument of Alberto Melucci (Keane and Mier 1989) on the new social movements, it could be said that they attempt to reveal what is globally concealed, and propose alternative meanings (e.g. pacifist, feminist, ecological, democratic, ecumenical/ethical, socialist) for what is globally revealed. Operating on the terrain of information, ideas, values and images, they also give global solidarity a much richer and more complex meaning.

The old internationalisms (labour, pacifist, feminist, democratic) had no communications theory, considering their own - often energetic, imaginative and innovative - communications practices largely a means to an organisational or institutional end. In the extreme case, with the Communist International, a process of reduction and substitution took place, with an attempt to impose a state-socialist identity on the peoples within the Soviet Union, the international labour movement and the world more generally.

Whatever the emancipatory, humanist, egalitarian, democratic or pacifist intentions of the old internationalisms, they tended to be broken or bent by the dramatic growth of the state-nation and by nationally-based and nationally-dependent capitalisms. Labour, which had initially understood the 'social question' as global in nature, came to accept its solution within the state-nation. Labour internationalism increasingly became a 'nationalist internationalism' (winning nations for those without them; achieving rights within them for workers without such). Workers, from being the most internationalist of social subjects, may today - in many countries - be amongst the most chauvinist.

Defence of labour and other popular and democratic interests and identities today increasingly requires - as in the North American Free Trade Area (Brecher and Costello 1994:95-102) - a democratic and popular sense of at least regional community. Typically, even the defense of the most local of identities - that of indigenous minorities - is today dependent on global awareness and activity (Wilmer 1993). A new democratic and pluralistic understanding of global communications and culture needs to be proposed, including its implications for the communications and cultural policies of new social movements and civil society more generally.

Contrary to the 19th century labour or socialist case, and to contemporary fundamentalist reproductions/reductions of such (whether religious or lay), the communications practice of any new democratic social movement will need to be self-understood as but one contribution to a more general global culture of solidarity. Contrary to earlier internationalist projects, any new one will also have to surpass the 'particularistic universalism' of its customarily Eurocentric forebears.

Such an 'alternative global communication and cultural project', would also have to be more than the self-determined and self-controlled activities of the new social subjects and related movements. It would have to be understood as carried, in part, by the dominant national, foreign or global media, commercial or state (Schechter 1994, Toward Freedom 1994).

In so far, again, as one recognises the ambiguities of the increasingly globalised dominant media, one can also recognise the ambiguities of the alternative ones. This implies the need for international(ist) networks of policy-oriented intellectuals and professionals to be theoretically critical and politically active in both spaces.

1.2.2. Particular

With respect to the present study I would like to specify certain other crucial terms, phrases or understandings:

Cultural globalisation: My use of this term encompasses an understanding of 'media imperialism' but surpasses it in so far as it recognises 1) the contradictory content of even transnational company (TNC) or Western state media; 2) the increasing global impact of such media from the South; 3) the increasing global distribution of cross-cultural products; 3) that projects for global cultural domination are not the same as successes (they can provoke opposition, alternative interpretation and differently-inflected adaptation); 4) the increasing international reach of, and access to, alternative culture.

Local response: I assume, for heuristic purposes, three broad types of response (in South Africa as elsewhere) to the increasing impact of the dominant global media: 1) a general welcome or acceptance of it on grounds of its own self-justifications (that it is modern, free, pluralistic, varied, advanced, 'what people want'); 2) a general rejection, on authoritarian/fundamentalist grounds (religious or lay, national or ethnic, right or left) as foreign, corrupt, destructive of the traditional, communal, ethical, local or popular; 3) critical engagement, based on both popular and alternative cultural values and resources.

Combinations of such positions are evidently possible (e.g. Campaign for Post-Apartheid TV 1993(?)).

Alternative media/culture/communication: Stangelaar (1986) sees the major source for alternative communication (AC) in the practical resistance to international capitalism, this implying struggle also against racism, sexism, the state and war (c.f. Lewis 1993). The four fundamental and interdependent characteristics of AC are: 1) a content, language, imagery and symbolism that comes direct from the people and confronts those of the oppressor; 2) an orientation toward a total social transformation; 3) a mobilising and organising role, surpassing both vertical and horizontal information flows with a 'spiral' communication model; 4) an active role in production and distribution by the relevant sector of the people and/or popular organisations. Such an active participation implies, amongst other things, a) interaction between sender and receiver; b) messages that further interaction of both the population and the professional communicators; c) accessibility of both form and content to the masses, at a minimal educational level, education being part of the communication; d) public access to both production and distribution channels; e) participation in the communication education structures; f) organisation of a public capable of criticising and eventually correcting the media.

I would like to qualify the above statement in two inter-related particulars. The first refers to point 1), which seems to me open to both populism and vanguardism (a common, and dangerous, left syndrome). The second has to do with the agents of alternative communication and the class, cultural or communicative positions or spaces they occupy. I would like to suggest that alternative communication and culture are the project, or projects, of democratically-minded, theoretically-critical and socially-committed intellectuals (academics, professionals, artists, organisers), oriented towards the new social movements and civil society, both nationally and globally. 'Alternative' is thus placed, in both class and cultural terms, in tension with the 'dominant' and the 'popular'. The three could be thought of as overlapping, interpenetrating and mutually-determining cultural spheres, physical spaces/geographical places, or even particular cultural products. This specification is intended to distinguish the actors in AC from traditional notions of the artistic 'avantguard' (related to dominant culture) or the ideological 'vanguard' (related to working-class, popular or national culture). It allows for, and even requires, alternative media or cultural actors to operate in relation to, and within, both other spheres as well as their own. It recognises alternative cultural projects, spaces and places as marginal in power terms but maximal in terms of cultural freedom and innovation. It allows alternative artists/communicators to play a hypothetical vanguard role without them being defined or self-defined in vanguardist/substitutionist terms.

A further specification is necessary here in relation to the international or global. It is easy to recognise a 'dominant global culture', and easy to name (though more difficult to have recognised) contributions to an 'alternative global culture'. But 'the popular' has, throughout its chequered history always been considered in relation to the local, or, at its widest the national, as in Gramsci's 'national-popular' (Gramsci 1983).³ In other words, 'the popular' exists only where the relevant masses or classes intensively live and share at least a language (which could include non-verbal sound and images). This specification evidently excludes the international conference hall, the TNC film studio - and the alternative international computer communication project. So, at the global level we would seem to

have only two hypothetical cultural projects or spaces, the dominant and the alternative. The popular, at global level, exists, or is carried, within one or both of these, which could be also considered as competing for hegemony over the popular.

1.2.3. Global solidarity culture

It may, finally, be useful to propose an initial understanding of 'a global solidarity culture' (GSC). I would like to think that this relates positively to two democratic communication projects, one national the other global. The first is the notion of a democratic 'public sphere' or 'public space' in South Africa (Gillwald 1993, Muller and Cloete 1993). The second is the new international People's Communication Charter (Hamelink 1994). The argument below is intended to bridge the national and the international, and also to suggest a more activist and transformatory orientation in both spheres.

1. It is necessary to specifically and actively promote a GSC if we wish to resist cultural globalisation and to construct peaceful, solidary, egalitarian, sustainable, democratic and pluralistic cultures - local, national or global. Such a concept must be explicitly value-loaded, future-oriented and prescriptive in nature if it is to allow for criticism of existing conditions and facilitate transformation. Such a concept must be developed and re-developed on the basis of analyses of the current contradictions of globalised communication and culture, from experiments at surpassing these, and from identification of popular dissatisfactions and aspirations in the face of the dominant world culture.

2. As a preliminary definition we might consider the following. A GSC implies the creation of transterritorial relations which enrich and empower popular and democratic communities or collectivities by exchanging, sharing, diversifying and synthesising their ideas, skills and arts. The strength of the dominant pattern of international relations and communications lies in finance, machinery, institutions, arms, territory, and their tendency to stratify, segment, oppose, oppress and destroy. Information is here a resource to be hoarded, sold, controlled and used to reinforce the concentration of wealth and influence. The strength of a GSC is asymmetrical. It lies precisely in the use and furthering of international communication and culture as a cooperative, constructive and creative relationship between people. Unlike a globalised culture, a GSC is not something coming from one or two countries or a handful of companies, nor is it one which homogenises. It is, on the contrary, something that provides both space for and stimuli to the local and particular, valuing difference and variety - at least in so far as the local and particular are not themselves racist, chauvinist, sexist, militaristic, authoritarian, etc.

3. The primary political force for the development of a GSC is provided by the new social movements (NSMs) with a critical and committed understanding of globalisation. Developing under conditions of globalisation, information capitalism and nation-statism, the NSMs are faced by the necessity of confronting their constraints. In so far as the NSMs (and 'movementist' ethnic and labour organisations) reject capitalist, statist, bloc, sexist, racist, etc., solutions, they are open to international dialogue and cooperation in a way that the old ones could not consistently be.

4. The most favourable terrain for the new democratic global social movements is precisely that of communication/culture. Movements such as those of women, human-rights, ecology - and the new labour ones - are increasingly recognising this, even whilst they are active in traditional parliamentary, community, industrial, lobbying, organising and financing activities.

5. The specific difficulties of creating a GSC are primarily those of motivation, resources and language. Motivation first requires recognition of the problem - something that is only spreading slowly and unevenly throughout the world. Resources must be sought amongst the interested categories themselves. Advantage can, however, also be taken of the institutions (e.g. public-service or community broadcasting) and finance (development-aid or solidarity funds) of liberal-democratic states, of unions, parties, churches, foundations and international agencies that seek to demonstrate their democratic or humanitarian credentials. Recognising the interpenetration or overlap between global solidarity on the one hand, and, on the other, labour/socialist internationalism, religious universalism and bourgeois cosmopolitanism, should enable activists to make principled and purposive recourse to such facilities. Language should be seen as a problem rather than a barrier, for the following two reasons. Firstly, because we have not even begun to explore the possibilities for the creation of a GSC between single or related language groups of different nation-states (not only English and Spanish but also Armenian, Hausa, Quechua, Dutch/Flemish/Afrikaans). A GSC does not require that everyone be able to speak in a direct and unmediated way with everyone else but that global solidarity be valued and demonstrated, even locally. Use, furthermore, can be made of the linguistic skills and cultural knowledge of immigrants and re-migrants. Foreign-language skills could be encouraged amongst both the masses and the activists. Secondly, we need to recognise the growing importance internationally of non-verbal communications and culture (music, dance, graphic arts, video), such as the South American poor women's arpilleras (tapestry, applique), appropriately called 'pictures that speak' (Sosa 1994).

6. Global solidarity groups are already capable of using for their own subversive or counter-assertive purposes the dominant international channels and symbols. This is exemplified by the strategy used by East-European dissidents to get their messages back to their own populations by using the dominant Western media. This strategy has been used implicitly by Greenpeace, adept at exploiting the mass media to get its minority message to a mass international public. But one needs to be conscious of what one is doing if, instead of riding a sealed train, one is not to be taken for a ride (Ryan 1991).

7. The progressive professional, technical, administrative and cultural middle classes are evidently going to have to further the above process, just as its democratic and internationalist elements have initiated it. A leading role could be played by radical communications specialists bored with providing ideologies, theories, strategies and techniques to nationalist technocrats or counter-elites (see, again, Hamelink 1994 and Toward Freedom 1994). Increasingly resentful of elitist technocrats and political manipulators, township dwellers, workers and others could respond positively, even to foreign specialists, if these help them rediscover their international history, develop the skills locked into alienated work, extend their own international knowledge and contacts - and are prepared to learn as well as teach.

8. The appropriate media for a GSC must differ according to place/space, category, level and political conditions. Place/space: video might become increasingly central within the US, where there now exists the possibility of broadcasting via satellite to individuals and public-service cable channels nationwide (Deep Dish 1986 Schechter 1994:2911); the most important for Africa at present is likely to be radio (Girard 1992, Gorfinkel 1992). Local, national, regional and global space suggest specific possibilities and constraints, with computer-mediated communication (CMC) and its growing possibilities, being self-evidently crucial for exploiting/bridging global space (Inoue 1994). Category: printed materials can be both read and produced by most peace-movement members, not by most members of rural labour unions. Level: the cost and technical complexity of computers makes them initially relevant to organisers and communicators, not to most social movement members/supporters. Political conditions: there are media and modes of expression with a high and therefore provocative political profile and there are those with low ones ('information', 'educational materials').

9. Self-determined self-activity amongst the relevant movement members and supporters is essential if such a project is not to reproduce the fate of the worker film, photo, radio, theatre and other such movements of the 1920s-30s. This was always subordinated to the ideology of its Communist initiators and later declined into a Soviet-controlled propaganda effort. International cultural activity from the grassroots, shopfloor, community can provide these with an independent sense of identity that can empower them - as it did 19th century European proletarians - in not only global but also national and local struggles.

10. If a GSC model already exists, it is largely hidden from public view. There may be cases or practices that embody a number of the four fundamental and interdependent characteristics of AC listed earlier. But we can hardly expect such particular cases or practices to each confront the oppressor, be oriented toward a total social transformation and have the participatory, educational and critical characteristics required. The development of such a model therefore requires the identification and analysis of the whole range of internationalist communication practices, whether of a generally non-dominant or a specifically alternative nature. We therefore need to examine traditional international solidarity communication, as well as such mass or relevant individual or group activities as migration, vacations, work and study trips, interpretation of dominant media images of the foreign and international, amateur or community radio, video and computer communication, correspondence, etc. We need to be sensitive to the communications work and skills of increasing numbers of skilled or semi-skilled communication workers, as well as those of increasing categories of 'proletarianised' education, cultural, communications and information professionals or technicians. These, and their organisations, are not only capable of acting internationally in their own right but also of acting as agents (educators, technical specialists) for others.

1.3. Conceptualisation: 'approach' and 'style'

I would like to suggest the value of two typologies for the analytical part of the paper, these having to do with 'approach' and 'style'.

1.3.1. 'Approach'

'Approach' is a non-technical term, which I use here to indicate theory, ideology or worldview, as customarily related to a state, party, movement, a revered past society or a desired future one. Relevant approaches to the foreign and international (F/I) in the South African case are listed below. The F/I distinction is not significant here but will be later: 'foreign' is material focused primarily on foreign countries/regions; 'international' is that concerned with relations between countries/regions, or the international/global level. Now for the approaches:

- Thirdworldist: pro-national-liberation, anti-imperialist, anti-TNC, anti-right-authoritarian, and party-vanguardist (i.e. the party or front as the true representative of the people or nation to the outside world - the traditional African National Congress (ANC) position);
- Social-Democratic or Social Reformist: incremental and institutional global reformist but not anti-capitalist (the traditional position of the Socialist International, the Western trade union internationals, and of many European development funding agencies);
- Democratic-Socialist: anti-capitalist, anti-authoritarian, pro-worker - sometimes taken to include the urban and rural poor (traditional position of the New Left after 1957 or 1968, as well as of many Third World solidarity groups in the West);
- Communist: anti-capitalist, proletarian-apocalyptic, state-socialist and party-vanguardist (traditional position of the South African Communist Party (SACP) and other Communist Parties internationally);
- Marxist-Leninist: proletarian-, peasant- or wretched-of-the-earth, apocalyptic, plus vanguard-internationalist, in the sense of seeing a particular present or future ideological tendency or party as the privileged bearer of internationalism (Trotskyists and Maoists with no state of their own);
- New Social Movement/Civil Society: a multi-levelled, multi-faceted, multi-directional internationalism, recognising a multiplicity of problems, subjects and movements, aware of globalisation, oriented to the development of an alternative sense of global community/culture, institutionalised in some kind of global civil society or alternative world order (many international ecological, peace, women's movements, international NGOs).

A few comments are necessary here. Firstly, the similarity between the Thirdworldist, Communist and Marxist-Leninist types raises the question of why they should be kept apart. This is because of their historical importance and mutual conflicts, themselves significant within labour and radical-nationalist movements internationally in the past. However, in the context of globalisation and the new social movements, it may well make sense to merge these into a Populist Internationalist category, an issue I will raise again later when discussing feminist publications. Secondly, whilst the sixth and last category above is my own, with no such general possibility of recognition as the earlier ones, I would argue that

it does help to 'make sense' or give shape to something with as yet no commonly-recognised name. Whilst I evidently am proposing it and favouring it, I do so in the hope of stimulating a discussion rather than of claiming - by naming - a terrain. I also evidently hope that my political identification with this type will not lead me to see it where it clearly does not exist.

1.3.2. 'Style'

'Style' is another non-technical term, having to do with communicative strategy: a rhetorical posture, a relationship with, or address to, a putative readership (c.f. Waterman 1991). Three styles relevant to the labour, socialist, nationalist and democratic press historically might be:

- The Rhetorical/Denunciatory, addressed to mass or crowd emotion and desire, posing the writer:reader relationship in terms of prophet and believer (typical of early labour, socialist and nationalist movement media). Whilst not necessarily identical to the polemical, this style does tend to pose issues in terms of a binary opposition, with the self:other relationship equally posed in terms of virtue:evil and the desired outcome in terms of victory:defeat.
- The Agitational/Mobilisational, addressed to organised will and capacity, posing the writer:reader relationship in terms of organiser and member (typical of 'early-organised' mass movement media). Whilst this may be expressed in ideological terms, or in the polemical mode, it lends itself to a more sophisticated and technical presentation.
- The Informational/Analytical, addressed to individualised reason and reflection, posing the writer:reader relationship in terms of teacher and student (typical of 'established' union, socialist and nationalist party media - and, for that matter, the establishment bourgeois-liberal one). Allows for the presentation of detailed information as well as for theoretical argumentation.

All of these writer:reader relations are essentially hierarchical ones, in which that hierarchy is neither necessarily questioned nor even revealed. These relations are those, respectively, of Prophet and Believer, of Leader and Follower, of Teacher and Student. A fourth hypothetical style might therefore be:

- the Critical/Self-Reflexive, addressed to the stimulation of critical and creative capacities, concerned to reveal the subject position and values of the writer, or to place the writer on the same plane as what is written, and to require or stimulate critical and creative capacities amongst readers.

This style is not essentially hierarchical. Nor is it, of course, essentially egalitarian. It is, however, subversive of hierarchy and therefore egalitarian in spirit.

There is no necessary one-to-one relationship between approach and style, although, for example, the Informational/Analytical style may predominate in contemporary international Social-Democratic discourse, and the Critical/Self-Reflexive has not been typical of the international Communist or Marxist-Leninist one. Nor is there a one-to-one

relationship between historical moment/period and predominant style, although certain correspondences have been suggested. I will, however, again suggest that the appropriate style today for international and internationalist communication should be this fourth one. It seems to me that the only sound basis for a global solidarity culture under conditions of a globalised information capitalism is dialogue between groups operating predominantly in the critical, creative and self-reflective mode (Waterman Forthcoming). In saying 'appropriate' above I allow for the possibility and - indeed - necessity for other styles, in so far as these address other such other human needs and capacities as the affective or expressive. 'Style', finally, should be considered an attribute not so much of individual messages as of the medium that carries them. This could, for example, mean that whilst an individual article might be in any of the above styles, that of the publication should, today, be the Critical/Self-Reflexive.

This paper will continue as follows: Part 2 will provide a background sketch of the alternative media in South Africa, concentrating on periodicals as the medium most-easily available and accessible to analysis; Part 3 will draw on the two typologies above to analyse foreign and international coverage in the South African Labour Bulletin (SALB or the Labour Bulletin); Part 4 will do the same with that in the feminist journal Agenda; Part 5 will conclude on the relationship between the analysis and a global solidarity culture project. The Bibliography will go wider than the references, providing interested readers with a classified list of writings relating to internationalism and alternative communication/culture in South Africa.

2. BACKGROUND: THE ALTERNATIVE PRESS AND OTHER MEDIA IN SOUTH AFRICA⁴

2.1. Bases for a global solidarity culture project

The bases for a GSC project exist, in South Africa: 1) in the historical experience and traditions of both the 'old' social movements (national, labour, socialist, church) and the 'new' ones (women, ecology, human rights, etc), particularly as these developed in the anti-apartheid struggle and transitional period (1990-94);⁵ 2) in the practice of alternative artists, organisations, networks and movements, critical of capitalist and state-dominated culture and media, sharing some of the values of the new global solidarity movements; 3) in a particular historical juncture: the victory of a globalised Western liberal capitalist civilisation over its Communist and Radical-Nationalist competitors, at the same time that questions are increasingly asked about the civilised nature of a globalised Western liberal capitalism! 4) the high value apparently placed, at least amongst the urbanised and unionised, on participatory democracy, solidarity, equality, tolerance, cultural self-expression, in the implicit or explicit understanding of 'contested terrains', 'civil society', struggle 'in and against' the state. The word 'bases' above is meant to suggest a certain potential. Given, however, the evident attractions - and increasing power/centrality - of a globalised culture of commodity fetishism, such bases must be understood as both temporary and uncertain. Given, further, the disorientation, confusion and possible disappointments consequent on the transition in South Africa, the danger of fundamentalist/authoritarian responses must also be recognised.

2.2. Periodicals: chronicle of a death foretold

There are few countries in the English-speaking world (here including such equally problematic others as Nigeria, India and the Philippines)⁶ that have had such a highly-developed and influential alternative media and culture as that of South Africa in the last one or two decades. There are even fewer countries where these media have been so intensively reflected upon, both in surveys and in theoretical/analytical writings.⁷ Yet already at the beginning of the 1990s a collection on the alternative press was announcing its death:

Ultimately, it seems that the alternative press was a 1980s phenomenon. This media was born in the popular [United Democratic Front] phase of the struggle against apartheid. It served this struggle well, but ironically the success of this struggle brought about a reformed South Africa that no longer appeared to have place for the alternative press...Once [in February 1990] a real reform of apartheid was set in motion the raison d'être of the alternative press was effectively ended...[I]t was now only a matter of time before overseas or Church funding for the 'alternatives' dried up. (Louw and Tomaselli 1991a:225)

Yet until the elections in 1994 that brought the Mandela government to power, one could witness the continued and energetic existence of a number of radical, popularly-oriented, daily or weekly newspapers, as well as of a whole number of highly-attractive and professional-looking periodicals, such as Work in Progress (WIP), Speak and Agenda (feminist), New Ground (ecological), South African Labour Bulletin, Workers' World and

Shopsteward (union-oriented), Learn and Teach (popular education). There even came into existence, around 1990, a new illustrated ecumenical magazine, Challenge. **Table 1** provides schematic information on a number of such alternative popular, political or academic journals. It reveals a considerable range of types, numbers of issues per year, staffing and circulation.⁸ Given all this, the alternative press might well have responded to Louw and Tomaselli - in 1991 - with the words of Mark Twain: 'rumours of my death have been exaggerated'.

But on arrival in Durban in July 1994, only one or two months after the historical election, I could hardly find up-to-date copies of these magazines, even in the university bookstores. The same was true of the party-controlled papers of the ANC, and its partner-in-government, the Communist Party. In these bookshops could be found only the more political/theoretical Transformation, Agenda and SALB, all of which have strong university (and Durban) connections, although possibly addressed to a wider community. The left press was otherwise largely represented by back issues of such party-controlled organs as: Workers News, 'Paper of the Workers International League (Leninist-Trotskyist Tendency/Britain)'; Oina Msebenzi, 'Paper of the Comrades for a Workers Government'; and The Socialist, 'Journal of the International Socialists, South Africa' - the latter bearing the appropriately archaic slogan, 'Neither Washington nor Moscow, but International Socialism'.

Of the periodicals mentioned above, only L&T, Speak, and New Ground could be found in CNA, South Africa's quasi-monopoly magazine distributor/retailer. Only L&T and Speak could be found on other bookstands or in the occasional supermarket. WIP had just collapsed. The Communist Party's newspaper, Umsebenzi, had ceased publication, as had the ANC's one, Mayibuye. On visiting Johannesburg in August I found that a whole group of independent magazines had had to combine, as the Independent Magazines Group, in order to share offices and administration/distribution costs. The move to collaborate in the IMG had clearly been inspired by an attempt to avoid the death sentence pronounced some three years earlier. All the magazines in the group, as well as other alternative publications, had had market or readership surveys done, mostly by a radical research group, the Community Agency for Social Enquiry (CASE). But WIP, as I have said, had already gone, and there was some apprehension in the IMG offices. By the time of my second visit, in October, L&T had collapsed, shortly to be followed by Speak. Meanwhile Shopsteward was moving back under closer institutional control by the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU). The IMG, which months before had moved into two floors of a centrally-placed office block, was moving out of one of them. The Cape Town-based International Labour Research and Information Group (ILRIG) announced that its 'magazine of international labour and politics', Workers' World, yet another illustrated periodical, was to be closed down. The death notice now seemed not so much exaggerated as simply premature.

The virtual collapse of the IMG periodicals was widely interpreted in financial or marketing terms - with some of the responsibility being placed on the shoulders of the Northern funding agencies for throwing too much money at them in the 1980s and/or withdrawing it too rapidly in the 1990s. Whatever the justification for these arguments they tend to conceal more-important ones. Indeed, those associated with these magazines tended to conceal these from either their readers, their funders or themselves. An overview of

Table 1: Publication characteristics of some alternative South African periodicals, mid-1994

	Chal- lenge	Trans- form- ation	South African Labour Bulletin	Shop- steward	Speak	Agenda
Issues p.a.	10	3-4	6	6	11	4
Pp. per issue	32	95	96	40	36	108
No. subscribers	2200	350		400	242	386
Subscription copies	2200	350	2200	400	242	852
Non-subs. copies	1000	170	2300	14,500	5-700	?
Price per issue: Min. Max.	R3 R3	R7 \$12	R4.33 R58.33	R2 R2	R2 R2	R10 \$12
Price p.a. Min. Max.	R8 R42	R26 \$55	R26 R350	R12 R12	R24 \$80	R25 \$85
Staff: Full-time Part-time	3	1	1 2	1 1	6	2 1
Copy source: Staff Outside Paid Unpaid Other	30% 15% 50% 5%	 95% 5%	30% 10% 70%	30% 5% 65%	85% 10% 5%	 100%
Contract out:	Repro Print	Layout Print	Sub-ed Market Distrib Print Photos etc.	Repro Print Distrib Market	Layout Market Graphic Ads Sales	
Board meetings	4 p.a.	4 p.a.	4 p.a.	6 p.a.	4 p.a.	1 p.w.

Notes: 1. This information is based on a mailed/phone questionnaire at a moment of crisis for some of the listed publications and must be considered approximate; 2. Transformation is a university-based radical academic journal rather than an NGO-based, foreign-subsidised one; 3. The relationship of the Rand to the Dollar was, in late-1994, US \$1=SA R3.5; SA R1= US \$ 0.285.

Source: Adapted and extended from Budlender (1994:34).

surveys of such periodicals suggests that the readers of several were largely white, and of the women's magazine, Speak, African but largely male!⁹

The demographic profiles of Challenge, Work in Progress and New Ground are roughly similar with the 'average' reader in these surveys being male, white, well educated, aged 30-49 years, with a high household income, working full-time, residing in the PWV [round Johannesburg], Natal or the Western Cape in a metropolitan area. Speak readers tend to be male, African, young and working full-time. (Castro, Everatt and Orkin 1994:11).¹⁰

2.3. In the streets and on the air

Other islands of alternative - or for that matter popular - culture were difficult to spot in an ocean of globalised media products and genres. 'Local content' was notably lacking even from African-language music broadcasting. Sound tapes throughout Durban were, with the exception of tape pedlars in the local 'non-white' railway station, almost exclusively foreign. My local video store had amongst its 1,000 tapes only a half-dozen South African ones of any kind. Only one South African movie was shown during a four-month period in Durban. South African choral singing - surely one of the most powerful traditions in the world - could be heard only during strikes or at the occasional meeting. Elsewhere I heard it solely from a group of buskers in a shopping mall. Other South African music provided occasional ethnic colour for TV advertisers appealing to a new middle class of African consumers. The Natal Workers Theatre Movement (Gunner 1994, Kotze 1988a and 1988b, Sitas Forthcoming), renowned nationally and even internationally for such plays as one on a strike at the Durban-based plant of a British TNC, was nowhere visible. Apart from one major wall mural, near the same non-white railway station in Durban (which is also the site of its major non-white markets) there were few if any radical, critical or even nationalist graffiti to be found. If it had not been for the new national flag, it might have been difficult for the famous Person from Mars to know s/he was in the new South Africa. To find the energetic and creative local cultures that do exist s/he would have to go beyond the conventional public or commercial urban realm and enter the factories, hostels, townships and villages.

On other fronts, in mid-1994, the battle was only just being joined. There was much discussion and negotiation going on around community radio. A whole floor of the COSATU building was occupied by the Democratic Media Trust's Centre for Democratic Communication (CDC). The DMT is a joint operation of the COSATU-ANC-SACP Triple Alliance. The CDC is a multi-media production centre, expensively equipped and staffed for video and TV, radio and audio, printing in full colour up to A3, housing an important photo archive. Whilst printed publications seemed to be being squeezed by the foreign funders, the CDC - whilst seeking to operate commercially - was evidently being generously funded by three Italian union confederations and one Norwegian labour movement agency. The Italian Communist one, the CGIL, was also funding the Metric Project, for the computerisation of COSATU, with the eventual possibility of the organisation being internationally linked by electronic mail.¹¹

In the middle of an attractive new culture and museum complex, a few blocks from the centre of Johannesburg, a new worker museum and educational centre was taking shape

round a reconstructed mineworkers' compound. The veteran Ravan Press appeared to be doing well. Phambili Books, the major radical bookshop in Johannesburg, revealed a surprisingly broad and up-to-date display of Marxist-Leninist, feminist, African, gay and other literature and periodicals from all over the English-speaking world. The new Y Press, in Durban, was demonstrating the commitment of COSATU and the university-based Trade Union Research Project to the production of high-quality popularisation of policy issues (Trade Union Research Project 1994). The Film and Allied Workers Organisation, a major cultural player in the late-apartheid period, put out an attractive report on the state of film, video and broadcasting in the new South Africa (Film and Allied Workers Organisation 1994). Apart from the overview it gives of the alternative media movement and media issues in the new South Africa, this one-off magazine-format publication also shows awareness of such a movement internationally:

We live at a time when the globalisation and homogenisation of communication is quickly gathering speed. We are also witness to increasing monopolisation and commercialisation of information and the expansion of the global economy...[T]he counter-movement to this force is creative, broad and deep. In every region of the world people are working to this purpose, reflecting on regional differences, discovering and examining each others' experiences, establishing links to find solutions to common problems and seeing and hearing each others work... (Naughton 1994:11)

The same contribution reports on numerous community-broadcasting projects, on an international community-broadcasting event, calls for global recognition of the 'third sector' (i.e. non-state, non-commercial) and ends with a rousing address to South Africa:

South Africa now holds a unique situation within the global information revolution. As a relative latecomer to electronic media and to community media specifically, it has just undergone a people-powered revolution which has put key activists in a position to write new legislation. This presents an opportunity to plan a very bright future for the local information order. Out of it could come a model for the rest of the world. (12)

The alternative press, which had lost much of its foreign subsidies and occasional staff to the state, politics or dominant media, might have demurred (Forrest and Pearce 1994). But the FAWO publication does suggest at least the vitality of the alternative audio-visual sector in South Africa - including a concern to reach into the townships and rural areas. It also recognises that such efforts are going to continue to need - and to demand - subsidies, either from external funding or from government (Ishmael 1994:20).

2.4. International labour communication and culture projects

FAWO is also right about the extent to which, internationally, people are reflecting on regional differences, discovering each others' experiences, establishing links and seeing and hearing each others work. In South Africa there are a number of activities or projects, mostly related to the labour movement, that could be considered to be contributing to such efforts.¹² Here are three of them.

2.4.1. COSATU breaks boundaries

In April 1994, some six months before its first congress in the new South Africa, COSATU published an attractive illustrated and coloured brochure, of some 32 pages, entitled Breaking Boundaries: Building an International Workers' Movement (Confederation of South African Trade Unions 1994). The brochure was funded by the Quebec-based Confederation des Syndicats Nationaux (CSN), and produced with contributions from Shopsteward, Umanyano Publications (which published both this magazine and SALB), and the Cape Town-based International Labour Research and Information Group (ILRIG). It was unpriced, being largely circulated within COSATU by insertion within an issue of Shopsteward.

The brochure was evidently intended to be a consciousness-raising and mobilising effort within COSATU. It could well be considered a popularisation of the foreign and international (F/I) orientation of SALB, or an extension of the limited F/I space in Shopsteward.¹³ The back cover reads thus:

'An international trade union movement that works with other sectors of civil society is the only force that can really challenge capital, and create a worldwide movement for peace and democracy' (Jay Naidoo, ex-General Secretary COSATU).

In this book trade unionists speak about why international solidarity is important, how COSATU has received solidarity in the past, and how COSATU is beginning to reach out to workers in other parts of the world.

Unionists talk about the issue of affiliation to the ICFTU [International Confederation of Free Trade Unions], and the role of International Trade Union Secretariats (ITS's), useful profiles of the different ITS's are included. Unionists also discuss the importance of building Company world Councils, and the critical issue of reshaping the world economy.

And, in an Introduction by new COSATU General Secretary, Sam Shilowa, it is said that:

International issues are not taken seriously by most COSATU workers. Workers leave international issues to their union leadership and COSATU. This book shows that we can no longer do this. International solidarity must involve working people.

This is, in my experience, a unique national union publication, in so far as it not only presents official policy or provides information but gives examples of solidarity that workers could follow at company or workplace level, raises major policy issues, and actually urges workers to get involved in these. Much of this is presented in the words of union secretaries, regional education officers, or even shop-stewards. Indeed, the only obvious obstacles to this brochure achieving its objectives are 1) that it is a one-off effort, and 2) that it does not spell out how workers could get involved in deciding union or COSATU international policy. What the brochure does demonstrate is the seriousness with which

COSATU is considering a new kind of internationalism, and its recognition that this requires messages addressed directly to at least workers at the shop-steward level.

2.4.2. Informing labour internationalists¹⁴

The Cape Town-based ILRIG has been mentioned in passing, largely as publisher of the now-discontinued Workers' World (WW). ILRIG was set up some ten years ago by pro-labour people connected with the University of Cape Town (UCT). It has two main faces outside the Cape. One of is a series of popular illustrated booklets on national and international labour movements, historical and contemporary, with particular attention to Africa and the Third World. The other has been WW, of which 14 or 15 issues have been published since 1989. ILRIG, however, also produces rather professional education packs, most recently on the ICFTU (International Labour Resource and Information Group 1994a), runs education and training programmes, has a documentation centre, and networks, locally and internationally, in the cause of international solidarity. It prepares union delegations for travel abroad, and it hosts foreign visitors. Apart from general services, ILRIG work has been divided into six major projects: International Solidarity, Global Strategies of Capital, Trade Union Cooperation in Southern Africa, Multinational Corporations, Women Workers in Trade Unions, and WW itself.

ILRIG has international publication exchanges or other contacts with national and international trade unions, resource centres, publications, academics and solidarity projects in all parts of the world, with the possible exception of the (ex-)Communist countries. Its activists have also travelled widely, from Brazil in the early-1980s to Western Australia in 1994. In this latter year it also had on staff Celia Mather, one-time editor of International Labour Reports in the UK, who guest-edited the SALB special issue on the new labour internationalism in 1991 (see Part 3 below). ILRIG declares that:

The main aim of our work is to assist organisations of workers in South Africa to learn from the experiences of their counterparts in other countries and to encourage the development of international links of labour solidarity [...] Our education and writing methodologies aim to develop the confidence, knowledge and skills of ordinary members of organisations, so that they can actively participate in shaping the policies of their organisations and the future of their society. We also try to empower the education and research structures of the organisations we work with... (International Labour Resource and Information Group 1994b:2)

It is interesting to note that ILRIG has decided to replace WW with a bi-monthly bulletin carrying information on how to organise international links and solidarity (International Labour Resource and Information Group 1994c). It will review relevant books and videos. It will be circulated throughout the Southern African region. And attempts will be made to insert the bulletin into other publications. ILRIG also intends to use electronic mail in order to obtain information and contributions for the new publication from abroad.

ILRIG is one of a number of such international labour and democratic resource projects. These include Asia Monitor Resource Centre (Hong Kong), Mujer a Mujer/Woman to Woman (Canada, USA, Mexico), Transnational Information Exchange (Holland, with

offices in Brazil, Malaysia, Moscow), Women Working Worldwide (UK), Third World Network (Malaysia), etc. Such resource centres are, in fact, communication centres. They provide unprocessed information, research services, bibliography, periodicals, books or brochures, sometimes audio and videotapes. They frequently provide training in the skills necessary to communicate. They prepare people for travel abroad. They usually provide a range of information sources or resources, rather than a pre-digested and pre-packaged 'position'.

ILRIG, it would seem, makes an interesting contribution toward a global solidarity culture project in South Africa. It does not encompass such a project and this for several reasons. One is that it is a labour-oriented project. Another is that it is oriented more to 'communication' than to 'culture'. A third is that it operates in the alternative rather than either the dominant or popular spaces. The form taken by ILRIG is significant in so far as it provides resources rather than carrying out organisation or imposing ideology.¹⁵ It could, hypothetically, develop the characteristics necessary for the coordination of a more general project. But, even as it is, it provides a model that those involved in other global solidarity projects (women? ecology?) could learn from.

2.4.3. An Indian Ocean labour culture network

This cultural project, in which South African labour-movement activists play an important part, is itself part of a recurring Indian Ocean Region Trade Union Conference (IORTUC) of a slightly more conventional nature. The first of these conferences took place in May 1991, the second in December 1992, the third in November 1994.¹⁶ The Cultural Conference took place as part of the Second IORTUC. It passed a resolution, later endorsed by the Conference as a whole, which stated in part:

It is vital that international union solidarity encompasses cultural exchange and celebration in order to strengthen the ability of working people to unite and organise to reclaim and define their cultural integrity through struggle and creative expression.

And:

International solidarity work must include the creation of direct information channels owned and controlled by working people themselves to ensure workers have access to information from fellow workers rather than the mass media. (Workers Unity 1994:19)

Decisions were accordingly taken to create a Network of Trade Union Cultural Workers within the region, and to ensure the attendance of such activists in the 1994 Conference.

The IORTUC is itself a unique project, demanding comparison with informal solidarity networks in, for example, the North American Free Trade Agreement area. One of the unique characteristics is that it involves a number of 'traditional' unions, whether of the Communist (India, Philippines) or Social-Democratic (Australia) traditions. Another is that it involves new 'social-movement unions' (South Africa, South Korea), worker-support

centres and even university-based intellectuals. But its most unique and promising feature must surely be the recognition of culture and communication.

2.5. Ironies of history

Promising as such international and internationalist projects are, there can be no assumption they will continue or develop. The prolonged crisis of the alternative media in South Africa is by no means over. In one of those ironies of history to which Marxists are so addicted, the high tide of the alternative media coincided with the last wave of apartheid oppression. This was, actually, no coincidence at all: there was a causal relationship between the two. It was the last vicious period of apartheid, which included many assassinations, mass shootings and dirty-tricks operations as well as extreme media repression, that provoked the opposition, called on all communicative talents, gave such a high profile to any successful expression of discontent. It also apparently encouraged foreign and international governmental and NGO funding to flow, in sometimes generous quantities, to communication and cultural projects. The period of the NSM-influenced United Democratic Front (1983-1991) was a period in which, in the continued absence of the ANC and SACP, a hundred oppositional flowers could bloom, and radical notions of a post-apartheid communication and cultural order could flourish (Tomaselli and Louw 1989, 1991). Magazines were set up to compete in appearance, quality and distribution with the slick commercial media. Professionals (some highly-paid compared to academics) were employed. Then came the release of Mandela, the legalisation of the ANC/SACP, the self-dissolution of the UDF, top-level bargaining between apartheid officialdom and that of the Tripartite Alliance. After the birth of the new South Africa, came the post-natal depression. The few experienced and talented Black staff were drawn off to more-influential or better-paid jobs. Some whites were also offered government jobs, revealed signs of burnout, or withdrew to consider other futures. Yet others seemed already nostalgic for the UDF period.

In the new South Africa the dominant media coverage of international news is extremely limited, in quantity, quality and orientation. A one-week monitoring exercise run in September 1994 found but 1.8 percent of news time devoted to international affairs on two major TV channels. There was a conspicuous lack of international stories in African-language broadcasts. The scope was also extremely limited even in such news as was broadcast, being, in all but one case on each channel, devoted to the US invasion of Haiti. The dominant media seems here to be following a familiar global pattern (Kantor 1994).¹⁷

This situation makes even more dramatic the loss of a unique pattern of foreign and international coverage pioneered by the alternative media in South Africa. The nature of that contribution will be suggested in the next part of this paper. The only compensation for the loss is that, by being cast out of the paradise of isolationist apartheid into the purgatory of a globalised and neo-liberalised communication order, radical media and cultural activists in South Africa may be condemned to join their opposite numbers elsewhere in the construction of an alternative global information and cultural order.

3. ANALYSIS: THE 'SOUTH AFRICAN LABOUR BULLETIN'¹⁸

3.1. Background

SALB celebrated its 20th anniversary in 1994. It began in Durban in 1974, in close association with labour studies specialists at the University of Natal Durban (UND) and the Institute of Industrial Education (IIE). The IIE was a response of radical, and mostly-white, academics to the Durban strikes of 1973 that signalled the birth of the new unionism in South Africa. SALB first appeared as a slim, dull, cyclostyled A5 periodical. But, although university-based, it was from the beginning movement-oriented, attempting to make analytical, theoretical and strategic materials accessible to at least labour leaders. SALB was largely inspired by a non-dogmatic New Left critical of Communism, Social Democracy and Radical Nationalism (at least in terms of the ANC's fixation on guerilla warfare and an eventual insurrection). Like other such socialist, church, liberal and democratic intellectuals around the world at this time, this group opted primarily for providing services to the growing working-class movement. It has been close, successively, to the Federation of South African Trade Unions (FOSATU, 1979-85) and COSATU (founded 1985), the two central organisations of the rising South African union movement. But it has always remained independent of these, has sometimes given the lead in new thinking, sometimes been sharply critical. It has also provided space for different union and socialist tendencies, and for strategy debates (also often sharp).

SALB has always received foreign funding, this coming primarily from progressive development-aid agencies rather than directly from foreign and international trade unions.¹⁹ SALB survived the suppression of various issues, the banning, trials and exiling of various editors and contributors, as well as the assassination of Rick Turner, its initial guiding spirit. It also seems to be surviving the collapse of the other alternative periodicals with which it was recently linked. Early 1995 its total circulation was 2,370. Distribution broke down as follows: national 2,290, international 80. 80 is a respectable but not exceptional foreign distribution for a national labour journal with much international relevance. Of the national distribution, 254 go to workers on an individual annual subscription basis, 349 go to unions on a bulk annual subscription basis, 770 go to unions on a monthly bulk basis; 205 go to corporations (which pay the exceptionally high corporate rate); only two go to government; students, individuals, institutions (NGOs?), exchanges, etc, cover the rest. One can imagine that its distribution to government offices will rise alongside the number of ex-union officers in government and as a liberal-democratic industrial relations pattern is institutionalised. One could also imagine a certain growth in foreign distribution if SALB were to make a point of the unique international coverage revealed below. SALB claims to be dependent on subsidies for under eight percent of its total income.²⁰ This is likely to have been exceptional within the IMG also.

A national sample survey of COSATU's 25,000 shop-stewards in 1992 suggested that five percent (say 1,250) were readers of this 'serious' journal (Pityana and Orkin 1992). It came sixth in a ranking of preference, being proceeded (in this order) by three commercial glossies and two 'popular' alternative publications. A 1994 sample survey/consultation with SALB readers throughout COSATU, revealed a relatively high value placed on it in comparison with other alternative periodicals, popular or serious. It also suggested that the international material was reasonably well received.

Interview with LULA



Lula, the Workers Party candidate in Brazil's presidential elections, visited South Africa in June to hold discussions with President Nelson Mandela. The former metal worker - who is leading the presidential race in Brazil - found time to speak to LINGA ZITA and KARL VON HOLDT between a diplomatic reception and watching the Brazilian world cup team beat the Russians 2-0.

L **about Bulletin:** What is the significance of your visit to South Africa and your meeting with President Mandela?

Lula: There is a certain similarity between the problems that exist in Brazil and South Africa. Of course we respect the differences that exist also. Racial apartheid and social apartheid has a lot in common with the problems of Brazil, where you have a privileged minority and a huge majority which is excluded from social development. Mandela's election means that the aspirations of those who are excluded are being met for the first time. At the same time there is a certain fear amongst the privileged sectors of society.

It's the same situation in Brazil where we have those that are excluded, the majority, and where we also have the

3.2. Foreign/International coverage

3.2.1. Quantitative analysis

The existence of a computerised index, covering Volumes 1 to 16 (1974 to 1991) makes it possible to state that of a total of some 1,916 items indexed over this 18-year period, some 287, or 14.3 percent, have fallen into the F/I category.²¹ The annual percentage has varied between a low of 2.2 percent (Vol. 8, 1982-3) and a high of 22.2 percent (Vol. 12, 1985-6). Variations from the mean have, however, generally been much less. There appears to have been no clear movement toward either an increase or a decrease in the number of such items published. Given, however, that in recent years the magazine has increased the number of short items - and that the notes, briefs, advertisements and satirical items tend to be brief indeed - a count of items may be misleading. Certainly, the impression one receives on scanning volumes is of an increase in F/I coverage over recent years. My own calculation of the last and current volume (Vol. 17, 1993 and Vol. 18, till November 1994 only) suggests that a number-of-pages comparison gives a higher percentage of F/I than would a number-of-items count: 15 percent for Vol. 17 and 23 percent for the incomplete Vol. 18. What seems to determine whether or not there is an above-mean F/I coverage is whether or not there is a signalled 'focus', or a concentration of articles, on F/I matter, in a particular volume. Identification of these concentrations also requires a specification regarding the F/I category, since in recent years there have been numerous foci, or on-going discussions, on 'socialism', 'social-democracy' and 'democratic socialism', which - whilst addressed to South African circumstances - have usually had an international character, implicit or explicit (**Tables 2a,b**).

For a national labour - indeed union - magazine, it is clear that SALB has a persistently high interest in foreign, international and strategic or theoretical matters of a far more than national nature. We can here make a comparison with Quadernos Laborales, a Peruvian monthly labour monthly, similarly oriented to, but autonomous from, the major left union confederation in Peru. In 1986, when I interviewed journalists from the NGO responsible for the magazine (Waterman 1992), they were apologetic about its failure to cover foreign and international material. During the following seven or eight years, Quadernos Laborales has devoted perhaps one page out of 30 to F/I material, usually news briefs.²²

3.2.2. Qualitative analysis

As far as the foreign is concerned, **Table 2a** already reveals a clear bias toward close neighbours. Thus Rhodesia/Zimbabwe, Namibia, Botswana, Lesotho and Swaziland received heavy attention in Vols.1-7 (1974-82). The particular interest in Rhodesia/Zimbabwe was evidently due to the questions its transition from a racist/isolationist to an independent 'socialist' regime raised for South African labour and unions. If 1974-82 marks a first period for foreign coverage, 1986 to the present marks another. Whilst Africa received its last 'special' appearance with another Zimbabwe issue in 1986, Volumes 12-18 see increasing attention to - though no special focus on - Western Europe, Australia, Latin America, the (ex-)Communist/Socialist world (East Europe, Russia, Grenada, Nicaragua, China). The dramatically growing interest in Brazil was due to the increasingly-recognised parallels between the Brazilian and South African labour movements (for which also see Seidman

Table 2a: Foreign and International coverage in the South African Labour Bulletin, Vols. 1-16, 1974-92 (as % of total items)

Vol	Tot nos	Dates	Item tot.	F/I tot.	F/I % *	'Specials'/thematic concentration, issue no. (#)
1	10	4.74-4.75	95	17	17.8	Rhodesia/Zimbabwe #9
2	8	5.75-4.76	69	12	17.3	Rhodesia/Zimbabwe #7
3	10	7.76-10.77	65	11	16.9	Rhodesia/Zimbabwe #6
4	8	1.78-2.79	66	11	16.6	Namibia #1-2
5	8	5.79-5.80	61	12	19.6	Botswana, Internat. #5,#8
6	8	7.80-7.81	65	11	16.9	Lesotho #4
7	8	9.81-7.82	74	8	10.8	Swaziland #6-7
8	3**	9.82-12.82	45	1	2.2	
9	8	9.83-7.84	72	14	19.4	International #6
10	7	9.84-8.85	115	30	26	Disinvestment #6
11	7	9.85-10.86	113	12	10.6	
12	8	11.86-10.87	108	24	22.2	Zimbabwe #6-7
13	8	11.87-2.89	120	12	10	
14	8	4.89-5.90	307	35	11.4	Disinvest., Socialism #1,#6
15	8	6.90-6.91	294	48	16.3	Socialism, Internat. #3,#7
16	8	7.91-12.92	247	29	11.7	Social Democracy #3,6 Brazil #3,6,8 ICFTU, Internat. #1,2,4,5
	125		1916	287	14.3	TOTAL

* Percentage of F/I items does not total vertically due to rounding.

** Computerised index covers only first 3 of total 8 issues in Vol. 8.

Table 2b: Foreign and International coverage in the South African Labour Bulletin, Vols.17-18, 1993-94 (as % of total pages)

Vol	No	Dates	Pp tot	F/I tot.	F/I %	'Specials'/thematic concentration, issue no. (#)
17	6	1.93-12.93	573	88	15	Socialism #6
18	5	1.94-10.94	492	115	23	Socialism #2
	11		1065	193	19	TOTAL

1994). But in many cases interest was apparently due to a perceived positive or negative relevance for South Africa.

The first international issues of SALB were Vol. 5, No. 8 (May 1980) and Vol. 9, No. 6 (May 1984), both issues also including such foreign material as that on Nigeria or Brazil. However, both issues paid highly-critical attention to the internationally-dominant Western unions, represented by the 'European' International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU) and the American Federation of Labour-Congress of Industrial Organisations (AFL-CIO). Both of these were already intervening heavily in South and Southern Africa. The first issue arguing for 'a new labour internationalism' was Vol. 15, No. 7 (April 1991). This seems to have begun a continuing debate on and around the ICFTU that continued in Volumes 16 and 17. Strategic issues with international implications may have earlier found place in SALB (e.g. discussion on the anti-apartheid strategy of disinvestment, Vol. 10, No. 6 and Vol. 14, No. 1). But it was from 1990, with the legalisation of the ANC and SACP and the approaching end of the apartheid era, that theoretical/strategic reports and debates - the latter with much international reference and many foreign participants - really took off.

Debates about 'socialism', 'social-democracy', 'social contracts/pacts' and 'democratic socialism' mark the period 1990-94 (e.g. Vol. 14, No. 6, Vol. 15, No. 3, Vol. 17, No. 6, Vol. 18, No. 2). But so do articles and debates about globalisation and internationalism. Indeed, it is my feeling that the Labour Bulletin was leaning heavily in the direction of a social-reformist dispensation locally at the same time as it was leaning heavily toward an alternative to such internationally. Convincing evidence of the first would require a systematic content analysis. But, for the second, article titles and number of pages suggest that SALB was not so much reporting or analyzing as promoting a new kind of labour internationalism related to a new understanding of the international. A number of items on 'globalisation' were accompanied by extensive reports on or from new international labour fora or groups. Much of this came from the Indian Ocean (Vol. 16, No. 5, 1992:66-73; Vol. 17, No. 2, 1993:76-79; Vol. 17, No. 3, 1993:76-81). But it also came from the another axis, that between the South African COSATU, the Brazilian CUT and the Italian Communist-led federation, the CGIL. Here it was reported, that the three organisations had agreed during a forum

to work for a new form of labour internationalism which could challenge the global domination of capital by building an alternative to the neo-liberal project. Such an internationalism should be based on a pro-active or strategic unionism which engages in industrial and social restructuring in each country. At its centre is a project for democratisation and social justice [...] Once the project of strategic unionism is adopted, it has to be extended into the international arena. it has to commit itself to the tough, ambitious fight for social regulation of the global economy. (Vol. 17, No. 5, 1993:72-79)

In so far as this did represent not only a high interest in the international but a new orientation toward such, we now need to relate it to other approaches.

3.2.3. Approach

We are now considering the material in terms of the typology mentioned in the Introduction, i.e. Thirdworldist, Social-Democratic, Democratic-Socialist, Communist, Marxist-Leninist, New Social Movement/Civil Society. My impression is that the original and continuing orientation of the SALB editors and writers has been a Democratic-Socialist Internationalism. This is suggested by: 1) the continual critique of not only international capitalism but also state-authoritarianism (left as well as right); 2) the critique of bureaucracy and authoritarianism within the international labour movement; 3) the sympathy for shopfloor worker movements, West, East and South; and 4) the welcoming of and support to a democratic and labour internationalism without geographical or political frontiers. An early indication of this orientation is provided in the 'Editorial Notes' for the issue with the special focus on the 'new internationalism':

[T]here is potential for militant, democratic trade union movements to emerge as a powerful force on the international stage with the capacity to reinvigorate and give new meaning to international solidarity... [T]he militant democratic organisations will have to start sharing experiences and strategising collectively. This could be one step forward in a struggle - together with other progressive organisations - for a new world order dominated, not by the interests of imperialism, the multinationals and finance capital, but by the interests of the ordinary citizens of our planet. (Vol. 15, No. 7, 1991:1).

The last sentence here contains hints of what I have called a New Social Movement/Civil Society approach. There have always been such other notes or approaches expressed within SALB, beginning with the first 'Focus on International Labour' (Vol. 5, No. 8, May 1980). Social-Democratic voices, both from within South Africa and from Europe/Australia, have been increasingly heard in the debates around the international trade union movement and the future of South Africa and its trade unions. In the argument of Alan Fine, Assistant Editor of the South African Business Day and correspondent of the ICFTU's Free Labour World:

South African socialists have, at this stage, given the absence of any credible socialist model anywhere in the world, little realistic option but to pursue, in the short to medium term, what amounts to a social-democratic agenda [...] The irony is that - as the experience of western and northern Europe shows - the more comprehensively these goals are achieved, the more will wither on the vine of improved quality of life the revolutionary consciousness of the working class on which the socialist revolution depends. (Vol. 16, No. 3, 1992:85)

Thirdworldist Internationalist notes have also been struck in recent years, particularly in the 'Special Focus' on the meaning of a new internationalism. Here an unnamed correspondent argued for a new international organisation or alliance, based on COSATU, the Brazilian CUT, the Filipino KMU and the Organisation of African Trade Union Unity (OATUU):

The new emergent and largely non-aligned trade union movements such as COSATU, CUT, OATUU, KMU and others are potentially in a powerful bargaining position. Their strength includes the support of extensive networks of worker activists in the established unions of Europe and North America. If their strengths are shared and consolidated, the non-aligned trade unions, together with union activists within the unions affiliated to the ICFTU and WFTU, could play a decisive role in campaigning for...the establishment of an international democratic trade union alliance...the free flow and exchange of information...specific campaigns reflecting the needs of the working class internationally...This would be a logical development...towards worker-controlled internationalism. (Vol. 15, No. 7, 1991:39. Emphasis in original).

A distinct Communist Internationalist note has hardly been heard, since the unbanning of the SACP took place simultaneously with the collapse of the state-socialist project internationally. Perhaps its first and last expression in SALB was in the famous paper by the SACP General Secretary, 'Has Socialism Failed?'. In defending the theory of Communism both from its practitioners and from its critics, Joe Slovo declared:

The crucial connection between socialism and internationalism and the importance of world working-class solidarity should not be underplayed as a result of the distortions which were experienced. These included excessive centralisation in the era of the Comintern, subordination of legitimate nationalist aspirations to a distorted concept of 'internationalism', national rivalries between and within socialist states (including examples of armed confrontation). Working class internationalism remains one of the most liberating concepts in Marxism and needs to find effective expression in the new world conditions. (Vol. 14, No. 6, 1990:16. Emphasis in original).²³

Certain other Marxist-Leninist voices have been heard in SALB, though more in the debate on socialism than in any on internationalism. However, Adam Habib and Mercia Andrews, of the Workers Organisation for Socialist Action (WOSA), hit an appropriately international, apocalyptic and workerist note (but simultaneously a nationalist 'weak-link' one?) when they declared:

The South African and international working class movements are today at crossroads. Faced with the attacks on socialism by the bourgeoisie, it is important that socialists respond in a concerted way to regain the moral highground that socialism to date has occupied. The collapse of Stalinism also heralds the possibility of a realignment of political forces within the socialist camp. This is imperative more so than ever before, for the South African working class is in a position today to establish the first society on the face of this earth to be based on the principle of 'from each according to his ability, to each according to his need'. (Vol. 15, No. 3, 1990:93).

As for a distinctive New Social Movement/Civil Society note (i.e. one pointing beyond labour, socialist or third-world internationalism), this has been struck to a some extent in the discussion following the issue that frontpaged the New Internationalism. Thus, Jeremy Brecher extended his analysis of 'bridge-building' (between unions, communities and

the new social movements) from the US to the North American Free Trade Agreement level when he stated that

The labour movement, along with environmentalist, small farmer, consumer, and many other allies, has mounted major campaigns to oppose these agreements... Labour, religious, and other popular organisations on both sides of the US-Mexico border have held a series of meetings and developed their own alternative proposals for a North American development pact which would protect workers, small farmers, consumers, and the environment while allowing for jointly-regulated economic integration. (Vol. 17, No. 4, 1993:72).

In a more strategy-oriented piece I myself argued that

the new labour internationalism...comes...from reflection on the successes of the internationalism of the 'new social movements' such as those on peace, human rights, women and the environment... [A] new Third World labour internationalism should be practical rather than ideological in nature...simultaneously addressed to the Third, First and Second Worlds... [It] would suggest the following...issues for action and discussion [...] Trade union autonomy and worker democracy [...] An internationalism of the shopfloor and of networks [...] Alternative forms of communication [...] A code of relations for richer partners [...] Including non-unionisable labour [...] Learning from women's movements [...] Starting internationalism at home [...] Broader social and economic democracy [...] alternatives to multinationalisation [...] alternatives to indebtedness [...] Alternatives to ecological catastrophe [...] Alternatives to militarism [...] Socialist alternatives to capitalism... (Vol. 16, No. 2, 1991.)

It would seem, in sum, that whilst leaning in a certain direction, SALB has also been providing some kind of platform for an international debate on labour strategies and for one on labour internationalism. Let us examine this matter further.

3.2.4. Style

I have already spoken of SALB as providing some kind of a platform for different approaches to the foreign and international. The same may be true for style.

The Rhetorical/Denunciatory. A positive example of this is provided by the British Trotskyist, Alex Callinicos, denouncing social democracy and energetically promoting 'struggle':

The alternative to social contract is struggle - or rather...struggles... It was, after all, struggle that built the workers' movement in South Africa [...] The struggle needs to be continued...[D]espite all the formulations about 'combining negotiations and struggle' - negotiations are becoming a substitute for mass struggle... Struggle...is...essential...to challenge a capitalist system which is in crisis, not just in South Africa, but all over the world [...] Of

course, 'struggle' can degenerate into an empty slogan...debate should instead be concentrating on the question of how to take the struggle forward. (Vol. 16, No. 6, 1992:67.)

Negative, i.e. denunciatory, passages or items have abounded in the debates about labour internationalism and socialism during the last few years. Here are samples from left and right socialists respectively. The first is from a critique, by Mike Neocosmos, of three different contributions (or contributors?) to the discussion on socialism:

They rehash tired old formulae... They trot out crude statements...One would have expected a little more self-criticism... [They reveal] a lack of seriousness towards theory, a failure to produce evidence and a pandering to...opportunistic tendencies...without providing evidence...based purely on assertion without any reference to evidence... [U]nsubstantiated theoretical assertions are precisely a feature of...Stalinism... Unfortunately, none of the above three contributions to the debate on socialism in the Labour Bulletin really seem to approach theoretical work with the seriousness it requires. Their assertive form of argumentation and their...ignorance of evidence...denotes...a kind of fear of contestation...fear of democracy. (Vol. 15, No. 7, 1991:71-74)

The second is from a letter by Dan Gallin, General Secretary of the International Union of Food and Allied Workers (IUF), criticising the South African Congress of Trade Unions (The ANC's traditional union ally from the 1950s to the 1990s):

SACTU in exile represented never more than a small clique of parasites living off Soviet subventions who put more energy into defending their sectarian turf...than into fighting apartheid. (Vol. 16, No. 2, 1991:5).

The Agitational/Mobilisational. Many of the contributions quoted earlier are written in this particular style, in so far as they are intended to move readers to a particular form of organisational action. Consider this passage, from a largely informational/analytical item, by Latin Americanist, Ian Roxborough:

Behind the disarray of the unions lies a failure of the Left... Revolution is not on the cards. What then is left? [...] The answer, at least in the short run, must be defensive [...] What does this mean in concrete terms? [...] 1. Accept some neo-liberal advantages [...] 2. Work within corporatist institutions [...] 3. Co-operate with governments and employers [...] 4. Form alliances with conservative union leaders [...] These are dark times. We must have the courage to look reality in the face. We must conserve our strength in the hope that a time will come when labour can once again take the offensive. (Vol. 16, No. 4, 1992:37. Emphasis in original)

The Informational/Analytical. This style is exemplified by the Brecher item above. Whilst it could be taken to implicitly favour the kind of action it is analyzing, this is not expressed in overtly argumentative or persuasive form. Here is a piece that is, perhaps,

more question-raising. It was written by Argentinean Ronaldo Munck in response to the Roxborough article:

While accepting the bleak economic scenario painted... I am not sure labour's alternatives are that limited. In particular, I believe the option of the social contract or social pact could be usefully explored. [...] Like most of social reality, the social contract is a contradictory phenomenon [...] Also, we need to ask whether a strategy for the labour movement can ignore the vital role played by the so-called 'new' social movements...in the struggle for democracy [...] On balance, the price paid for not pacting seems greater than the risk involved in participating in some kind of democratic social pact [...] What is not clear is how the trade unions might broaden their traditional role to embrace...the 'new' social movements [...] We certainly [also] need to challenge the situation whereby capital works with a broad international project, while labour remains imprisoned within its national boundaries... (Vol. 17, No. 1, 1993:62-66)

The Critical/Self-Reflexive. Curiously enough, the only individual item which would seem to fit this bill would be the previously-mentioned re-evaluation of socialism (actually Communism) by SACP Secretary, Joe Slovo (Vol. 14, No. 6, 1990). In so far as he criticised both the (ex-)Communist world and the SACP (for its previously uncritical identification with this) he provoked an extensive and energetic discussion in the Labour Bulletin. However, even the limited self-criticism in his article is hardly reproduced either by contributors to this particular debate, or in other items on the problematic past of institutionalised internationalism. Thus, none of the political Social-Democrats seem to have felt it necessary to analyse, far less criticise, past national Social-Democratic collaboration with their own warring states and oppressing empires. And such new and startling admissions as were made on one occasion by ICFTU leaders, concerning past collaboration with corrupt unions and dictatorial regimes (Vol. 17, No. 1, 1993:67-71), was neither accompanied nor followed by any more serious self-reflection.

SALB has published large numbers of interviews, which have often given space and voice to those whose persons or organisations have been elsewhere criticised in the journal. Thus, although Mike Allen, a British international labour journalist, sharply criticised the SALB Special Focus on 'the new internationalism' for its 'blatantly leading questions' (Vol. 16, No. 2, 1991:61), both he and many other officers/supporters of the ICFTU have been provided with considerable space to both defend the ICFTU and criticise its detractors. This means that the Labour Bulletin has been contributing to, or even creating, not only a democratic South African public sphere but also a global one. Given the customary absence of any debate, or even discussion in the periodicals of the traditional labour internationals, this is no mean achievement.

It could thus be argued that, in so far as it has provided a platform or arena for a variety of approaches (and styles), the Labour Bulletin exemplifies the Critical/Self-Reflexive mode. I do not, however, think that this is the case. Part of the definition of this style is 'to stimulate collective critical and creative capacities amongst readers'. Whilst occasional letters from rank-and-file activists in the Bulletin do deal with F/I matters, most of the discussion remains amongst academics and politicians, South African or foreign. It would

seem that the creation of such capacities amongst union readers requires that the publication in question go beyond itself, stimulating or feeding into the more general kind of global solidarity culture project with which this paper will later deal.

4. ANALYSIS: 'AGENDA'²⁴

4.1. Background²⁵

Agenda first appeared in 1987. It was largely an outcome of the development of women's studies in South Africa and feminist activity in Durban and elsewhere. There was a felt need in South Africa for an addition to both the more serious alternative publications, which gave little attention to women, and to Speak, which, whilst feminist, had a popular orientation. At this time South Africa's women's and feminist movements were less developed than those in many other parts of the world. They were also isolated from the feminist intellectual and political ferment outside South Africa, whether nationally, regionally or internationally.

Whilst these problems could be considered results of apartheid policies, others were due to the nature of the anti-apartheid movements locally. These concentrated heavily on issues of race and class, with those concerning women a distant third. There was, moreover, the local perception of the left that feminism was a White, Western, Middle-Class concern. If the journal could have been originally stereotyped as White, Western, etc, then one would have to add the left South African qualification, 'of a special type'. The journal may have been created as an 'alternative to the alternative' (Holland-Muter 1994), but it had and has intimate links with Black women in the labour, national, democratic and community movements, has written about men and masculinity, and has provided space for male writers.

Whilst certain obstacles to the development of a South African feminist journal might have diminished with the decline of apartheid, others have not. The prohibitive costs of foreign journals continues to restrict access to the women's movement and feminist ideas internationally, making the local one a crucial means of access to the outside world. Nor has the need disappeared for a bridge between academic feminists and those in policy-making, parties, the unions and a myriad of community organisations and other NGOs. Indeed, it could be said that with the post-apartheid movement of feminists from women's studies and movements into legislatures, the mainstream media, ministries and other positions of formal power, the need for this bridging function has increased.

Agenda has always been produced by a 'collective', even whilst it has moved from a totally volunteer staff to one with two full-timers and a part-timer. The Editorial Collective has functioned more frequently and more intensively than those of other alternative periodicals, thus providing extensive and varied training to members, and - at least implicitly - exemplifying the feminist insistence that the political is also the personal and the professional. The difference between the SALB Editorial Board and the Agenda Editorial Collective is suggested by the high profile of the former within its pages compared with the low profile of the latter. This contrast is particularly evident in respect of the Editor of the Labour Bulletin and the Coordinator of the Agenda Collective. If, moreover, it has been possible to identify a SALB 'line' or general orientation, at particular times, this is hardly possible for Agenda, which has made efforts to provide place for a wide variety of opinions.²⁶

Agenda began with small grants from South African and foreign funding agencies. Since 1991 its main funder has been the Dutch humanist development funding agency,

Agenda

A JOURNAL ABOUT WOMEN & GENDER

R8.80 (VAT INC)

NO 19 1993

Women and difference

Can white women
represent black?

We
remember
Audre
Lorde



HIVOS. In 1990 Agenda shifted from two to three issues a year. In late-1991 it shifted up to four, where it remains at present. At the same time it decided to produce theme issues, which are highlighted on the front cover. Themes have included Women and the ANC, Sexual Politics, Health, Violence, the Economy, Difference, Democracy, etc. In 1994 the magazine claimed to have just under 400 subscribers.

A limited and possibly unrepresentative readership survey (Data Research Africa 1994) suggested that four out of five readers are university educated, half of them are academics, two-thirds are white, one-third Black (i.e. African, Coloured, Indian). Indeed, the journal probably functions most effectively to link feminist academics and to provide resources for courses on women or gender. Most readers of Agenda speak English at home. The most popular rubrics amongst them are articles, book reviews and interviews. Asked about what topics they would most like to see covered, 16 percent say 'politics' and 'practical information', only seven percent 'international issues' (ranked tenth of 17 items). Readers are satisfied with the feminist orientation of Agenda but there are complaints about over-theoretical writing. Due, in part, to travel abroad for study and other purposes, Agenda has always had a certain foreign input, at least in terms of contributed articles. It has also always had some foreign distribution, whether in Southern Africa, the North or the Third World.

Since early on, Agenda has been aware of the class and ethnic implications of its contents, its language and theoretical level, and the social make-up of its readership, its editors and its contributors.²⁷ It has worked hard on the ethnic, occupational and class composition of its Editorial Collective and contributors, with some success over the years. It is, however, confronted with a continuing problem concerning Black women: that the few qualified and interested are also in very high demand in other spheres in South Africa - feminist or not. Low sales amongst Blacks may be due to the low numbers of the highly-educated amongst them, and the other demands on their attention, as well as to their lower income level. Despite all its limitations and problems, Agenda would seem to bear favourable comparison with feminist political/theoretical journals in other countries, and to make a distinct contribution to feminist knowledge and women's politics internationally.²⁸

Agenda also plays a crucial role in the new South Africa more generally. There is, here, a paradoxical situation with respect to women. On the one hand there is a high level of official, and even media, awareness and recognition of women's oppression and the need for affirmative action. This has already led to relevant language in legal and policy documents, and to one of the world's highest proportions of female parliamentarians. On the other hand, as local feminists flatly declare, 'there is no women's movement in South Africa'. This is in dramatic contrast with much of Latin America, where the relationship is reversed: little official or media recognition, high level of autonomous women's and feminist activity. The situation in South Africa is, no doubt, due to the political energy flowing into the anti-apartheid struggle, followed by a certain exhaustion or confusion in the immediate post-election period. Whatever the case, the role of this feminist publication in raising new or difficult issues, in providing for continuity with the past, and a stimulus for the future, is probably quite crucial.²⁹

4.2. Foreign/international coverage

4.2.1. Quantitative analysis

The quantity and proportion of foreign/international material is shown schematically in **Table 3**. In the case of Agenda I find it necessary to recognise and allow for a specific 'theoretical/strategic' (T/S) sub-category amongst the F/I. This is due to the considerable proportion of such material in the journal, much of which makes exclusive or heavy reference to F/I literature or debates. As will be seen from **Table 3**, F/I+T/S material takes around one-third of total space in Agenda. This is at least twice as much as SALB. Even if we subtract the T/S, almost one-quarter of the journal is still devoted to F/I material. Expressed in percentages, total Foreign material would be 9.8, International 14 and Theoretical/Strategic 10.5. So, whichever way we look at it, Agenda is a very internationally-oriented journal. The extent of this is something which neither readers nor observers seem aware of.³⁰

Whilst there has only been one 'focus' on anywhere outside South Africa (Southern Africa, No. 14, 1992, with 75.6 of its material being F/I), Agenda does give considerable attention to the rest of Africa, both in its foreign and its international coverage. Further analysis³¹ of the 23 issues of the journal reveals the following:

- Of the Foreign material, about one-half deals with Africa and the diaspora (the latter mostly US women writers), one-third with the industrialised capitalist world, the rest with the non-African Third World - with just one or two mentions of the (ex-) Communist world;
- Of the International material, over three-quarters deals with the 'global' (i.e. two or more world areas, or the global level), but almost one-quarter deals with Africa;
- Of the Theoretical/Strategic material, almost two-thirds is 'global' (e.g. referring to both African and US/UK literature), and almost one-third refers to the First World (i.e. primarily US/UK literature).

If we cut the cake the other way, looking at distribution of total F/I+T/S material between world areas or levels, we find the following:

- Global: almost one-half;
- Africa (inc. diaspora): almost one-quarter;
- First World: almost one-quarter;
- Rest of Third World, (ex-)Communist World: almost negligible.

It is interesting, again, to note that none of the surveys or analyses of Agenda discusses - far less criticises - this specific distribution.

Table 3: Foreign/International (including relevant Theoretical/Strategic) coverage in Agenda, Nos 1-23, 1988-94 (as % of total pages)

No	Year	Tot. Pp.	For. Pp.	Int. Pp.	T/S Pp.	Tot. F/I + T/S	% F/I + T/S	% F/I	Focus
1	1987	92	5.9	0.5	29	35.4	38.5	6.5	
2	1988	91	3.5	13.6	14	31.1	34.2	18.8	
3	1988	97	15.7	0	0	15.7	0	16.2	
4	1989	112	4.5	20.8	0	25.3	0	22.6	
5	1989	92	4.7	16.3	0	21	0	22.8	
6	1990	95	5	35.7	0	40.7	0	42.8	
7	1990	85	14.9	11.3	0	26.2	0	30.8	
8	1990	93	5.8	3.9	6	15.7	16.9	10.7	The ANC
9	1990	90	0	42.7	8.8	51.5	57.2	47.4	Nat. Lib.
10	1991	119	32.4	0.5	13.2	46.1	38.7	27.6	
11	1991	93	2	10.6	31	43.6	46.9	13.5	Sex. Pol.
12	1992	93	9.3	10.5	7.5	27.3	29.3	21.2	Rural
13	1992	95	6.4	8.9	0	15.3	0	16.1	Culture
14	1992	102	32.5	44.6	0	77.1	0	75.6	Sthn Af.
15	1992	104	0	15.7	4	19.7	18.9	15	Health
16	1993	117	8.9	9.7	14	32.6	27.9	15.8	Violence
17	1993	93	5	9	16	30	32.3	15	Leisure
18	1993	110	3	7.5	4.7	15.2	13.8	11.2	Economy
19	1993	102	10	9.5	33.3	52.8	51.8	19.11	Dif'rence
20	1994	110	11.6	8.7	15	35.3	32	18.4	Democ.
21	1994	126	13.7	19.8	5.5	39	31	35.6	Education
22	1994	108	23.2	11	15	49.2	45.6	31.7	Family
23	1994	110	11	15	27.6	53.6	48.7	23.6	Body Pol.
		2329	229	325.8	244.6	799.4	34.3	23.8	TOTAL

Notes: 1. 'Foreign/International-Theoretical/Strategical' includes those theory/strategy items primarily relating to F/I literature or debates (excepting book reviews); 2. Columns may not add due to rounding.

4.2.2. Qualitative analysis

What accounts for the high proportion of foreign and international coverage in Agenda, and what is its nature? Let us consider all those issues with over the average 34.3% F/I+T/S coverage. There are ten of these (Nos. 1, 6, 7, 9, 10, 11, 14, 19, 22, 23). They are described in **Box 1**.

This extensive sample draws attention to certain qualities of F/I coverage in Agenda. The first must be the considerable attention given conferences, whether academic, political or - often - academic/political. The second is the heavy involvement in international feminist debates, theoretical, strategic or - often again - theoretical/strategic. The third is the attention given to foreign books and/or films. We will return to these matters after considering approach and style below.

4.2.3. Approach

I am not sure how appropriate my original typology is for a journal that is both clearly feminist and largely academic. The typology was, after all, inspired by reflection on past and present labour and socialist publications addressed - as such have been - to politics, economics or political-economy. It was also based on political publications, whether of a more theoretical or more popular type. Yet, Thirdworldist and Social-Democratic/Social-Reformist internationalisms do find expression in women's movements and publications. Indeed, they also clash there, as they have over international population policies. And one can find echoes of Marxist-Leninist internationalism both amongst academic and different 'popular' feminisms globally. Indeed, I think it makes more sense, in the Agenda case, to operate with a concept of 'populist internationalism', combining characteristics of Communism and Marxism-Leninism and generalising from them thus:

- Populist Internationalism: the relevant 'people' as the subject of progress, democracy, virtue and internationalism; the 'non-people' as conservative, authoritarian /hierarchical, evil or chauvinist/racist; and the speaker as a representative of the oppressed, a leader of them, or a possessor of truth.

The Social-Democratic/Social-Reformist internationalism common to global feminist writings, seems to be irrelevant, at least so far, in the semi-insurrectionary conditions of South Africa. A Democratic-Socialist internationalism, prioritising the working class, might seem to be irrelevant to this case but turns out not to be so. As for the New Social Movement/Civil Society approach, this concept was developed largely on the basis of reflection on the internationalism of second-wave feminism, and ought, therefore, to be relevant here.³² So, whilst admitting the possible limitations of the original typology, let us consider the listed types, qualified or combined as above. The categories would then be: Thirdworldist, Populist, Democratic-Socialist, New Social Movement/Civil Society.

A Thirdworldist internationalism can occasionally be found within Agenda, and is surely articulated by Black South African feminist, Bunie Sexwale, in her extensive criticism

Box 1: F/I+T/S contents of the 10

No. 1 (1987)

Dominated by theoretical items, with 22 pages on the meaning of feminism (Michelle Friedman, Jo Metelerkamp, Ros Posel), and a further five on androcentric knowledge (Michelle Friedman, Alison Wilks). But there is also a five-page review of a book on women in Northern Ireland, with at least implicit reference to South Africa.

No. 6 (1990)

Dominated by material on and around the First African Regional Meeting on Women and Health (Debby Bonnin). Since this took place in Uganda, space is given to a statement on the topic by Uganda's President, and an item on women and politics in that country as a possibly relevant model for South Africa (Barbara Klugman). No. 6 also has major reviews of books dealing with women and nationalism, women and development, and women's movements.

No. 7 (1990)

Has an item on childhood sexual abuse (Ann Levett) addressed to Western research on this (leading to a prolonged debate in succeeding issues), and items on women in Mozambique (book review) and Canada (Pat Horn).

No. 9 (1991)

Has nearly 20 pages of reviews of internationally-oriented books, and 16 pages on women and international conferences (Shireen Hassim, Francie Lund, Cristopher Ballantine, Kedibone Letlaka-Rennert, Debby Bonnin), plus one specifically on 'feminist conferencing' (Susan Bazilli).³³

No. 10, 'Women's Emancipation and National Liberation' (1991)

Has - exceptionally - 25-6 pages on women under (ex-)Socialist regimes (Maxine Molyneux on the Communist ones, Signe Arnfred on Mozambique), plus reviews of books on Russia and Nicaragua, and 13 pages on Women and Emancipation in South Africa and internationally (Pat Horn). The Mozambique item draws explicit lessons for South Africa, as does the emancipation piece. The other items are implicitly motivated by this concern.

‘most-international’ issues of Agenda

No. 11, ‘Sexual Politics’(1991)

Dominated by three Focus-relevant theoretical items, taking a total of 31 pages, one responding to Levett’s in No. 7 (Diana E.H. Russell), one on heterosexism (Louise Mina), one on violence against women (Mikki van Zyl).

No. 14, ‘Women and Southern Africa’ (1992)

Has two major Focus-relevant articles, one on structural adjustment (Julie Cliff), one on women in Mozambican popular songs (Estevao Filmao), amounting to 30 pages, plus reports on conferences about gender and development, gender and urbanisation, gender and popular education, gender and law (19-20 pages).

No. 19, ‘Difference’ (1993)

Has two theoretical items on the topic, totalling 26-27 pages (Jacky Sunde/Vivienne Bozalek, Catherine Campbell), and 12 pages on the Black US lesbian feminist writer Audre Lorde, two theoretical items, plus relevant shorts and reviews.

No. 22, ‘The Family in Question’ (1994)

Has a Focus-relevant 10-page article on psychology, gender and childhood (Erica Burman), and several shorter items, but also 16 pages on Black US writer, Toni Morrison, five on women and the world economy (Althea Macquene), and a further item on Beijing.

No. 23, ‘Body Politics’ (1994)

Has a Focus-relevant 16-page theoretical item (Robert W. Connell), seven pages on ‘gender training’ (Bunie Sexwale), another 11-page theoretical item on women and jokes (Wilhelm and Melanie Verwoerd), seven pages of film reviews, plus shorter items on the Self-Employed Women’s Association, India (Shafika Isaacs), and yet another Beijing item (Mavivi Manzini).

NB. All of these issues also carry brief items with news on forthcoming international conferences, and the book or film reviews are customarily on F/I items. Nos. 19-23 also carried the 2-page ‘Letter from London’, by Editorial Collective member Jo Beall, that had been run regularly since No.17.³⁴

of the international (i.e. Western) 'gender training' establishment.³⁵ Commenting on an Amsterdam workshop, Sexwale says:

Firstly, some of the women worked for funding organisations and pursued this interest in several hegemonic and patronising ways...that...were experienced and interpreted quite negatively by the Latin American, Caribbean, African, Asian and Pacific (LACAAP) women [...] Secondly...groups were divided according to continents [but some in the] North America and Europe...group raised an objection to the name. It was argued that...their work was international, therefore they called themselves 'the global' group [...] The obvious political insensitivity and supremacist assumptions of this label were left unchallenged but discussed in the corridors from then on. [...] Thirdly, reflecting common North/South relations, the North took this opportunity...to use women of the South as sources of data for their...missions and consultancies [...] One of the most disturbing aspects of dominant gender training is a complete disregard of the ethical questions which have been debated, negotiated and by now broadly established within the feminist movement and women's studies. (No. 23, 1994:59-61)

The occasional populist note is struck in the journal, as it is in the report by the Black South African feminist, Lumka Funani, on a US-Nigerian sponsored international conference. This was on 'Women in Africa and the African Diaspora: Bridges Across Activism and the Academy', and was held in Nsukka, Nigeria, 1992. Although the article is differently inflected at the end, the predominant voice is, I think, populist:

The question that tore the conference apart was 'Should white women present papers about black women's experiences?' This question was raised by an Afro--American. Before this question was addressed, the next question was asked, 'What do American women know about the struggle in Africa?' [...] Black American women who were in the majority at the conference...said 'No', white women must not read papers about black women's experiences. [...] It is legitimate and justifiable for only black women to protest for what we so broadly and confidently know about our suffering...[T]he thinking and reflecting subject is no other than the native herself. The colonist/white person cannot strike back with mere academic 'knowledge'. [...] ANC political philosophy imposed by the Euro-African woman, which is non-discriminatory, was supportive of the fact that white women should participate [...] All this bitterness arises from the poverty which is the fundamental result of the policy of apartheid and its discrimination of various kinds - economic, spiritual, educational, social, emotional... [...] We need our own space to explore our own realities, first, before we can make this space available to others. (No. 15, 1992:63-68. Emphasis in original)

An exceptional Democratic-Socialist position (here meaning one that favours a gender-sensitive labour internationalism but does not problematise gender relations) is articulated in an item on 'Women Workers and the World Economy', by Althea Macquene of the Cape-Town based International Labour Research and Information Group (ILRIG):

The attack of international capital on the poor and exploited has also been an attack on women and women workers worldwide. [...] The most glaring feature of this crisis is the rapid increase in poverty and the stark inequality between rich and poor people and rich and poor nations [...] The present conservative policies of world capitalism have undermined the gains made by women and their organisations. World capitalism can only be successfully fought by united action from the international working-class movements. But the struggle of the working class must also be a struggle against women's oppression. (No. 22, 1994:81-85)

How about the New Global Solidarity/Civil Society? Whilst it could be argued that this is the implicit undertone in the many Agenda articles concerned with facing up to power differences between women inter(nationally), and seeking for inter(national) relations between women that recognise and respect difference, it is not easy to find more explicit statements. In a theoretical item on violence against women, Mikki van Zyl uses the term 'Global Feminism' to characterise and identify with the work of German feminist Maria Mies:

Over the last few years feminists who were working with women and their struggles all over the world came to the conclusion that all the struggles were intertwined and that we had to try and paint a complete picture of them all [...] By looking at the international sexual division of labour, [Mies] shows how underneath the layers of relations of capitalist and socialist accumulation lie patriarchal relations which exploit women [...] Within her theory we...have an explanation which links the hitherto privatised experiences of women to a feminist analysis which applies equally to broad economic and political social structures [...] Global feminists...stress the need for...linking feminist demands on a variety of fronts. To achieve this we need the establishment of effective international networks of cooperation on issues... Although networking on a local level has long been part of many women's cultures, international feminist networks have developed since 1975... Since about 1987 there has been an increased call for global networking around violence against women, and the recognition that violence against women is a violation of human rights. (No. 11, 1991:71-72)

A related note is struck, briefly but significantly, in a general article about 'Feminist Conferencing' by Susan Bazilli:

[T]here is a real poverty of networks in Southern Africa when compared to Britain and North America [...] We need to be networking around, for, of and with women - activists, academics, politicians, structures, resources - locally, nationally, internationally. (No. 9, 1991:44-52)

If there is little explicit theorising about internationalism within Agenda, does it have a distinct style?

4.2.4. Style

Once again the question arises of the relevance of my typology (Rhetorical/Denunciatory, Agitational/Mobilisational, Informative/Analytical, Critical/Self-Reflexive) for a journal that is not simply feminist but also to a considerable extent academic. Whilst, however, the first two categories might seem more suited to 'popular' or 'political' publications, it must be remembered that Agenda is also a political publication.

The Rhetorical/Denunciatory style can, I think, be found, and not only in some of the more populist writings. Thus, Lumka Funani, in another contribution to the debate on the Nsukka Conference, replies to Fidela Fouché, using the following terms:

I, therefore, question the sincerity and intention of Fouché...opportunistic...mischievous and downright irresponsible...spurious arguments...brazen and ham-handed contempt...pathological response [...] sterile and tautologous [...] shockingly naive... (No. 17, 1993:55-57)

But, immediately following this item, there is this response by the same Fouché to a 'pro-pornography' piece in Agenda No. 16 by Canadian feminist Tracy Adlys:

Adlys's theme has little relevance to the broad South African context. At most, it expresses the (decadent?) sexual proclivities of a very small minority of privileged, leisured and reactionary middle class women. (No. 16, 1993:3)

More positively, the Rhetorical/Denunciatory style can be found at the end of an interview with Egyptian writer and feminist activist, Nawal el Saadawi:

[W]omen in South Africa have a cause which is against political, social and economic oppression as well as against gender oppression. We should unite - women in South Africa with Egyptian women, Palestinian women, African and Arab women - because women all over the world should be fighting the same cause. Because the main enemy against women in South Africa is the international political system and the exploitative and imperialist neo-colonial powers and multinationals. They are really keeping your government in power. They are the same powers that are keeping the Israeli government in power and who are helping our many national governments in Africa and the third world to oppress their people. So we have the same enemy; we are in the same boat so to speak, and we have to fight together. (No. 5, 1989:39)

Neither the negative nor the positive expression of this style is common in the journal. The second negative example above (by Fouché) is, however, not too distant from the personalised charges and counter-charges sometimes expressed in the prolonged international theoretical controversy over ways of understanding sexual violence against children (Nos. 7, 11, 12, 16, 17, 18). The amount of space devoted to this one international controversy in Agenda (a total of some 46-7 pages) justifies a consideration of its terms - which themselves became a matter of discussion within the journal (No. 17, 1993:2). In an otherwise balanced commentary on the debate, Liz Kelly comments on 'post-modernist' feminists in a manner clearly intended to include the South African responsible for the controversy:

White privileged women in the west have been drawn to post-modernism [also because t]he challenges to an unproblematic sisterhood amongst women demanded that we face what it meant to be part of both oppressed and oppressor groups. Many white feminists have given up involvement in the activist women's movement because the challenges we had to face hurt too much, and involved engaging directly with what it meant to give up power. Those who can, have withdrawn into a more academic/intellectual environment, and ideas about fragmented selves can become a way of escaping facing one's complicity in other forms of oppression. (No. 16, 1992:32)³⁶

The Agitational/Mobilisational voice is much more common in Agenda, as in one of five recommendations to be found at the end of an item on women and aids by Vicci Tallis:

- * We need to focus on the needs and concerns of women in all aspects of Aids - this includes women as caregivers, mothers and lovers. The focus of International Aids Day on 1st December 1990 is women - we need to organise activities for that day. (No. 19, 1991:9).

Similarly, a review of a book on global population and contraceptive policies ends with its author's list of (universal?) rights - which reviewer Barbara Klugman considers could provide a useful starting point for discussion in South Africa. This list, which is clearly intended to move readers to action, includes such items as:

- * The right to choose how to give birth, and to have control over the development and use of new reproductive technologies. [...]
- * The need for men to participate as equal partners in childbearing, housework, and birth control, so women no longer have to shoulder the 'double burden'. (No. 9, 1991:77)

The Informational/Analytical style is common enough, as might be expected, and hardly needs exemplification. Most of the many conference reports are in this mode. So are many of the numerous theoretical pieces, although - this being in part an academic journal - these pieces are often more abstract than 'Informational/Analytical' might suggest. Take this extract from an item on body and gender by Robert Connell:

The concept of body-reflexive practices allows a more exact definition of gender. Gender is a way in which social practice is ordered. In gender processes, the everyday conduct of life is organised in relation to a reproductive arena, defined by the bodily structures and processes of human reproduction. This arena is constituted by the materiality of bodies just mentioned. (No. 23, 1994:14)

Perhaps the most interesting examples of this style are the articles intended to give an overview of debates or positions, without pushing a particular interpretation. In so far as they present alternatives, they invite reflection or option (thus moving in the direction of our

next and last category). Here is the beginning of the keynote article, 'What is Feminism - and What Kind of Feminist am I?', by Michelle Friedman, Jo Metelerkamp and Ros Posel:

Stereotypes of feminists are almost as commonplace as stereotypes of women in general and certainly as unflattering [...] Even for those women who identify themselves as feminists or with feminist issues there is confusion over the debates that rage within feminism and the relationship between women's struggles and struggles against other forms of oppression and exploitation [...] This paper tries to make sense of these issues by examining in turn the five main categories of feminism which prevail today; namely 'liberal feminism', 'radical feminism', 'marxist feminism', 'socialist feminism' and 'feminism in the third world'. (No. 1, 1987:3)³⁷

What of the Critical/Self-Reflexive mode itself? This is much in evidence in the discussion about the conferences in which Black:White, Academic:Activist, and even Black American:Black African conflicts came to the fore. It was these conferences that eventually led to an Agenda workshop and special issue (No. 19) that dealt with both 'difference' and 'representation'. Here is an extract from one such piece by a Black American heterosexual woman (Amanda Kemp), reflecting on her own performance of the writings of Black American lesbian writer Audre Lorde:

The very act of representation involves at least two parties: that which represents and that which is re-presented. The two are not exactly the same. Even when I speak for myself I choose which me to present to you... I can never be you. I am always crossing to understand you, to translate what you say into my language, my experiences. [...] Dishonesty comes into the picture when we deny that we are crossing boundaries. When we expect a black woman from New York who has attended elite educational institutions all of her life to be the same as a black woman from Angola displaced by civil war, we are dishonest. [...] My performance of 'The Black Unicorn' was dishonest in the sense that I did not incorporate the journey, the boundary I was crossing, the privilege I had in crossing, in the show. (No. 19, 1993:28)

Although self-criticism, or revelation of vulnerability, can themselves be used to effect an insidious attack or to deflect reader criticism, the self-questioning here is not untypical of many contributions to this extended Agenda debate.

4.2.5. Discussion

The necessity of this section is due to the difference of Agenda from the labour and socialist publications, on the basis of which my typologies were largely developed. Let us consider such differences before further discussing the analysis above.

First, 'Agenda' as an academic journal. Many academic journals in the English-speaking Third World (here, again, including India, Nigeria, the Philippines) are incorporated into a global, or at least Anglo-Saxon, 'world of learning', hegemonised by the USA and UK (though increasingly including Canada, Australia). Legitimation of one's writing here depends less on explicit political/ideological positioning, social relevance,

accessibility to non-specialists, or even originality of analysis; it depends more on relationship to 'the literature', 'the discipline', as well as to required academic styles - and even detailed referencing and punctuation ones. Another distinct characteristic of this world is the role of the international conference. Indeed, the international conference represents, for academia, not only its conventional perquisite of office (most travel being funded by the academic institutions concerned), and mark of prestige (conference attendance, even without presentation of a paper, being customarily listed in the individual's curriculum vitae). It is also academia's ritual of global community. Agenda belongs, in part, to this world, having sought and obtained formal academic creditation³⁸ - , meaning professional recognition for South African academics publishing within it. This may also help to explain both the high proportion of T/S material amongst the F/I, and the high proportion of Global and First World reference in the T/S material.

Second, 'Agenda' as a feminist publication. This has a number of significant implications, marking a considerable difference even from a radical and innovatory labour journal. The first point here is that 'second wave' women's and feminist movements are not, in general, incorporated into structured and hierarchical national or international institutions and procedures.³⁹ Like other new social movements, furthermore, that of feminism is not directed to 'winning power' or 'controlling the commanding heights of the economy' in conventional political and/or economic terms. Whilst it evidently addresses itself to political domination and economic exploitation, feminism is primarily oriented toward the expansion and enrichment of civil society, nationally and globally.⁴⁰ In so far as the existence of a meaningful national democracy is increasingly recognised to require a surpassing of national, regional or bloc borders (Held 1991), it may be that the national:foreign or local:global distinction is likely to be challenged or blurred. The second point here is that the feminist movement does challenge the customary private:public and personal:political oppositions so necessary to the control of women. In so far as it insists that there must be an explicit and principled relationship between the personal and the political (increasingly extended to the professional), the politics of, and in, women's movements are likely to be personalised - at least in the sense of people being required to put their bodies where their mouths are. For feminist publications this may mean higher levels of emotion or personalisation - also at international level - than we are accustomed to from the old labour or, for that matter, the new ecological movements. It should also mean that such publications are under some pressure to develop what I have called the Critical/Self-Reflexive mode.

Having suggested some possible, or partial, explanations for the specific nature of F/I material in Agenda, let me address myself directly to the following features or issues: 1) the high proportion of space devoted to conferences, debates and reviews; 2) the 'invisibility' of F/I coverage in the journal; 3) the Critical/Self-Reflexive nature of Agenda as medium.

1. The domination of international (and, indeed, national) coverage by conferences, debates and book or film reviews is not only a matter of the more-academic nature of Agenda. It must also be, in part, due to the past isolation of South Africa and to the early stage of development of the feminist movement and women's studies in the country. In combination, these provide a powerful motive to dip into the rich source of experiences and ideas provided by the foreign and international women's movements. There are simply, at this moment, not that many South African women's or feminist conferences, debates, books or cultural performances! All this is in contrast with the local labour and socialist

movement. Why, however, these particular F/I activities? In her analysis of the global women's movement, Jessie Bernard (1987:Part 3) implicitly identifies its activities in terms of conferences, communication and campaigns. Agenda would seem to be heavily involved in the first two (at least if we stretch 'communication' to include debates and media) but only peripherally in the third.

2. There is no evidence that the 'invisibility' of F/I coverage in Agenda is due to any explicit awareness of globalisation - any kind of post-nationalism. It is probably due, rather, to a shared sense of community with women's movements and feminism globally, sharpened, perhaps, by the relative lack of such with other progressive movements locally. This is common to early feminist movements. But, in so far as this matter is not reflected upon, it could hypothetically disappear along with the development and institutionalisation of the women's movement nationally. This has been the case with most labour movements and publications, even if SALB is so far a partial exception.

3. I have earlier said that we should consider the Critical/Self-Reflexive style as a property not so much of the message as the medium. I think that Agenda contributes to an 'alternative public sphere' in interesting ways. This is best demonstrated by the overlapping discussions on 'feminist conferencing', 'difference' and 'representation'. These actually led to an Agenda workshop, intended precisely to reach women activists beyond the editorial, authorial and readership constituencies (see Agenda 19, 1993). This particular conference involved unionists, rural organisers, academics, a poet, and one of the (foreign?) funders. It was, in fact, one of a series of workshops and panels organised by the journal, occasionally involving foreign visitors.⁴¹ However, I think it is the previously cited item on feminist conferencing by Susan Bazilli (No. 9, 1991:44-52) that best reveals the platform function of Agenda and the way this can allow for the open and constructive discussion of issues relevant to a culture of solidarity, national or international. The paper deals, amongst other issues, with the following: 1) allowing for those who feel the need to 'speak bitterness' but avoiding polarisation; 2) organising events not dependent on the capacity to write papers; 3) avoiding territorial and competitive claims with respect to the struggle and knowledge; 4) ensuring outreach to those unable to attend; 5) attending to the (differentiated) gender politics of conference place, space, financing, time, paper or presentation accessibility, language; 6) recognition that preparatory 'networking' can exclude as well as include; and, finally, 7) avoiding formation of an elite of 'conference goers'. This critique of the conference form not only breaks with the dominant academic paradigm mentioned earlier but also with that of that of the subaltern one, as customarily exemplified within the labour movement. It shows, moreover, an implicit awareness of the significance of communicative form in the emancipatory process, even when it does not name such.⁴² The only question remaining here is of whether one can provide an effective platform for the development of a global solidarity culture when communication remains transparent and the international invisible.

5. CONCLUSION: TOWARD A GLOBAL SOLIDARITY CULTURE PROJECT

We are now back with both the general and the particular arguments raised in the Introduction (1.2). There I set out propositions concerning alternative communication and a global solidarity culture. Amongst other things I argued: 1) that the progressive professional, technical, administrative and cultural categories can play an important role in advancing such a project; 2) that any alternative culture and communication project must also be present in both the dominant and popular cultural spaces; 3) that alternative culture and communication must be understood as part of the new global social movements; 4) that active participation in such a project requires a) interaction between sender and receiver, b) messages furthering interaction between the population and the professionals, c) accessibility of both form and content to the masses, d) public access to both production and distribution processes, e) participation in communication education structures, f) a public capable of criticising and correcting the media.

In relation to both our journals and our projects (Part 2.3), it is the categories in Point 1 above that I am addressing. What may be still lacking amongst such people in the South African case are, first, any sense of being involved in a common project and, consequently, any systematic collaboration between them (for which see further below).⁴³ As far as Point 2 is concerned, we must recognise that such alternative global communication or cultural projects as there might be in South Africa are largely confined to the margins and do not operate on the terrain of dominant or popular culture. With respect to Point 3, we can certainly see the relationship between the international communication/culture projects and the new social movements, both in South Africa and more widely. This is not simply a matter of such influence as SALB's international coverage may have within the international trade union movement, nor of the manner in which Agenda seems to share in its international movement as spontaneously as it does in the national one. It is also a matter of the contribution that South African labour activists may be making to create a unique new trans-oceanic labour culture.

This leaves us with Point 4. It must be evident that however important such journals as SALB and Agenda are, they hardly fulfil - could hardly ever be imagined to fulfil - criteria a) to f). This is not simply a matter of the educational level of the South African population: one can assume this will rise rapidly over the next decade. It is also, obviously, because a primary address to reading and reason hardly exhausts existing cultural practices or fulfils growing cultural needs. The rapid current development of electronic audio-visual media globally, moreover, is having dramatic effects both on social 'mediators' and on forms of social protest. Thus, in Latin America, one observer has noted that the professionals of the written word are losing influence relative to those of the projected image (Franco 1994).⁴⁴ And another has pointed out the shift in form of public protest expression represented by the street demonstrations of caras pintadas (painted faces) that helped bring down Brazilian President Collor in 1992 (Vandresen 1993).⁴⁵ These new forms are accessible to more people and thus lend themselves better to a participatory culture and to a cross-cultural one. The future role of the journals, as media of internationalism, must therefore be increasingly evaluated in terms of the service they provide to the other media forms mentioned in Part 2.3 and the international media and culture projects in Part 2.4. I would thus argue that it is in the interest of the internationalist journals to sponsor or join some kind of coordinated network that could allow for discussion both up and down the new

social movements and between them. In so far as these journals may have considered themselves, or even been considered more widely, as being at the centre of alternative national or international communication, they may now find themselves being shifted to the periphery. Whether or not they consider this a threat or an opportunity will depend on whether or not they share the evaluation of Jean Franco. Talking of this displacement of the literary intelligentsia in Latin America, she notes the

tectonic shift from apostlehood to the nomadic margins - which is certainly appropriate in the era of Benetton internationalism and e-mail universalism. The conclusion is not as paradoxical as it seems. In the age of global flows and networks, the small scale and the local are the places of greatest intensity. (Franco 1994:21)

One last point. The journals and projects analysed are likely to be seen, both by their promoters and by those they reach, as a means to an organisational end. I want to argue again, in the light of the Introduction, that they must today be analysed primarily in communication/cultural terms. That means seeing them as creators of internationalist meaning and feeling, with this being understood as itself a source of power. This does not mean that organisation and action are today redundant. It means that they will be energised and renewed - and repeatedly challenged - by the force of information, ideas, sounds and images.

The final conclusion of this paper can therefore be found even before the Introduction. If a person is a person because of other people, then a people becomes a people because of other peoples. This is not the same as the mutual recognition of states, institutions or corporations, in either the Old or Renewed World Order. Those relationships are based on attack and defence, competition and fear, greed and envy, patronage and clientage, superordination and subordination. The international relations of the dominant are at best based on the recognition of enlightened mutual self-interest - but always against some non-self - the excluded, exploited, marginalised-yet-threatening Other. In this study we have been talking of mutual recognitions that are indications of concern, tokens of respect, expressions of liking, inspired by concerns for equality, justice, solidarity and a humane and sustainable world civilisation.

Today, globally, the advancement of this project will require an increasing number of mirrors in which we see you see us; in which you see us see you.

ENDNOTES

1. From Inside, Staffrider Series, No. 21. Ravan Press, Johannesburg. 1983. Thanks to Jeremy Cronin and Ravan Press for permission to reproduce this poem.
2. There are also more practical reasons for my choice here. One is simply the promise I made to both myself and those South Africans who helped me, that I would complete something before leaving the country. The other is that whilst I had intended to make a whole paper out of what is now only Parts 2.3-2.4, I collected a wide range of alternative magazines and then inevitably began reading and analyzing them. I hope to return to the other material and the original idea at the length they deserve on another occasion.
3. Some exceptions occur to me: a) the Jewish joke, carried by the ever-wandering Jew in an always anti-semitic world; b) the anti-communist joke, possibly reproduced rather than transported, due to the identical authoritarianism, rigidity and po-faced nature of would-be omnipotent regimes), c) rock and other such musical genres, transported by either the dominant media or alternative artists, and infinitely adaptable to local uses, including those of cultural or political protest (Garofalo 1992).
4. For relevant background literature on South Africa see the Classified Bibliography.
5. Fiona Dove, former editor of Shopsteward in Johannesburg, has put it to me that a sense of international solidarity in South Africa is neither as wide or deep as this point may suggest. I am prepared to accept this. But my feeling is that it is probably wider and deeper here than in most other countries I can think of! The fact is, however, that we don't really know, for either South Africa or anywhere else, unless and until the matter is researched. This was one of the three other kinds of research I proposed to carry out whilst in South Africa and which I had to put back on the shelf in order to pursue the fourth one.
6. English is the home language of only nine percent of the South African population, compared with, for example, Afrikaans at 15 percent, and Zulu at 22 percent (Trade Union Research Project 1994:7). However, amongst shop-stewards, whilst 20 percent do not read English at all, it is the common reading language of 56 percent (Pityana and Orkin 1992:45).
7. In addition to items referred to directly above and below, or to be found in the Classified Bibliography, one must highlight the series of surveys done by CASE, summarised in Castro, Everatt and Orkin (1994). I received this last item, unfortunately, only after completing my study. A separate CASE study, of the feminist journal, Agenda, not only provides detailed insight into that journal, with relevant insights into other such, but, as we will see, also implicitly suggests a an interesting multi-methods approach to such evaluations (Budlender 1994). Meanwhile, Colleen du Toit (1994) makes a convincing plea for continued foreign donor support to information-oriented NGO activities.

8. What neither the chart of Budlender nor my own analysis reveals is the extent or nature of the financial dependence on the foreign funding agencies. A full analysis of these publications, in terms of international solidarity, would require a detailed analysis of this quite fundamental relationship. It is to be hoped that the work of Nina Shand, an experienced journalist doing a Master's thesis within the Sociology of Work Programme at the University of Witwatersrand, on the labour relations and organisation of the IMG group, will also deal with this matter.
9. I follow what I understand as South African convention in using racial categories which have racist undertones or even overtones: white, African, Coloured, Indian, Black (all non-white).
10. There is a problem in relying on this source, as with the surveys it summarises. As both the surveys and the final report point out, they were largely dependent on questionnaires inserted in the magazines and therefore biased toward the more educated, experienced and motivated readers. Speak even offered a tee-shirt as incentive. In cases of group discussions and interview research, the publication staff actually recruited respondents. If these biases must be accounted for (but how?) in the original readership surveys, one meets further problems in the final (i.e. secondary) report. As the subtitle makes clear, this only covers 'selected publications associated with' the IMG. It thus signally excludes the two labour publications, SALB and Shopsteward. Yet reference is often made to the IMG group as a whole, as well as to a qualitative CASE survey of SALB itself. Furthermore, the orientation of the IMG studies seems to have been toward marketing and - at least implicitly - finance and subsidies. This means that the problem of which media are appropriate for alternative communication in South Africa cannot be considered, any more than that of appropriate content (except in terms of reader preferences). The question must be asked whether - given the collapse of the IMG group even before the final report - the surveys were not a matter of throwing more money and effort in the wrong direction. It is, in any case, clear that we need a study of the IMG group in terms of alternative media theory and practice. This would seem a better way to honour the deceased publications than mourning their loss (Holdt 1994, Vick 1994b).
11. For experience and opinion on alternative labour computer projects in South Africa, see Adler 1992 and Miller 1992. Taffy Adler, then with WorkNet, the major South African NGO and social movement computer network also expressed himself forcefully on foreign funding. Conversation with him in 1992, and with three or four alternative computer specialists since then, suggest that his remarks referred to or included the COSATU project:

WorkNet's experience here, which has intensified as we have looked to a more sophisticated system, will form a chapter in the literature on under-development and neocolonialism. We have had to negotiate our way around donor requirements which in addition to ensuring that some of the money is tied to non-South African administrative support groups, or non-South African hardware and software suppliers, have also sometimes left us with debts incurred on the delayed and often very overdue transfer of funds. We have also had to deal with donor

appointed system consultants who are both unfamiliar with the conditions I have described previously and arrogant in their refusal to accommodate them in their proposals. Such people are responsible for state of the art hardware and software languishing in offices around the country. Finally we have had to deal with the failure of foreign based consultants to honour system design and implementation programmes. This failure not only impacted on the technical capacity of WorkNet, but also on our user base who have grown quite sceptical about our ability to deliver what we promised at the time and in the form we promised it. These are the burdens and challenges of running a democratic network in a 'developing country'. (Adler 1992)

12. These may also exist for the women's movement, or develop during the 1995 Beijing Conference process. They probably operate within or around the human rights, ecological, civics (urban residential), church and other such movements. An identification and analysis of all such projects would be more than worthwhile but would evidently take more time than I had available.
13. Only some seven percent, according to my calculations.
14. The major source for this account is ILRIG's latest annual project report (International Labour Resource and Information Group 1994b).
15. I am here speaking of the project as a whole rather than of Workers' World in particular, since the latter did have a high ideological profile.
16. For more on or from these conferences see Lambert 1992, Sitas 1994, Workers Unity 1994. This section has also benefited from my conversations with Ari Sitas in Durban on his return from the Third IORTUC, December 1994. The IORTUC is an Australia-based initiative with strong South African connections. A key figure in Australia has been Rob Lambert, an academic labour specialist who earlier worked with the unions and SALB in South Africa. The conference thus comes out of the well-established internationalism of the South African unions and the growing recognition by Australian ones of the dangers of globalisation. The conference cuts across traditional ideological tendencies and political affiliations in the region, thus providing a place within which the more-radical or more-democratic unions (the terms do not necessarily coincide) can meet at a level much closer to the shopfloor than previously.
17. A note of caution is in order here also since radical media monitoring in South Africa has been heavily criticised for methodological weaknesses (Tomaselli 1994).
18. We have an embarrassment of riches here. There exist, firstly, both published and unpublished indices for SALB, the first covering 1974-85 (South African Labour Bulletin 1986), the second a computerised one covering 1974-91 (details available from SALB on request). Accounts of SALB, by co-founder Eddie Webster, are to be found in an edited selection drawn from the first ten years (Webster 1986) and in the 20th anniversary issue (Webster 1994). Surveys dealing with SALB directly or indirectly include Community Agency for Social Research 1994 and Castro, Everatt

and Orkin, Murphy 1994, Pityana and Orkin 1992, and South African Labour Bulletin 1994.

19. It has, however, also received money, directly or indirectly, from at least one major foreign union source, the Dutch FNV. In its annual report for 1993 (Federatie Nederlandse Vakbeweging 1994:56), this declared:

Umanyano Publications is a publisher of trade union publications that produces the South African Labour Bulletin and the COSATU activists' paper. The [Dutch funding] project is meant to support the managerial capacity of the publisher. It is the intention that, by increasing the number of publications, by greater efficiency and by an improved distribution system, it will be possible to operate independently within three years. At the same time the organisation will attempt to meet the growing need of the trade union movement for publications and support in the media field. (My translation)

The financial contribution was Dfl.111,150, some R.55,575, approximately US\$15,400.

20. The above information was faxed by SALB, January-February 1995.
21. A computerised index must be considered a very useful aid to, but no real substitute for, detailed and direct content analysis. One is, firstly, dependent on the technical sophistication of the database programme employed, which may or may not allow for manipulation of data in ways not intended by those who created the index. Secondly, one is dependent on the keywords employed by the designer of the index. This particular index classified some items as 'international', but this category did not, for example, cover all items primarily about South Africa but having significant international content or relevance. One is, finally, dependent on the rigour of the database creators in avoiding double entries, errors in dating or volumes. Although the SALB index seemed to me a rather professional one, and of high value to libraries and other resource centres, I found minor problems in a number of areas. I proceeded as follows. Firstly, in my keyword search, I added to 'international' and 'foreign' the names of countries and regions, 'socialism', 'communism', 'social democracy'. Then I transferred the selected items from the database to Word Perfect, keyed and sorted them by volume and issue number, removed the duplicates I had created, and spot-checked the resulting index against my (incomplete) set of SALB. The procedure is adequate for giving a distinct impression of F/I content over the 20-year period, and it was certainly much more economical than producing my own index.
22. No sooner had I written this than I received an issue of Quadernos Laborales with two articles, totalling four pages, on international issues. It is too early to ascertain whether this is an exception or whether its publishers have finally become aware of the significance of globalisation and the international labour movement!

23. Joe Slovo continued to reflect on the relationship between the SACP and the Soviet Union until just before his death in early-January 1995 (Niekerk 1994).
24. The justification for the more extensive treatment of this publication lies in its being, to the best of my knowledge, the first such analysis of a feminist publication.
25. The main source for this is an evaluation for the Dutch funding agency, HIVOS (Budlender 1994). Debbie Budlender's report provides a sophisticated multi-methods model for the evaluation of alternative publications (it could be fruitfully used in self-evaluation also). It deserves consideration and possible replication elsewhere, which would make systematic comparative analysis possible. The report covers: the publication itself (including aim, readership, planning, impact and income); an organisational analysis; relationship with the South and Southern African context; relationship with the funder; conclusions and recommendations. Whilst this might be a conventional rubric, the methods employed are diverse and appropriate. Budlender used the following: extensive interviews with 20 of 26 past and present collective members; 30 phone or personal interviews with over 30 women from NGO, academic, publishing and political communities; visits to 16 stockists of Agenda in Durban, Johannesburg and Cape Town; construction of a database index of the first 22 issues, with keywords, analysed according to contributor characteristics, type of material and content; another database of collective members, recent referees and Agenda workshop participants; a two-page questionnaire answered by six other alternative publications for comparative purposes (see **Table 1** earlier); a questionnaire to all South African universities concerning gender programmes and policies; examination of documents held by the magazine; checking of relevant publications for references to articles in Agenda. Useful additional light on Agenda is thrown by the account of long-time Coordinator, Susan Holland-Muter (1944), particularly with respect to the problems of the Editorial Collective.
26. A point I owe to Debbie Budlender (Email 10.1.95).
27. If not self-aware, Agenda has been made aware by national and international conferences and workshops, some to be referred to below. It has, additionally, been subject to direct criticism by such writers as Kedibone Letlaka-Rennert 1991(?). For general criticism or self-criticism of the feminist movement in South Africa, see Hassim and Walker (1993) and Lewis (1993). Both of these items make direct reference to the 1991 Conference on Women and Gender in Southern Africa, held at the University of Natal, Durban.
28. Conversation with the Peruvian feminist, Gina Vargas, Latin American Convenor of the NGO Forum for the 1995 Beijing UN Women's Conference, Durban, October 1994.
29. Conversations with a number of Durban and Johannesburg feminists, October 1994.
30. Thus, the evaluation by Debbie Budlender, using very narrow criteria, only records four percent as 'International' (Budlender 1994:11). And whilst survey material suggests readers have no great interest in the 'international', neither do they seem to have any particular objections to what, by my calculation, represents between one-

quarter and one-third of their journal. This invisibility, or transparency, of the international is a matter I will have to return to below. In the meantime, Debbie Budlender has commented on my argument here that

for many people, particularly within feminism, the international links are not unproblematic. They raise the whole question of the imposition and/or appropriateness of western feminism, rather than the development of a more indigenous one' (Email 10.1.95).

31. I did this analysis after constructing **Table 3**. It was done by a rough calculation rather than by the construction of the kind of database available for SALB. Due to doing two separate analyses, the figures for the second do not precisely match those for the first. The proportions match, however, well enough, thus giving me the confidence to present them to the reader (though not in tabular form). I have, since writing this, been given access to Debbie Budlender's database for articles in Agenda. This is a useful tool and provides a base for more rigorous and sophisticated analysis in the future.
32. For further evidence and argument here see Waterman (1993).
33. Debbie Budlender implies that my definition of 'international' may be as over-broad as hers (Budlender 1994) was over-narrow:

Thus, for example, Lund, Ballantine etc were writing about a Conference of Women and Gender in Southern Africa. Although it professed to be Southern, it was in fact overwhelmingly South African-based. (Email 10.1.95)

Since neither of us has any motive for either under- or over-estimating, it seems to me that what is at stake are - in order of importance - overall purpose, general criteria and interpretation of the particular. My overall purpose would be a comparison with the Labour Bulletin, the dramatic difference in proportions being hardly disputable. My general criteria have been spelled out. I could therefore accept her point on this particular case (or a number of others) without, I think, the argument being seriously affected.

34. Both the earlier-mentioned reports on Agenda revealed the unpopularity of this feature amongst readers, and it has been consequently abandoned. 'Support for my theory of our general self-centredness?' asks Budlender (Email 10.1.95). I think not. Jo Beall's page read more like a personal circular letter to friends than something addressed to Agenda readers.
35. 'Gender Training' is a methodology for sensitising and qualifying those working in organisations or projects concerned with 'gender and development'.
36. Disparagement of an argument's author is, of course, common enough in dominant academic discourse, national or international, male or female. This rhetorical device is called ad hominem, not quite appropriate here, perhaps, since it means attacking not the argument but the man.

37. Debbie Budlender (Email 10.1.95) feels that this item is less even-handed than I might have suggested, there being an 'evolutionary feel to the way the theories are presented'.
38. Budlender (Email 10.1.95).
39. There is, for example, in South Africa, no women's equivalent of COSATU, of South Africa's old or new labour laws, or of institutionalised collective bargaining. Nor is there, at international level, an International Confederation of Free Women's Unions, or an International Gender Organisation. Such structures and procedures may have existed in some form in the past (e.g. the Communist-controlled Women's International Democratic Federation) and may, of course, again do so in the future. Thus, there is in South Africa a women's wing of the ANC, a Women's National Coalition, and networks organised around such issues as health. There has also been extensive and energetic campaigning around the UN's 1995 women's conference in Beijing. It is, however, significant that - the ANC excepted - the words used are precisely those of 'coalition' and 'network'. And that the woman responsible for coordinating the South African contribution to the NGO Forum in Beijing publicly insists that her task is information, advice and coordination, rather than organisation, distribution of funding and decision-taking (observation at regional and national meetings on the Beijing Conference, Durban and Roodepoort, October 1994).
40. This statement applies, I think, to liberal feminisms (e.g. Bernard 1987) as well as to the more radical varieties.
41. Although Budlender (1994) and Holland-Muter (1994) give differing accounts of the viability of these.
42. The general unconsciousness of itself as a communicative form is recognised by Holland-Muter (1994):

Agenda was more concerned with its role in transforming society, and raising debates within the women's movement(s), than...with itself as a media project...This has partly to do with the members of the collective not having a media background...Only one or two women in the collective had any hard media skills, which were not always easy to transfer during the time available.
43. It would, however, be interesting to find out to what extent there was influence and exchange on foreign and international coverage between SALB and Shopsteward (which were produced for a year or two in the same office), and between Agenda and Speak (which were produced in separate cities but between which there were many contacts).
44. As Jean Franco (1994:17) puts it:

a high level of literacy is no longer the inevitable stepladder to modernity. Music and the television image, rather than the printed word, have become the privileged vehicles for the exploration of Latin American identity and the nature of modernity.

45. Monique Vandresen (1993:33) says:

Where the movement of 1968 was literary, the new is televisive [sic] and musical. Their sayings don't come from Che or Fidel, they don't know who Sartre is - they come from rock and roll songs and advertisements.

BIBLIOGRAPHY, CLASSIFIED AND GENERAL

This bibliography extends beyond the references to include related materials, mostly dealing with internationalism and with alternative or popular communication. I am not aware of existing bibliographies or document collections on these particular areas, so this element may be useful to other researchers. Many, but not all, of the mentioned items are in my own collection of documents, along with extensive (but incomplete) collections of the Independent Media Group's and related periodicals, covering the 'transition period' (sometimes much longer). I would appreciate hearing from anyone else interested in developing bibliography and documentation on internationalism and alternative international communication in relation to South Africa.

Classified bibliography

1. General political (including Left and Socialism): Adam and Moodley 1993, Holdt 1994, Murray 1994, Theoria 1992, Work in Progress 1993.

2. Globalisation: Saul 1994, Sitas 1994.

4. Ideological hegemony or dominant discourses: Louw 1994a and 1994b. Muller and Cloete 1992, Sitas 1993.

3. Internationalism: Adam and Moodley 1993, Beerends 1993, Braam 1992, Cohen 1979, Danaher 1989, Edgar 1983, Federation of South African Trade Unions 1983 and 1984, Fine and Welch 1982 Gelderen 1981, International Confederation of Free Trade Unions 1974, Johns 1975, Kaarsholm 1988, Lambert 1992, Love 1985, MacShane, Plaut and Ward 1984, Minty 1982, National Union of Namibian Workers/Confederation of South African Trade Unions 1989, National Union of Metalworkers of South Africa 1992, Orkin 1989, Ruskin Students Association 1975, Saskatoon Solidarity Committee 1981, Saunders 1989, Sitas 1994, South African Congress of Trade Unions 1976 and 1981, South African Labour Education Project 1985, Southall Forthcoming, Shepherd 1977, Steinhart 1988, Stephen 1994, Stillman 1993, Trades Union Congress 1974(?), Tsuzuki 1991, United Democratic Front 1985, Webster 1984, Wickins 1978, Willets 1982.

5. Popular or alternative communication and culture: Adler 1992, Berger 1992 and 1993, Bonnin and Sitas 1990, Castro, Everatt and Orkin 1994, Chetty 1988a and 1988b, Coetze and Poley 1990, Culture and Working Life 1991, Development Dialogue 1989, Erlmann 1994, Film and Allied Workers Organisation 1994, Forest and Pearce 1994, Gorfinkel 1992, Gunner 1994, Hannerz 1994, Ishmael 1994, Jackson 1993, Kotze 1988a and 1988b, Louw 1992, Louw and Tomaselli 1991b, Magill 1992, Media Development 1985, Miller 1992, Moss 1990, Naughton 1994, Nuttal Forthcoming, Phelan 1987, Rama and Louw 1993, Sitas Forthcoming, Tomaselli and Louw 1989 and 1991, Tugwana 1989, Vick 1994a, Wessels 1989).

6. Urbanised and unionised working class: Adler and Webster 1994, Baskin 1994, Crompton and Erwin 1991, Desai and Habib 1994, Maree 1993, Munck 1993, Pityana and Orkin 1992, Webster and Ginsberg 1994).

7. Women's movement, studies, culture and media: Hassim and Walker 1993, Lewis 1993, Kotze 1988b, Lloyd 1994, Nuttal 1994, Speak 1994.

General bibliography

Adam, Heribert and Kogila Moodley. 1993. The Negotiated Revolution: Society and Politics in Post-Apartheid South Africa. Johannesburg: Jonathon Ball. 277 pp.

Adler, Glen and Eddie Webster. 1994. 'Challenging Transition Theory: The Labour Movement, Radical reform, and Transition to Democracy in South Africa'. (Paper for International Sociological Association Congress, Bielefeld, Germany, 18-23 July 1994). 30 pp.

Adler, Taffy. 1992. 'Democratic Electronic Networks: The WorkNet Experience in South Africa'. Paper for Conference on Information Technology, Electronic Communications and the Labour Movement, GMB College, Manchester, April 14-16. 5 pp.

Baskin, Jeremy (ed). 1994. Unions in Transition: COSATU at the Dawn of Democracy. Johannesburg: NALEDI. 88 pp.

Beerends, Hans. 1993. 'De Zuidelijk Afrika Beweging' (The Southern Africa Movement), in Beerends, Hans, De Derde Wereld Beweging: Geschiedenis en Toekomst. Utrecht: Jan van Arkel. Pp. 177-200

Berger, Guy. 1992. 'The Promise of the Present Press: Scenarios for the 90s'. Unpublished (Paper to Media and Democracy Seminar, Grahamstown, South Africa, April 10).

Berger, Guy. 1993. 'The Alternative Press'. Unpublished (Address to Rhodes University Winter School, Grahamstown, South Africa).

Bernard, Jessie. 1987. The Female World from a Global Perspective. Bloomington: Indiana University Press. 287 pp.

Bonnin, Debbie and Ari Sitas. 1990. 'The Struggle over Leisure: Durban Workers, Culture and Education', South African Labour Bulletin, Vol. 15, No. 2, pp. 61-64.

Braam, Conny. 1992. Operatie Vula: Zuidafrikanen en Nederlanders in de strijd tegen apartheid (Operation Vula: South Africans and Netherlands in the Anti-Apartheid Struggle). Amsterdam: Meulenhoff. 312 pp.

Brecher, Jeremy and Tim Costello. 1994. Global Village or Global Pillage: Economic Reconstruction from the Bottom Up. Boston: South End. 237 pp.

- Budlender, Debbie. 1994. '"Agenda": Evaluation Report: October 1994'. Unpublished (Prepared for the Dutch Humanist development agency, Hivos). 52 pp.
- Campaign for Post-Apartheid TV. 1993(?). Building a National Picture. N.A.: N.A. 4 pp.
- Cason, Jim. 1994. 'US Policy Toward Post-Apartheid South Africa', Peace and Democracy News, Vol. 7, No. 3, Winter 1993/4, pp. 1, 22-23.
- Castro, Joan de, David Everatt and Mark Orkin. 1994. Surviving the Transition: Alternative Media and Reading Culture in the New South Africa. Johannesburg: Community Agency for Social Enquiry. 28 pp.
- Chetty, Ansuya. 1988. 'The "Sowetan" and "New Nation" - 1 January 1987 to 31 December 1987: A Content Analysis and Comparison'. Unpublished (Contemporary Cultural Studies Unit, University of Natal, Durban). 39 pp.
- Chetty, Ansuya. 1988. '"New Nation": Unmasking TFP's [Tradition, Family, Property's] Media Manoeuvre'. Unpublished (Contemporary Cultural Studies Unit, University of Durban, Natal. 38 pp.
- Coetzee, Ampie (ed) and James (ed) Polley. 1990. Crossing Borders: Writers Meet the ANC. Bramley: Taurus. 207 pp.
- Cohen, Robin. 1979. 'Introduction', in Nzula, A.T. & Potekhin, I.I. & Zusmanovich, A.Z, Forced Labour in Colonial Africa. London: Z Press. Pp. 1-19
- Community Agency for Social Enquiry. 1994. 'The "South African Labour Bulletin" in Transition: Reconciling Different Readers' Interests. A Qualitative Research Study of Corporate Sector Subscribers and Policy-Makers'. Unpublished (Community Agency for Social Enquiry, Johannesburg). 26 pp.
- Confederation of South African Trade Unions. 1994. Breaking Boundaries: Building an International Workers' Movement. Johannesburg: Umanyano Publications. 32 pp.
- Crompton, Rod and Alec Erwin. 1991. 'Labour and the Environment', in Cock, Jacklyn (ed) & Koch, Eddie (ed), Going Green: People, Politics and the Environment in South Africa. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Pp. 78-91
- Culture and Working Life Project. 1991. 'Bring Culture to the Factories!', South African Labour Bulletin, Vol. 15, No. 6, pp. 66-67.
- Danaher, Kevin. 1989. 'The US Struggle over Sanctions against South Africa', in Orkin, Mark (ed), Sanctions against Apartheid. Cape Town: David Philip. Pp. 131-141
- Data Research Africa. 1994. 'Agenda Research Survey: Volume 1'. Durban: Data Research Africa.

- Deep Dish. 1986. Deep Dish Directory: A Resource Guide for Grass Roots Television Producers, Programmers, Activists and Cultural Workers. New York: Paper Tiger Television. 98 pp.
- Desai, Ashwin and Adam Habib. 1994. 'Social Movements in Transitional Societies: A Case Study of the Congress of South African Trade Unions'. Unpublished (Sociology Department, University of Durban Westville, Durban). 42 pp.
- Development Dialogue. 1989. 'The Right to Inform and Be Informed: Another Development and the Media', Development Dialogue (Special Issue), No. 2,
- Edgar, Robert. 1983. 'Notes on the Life and Death of Albert Nzula', International Journal of African Historical Studies, Vol. 16, No. 4,
- Erlmann, Veit. 1994. 'Africa Civilised, Africa Uncivilised: Local Culture, World System and South African Music', Journal of Southern African Studies, Vol. 20, No. 2, pp. 165-180.
- Federatie Nederlandse Vakbeweging. 1994. Wij en Zij: Jaarverslag 1993 (We and They: Annual Report 1993). Amsterdam: Federatie Nederlandse Vakbeweging. 75 pp.
- Federation of South African Trade Unions. 1983. 'South Africa: Unionism, Nationalism and International Working-Class Struggle', Newsletter of International Labour Studies, No. 17, pp. 10-17.
- Federation of South African Trade Unions. 1984. International Policy Statement. Durban: Federation of South African Trade Unions. 12 pp.
- Film and Allied Workers Organisation. 1994. Rough Cut: Perspectives on the State of Film, Video and Broadcasting in South Africa. Fereirasdorp: Food and Allied Workers Union. 34 pp.
- Fine, Bob and Lawrence Welch. 1982. A Question of Solidarity: Independent Trade Unions in South Africa. London: Socialist Forum for Southern African Solidarity. 44 pp.
- Forrest, Drew and Justin Pearce. 1994. 'Alternative Press Drowns in Red Ink', Weekly Mail and Guardian (Johannesburg), 11-17 November, pp. 8.
- Franco, Jean. 1994. 'What's Left of the Intelligentsia? The Uncertain Future of the Printed Word', NACLA Report on the Americas, Vol. 28, No. 2, September/October, pp. 16-21.
- Garofalo, Reebee. 1992. Rockin' the Boat: Mass Music and Mass Movements. Boston: South End Press. 333 pp.
- Gelderen, C. van. 1981. 'Review of A. Nzula', Critique, No. 14.

- Gillwald, Alison. 1993. 'The Public Sphere, The Media and Democracy', Transformation (University of Natal, Durban), No. 21, pp. 65-77.
- Girard, Bruce (ed). 1992. A Passion for Radio: Radio Waves and Community. Montreal: Black Rose. 212 pp.
- Gorfinkel, Edric. 1992. 'When There is no Radio', in Girard, Bruce (ed), A Passion for Radio. Montreal: Black Rose. Pp. 201-212
- Gramsci, Antonio. 1983. 'National-Popular Literature, the Popular Novel and Observations on Folk-Lore', in Mattelart, Armand (ed) & Siegelau, Seth (ed), Communication and Class Struggle: 2. Liberation, Socialism. New York: International General. Pp. 71-75
- Gunner, Liz (ed). 1994. Politics and Performance: Theatre, Poetry and Song in Southern Africa. Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press.
- Hamelink, Cees. 1994. 'People's Communication Charter', in Hamelink, Cees, Trends in World Communication: On Disempowerment and Self-Empowerment. Penang: Southbound/Third World Network. Pp. 151-161
- Hamelink, Cees. 1994. Trends in World Communication: On Disempowerment and Self-Empowerment. Penang: Southbound/Third World Network. 168 pp.
- Hannerz, Ulf. 1994. 'Sophiatown: The View from Afar', Journal of Southern African Studies, Vol. 20, No. 2, pp. 181-194.
- Hassim, Shireen and Cheryl Walker. 1993. 'Women's Studies and the Women's Movement in South Africa: Defining a Relationship', Women's Studies International Forum, Vol. 16, No. 5, September-October, pp. 523-534.
- Held, David. 1991. 'Democracy, the Nation-State and the Global System', Economy and Society, Vol. 20, No. 2, May, pp. 138-172.
- Holdt, Karl von. 1994. 'Socialist Conference: Finding Direction of Losing Direction?', South African Labour Bulletin, Vol. 18, No. 6, December, pp. 55-60.
- Holland-Muter, Susan. 1994. 'Making Use of the Alternative Communication Model:...A Critical Study of "Agenda: A Journal about Women and Society"'. Unpublished (Term Paper, Institute of Social Studies, The Hague). 9 pp.
- Inoue, Cristina. 1994. 'Computer Mediated Communication and Non-Governmental Organisations: Possibilities and Limitations'. Unpublished (MA Research Paper, Institute of Social Studies, The Hague). 66 pp.
- International Confederation of Free Trade Unions. 1974. Investment in Apartheid. Brussels: International Confederation of Free Trade Unions. 32 pp.

- International Labour Resource and Information Group. 1994a. The ICFTU: Should COSATU Affiliate? A Workshop Pack for Trade Union Branches. Cape Town: International Labour Resource and Information Group. 32 pp.
- International Labour Resource and Information Group. 1994b. 'Annual Project Report July 1993-June 1994'. Unpublished (International Labour Resource and Information Group, Cape Town). 27 pp.
- International Labour Resource and Information Group. 1994c. 'Project Six: ILRIG Newsletter'. Unpublished (International Labour Research and Information Group, Cape Town). 3 pp.
- Ishmael, Richard. 1994. 'Township Distribution in the South African Context', in Film and Allied Workers Organisation, Rough Cut: Perspectives on the State of Film, Video and Broadcasting in South Africa. Ferreirasdorp: Film and Allied Workers Organisation. Pp. 19-20
- Jackson, Gordon. 1993. Breaking Story. Boulder: Westview Press.
- Johns, Sheridan. 1975. 'The Comintern, South Africa and the Black Diaspora', The Review of Politics, Vol. 37, No. 2.
- Kaarsholm, Preben. 1988. 'The South African War and the Response of the International Socialist Community to Imperialism between 1896 and 1908', in van Holthoon, Frits (ed) & van der Linden, Marcel (ed), Internationalism in the Labour Movement, 1830-1940. Leiden: Brill. Pp. 42-67
- Kantor, Lara. 1994. 'International News: The World According to CNN, AP, Reuters...', Media Mask (Johannesburg), Vol. 1, No. 2, September/October, pp. 5-10.
- Keane, John and Paul Mier. 1989. 'New Perspectives on Social Movements: An Interview with Alberto Melucci', in Melucci, Alberto, Nomads of the Present: Social Movements and Individual Needs in Contemporary Society. London: Hutchinson Radius. Pp. 180-234
- Kotze, Astrid von. 1988a. Organise and Act: The Natal Workers Theatre Movement 1983-87. Durban: Culture and Working Life. 127 pp.
- Kotze, Astrid von. 1988b. 'Women Workers and the Struggle for Cultural Transformations', Agenda, No. 3, pp. 49-62.
- Lambert, Rob. 1992. 'Constructing the New Internationalism: Australian Trade Unions and the Indian Ocean Regional Initiative', South African Labour Bulletin, Vol. 16, No. 5, pp. 66-73.
- Letlaka-Rennert, Kedibone. 1991(?). 'Women's Oppression and Power Relations in the Act of Writing'. Unpublished (Working Paper, University of South Africa, Pretoria). 17 pp.

- Lewis, Desiree. 1993. 'Feminisms in South Africa', Women's Studies International Forum, Vol. 16, No. 5, September-October, pp. 535-542.
- Lewis, Peter. 1993. Alternative Media: Linking Global and Local. Paris: UNESCO Publishing. 130 pp.
- Lloyd, Libby. 1994. 'Speak Magazine: Breaking Barriers and Silences', in Riano, Pilar (ed), Women in Grassroots Communication: Furthering Social Change. Thousand Oaks: Sage. Pp. 251-259
- Louw, Eric. 1992. 'Proposal for the Establishment of a Media Diversity Trust (Draft: For Discussion Only)'. Unpublished (Cultural and Media Studies, University of Natal, Durban. 14 pp.
- Louw, Eric. 1994a. 'Shifting Patterns of Political Discourse in the new South Africa', Critical Studies in Mass Communication, Vol. 11, pp. 22-53.
- Louw, Eric. 1994b. "'Diversity" Versus "National Unity": The Struggle Between Moderns, Pre-Moderns and Post-Moderns in Contemporary South Africa', Paper to Australian and new Zealand Communication Association Conference, Sydney, 11-15 July, 1994., pp. 33.
- Louw, Eric (ed). 1993. South African Media Policy: Debates of the 1990s. Bellville: Anthropos.
- Louw, Eric and Keyan Tomaselli. 1991a. 'Impact of the 1990 Reforms on the Alternative Media', in Tomaselli, Keyan (ed) & Louw, Eric (ed), The Alternative Press in South Africa. London: James Currey. Pp. 222-226
- Louw, Eric and Keyan Tomaselli. 1991b. 'Developments in the Conventional and Alternative Presses, 1980-1989', in Tomaselli, Keyan (ed) & Louw, Eric (ed), The Alternative Press in South Africa. London: James Currey. Pp. 5-14
- Love, Janice. 1985. The US Anti-Apartheid Movement: Local Activism in Global Politics. New York. Praeger.
- MacShane, Denis, Martin Plaut and David Ward. 1984. Power! Black Workers, Their Unions and the Struggle for Freedom in South Africa. Nottingham: Spokesman.
- Magill, Ted. 1992. 'Changing Times for SA's Main and Alternative Press', Weekend Argus, 21 March,
- Maree, Johann. 1993. 'Trade Unions and Corporatism in South Africa', Transformation, No. 21, pp. 24-54.
- Media Development. 1985. 'Alternative Communication in South Africa', Media Development (Special Issue), Vol. 32, No. 3, pp. 1-32.

- Miller, Shirley. 1992. 'Chemical Workers Industrial Union -South Africa'. Paper to Conference on Information Technology, Electronic Communications and the Labour Movement, Manchester, 14-16 April, 1992. 3 pp.
- Minty, Abdul. 1982. 'The Anti-Apartheid Movement and Racism in Southern Africa', in Willets, Peter (ed), Pressure Groups in the Global System: The Transnational Relations of Issue-Orientated Non-Governmental Organisations. London. Pinter. Pp. 28-45
- Moss, Glenn. 1990. 'Perish or Publish: Consolidating the Alternative Voice', Southern African Report, Vol. 6, No. 1, June,
- Muller, Johan and Nico Cloete. 1993. 'Out of Eden: Modernity, Post-Apartheid and Intellectuals', Theory, Culture and Society, Vol. 10, pp. 155-172.
- Munck, Ronaldo. 1993. 'South Africa; Of Workers, Unions, Civics and Pacts'. 33 pp.
- Murphy, Mike. 1994. 'Consultation with SALB Trade Union Readership'. Unpublished (University of Natal, Durban?). 22 pp.
- Murray, Martin. 1994. The Revolution Deferred: The Painful Birth of Post-Apartheid South Africa. London: Verso. 272 pp.
- National Union of Metalworkers of South Africa. 1992. 'Viva Worker Solidarity: International Policy Background Document'. Unpublished (Background Document for National Workshop on International Policy). 33 pp.
- National Union of Namibian Workers/Confederation of South African Trade Unions. 1989. Namibian Workers Organise. Johannesburg: Confederation of South African Trade Unions. 75 pp.
- Naughton, Tracey. 1994. 'Setting a Global Course for Community Media', in Film and Allied Workers Organisation, Rough Cut. Perspectives on the State of Film, Video and Broadcasting in South Africa. Ferreirasdorp: Film and Allied Workers Union. Pp. 11-12
- Niekerk, Philip van. 1994. 'Fragile, but Slovo's Reaping the Fruits of a Lifelong Fight', Weekly Mail and Guardian (Johannesburg), December 9-14, pp. 29.
- Nuttal, Jolyon. Forthcoming. 'Sustaining Media Diversity in South Africa', Review (Department of Journalism, Rhodes University, Grahamstown, South Africa),
- Nuttall, Sarah. 1994. 'Reading in the Lives and Writing of Black South African Women', Journal of Southern African Studies, Vol. 20, No. 1, pp. 85-98.
- Orkin, Mark (ed). 1989. Sanctions Against Apartheid. Cape Town: David Philip. 328 pp.

- Phelan, John M. 1987. 'The Black Alternative', in , Apartheid Media: Disinformation and Dissent in South Africa. Westport: Lawrence Hill. Pp. 64-93
- Pityana, Sipho (ed) and Mark (ed) Orkin. 1992. Beyond the Factory Floor: A Survey of COSATU Shop-Stewards. Johannesburg: Ravan. 99 pp.
- Rama, Kubi and Eric Louw. 1993. 'Community Radio. People's Voice or Activist Dream?', in Louw, Eric (ed), South African Media Policy: Debates of the 1990s. Bellville: Anthropos. Pp. 71-78
- Ruskin Students Association. 1975. Ruskin College and the Institution of Industrial Education: An Analysis. Oxford: Ruskin College Students Association.
- Ryan, Charlotte. 1991. Prime Time Activism: Media Strategies for Grassroots Organizing. Boston: South End. 295 pp.
- Saskatoon Solidarity Committee. 1981. Partners in Imperialism: The Canadian Labour Congress and Social Democracy in the Third World. Saskatoon: Saskatoon Solidarity Committee.
- Saul, John. 1994. 'Globalism, Socialism and Democracy in the South African Transition', in Miliband, Ralph (ed) & Panitch, Leo (ed), Socialist Register 1994: Between Globalism and Nationalism. London: Merlin. Pp. 171-201
- Saunders, Jonathon. 1989. Across Frontiers: International Support for the Miners' Strike 1984-85. Oxford: Canary Press. 288 pp.
- Schechter, Danny. 1994. 'Human Rights and Network Wrongs', Towards Freedom (Burlington, Vermont, USA), December, pp. 5-7, 35-36.
- Seidman, Gay. 1994. Manufacturing Militance: Workers' Movements in Brazil and South Africa, 1970-1985. Berkeley: University of California Press. 361 pp.
- Shepherd, George. 1977. Anti-Apartheid: Transnational Conflict and Western Policy in the Liberation of South Africa. Westport: Greenwood Press.
- Sitas, Ari. 1993. 'Managing the Democratic Revolution', South African Labour Bulletin, Vol. 17, No. 2, pp. 76-80.
- Sitas, Ari. 1994. 'Globalisation: Labour Responses'. Unpublished (Rough draft for Indian Ocean Trade Union Conference, Perth, Western Australia, November 18-26, 1994). 5 pp.
- Sitas, Ari. Forthcoming. The Flight of the Gwala-Gwala Bird: Essays on Politics, Culture and Labour in Natal. 172 pp.

- Sosa, Ana Maria. 1994. 'Arpilleras: Cuadros que Hablan: A Close Encounter with a Different Form of Literacy'. Unpublished (Course Paper, Institute of Social Studies, The Hague). 30 pp.
- South African Congress of Trade Unions. 1976. Workers in Chains. London: South African Congress of Trade Unions. 19 pp.
- South African Congress of Trade Unions. 1981. Isolate South Africa Now!. London: South African Congress of Trade Unions. 8 pp.
- South African Labour Education Project. 1985. British and South African Mineworkers must Unite!. London: Southern African Labour Education Project. 8 pp.
- South African Labour Bulletin. 1987. Index Volumes 1-10, April 1974-August 1985. Landsdowne: Citadel Press. 75 pp.
- South African Labour Bulletin. 1994. 'The South African Labour Bulletin's Survey of its Trade Union Readership', South African Labour Bulletin, Vol. 18, No. 3, July, pp. 4-5.
- Southall, Roger. Forthcoming. Imperialism or Solidarity? International Labour and South African Trade Unions. 394 pp.
- Speak. 1994. 'Tell Us What You Think of Speak', Speak, No. 49, May, pp. 15-18.
- Stangelaar, Fred. 1986. 'Outline of Basic Principles of Alternative Communication', in Waterman, Peter (ed), The Comintercomdoc Papers. The Hague: International Labour Education Research and Information Foundation. Pp. 11-22
- Steinhart, Edward. 1988. 'South African Labor and International Support', African Studies Review, Vol. 31, No. 2, pp. 17-34.
- Stephen, Michael. 1994. 'Sekunjalo: Now is the Time: Michael Stephen on the Transforming Anti-Apartheid Movement', New Times (London), 9 July, pp. 11.
- Stillman, Don. 1993. 'International Labor Solidarity: The Campaign for Justice for Moses Mayekiso', in Adler, Glenn (ed) & Suarez, Doris (ed), Union Voices: Labor's Responses to Crisis. Albany: SUNY. Pp. 243-300
- Theoria. 1992. 'The State and Civil Society', Theoria (Special Issue), No. 79, pp. 1-104.
- Toit, Colleen du. 1994. 'NGOs: Silver and Silence', Weekly Mail and Guardian, 18-24 November, pp. 30.
- Tomaselli, Keyan. 1994. 'Media Monitoring and Methodology', Communicatio, Vol. 20, No. 2, pp. 84-87.

- Tomaselli, Keyan (ed) and Eric (ed) Louw. 1991. The Alternative Press in South Africa. London: James Currey. 236 pp.
- Tomaselli, Keyan and Eric Louw. 1989. 'Alternative Press and Political Practice: The South African Struggle', in Raboy, Mark (ed) & Bruck, Peter (ed), Communication For and Against Democracy. Montreal: Black Rose. Pp. 189-203
- Toward Freedom. 1994. 'Special Focus on Global Media', Toward Freedom (Burlington, Vermont, USA), December, pp. 5-38.
- Trade Union Research Project. 1994. A User's Guide to the South African Economy. Durban: Y Press. 103 pp.
- Trades Union Congress. 1974(?). Trade Unionism in South Africa: Report of a Delegation from the Trades Union Congress. London: Trades Union Congress. 40 pp.
- Tsuzuki, Chuschichi. 1991. Tom Mann, 1856-1941: The Challenges of Labour. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 288 pp.
- Tugwana, Gabu. 1989. 'The "New Nation"', Development Dialogue, No. 2, pp. 81-87.
- United Democratic Front. 1985. 'UDF and the International Struggle', Isiziwe/The Nation: Journal of the United Democratic Front, Vol. 1, No. 1, November, pp. 40-48.
- Vandresen, Monique. 1993. 'New Social Movements, Democratisation and Modernisation in Brazil: The Case of the Caras Pintadas'. 66 pp.
- Vick, Chris. 1994a. 'The WIP Survey', Work in Progress, No. 96, April/May, pp. 45.
- Vick, Chris. 1994b. 'WIP: R.I.P', Southern Africa Report, Vol. 9, No. 5, July, pp. 20-21.
- Waterman, Peter. 1991. 'International Communication and International Solidarity: The Experience of the Coordinadora of Spanish Dockworkers'. 187 pp.
- Waterman, Peter. 1992. 'The Transmission and Reception of International Labour Information in Peru', in Wasko, Janet (ed) & Mosco, Vincent (ed), Democratic Communications in the Information Age. Toronto: Garamond. Pp. 224-247
- Waterman, Peter. 1993. 'Hidden from Herstory: Women, Feminism and the New Global Solidarity', Working Paper: Sub-Series on Women's History and Development, No. 17. The Hague: Institute of Social Studies. 62 pp.
- Waterman, Peter. Forthcoming. 'Globalisation, Civil Society, Solidarity', in Braman, Sandra (ed) & Sreberny-Mohammadi, Annabelle (ed), Globalisation, Civil Society and the Public Sphere. Cresskill: Hampton Press:
- Webster, Eddie. 1984. 'The International Metalworkers Federation in South Africa (1974-80)', South African Labour Bulletin, Vol. 9, No. 6, pp. 72-94.

- Webster, Eddie. 1986. 'A History of the SALB', in Maree, Johann (ed), Ten Years of the South African labour Bulletin 1974-1984. Johannesburg: Ravan. Pp. xi-xvi
- Webster, Eddie. 1994. 'Twenty Years of the Bulletin: A View from Within', South African Labour Bulletin (Special 20th Anniversary Issue), Vol. 18, No. 5, November, pp. 16-22.
- Webster, Eddie and David Ginsberg. 1994. 'Competing Notions of Democracy Pose a Great Challenge', Business Day, May 27,
- Wessels, Elsabe. 1989. 'The Role of the Independent Alternative Grassroots Media in South Africa', Development Dialogue, No. 2, pp. 72-80.
- Wickins, Peter. 1978. The Industrial and Commercial Workers' Union of South Africa. Cape Town: Oxford University Press. 222 pp.
- Willets, Peter (ed). 1982. Pressure Groups in the Global System: The Transnational Relations of Issue-Orientated Non-Governmental Organisations. London: Frances Pinter. 225 pp.
- Wilmer, Franke. 1993. The Indigenous Voice in World Politics: Since Time Immemorial. London: Sage. 247 pp.
- Work in Progress. 1993. 'What's Left for the Left?: A Cold Hard Look at South Africa's Socialist Movement', Work in Progress, No. 89, June, pp. 10-22.
- Worker's Unity. 1994. '2020 - Free Trade Unions in Asia', Worker's Unity: Newsletter of the Indian Ocean Trade Union Conference (Perth, Western Australia), Vol. 1, November, pp. 24.

ISS WORKING PAPERS

Papers can be purchased or ordered by mail from:

The Bookshop
P.O. Box 29776
2502 LT The Hague
The Netherlands

*Papers marked with an asterisk are out of stock and will not be reproduced. If you would like to order copies, please contact either the author or ISS library.

A complete list of Working Papers is available from the The Bookshop.

GENERAL SERIES

117. Francisco Uribe-Echevarría: *Small-Scale Industrial Development. Policy and Strategic Issues* (January 1992).
118. Cordella Charlton: *Investment Patterns and Economic Growth in Jamaica: 1981-1988* (January 1992).
119. M. Asghar Zaidi: *Relative poverty in Pakistan. An estimation from the Household Income and Expenditure Survey (1984-85)* (February 1992).
120. M. Spoor: *Issues of 'State and Market': From Intervention to Deregulation of Food Markets in Nicaragua (1979-1992)* (March 1992).
121. T. Jansen: *Defining New Domains. Identity Politics in International Female Migration: Indonesian-Chinese Women in The Netherlands* (April 1992).
122. N. Robertson: *Economic Articulation: A Neglected Dimension of Economic Performance* (April 1992).
123. Miguel Teubal: *Food Security and 'Regimes of Accumulation': The Case of Argentina* (May 1992).
124. Carmen Diana Deere: *Socialism on One Island? Cuba's National Food Program and its Prospects for Food Security* (June 1992).
125. Howard White and Mark McGillivray: *Descriptive Measures of the Allocation of Development Aid* (June 1992).
126. Howard White and Mark McGillivray: *Two Papers on Aid and Government* (June 1992).
127. Howard White: *Should We Expect Aid to Increase Economic Growth?* (July 1992).
128. Ashwani Saith and Ajay Tankha: *Longitudinal Analysis of Structural Change in a North Indian Village: 1970-1987. Some Preliminary Findings* (July 1992).
129. Peter Waterman: *International Labour Communication by Computer: The Fifth International?* (July 1992).
130. Nira Yuval-Davis: *Nationalism, Racism and Gender Relations* (July 1992).
131. Claudia B. Sánchez Bajo: *Argentine-Brazilian Integration in a Historical Perspective* (August 1992).
132. Cecilia Choon Sim Ng: *Office Automation in Malaysia; The Case of the Telecommunications Industry* (September 1992).
133. Howard White: *Aid, Investment and Growth: What Prospects in the 1990s?* (October, 1992).
134. Des Gasper: *Development Ethics -- An Emergent Field? A look at scope and structure with special reference to the ethics of aid* (October 1992).
135. Mark McGillivray and Howard White: *Measuring Development? A Statistical Critique of the UNDP's Human Development Index* (October 1992).
136. Max Spoor: *Institutional Reform and Grain Markets in Post-1990 Nicaragua. The Impact of Structural Adjustment* (October 1992).
137. Bas de Gaay Fortman and Gonwongbay A. Myers: *Political Economy of Security Revisited* (November 1992).

138. Howard White and Saman Kelegama: *External Shocks, Adjustment Policies and the Current Account: The Case of Sri Lanka, 1971-1991* (December 1992).
139. Godfried van Benthem van den Bergh: *A World in Flux. The development of global power relations and order* (January 1993).
140. Des Gasper: *Policy Analysis and Evaluation. An agenda for education and research* (January 1993).
141. Aart van de Laar: *Water Development for Power and Irrigation, The Environment and Sustainable Development* (February 1993).
142. Jorge Salazar-Carillo: *The Impact on Caribbean Basin Trade and Finance of the NAFTA* (February 1993).
143. Carmen Diana Deere, Eriel Gonzales, Niurka Pérez and Gustavo Rodriguez: *Household Incomes in Cuban Agriculture: A Comparison of the State, Cooperative, and Peasant Sectors* (February 1993).
144. Ines Morovic: *Currency Convertibility and Economic Transition in Central and Eastern Europe* (February 1993).
145. Godfried van Benthem van den Bergh: *Myth and Process: Two Meanings of the Concept of the Nation* (March 1993).
146. Des Gasper: *Entitlements Analysis - Relating Concepts and Contexts* (April 1993).
147. Peter Waterman: *Globalisation, Civil Society, Solidarity. The politics and ethics of a world both real and universal* (April 1993).
148. Mark McGillivray and Howard White: *Explanatory Studies of Aid Allocation among Developing Countries: A Critical Survey* (April 1993).
149. George Irvin: *Rebuilding Cambodia's Economy: UNTAC and beyond* (May 1993).
150. Liesbeth Heering: *Case Study on the Way in which an Urban and a Rural Community in Yogyakarta Participate in Health and Health Care for Children* (May, 1993).
151. Nira Yuval-Davis: *Women, Ethnicity and Empowerment* (June 1993).
152. Jan Nederveen Pieterse: *Globalization as Hybridization* (June 1993).
153. Howard White and Lois Woestman: *The Quality of Aid: Measuring Trends in Donor Performance* (June 1993).
154. Jan Nederveen Pieterse: *Varieties of Ethnic Politics and Ethnicity Discourse* (June 1993).
155. Elisabeth Mayer-Rieckh: *"Beyond Concrete and Steel". Power-Relations and Gender: The Case of Vietnamese Women in the Detention Centres in Hong Kong* (June 1993).
156. Ines Smyth: *Paid family labour in small scale enterprises: considerations from an Indonesian experience* (June 1993).
157. Sirimal Abeyratne: *Effective Anti-Export Bias of the Sri Lankan Manufacturing Industry* (July 1993).
158. Dik Roth: *A Development Project and its Sociocultural Environment: Land Reform and Settlement in the Pompengan Integrated Area Development Project (PIADP), Luwu, South Sulawesi, Indonesia* (September 1993).
159. S. Parasuraman: *Impact of Displacement by Development Projects on Women in India* (August 1993).
160. Max Spoor: *Transition to Market Economies in Former Soviet Central Asia: Dependency, Cotton and Water* (September 1993).
161. S. Parasuraman: *The Anti-Narmada Project Movement in India: Can the Resettlement and Rehabilitation Policy Gains be Translated into a National Policy* (October 1993).
162. M. Teubal: *Agroindustrial Modernization and Globalization: Towards a New World Food Regime* (December 1993).
163. David Dunham and Saman Kelegama: *Economic Liberalization and Structural Reforms: The Experience of Sri Lanka, 1977-93* (January 1994).
164. J.J.P. van Heemst: *The Nonprofit Sector in the National Accounts: A Numerical Exercise with Data for the Netherlands* (December 1993).
165. Max Spoor: *Agrarian Transformation in Nicaragua: Markets, Peasant Rationality and Choice of Techniques* (January 1994).
166. Marc Wuyts: *Accumulation, Industrialization and the Peasantry: A Reinterpretation of the Tanzanian Experience* (January 1994).

167. Godfried van Benthem van den Bergh: *The Nuclear Revolution into its Second Phase* (January 1994).
168. Aart van de Laar: *Irrigation Development, Food Production and the State in Historical Perspective* (January 1994).
169. Aart van de Laar: *Irrigation Evaluation, Performance Measurement and Trade-offs between Production, Efficiency and Equity in Irrigation Investment Strategies* (January 1994).
170. Bernadette Resurreccion - Sayo: *Farmers, Loggers on Fragile Land. Changing Gender Relations in a Philippine Mountain Village* (January 1994).
171. P. Harrison: *The Impact of Oil on Trinidad and Tobago 1966-1990* (February 1994).
172. L. Hanmer: *Equity and Gender Issues in Health Care Provision. The 1993 World Bank Development Report and its Implications for Health Service Recipients* (May 1994).
173. C. Kay: *Rural Development and Agrarian Issues in Contemporary Latin America* (May 1994).
174. George Irvin: *Vietnam: some Macroeconomic Dimensions of Doi Moi* (May 1994).
175. G. Mgongo Fimbo: *Africa: the Multiparty Debate* (June 1994).
176. Tasso de Souza Leite: *Agrarian Reform and Development in Brazil: Re-opening a Debate in a Time of Crisis* (June 1994).
177. H. White: *Import Support Aid: Experiences from Tanzania and Zambia* (August 1994)
178. Jessica Byron: *Caricom in the Post-Cold War Era: Regional Solutions or Continued Regional Contradictions ?* (August 1994)
179. Howard White and Saman Kelegama: *The Fiscal Implications of Privatisation in Developing Countries: The Sri Lankan Experience* (August 1994)
180. Lucia Hanmer: *What Happens to Welfare when User Fees Finance Health Care ? The Impact Gender on Policy Outcomes; Theory and Evidence from Zimbabwe.* (August 1994)
181. Martin Herlaar and Wim Olthof: *Rural Local Government and Development Planning, with Experiences from Buhera District, Zimbabwe.* (August 1994)
182. Gabriela Riveiro: *Neoliberal Policies, Small Farmers and Local Organizations: Towards an inclusive and Democratic Restructuring of Agriculture in Tucuman, Argentina.* (December 1994).
183. J. Harrod: *Models of Labour and Production: The Origins and Contemporary Limitations of the Anglo-American Model.* (December 1994)
184. Lucia Hanmer: *Modern Industrialization and Structural Change.* (January 1995).
185. Surya P. Subedi: *Environmental Policy: From Regulation to Economic Instruments: International Legal Aspects of Eco-Labels* (February 1995).
186. Sunila Abeyesekera: *Women's Human Rights. Questions of Equality and Difference.* (February 1995).
187. Jan Nederveen Pieterse: *The Development of Development Theory Towards Critical Globalism.* (February 1995)
188. Peter Waterman: *Holding Mirrors out of Windows: A Labour Bulletin, a Feminist Agenda, and the Creation of a Global Solidarity Culture in the New South Africa* (March 1995)

sub-series:

MONEY, FINANCE AND DEVELOPMENT

-
37. Richard P.C. Brown, Ahmed Nur Kulane Hassan, and Alemayehu Geda Fole: *Debt, Adjustment and Donor Interventions in Post-War Horn of Africa* (May 1991).
 38. Fernando Tenjo-Galarza: *Private Sector Adjustment and Corporate Behaviour in Colombia* (May 1991).
 39. Laurean Rutayisire & Rob Vos: *A SAM for Tanzania* (September 1991).
 40. E.V.K. FitzGerald and Joke Luttik: *A Note on the Measurement of Trade and Financial Linkages in the WAM* (November 1991).
 41. Rob Vos: *Aid Flows, Trade and Global Macroeconomic Adjustment* (April 1992).
 42. Rob Vos: *Prospects of Financial Flows to Developing Countries in the 1990s. The Global Macroeconomic Trade-Offs* (October 1992).
 43. E.V.K. FitzGerald, Karel Jansen and Rob Vos: *External Constraints on Private Investment Decisions in Developing Countries* (November 1992).

44. Arjun Sengupta: *Aid and Development Policy in the 1990s* (March 1993).
45. Luis Jemio and Rob Vos: *External Shocks, Debt and Adjustment: A CGE Model for the Philippines* (March 1993).
46. Luis Carlos Jemio and Karel Jansen: *External Finance, Growth and Adjustment. A Computable General Equilibrium Model for Thailand* (March 1993).
47. Niek de Jong, Rob Vos, Tjeerd Jellema: *Trade and Financial Flows in a World Accounting Framework* (April 1993).
48. Rob Vos and Alejandro Izurieta: *Trade Multipliers in a World Accounting Matrix Framework* (August 1993).
49. Karel Jansen: *Direct Foreign Investment and Adjustment: the case of Thailand* (August 1993).
50. Niek de Jong, Rob Vos, Tjeerd Jellema and Harm Zebregs: *Trade and Financial Flows in a World Accounting Framework. Balanced WAMs for 1989-90* (October 1993).
51. Rob Vos: *Financial Liberalization, Growth and Adjustment: Some Lessons from Developing Countries* (October 1993).
52. Mark McGillivray and Howard White: *Aid Principles and Policy: An Operational Basis for the Assessment of Donor Performance* (December 1993).
53. Oliver Morrissey and Howard White: *Evaluating the Concessionality of Tied Aid* (January 1994).
54. Rob Vos: *External and Domestic Financial Constraints on Adjustment. A General Equilibrium Framework for Mexico* (July 1994).
55. Niek de Jong and Rob Vos: *What is Measured in Studies on the Determinants of Direct Foreign Investment?* (August 1994).
56. Niek de Jong and Rob Vos: *Patterns of International Finance between Major Trading and Investing Partners: A World Accounting Approach* (August 1994).
57. Niek de Jong and Rob Vos: *Theoretical and Empirical Approaches to Direct Foreign Investment: A Survey of Literature* (August 1994).
58. Alemayehu Geda: *A Comparative Look at International Linkages of the World Bank's Global Economic Model (Bank-GEM) and other North-South (N-S) Economic Models* (November 1994)
59. Rob Vos: *Aid flows and 'Dutch Disease' in a General Equilibrium Framework for Pakistan* (November 1994)

sub-series: WOMEN'S HISTORY AND DEVELOPMENT: THEMES AND ISSUES

14. Leith L. Dunn: *Women Organising for Change in Caribbean Free Zones: Strategies and Methods* (October 1991).
15. Geertja Lycklama à Nijeholt: *Women and the Meaning of Development: Approaches and Consequences* (February 1992).
16. Rudo B. Gaidzanwa: *The Ideology of Domesticity and the Struggles of Women Workers: The Case of Zimbabwe* (April 1992).
17. Peter Waterman: *Hidden from Herstory: Women, feminism and the new global solidarity* (January 1993).
18. Ineke van Halsema: *The Struggle over Female Identities in a South-Brazilian Village* (December 1993).
19. Amrita Chhachhi and Renée Pittin: *Multiple Identities, Multiple Strategies: Confronting State, Capital and Patriarchy*. (March 1995)

