



Institute of  
Social Studies  
Advisory Service

Integrating Provincial Plans into the National  
Planning System of Zimbabwe

Dr. A.H.J. (Bert) Helmsing

P.O. Box 90733  
2509 LS The Hague

Integrating Provincial Plans into the National  
Planning System of Zimbabwe

Dr. A.H.J.(Bert) Helmsing

February 1990

Institute of Social Studies Advisory Service (ISSAS)  
P.O. Box 90733, 2509 LS The Hague, The Netherlands

## 1. GENERAL INTRODUCTION

- 1 The main tasks of the consultant were defined as follows:
  - a) to undertake preparatory work for the formulation of guidelines to be used in the preparation of provincial plans;
  - b) to elaborate background material required for a draft section on national policy for regional development in the framework to the 2nd Five Year National Development Plan.
- 2 This report is divided into two main parts, each presenting findings on one of these respective tasks.
- 3 Preparatory work for the provincial plan guidelines  
The experiences with regional planning during the first five year plan period (1986-1990) have brought to light not only deficiencies in the 5 Year Provincial Development Plan (5YPDP) documents themselves but have shown also that a number of organisational and procedural problems have prevented regional planning from fully developing itself and, in particular, have hampered an effective implementation of the 5YPDPs. A dominant issue in this context has been the integration of the 5YPDPs into national planning and into the public resource allocation system.
- 4 Theorists often distinguish between procedural and substantive planning theory, and treat each separately. Procedural planning theory concerns itself with the organization of planning, while substantive planning theory concentrates on planning methodologies. In reality the two are interdependent. Certain planning methodologies can only effectively be used within a specific organizational context. In the case of Zimbabwe's 5year provincial plans this also applies: it would not be appropriate to discuss the matter of regional plan methodology -for which guidelines are needed -, in isolation of the organisational and procedural context in which they have to be used. One could go one step further and argue that several issues with regard to the roles and organisational context of regional planning need to be resolved in order to consider alternative measures to improve the methodology of regional planning.
- 5 Section 2 contains an analysis of the attempts to regional planning at provincial level during the first five-year plan period. In order to do so, the first part of the section sets out a framework of analysis, while the second part of the section is devoted to the application of this framework to the Zimbabwean planning realities.
- 6 Section 3 synthesizes the main lessons drawn from the analysis and suggests various changes in the organisational context and examines various mechanisms to be adopted in the planning methodology to improve the planning performance.
- 7 Section 4 discusses a number of practical issues that needs to be addressed to implement the earlier proposals.
- 8 Although this report is focussed on provincial level planning and their integration into the national level, it needs to be emphasised that

part of the problems of performance of regional planning in Zimbabwe lies outside these levels, and concern district and subdistrict planning structures. Where appropriate this report will relate to these levels but it does not fully address the problems and solutions for (sub)district level planning.

9 Preparation of background material for the formulation of a national policy of regional development

Both regional and urban development have been listed in the first 5YNPD as policy areas (F5YNPD, pp 20-21). Broad development objectives were formulated but no specific policy initiatives were announced. In view of the growing concern with regard to the regional distribution of growth and employment, the GoZ has now decided to consider the possibilities for developing a national policy of regional development. As part of the preparations for such an effort, the consultant was requested to prepare background material. This implied the gathering of information, both quantitative and qualitative data, statistics and studies on various dimensions of regional development. The work undertaken by the Consultant is reported in two sections. The first, section 5 of this report, identifies basic information requirements and main policy areas; the second section, (section 6 of this report) provides a systematic listing of identified materials, and tasks to be carried out by NPA staff.

P A R T I

PREPARATORY WORK

FOR THE

FORMULATION OF REGIONAL PLANNING GUIDELINES

## 2 REVIEW OF ZIMBABWE'S PROVINCIAL PLANNING EXPERIENCE 1986-1990

## 2.1 Analytical framework

10 Regional planning concerns the spatial and functional coordination of development activities with the aim to improve the overall efficiency in and effectiveness of resource allocation and the overall socio-spatial distribution of development. The key feature of regional planning is its preoccupation with relationships between sectoral and spatial dimensions of development and planning.

Regional Planning (RP) can be operational at many different levels. From local level (e.g. urban master and district development plans), to intermediate (provincial or departmental), to national and international (EEC's regional policy). In the case of Zimbabwe RP is operational in various forms at local and provincial level. This report focusses on the provincial level. Given the intermediate position of provincial regional planning, one has to examine the other levels with which it links up, the national and local levels. Taking these considerations into account, the role and functioning of RP at provincial level can said to be defined by the following set of constituent elements.

- intersectoral coordination
- local authority coordination
- central - local relations
- planning method
- projects

Below each element will be elaborated upon.

RP involves inter-sectoral coordination

11 In a mixed economy, intersectoral coordination has two meanings: one refers to the coordination within the public sector. The other refers to coordination between the public and private sectors.

12 The provision of public services through various sectoral ministries needs to take into account the spatial and functional complementarities and linkages between these interventions/actions. The contribution of RP in this regard is ensuring that sectoral actions and investments are properly coordinated in space and functionally, so as to minimize incoherence and dysfunctionalities in the provision of public services and thereby improve the effectiveness and efficiency of public service delivery. A regional plan or regional development strategy provides a key input in this coordination effort as it expresses a broad agreement at provincial level of economic, sectoral and spatial development priorities. Public sector investment coordination is a narrow, but nonetheless essential, goal of RP.

13 Public-private sector investment coordination is a wider goal of RP. Public and private sector investment dynamically interact. While the public sector, certainly in a mixed economy with socialist aspirations, seeks to lead in certain sectors and economic fields (e.g. cooperatives), in others the private sector predominates, either as industrial firms, as farmers and peasants and traders, etc. Private sector investments create very often a need for complementary public sector investments, in e.g. infrastructure, without which the private

sector would not prosper. Indicative public planning and 'concertation' with the private sector (see Hilhorst report), can be instrumental to achieve such reconciliation of public and private sector investment activity. Given the scarcity of public resources and limits to state intervention, the public sector planning cannot disregard this dynamic.

RP involves the coordination of local authorities

14 The responsibilities for provision of public goods and services and for the organisation of space are shared between central and local authorities. The degree to which these responsibilities are shared varies from country to country (see also below).

15 RP seeks to enhance coordination of local authorities (LAs). A provincial development strategy or plan assigns specific economic and spatial development roles to the various local authorities which are comprising the RP area (e.g. in the case of Zimbabwe to the various Urban Councils (UCs) and Rural and District Councils (RCs and DCs). The development planning activities of these local authorities need to be articulated (e.g. when deliberately seeking 'spill-over effects' of projects) so that also from this level, no mismatches occur which are wasteful from a resource point of view.

RP involves central - local relations

16 RP takes place within a certain context of relations between central government and local authorities. The degree to which RP forms a part of a system of planning is very much determined in this dimension. It depends on the formal powers given to the RP agency(ies) in relation to both the local and the central levels. The degree to which RP is capable of addressing lower level priorities and can enforce compliance by LAs to agreed development priorities, is determined in this relationship. It also shapes the influence a province can bring to bear on the national/sectoral level. In case the RP agency at provincial level would not have statutory or financial powers of its own (e.g. a budget), it would require a 'sponsoring body' at national level capable of ensuring that its influence is being felt.

Planning method

17 In a mixed economy RP revolves around the formulation of a **regional development strategy**. A regional development strategy can be defined as a statement of (regional development) objectives and incorporates a series of actions or interventions on key issues needed to achieve these objectives based upon a thorough understanding of the regional economy.

18 A strategy has at least two components. One is the economic development component which concerns the economic development of the area concerned, its current trends, and its structural economic strengths and weaknesses. It specifies what economic actions are required (at local, regional and national level) on the key issues so as to achieve stated development objectives. The second component is the spatial development component, which concerns the current trends in utilization in natural resources (incl. land use) and location of population and economic activity in space, the main spatial/infrastructural bottlenecks in the future development of these

taking into account locational and land utilization problems and potentials.

19 The first component seeks to influence economic development of the province by influencing the sectoral resource allocation process and by special regional economic policy instruments. The second component especially looks at the spatial reflection of development and seeks to influence the spatial interactions by infrastructural (and housing) provisions and land use and development control instruments. Needless to say that the two components are interrelated. The economic processes react to spatial conditions of landuse and location and the in situ economic growth processes, in their turn, change these spatial conditions.

Projects

20 Only if the organizational, political and financial environment is very stable (as for instances is assumed under 'command economy' situations), is it realistic to assume that RP can engage in formulating detailed sectoral targets and formulate long term plans which contain sectorally defined 'bundles' of projects and work out detailed implementation schedules and financial requirements. Sometimes such stability is artificially created by the establishment of a special authority (regional development corporation), which is a parastatal with its own funding with/without powers to raises loans.

21 In case such stable conditions do not exist, then RP becomes more process oriented. RP seeks to implement or achieve its development strategy by seeking to influence the local and national sectoral investment project decisions. Given the uncertainty of the situation, not all projects to be implemented during the plan period are identified, costed and appraised at the start of the planning period. Although there may be a small 'shelf' of projects. New projects are generated continuously, in various quarters, and need to be assessed on their priority against the provincial development strategy.

22 The frequency (cq. the time horizon) with which main RP activities are undertaken needs to be considered. When conditions are stable, RP can appropriately engage in detailed five year plans. Annual provincial plans would become a routine measure to link up with the annual budget cycle so as to implement the (multi-year) plan in stages. The main peak of planning activity would concentrate around the formulation of the said five-year plan. Implementation is more of an administrative affair.

23 If, however, conditions are less stable and circumstances less clear, RP cannot predetermine resource allocation priorities in great detail for a five year time period. This problem can be addressed by dividing priority setting into two parts. The first general priority setting takes place when the Regional Development Strategy is formulated; the second detailed priority setting is done annually. As a result annual plans are not merely implementation measures that can be dealt with administratively but play a full role in the resource allocation process.

## 2.2 Regional Planning and the First Five Year Provincial Development Plans

24 The current provincial planning structure is entirely of a post-independence origin although there are some important pre-1980 experiences with RP. For example the Intensive Rural Development Areas programme (Ministry of Finance/ARDA) and the Sebungwe Regional Plan (Dept of Physical Planning). The important difference is that the pre-independence experiences were mainly tied with special planning region or programme areas, while the post-independence RP approach was, in theory, country-wide and organised along existing administrative areas.

25 The creation of the provincial planning system was part of the GoZ drive for rural development. The Prime Minister's Directives on Decentralization of 1983 and 1984 have shaped the evolving planning structures. The main emphasis was initially on the creation of district and subdistrict planning structures, notably the District Development Cte, the Village and Ward Development Committees (VIDCOs and WADCOs). The 1984 Provincial Councils & Administration Act created the provincial level regional planning. It became the responsibility of the Provincial Development Committee (PDC) which is a committee of the Provincial Council. The PDC became responsible for the preparation of the first 5YPDPs (Mutizwa-Mangiza, 1986)

26 In 1985 and 1986 the first serie of 8 5YPDPs was prepared. The manner in which this task was undertaken varied from province to province. In some cases the five year plan preceded the preparation of district development plans (5YDDPs), like in Matabeleland, while in others the two were undertaken simultaneously. The committees structure as well as the membership of each committee, adopted by the PDC of each province, to prepare the main components also differed. The common feature was that in all cases the Department of Physical Planning served as the technical secretariat.

27 It is important to note that the PC is not a layer of government with certain statutory powers to raise revenues and to undertake expenditures. Its political head, the Provincial Governor is appointed by the President and he relates administratively to the Ministry of Political Affairs. The administrative support to the Provincial Council is provided by the Ministry of Local Government, Rural & Urban Development (MLGRUD). The Provincial Administrator (who is a civil servant from MLGRUD) is also the Chairman of the PDC.

28 The PC&A Act specifies both long term and short term planning. In order to implement the 5YPDPs, annual plans were to be prepared in order to feed into the existing annual budget cycle and the public sector investment programme. Annual Provincial Plans (APPs) are the main vehicle to implement 5YPDP proposals.

29 **Assessing the experience**  
The framework of constituent elements of RP can now be used to examine the first experiences with RP and the first round of Five Year Provincial Development Plans.

## Intersectoral coordination

30 The 5YPDP and the subsequent APPs have made a significant start in developing a process of intersectoral coordination at provincial level. The establishment of the PDC, as a forum, and the five year plan tasks as a joint responsibility, gave the provincial heads of sectors ministries, and local authorities an important opportunity to share common experiences and problems, to exchange ideas on solutions and about complementarities. The ensuing informal coordination has been an important 'spin off'. This particularly manifested itself in the identification of projects. The 5YPDP give evidence of close functional and spatial coordination in the project identification stage, especially with regard to the social sectors.

31 Due to a number of deficiencies in the organisational context and planning methods, in particular high degree of centralisation on decision making within a number of sectors and the lack of screening of projects and the quality of the projects themselves, there is still considerable scope to improve the effectiveness of this coordination.

32 There appear to be quite considerable imbalances in the capacity to plan and coordinate development activities among the various provinces. Some provinces such as Midlands and Masvingo are among the ones that have made considerable progress.

33 The provincial RP planning efforts have not been very succesful in achieving a better coordination between the public and the private sector. There are several reasons for this. One is the apprehension in the private (formal) sector about the scope and nature of development planning in the country. The other reason was that the level of private sector investment was minimal anyway as the country was just recovering from a drought induced recession. A third reason has to do with the bias in the 5YPDPs to communal areas. The interest representation of peasants and rural businessmen was expected to take place via subdistrict (WADCO and VIDCO) levels. The commercial farming areas and towns were not recieving significant attention in the planning exercise. As a result there was less ground for public-private coordination.

34 **Local authority coordination**  
Coordination of local authorities has been very limited. The whole planning exercise revolved around the communal areas (District Councils and CG Field Administration). Urban local authorities (the Urban Councils - UCs) and Rural Councils (RCs) were not seriously involved.

35 Although the UCs and RCs are represented on the PC and hence at the PDC, the PC&A Act does not require UCs and RCs to channel their plan proposals via the province. They have continued to rely on the established direct channels via MLGRUD. The MLGRUD, which is the main sponsoring body, as specified under the PC & A Act, has not required the local authorities to submit their proposals through the PDC. Some provinces have however included the UC and RC submissions in the APPs (e.g. Midlands and Mashonaland Central). This situation is unsatisfactory. RP cannot fulfil its functions when important parts of the space-economy are not effectively incorporated.

Central - local relations

36 The system of government that evolved during the first 9 years of Independence was characterised by: a) considerable institutional changes, as new ministries were established, ministries were re-organised, departments moved between ministries etc. b) considerable efforts to extend public services (notable social services) to communal areas; c) efforts to reduce the imbalances in the local government system, by strengthening DCs and reducing the autonomy of UCs. The central-local relations have been in a state of flux at both ends, and respective roles are still being re-defined.

37 During the eighties one could initially observe a process of income centralization and simultaneous expenditure decentralization (Helmsing, 1987 & 1989). The latter is however being reverted. Local authorities, in particular, rural local authorities have currently fewer expenditure responsibilities than prior to the first 5YNDP. Whether this trend will be consolidated, depends on the implementation of the RDC Act (esp. the financial regulations). Its outcome will have a fundamental impact on the future of decentralized planning in Zimbabwe.

38 The decentralization within sector ministries is much more difficult to assess. This in part is due to the fact that not all ministries are to the same degree 'final demand oriented' and hence would require a careful local participation for a proper implementation of their tasks. Notwithstanding these and other qualifications, it appears that intrasectoral decentralization has met with only partial success. Many ministries continue to have highly centralized decision making procedures, with limited powers delegated to provincial heads, and virtually none to their district officers. The findings of the Public Service Review Commission confirm this. The report on the visits of the PSRC to a number of provinces and districts gives numerous examples poor implementation, coordination and planning (PSRC report, Vol. 2, 1989).

39 Although several ministries have gone at length to incorporate local participation in the identification of local projects (e.g. in rural water, roads), the decision-making regarding resources remains concentrated at Head Office. The latter is in part due to the financial regime as laid down in the Finance Act and in some cases also due to shortages of technical staff to develop and appraise and implement large and/or complex projects.

40 The PMs directive defined the local planning system (VIDCO, WADCO and DDC) in a 'bottom-up' manner. It emphasises needs identification and project proposals to be sent to the next higher level which in its turn aggregates these, adds further provincial needs and projects and passes these together on to the next higher level, and so on. The system does not prioritize needs and does not screen projects on the basis of resource constraints and appropriate plan guidelines.

41 A single provincial plan covering not more than 56% of its own land area and only one-third of its own total population, could therefore generate as much as 2200 projects with an estimated combined value of approx. 300 mln. dollars. For comparative purposes it is interesting to mention that the total available in the PSIP 88-90 for 420 'small

projects' amounts to 350 mln., an average of 210 projects with a value of 175 mln per annum.

42 The implicit view in the approach followed in the first round of 5YPDPs is that a national plan is the sum total of all local and all provincial and all national projects. The very need for a multi-level planning system is, however, to reduce the complexity by assigning each level and sector with its own responsibilities and to ensure that all levels/sectors intermesh by means of appropriate coordination, delegation and integration.

43 The PC and more specifically the PDC forms the apex of this territorially based planning system. There are inadequate mechanisms to ensure that these territorial plans properly feed into national level sector planning.

44 The regional planning system as it developed over the last few years, has apparently met with only limited success in significantly influencing investment behaviour of sector ministries, with the notable exception of some ministries (see, for example, Mellor and Conyers, 1989).

45 It should be added, however, that this can also be considered fortunate in view of the quality of proposals and lack of screening and prioritization.

46 The respective roles of central-local authorities have not yet completely crystallised. The planning system at district and provincial level will continue to be subject to change, in particular in consequence of the outcome of the DC & RC amalgamation process.

47 The MLGRUD is the main 'sponsoring body' of RP at all administrative levels.<sup>1</sup> At district level, the DA was the Chief Executive Officer of the DCs as well as the Chairman of the DDC; at provincial level, the PA presided over the PDC. At national level MLGRUD receives the 5YPDPs as well as the APPs and forwards these to MFEPD. MLGRUD has yet to develop mechanisms to ensure that provincial plan proposals would influence sector bids in the national level PSIP allocation process.

48 The role of MFEPD, and in particular of NPA, has not been defined in the PC&A Act. This may help to explain the lack of integration of provincial plans into the national planning system. This unclarity is understandable as, for example, the NPA did not exist at that time. The situation is however undesirable, and needs to be remedied.

Planning method

49 The 5YPDPs do not contain provincial development strategies. Not only are the economic analyses generally weak and superficial but also the spatial development component is mostly incomplete, except for reiterations of the national RSC/DSC/GP programme. The 5YPDP were in

<sup>1</sup> Other agencies are engaged in ad-hoc regional and integrated area plans. For example ARDA's CARD programme in Gutu or the Mid-Zambesi settlement programme of DERUDE.

11

some occasions prepared prior to the formulation of district development plans, or were prepared simultaneously.

50 In view of the instability in the organizational and financial environment surrounding the regional planning system, it is not advisable to engage in detailed 'blueprint' type planning. In view of economic, policy and institutional uncertainties, it is desirable that RP arrangements are essentially flexible.

51 Flexibility in planning should not be confused with inability to plan. Process planning explicitly recognises that there are considerable uncertainties about resource availabilities as well as about future economic growth. These uncertainties do not only arise from lack of control over the external planning environment but also lack of information, insufficient knowledge and know-how about changes in the economy, in government policies as well as in the planning system itself.

#### Projects

52 The 5YPDPs contain large numbers of projects generated on the basis of unconstrained needs identification which do not appear to have been justified either in terms of provincial development priorities or on the basis of resource availabilities. The plan documents can therefore best be considered as large 'shelves' of preliminary project proposals.

53 The subnational planning system also produces annual plans. Again the 'bottom up' approach is characteristic. In theory, VIDCO, WADCO and DDC provide inputs, in the form of project proposals, into the provincial annual plan cycle. In Midlands province this elaborate process appears to work to some extent, while in other provinces grassroots planning structures are either partially or wholly dormant or only nominally involved.

54 These multi-level rounds of generation of project proposals resulted in APP submissions which in the first years of operation were far in excess of actual resource availabilities. The national public sector resource availability is unknown at the time of APP preparation. There is no specification of amounts to be allocated (or ceilings) to any subnational level (VIDCO, WADCO, District, Province). Due to the absence of effective screening and assessment of projects against district/provincial development criteria, the APP system developed into a kind of 'decentralised budget bidding system' but without any systematic planned choices.

55 The improved 'performance' of some of the annual provincial plans (e.g. in Midlands) is in part due to the fact that the PDC subcste's have become more strict in accepting (ill-conceived and prepared) proposals 'from below', and partly due to a better understanding by the PDC of sector specific national development guidelines, rather than due to a conscious process of rationalised provincial selection/prioritization.

#### Provincial plans and the national level

56 The apparent ineffectiveness of the APPs to influence public sector investment allocation is not in the least due to the fact that APP did

not receive any follow up on the part of MLGRUD. This ministry functioned at best as a 'mail box' which passed the 5YPDPs and the subsequent APPs on to MFEFD (NPA) without further action. The Central Planning Unit of MLGRUD has made some attempts in 1988 to review the APPs, but has not systematically pursued or supported the implementation of these plans via PSIP. No special mechanisms have been developed to ensure that provincial plans become implemented.

57 The National Planning Agency was only established in 1987, thus after the first round of 5YPDPs had been prepared. The 5YPDPs were not considered part of the (parallel) exercise of formulating the five year national development plan (5YNPD). In fact, the 5YNPD did not serve as a framework for the formulation of the 5YPDPs (disaggregating national level plans into provincial ones) but at the same time did the 5YNPD not take into account provincial planning activity. The 5YNPD and the 5YPDPs were developed independently of each other.

58 MFEFD (NPA) has only recently (1988) begun to concern itself with provincial planning and in particular the APPs. It has established a regional planning division and has posted 2 Chief Provincial Planning Officers (CPPO) in the provinces, each servicing 2 provinces (Matabeleland North and South and Mashonaland Central and West respectively). The NPA is currently not adequately prepared to make a serious attempt to integrate provincial regional planning into national planning. Not only because of staffing problems but also because of the fact that its position in the RP planning system is not clearly defined.

#### Provincial Plans and the local level

59 As already stated earlier, the UGs and RCs have largely ignored the RP system at district level. They have made their public sector investment submissions directly to the MLGRUD to be included in the PSIP submission of that ministry.

60 District level RP has therefore tended to focuss almost exclusively on District Councils areas. Some of the problems of RP at provincial level can also be found at district level and in magnified form. In particular, problems relating to lack of specification of responsibilities and functions of each (sub)district level, staffing, quality of project proposals.

61 Given the high degree of centralisation in sector ministries, the district level has not become an effective level of inter-sectoral coordination. At the district level representatives of ministries have even less authority and capacity to work out agreements with other SMs regarding their activities. A recent study pointed to the lack of specification of functions and powers at district and sub-district level, resulting in considerable duplication of effort. As the district councils well as VIDCOs and WADCOs have very limited resources to their disposal, virtually all their proposals are passed on to provincial level. Given the poor quality of these proposals many are being rejected (Mutizwa-Mangiza, 1989).

62 District Councils are extremely poor in financial terms (Helmsing & Wekwete, 1987; Helmsing, 1989). Many of their proposals for funding by other public sector levels, particularly the SMs are rejected. Yet,

the District Councils play a clearly identifiable role with regard to the mobilization of other resources for the district, namely, income generating projects, community self help and NGO resources. Thus, the paradoxical situation has arisen where DC's role within the public planning system is marginal, whereas at the same time it is involved in sometimes considerable non-public development projects. The public-private sector coordination is therefore not very effective carried out at the district level.

### 3 MEASURES TO IMPROVE THE REGIONAL PLANNING SYSTEM AND PERFORMANCE

#### 3.1 Framework for RP in the nineteen nineties

63 The planning system that evolved during the last 5 years or so has been marked by a high degree of enthusiasm and commitment on the part of grassroots institutions, provincial bodies as well as some national and sector ministries. However, more recently a crisis of expectations has arisen among 'beneficiaries' and frustration has been mounting at local and provincial professional planning levels about the lack of success in the implementation of the plan proposals, up to the point that some interviewed persons openly question the case for a new round of 5 year district and provincial development plans (see also Mellor & Conyers, 1989, DPP Conference 1989).

64 It is important to stress here that the lack of success of RP is not merely an implementation problem (which often is reduced further to a 'lack of funds' problem). The problem finds its origin in the organisational context of RP as well as in the choice of planning method.

65 Measures should be considered to re-invigorate the decentralized planning system. This re-invigoration means on the one hand to correct the deficiencies that have become manifest during the first few years. It also means to carry the development one stage further towards a decentralised planning system.

66 The framework that was used to assess the first round of the RP experiences, will now be used to discuss some of the possible measures to improve the RP system.

#### Intersectoral coordination

67 The planning system as it evolved during the first 5 year plan period, made marked improvements in intersectoral investment coordination through joint identification of projects. However, this process was unconstrained by resource limitations and provincial selection criteria. The district and provincial levels duplicated each other in as far as intersectoral coordination of public investment is concerned.

68 In view of the earlier diagnosis it is proposed here to concentrate PSIP investment coordination at the provincial level. The district level, although perhaps closer to the level at which (local) needs arise, is too far removed from the level of decision-making to have a significant and meaningful impact, given the current organisation

of the public sector, in particular of the sector ministries. The provincial level is less far removed, and has in addition better administrative and technical capacities, and staffing to undertake such coordination.

69 At the same time this coordination should not remain without commitment. In other words measures should be taken to ensure that the fruits of provincial level coordination are carrying weight in the national resource allocation process (PSIP). This means that measures have to be taken that stimulate the sector ministries to incorporate projects proposed by their own provincial units in their national PSIP bids (see p. 16 below).

70 The public sector investment coordination at district level should limit itself only to coordinate those investment projects which are undertaken with resources made directly available at that level. Thus, the District Development Committee, which after the Amalgamation is much more closely related to the Rural District Council, should concern itself with projects funded by RDCs directly or with CG grants-in-aid, or through self help.

71 At Independence great parts of the rural population in many provinces and districts was lacking access to basic physical and social infrastructure. Over the last 9 years a lot of attention and considerable resources have been diverted towards providing these facilities to the rural population. In spite of this and for a variety of reasons, economic growth has been lagging behind and unemployment has risen to very high levels (CSO Labour force survey, 1988). In view of this, the attention of RP should shift more towards the promotion of economic development and the mobilization of resources from outside the public sector. This calls for a change in emphasis in RP and for a greater public-private sector coordination.

72 Public-private sector coordination at district and provincial level can only work if coordination agreements are implemented. Thus both district and provincial public planning need to be ensured of a better chance of implementation. Public-private sector investment coordination at district level is more likely to concern itself in the rural areas with self-help, community and small group and NGO supported projects, while this type of coordination at provincial level is more oriented towards formal private sector.

#### Local authority coordination

73 The RP experiences during the first five year plan period have been particularly deficient in this aspect. The First 5YPDPs were mainly communal area development plans. In order to exploit its full potential RP needs to cover all local area jurisdictions within a province. Many economic and spatial linkages and investment complementarities exist between the towns and their respective rural hinterlands, between agriculture and urban services and industrial activities. Sectoral and spatial development priorities need to be formulated for the regional economy as a whole. This requires that all local authorities participate in the regional planning process at provincial level. Concretely this would imply that the PDC would be informed about the investment programmes of all local authorities in

the province and would have to be in a position to pass a judgement on the PSIP proposals of each local authority.

Central-local relations

74 Decentralised planning is seriously constrained by structural problems in the relations between central government and local authorities. As argued earlier a number of these problems are not likely to be resolved very quickly. The post-independence restructuring of the local government system was a necessary one and has not yet been completed.

75 The Finance Act imposes a financial regime which centralises expenditure authority. The management and staffing problems of sector ministries impose additional limits on the degree to which they can decentralise their operations. The persistent uncertainties about policies and national resource availabilities foments centralization in their own planning and budgeting (Helmsing, 1988).

76 There are not only considerable social, economic and fiscal inequalities between local authorities and provinces, but also serious disparities in the technical and administrative capacities of local authorities and of provinces to plan their own development. These factors limit the degree to which planning activities can be decentralised to provincial and local levels. Inevitably the strengthening RP is a process in stages. Every new measure needs carefully to be assessed against these constraints.

77 There is a consensus of opinion that the lack of resources availability and of other means to influence the financing of district and provincial plans is one of the chief problems. Decentralised planning without decentralisation of resources is seen as 'toothless' or as a 'paper tiger'. A number of suggestions have been made to remediate this problem. Some of these will be discussed below. A distinction will be made here between the district and the provincial level.

District/local level financial decentralisation

There are a number of ways to improve direct and/or indirect district level access to resources. Among these are:

78 - i) extension of the local fiscal base  
The aim is to make particularly the RDCs viable from a financial point of view. The RDCs are seriously constrained to finance development projects because of an insufficient local fiscal base to cover loan interest and repayment as well as other recurrent expenditures arising from new projects. For rural local authorities this may require the introduction of new local taxes to replace the current low yielding and inequitable development levy as well as improved charging for public services rendered (Helmsing, 1987 and 1989). Urban local authorities have a larger fiscal base but need to improve (and allowed by central government to improve) their fiscal effort.

79 - ii) a Rural District Council Fund.  
Given the dualistic nature of the economy it is difficult to devise systems of local taxation that are administratively easy to administer and that are equitable in both a vertical (between income groups) and

horizontal (treatment of people and enterprises with similar income levels) sense. Proposals have been made for a nationally collected rural local tax (grains and livestock levy) to be deposited in a Rural District Council Fund out of which allocations are made to the RDCs. (Helmsing, 1989);

80 - iii) Annual Development Grant.  
This grant would be the public investment equivalent to the (current expenditure) administration grant. Each local authority would be informed about the amount of the allocation and would have to submit viable projects to MLGRUD. Such a capital expenditure grant could be operated in a manner similar to the PSDS pilot project in Midlands; The DDC should formulate the projects and implementation is subject to approval by MLGRUD;

81 - iv) 'Food for Work projects'  
A somewhat different and more restricted proposal would be to expand the revitalised 'Food for Work' programme administered by the DA in each district. As in option iii) the DDC should formulate the projects, but these would have to be approved by the RDC (under the new RDC Act), as part of the Annual District Development Plan.

82 - v) 'Deficiency grant' allocation.  
Proposals for 'deficiency grants' are based on two premises: a) one can identify a number of basic local public provisions which should be accessible to all residents at a certain standard of service; b) there are inequalities in the ability to pay for these services. The gap between the expenditures required to provide these local provisions at a certain level of standard and the local revenues that can be generated applying a certain standard of charging is the local 'deficiency' in resources that needs to be financed through a CG grant. A system of deficiency grants is currently used in Botswana (Segodi, 1989).

83 The first two options strengthen RDC finances to undertake development projects whereby the DDC plays a technical and advisory function. In options 'iii' and 'iv' there is a greater role for the DDC while final approval is required from MLGRUD (as is also needed for 'v').

Financial decentralisation to the provincial level

84 At provincial level there are currently no legal powers to raise revenue and to authorise expenditures and many planners, administrators and politicians, see this as the key issue. Several alternatives can be considered to remediate this problem which differ in the extent to which shifts are necessary in the current government resource flows.

85 i) provincial budget  
Proposals for a provincial budget have been made by the provinces. Some refer specifically to a grant to the PC/PDC to finance its current expenditures. Currently the PC is serviced by the PA's office, which bears its operational costs. Others have gone further and propose the provincial level to become a fully fledged level of government with its own revenue and expenditure responsibilities. This would require a substantial reorganisation of the government structure and in view of the current discussion about the size of the public

sector as a whole this is not a desirable option, given also the size of the country. Furthermore the creation of a provincial budget would require a revision of the Finance Act which is not likely to take place in the short and medium run.

86 ii) delegation of expenditure powers to provincial heads  
This proposal to delegate limited expenditure powers to heads of sector ministries was launched by the Public Service Review Commission (PSRC) in 1989. The PSRC seeks to give provincial heads of ministries some limited authority to authorise transfers between budget heads and subheads. The chief gain is flexibility in the recurrent budget to meet bottlenecks in the implementation and running of projects and programmes.

87 iii) global provincial allocation  
The proposal by the PSRC concerns recurrent expenditures. The global provincial allocation, suggested here, concerns capital development expenditures. These two proposals are therefore complementary. Taking into account the PSIP procedures it is proposed to investigate a Global Provincial Allocation (GPA) which the PDC would decide how to allocate among the sectors on projects which have been technically formulated, appraised and approved by the corresponding sector. These projects enter under a special heading in the APP of the province concerned. Once the PDC has approved a project under this GPA, the project enters automatically the sector bid of that particular ministry. The Ministry concerned is required to mark that particular project as a 'provincial project' in its sector bid to PSIP. Once approved during the normal PSIP procedure, it is the sector ministry concerned that implements the project. The PDC can monitor these projects via the CRPO in that province.

88 The sector concerned has itself formulated the project and approved it on technical grounds. Its inclusion under the GPA, obliges that ministry to execute it. These projects are, as it were, administratively 'protected' from national sector HQ screening and elimination. Provincial projects are to some extent politically endorsed at the PC but require approval by Parliament. Provincial projects are part of the various ministry chapters in the national budget. The approval procedure by Parliament takes place in the normal manner.

89 Local Authorities (possibly with the exception of the City of Harare and of Bulawayo) will have to be required to present their PSIP proposals through the APP cycle and the PDC's advice will play a role in the national PSIP deliberations. This would ensure that the required coordination of local authorities will be effective. This would require instruction to be issued to this effect by the Minister of LGRUD and may require amendments of the Urban Councils Act and the Rural District Councils Act

90 Thus, the entire PSIP procedure remains intact, no major revisions are required. The only addition to the PSIP procedure is that a PSIP Circular has to be issued annually which indicates for each province the 'global provincial allocation' for that particular year. In view of the current PSIP timeschedule this circular would have to be issued in October.

91 On the basis of research, proposed in Part II of this report, on classifying projects into national and provincial projects and regionalizing past PSIP allocations as well as other work carried out in preparation for the national 5YDP (budget forecasts), one needs to determine the appropriate amount and alternative inter-provincial distribution formulas.

92 The PDC can only decide on the use of this global allocation on the basis of the Provincial Development Strategy. It is the PDC Planning, Monitoring and Budgeting SubCommittee, headed by the CPPO, which annually should formulate the proposal for the GPA, to be discussed by the PDC and approved by the PC. Projects to be included have to be prepared via the other (sector) subcte's of the PDC. The latter would have to ensure that proposed projects meet sectoral appraisal criteria.

93 If sectoral ministries already work in a decentralized manner, taking into account provincial development priorities, then this proposal would not lead to significant reallocations within the sector (e.g. MoT), but the proposal as a whole may cause some intersectoral re-adjustments. It is therefore recommended that one starts slowly so that NPA can closely monitor these sectoral re-adjustments.

94 The PDC and its subcommittees would be mainly responsible for planning the provincial projects to be funded by national sector ministries. While the LAs are responsible for projects funded by and through LAs and DAs. The PDC would however have a supervisory role with regard to the latter, in so far as they request national (incl. PSIP) funding.

95 The implication of this proposal is that MLGRUD would remain the main 'sponsoring body' of RP at district level. MLGRUD is formally responsible for the LA (incl LA development grants, approval of LA loans, rates etc) and as the DA chairs the DDC and executes the Food for Work Programme.

96 The adoption of the GPA and possibly other measures (see below) to improve the integration of APPs into the national planning system, suggest that FEPD(NPA) would have to become the main 'sponsoring body' of RP at provincial level in view of its central role in the national intersectoral resource (incl. PSIP) allocation process.

97 In view of the multi-disciplinary nature of RP and the inter-dependencies between district and provincial level planning, it is essential that FEPD and LGRUD develop a common understanding and approach and operate as much as possible as joint professional planning teams (see also below).

Planning method  
98 Given the intended scope of planning, the organizational context, the medium term uncertainties about the performance of the economy, as well as about national policies and resource availabilities, it seems more realistic to concentrate planning efforts on improving the annual provincial plans and their integration into the national planning system, than to engage in a second round of formulating detailed five year provincial plans.

99 Regional planning in the 1990s would require: i) more focus on economic development of the provinces; ii) a greater emphasis on resource mobilization; iii) a greater need for public-private sector coordination; iv) coverage of all local authority jurisdictions (rural and urban) in each province, and v) a greater concern for the disparities between provinces and between districts.

100 A strategic planning method is much more appropriate in this context. The Hilhorst Report lists twelve main steps for the formulation and implementation of a Provincial Development Strategy (PDS) and projects and programmes of action. For the purpose of the analysis presented here, these series of steps may be broken down into two phases. Phase A) Generation of a PDS or Strategic Plan (PDS/SP) and the formulation of Provincial Project Criteria (PPC); and, Phase B) Development monitoring and the formulation and selection of Provincial Projects

101 The generation of a PDS/SP concerns medium term development of a province for which the current five year plan framework is quite appropriate. With the exception of possibly a mid-term review, the output of this stage - the PDS/SP -, would remain a standing document for the entire plan period. The same applies to provincial project criteria.

102 The second stage repeats itself every year and its main output is the Annual Provincial Plan. This recurrent APP cycle should feed into the national PSIP cycle.

103 Phase A can be further subdivided into the steps identified by Hilhorst, namely:  
 i) a framework for the preparation of PDS, to be issued by NPA, which states the main national objectives of regional development, the broad aims of a PDS and a timetable for PDS formulation;  
 ii) identification of main development problems by each (R)DC and UC;  
 iii) "forming of working groups, tasks forces and teams composed of representatives of the relevant line-ministries and private sector organisations with a view to identifying the main ongoing investment projects, current plans and main problems in the province" (ibid:12);  
 iv) a national policy of regional (provincial) development should provide additional guidelines which in each province need to be related to the identified main provincial and district development problems. The task forces and working parties (as under iii) use these to come up with preliminary courses of action with regard to each objective/problem cluster;  
 v) the outputs of the various working parties and task forces is developed by the Planning Subcte of the PDC into a draft PDS/SP; the components of this document have been defined in section 2 of this report. This document will have to be approved by the PC.  
 vi) On the basis of the outputs of the previous steps, working parties and taskforces formulate draft provincial development criteria (which need to be of sectoral, spatial and functional nature). The Planning Subcte of the PDC develops the drafts of the working groups into a coherent set of provincial development criteria to be approved by the PC. Together with the PDS these criteria provide the framework for assessing the priorities of individual projects.

104 The next phase, Phase B, concentrates on the identification and formulation of projects and coincides with the remaining 6 steps identified by Hilhorst. It is important to note that these steps should culminate in the APP for each province. All subcommittees of the PDC should play a role in the identification of projects; formulation, costing and sectoral appraisal should be undertaken by the relevant sector ministry; decisions on provincial appraisal of projects and selection of projects for inclusion in GPA should be prepared by the Planning & Budgeting SubCte (chaired by the CPPO) and be approved by the PDC/PC. These decisions are in turn important inputs in the advice the CPPO has to provide to NPA Head Office for national PSIP Committee meetings as well as for approval of donor and NGO projects.

Projects  
 105 Projects can be seen as one of the chief outputs of planning processes. Improved project identification and selection is therefore a critical element in the improved planning performance. As elaborated above, RP during the first five year plan period suffered from deficiencies in this regard. There is a need a) to eliminate the 'unfettered' and 'unrestrained' generation of project proposals; and, b) to introduce a capacity to choose/prioritise project proposals. This can be done in many ways. Here only some of the main suggestions are made.

106 a) separate projects by main source of funding  
 Thus, VIDCO, WADCO and Rural/District Councils plans should concern only the resources that are available to these institutions. Thus, VIDCO and WARD level projects are mostly community self help and NGO aided projects. Hence VIDCO and WARD plans should concentrate on planning the use of these resources and generate a small shelf of viable projects.

107 The local authorities have certain revenues of their own. A RDC plan should in principle only concern itself with projects to be funded from resources available to the LA (these include general and specific capital grants).

108 b) introduce choice enabling measures  
 The very introduction of resource constraints already makes participants in the planning process more conscious of the need to make choices. The selection of projects needs to be rationalised in terms of development priorities lest it degenerates into purely political allocation;

109 -1) monitor all new project activities in a province from all sources so that participants are better informed about development activities. The efforts made by the CPPO (NPA) Mashonaland Central/West to monitor development projects of local and central authorities as well as of NGOs are commendable in this respect. This monitoring role is of critical importance for a balanced provincial appraisal of projects.

110 -2) generate a common framework by way of a Provincial Development Strategy and Provincial Project Criteria as discussed above;

111 -3) provide sector specific project identification and selection guidelines, checklists and questionnaires for local level use. Several ministries and departments have been quite innovative in this area. E.g. the road planning section of DDF, the rural water & sanitation programme;

### 3.2 Role and position of NPA in Regional Planning

112 The Department of Physical Planning (MLGRUD) has played a central role in the post-independence experiences with regional planning. The DPP provided the technical support to the PDC and its provincial planning officers have played a critical role in the preparation of district and provincial development plans. The DPP planners played a double role. On the one hand they performed the function of generalist regional planners, who mobilised and coordinated other sector representatives inputs into the plan formulation exercises. On the other hand DPP had to carry out its statutory functions regarding land, the built environment and land use control.

113 At the time of Independence DPP and ARDA were probably the only planning agencies that had the required capacity (even if one-sided and incomplete) and planners posted in the provinces to fulfill the urgent post-independence demand for rural and regional planning. As a result DPP has built up considerable knowledge and has currently a field staff of 26 planners. The experiences and views of this body of planners are important when considering the role and position of the NPA.

114 There is a clear recognition among the professional planners of DPP that the current subnational planning system has a number of serious shortcomings. Many of these shortcomming have been voiced in this report and there is no need to repeat them here again. Recently DPP planners have discussed the future of regional planning in their 1989 Annual Planners Conference and they have come up with a number of relevant proposals to improve the functioning of the planning system.

115 The DPP Planners Conference (DPP-PC) stresses the need for strategic planning and for a greater emphasis on projects, identified by level of funding. The DPP-PC also recognises that the nature of RP would be different at each operational level. At local (or subdistrict) level the main emphasis would be on community self-help projects. The role of DPP would be limited to strictly physical planning matters and a general supportive (rather than leading) role.

116 At district level some strategic planning is considered necessary to guide district level (own) resource allocation and as an input into provincial level planning. Involvement of the district (i.e. (R)DDC) in projects would be restricted to those that are locally funded. For centrally funded projects the DPP-PC proposes a rolling plan (or shelf of project proposals) to be used in preparation of APP in each province. The Conference recognised that district level planning should be primarily a responsibility of the local authorities themselves. The DPP would play an advisory role in physical planning matters. It sees a role for the NPA to assist the local authority with economic analysis and budgetary implications of its plans.

117 The provincial level is seen by the Conference as the level at which strategic planning takes its full shape and has to reconcile national sectoral policies with district and provincial development priorities and potentials. This provincial strategic plan would provide the framework for prioritising projects submitted by the districts for externally funded (= PSIP) projects. The conference sees the province to play an 'advocacy role' seeking to influence sectoral decision making. According to the DPP-PC, the DPP would have to reduce its roles at the provincial level. While the DPP still should play an active role in the identification of provincial development strategies/strategic plans, "the Provincial Administrator and the National Planning Agency [should] be the lead agencies in the Annual Project Planning cycle where the PA provides administrative services and the NPA technical services"(DPP-PC:9). Lastly, monitoring and evaluation of plans and projects is seen as activities to be undertaken jointly by DPP and NPA.

118 The role of RP at the national level was not fully discussed at the DPP conference. Consequently its conclusions have a preliminary character. In as far as provincial projects are concerned, the Conference saw a need to ensure that they are taken into account in the PSIP allocation procedure. Several suggestions were made ranging from provincial political pressures applied at national level to the strengthening of the role of NPA viz. provincial projects. The Conference did not see any particular role for DPP in this context. With regard to provincial strategies, the DPP might play a role in seeking to reconcile these with national development trends and priorities. However, this could not be elaborated in the absence of a well-developed concept of a national physical plan.

119 On the basis of the above, it can be concluded that DPP planners clearly recognise the need for NPA to 'enter' the RP system and have invited the NPA to do so. The proposals made in this report are in many respects complementary to the ones recommended by the Conference. In general terms, DPP would largely 'return to its professional roots' of physical planning and would play an advisory and technical support role to the districts. At provincial level the department would do the same, but work jointly with the NPA on the preparation of provincial strategic plans and on implementation monitoring. The NPA would concern itself in addition with the financial and budgetary coordination both at provincial and national levels.

### 4 STEPS TO BE UNDERTAKEN BY THE NATIONAL PLANNING AGENCY

120 The analysis and proposals discussed above imply that the NPA will take a more active role in RP in Zimbabwe, both at provincial and national levels. In this regard there are a number of issues that need attention. Among these are:

- strengthening the RP capacity at the NPA Head Office.
- strengthening its presence in the provinces
- investigate arrangements within MFEPD regarding the GPA
- clarify division of tasks with DPP
- clarify respective roles of MLGRUD and MFEPD
- clarify NPA's RP role to Sector Ministries, PCs and LA's

Below each issues will be elaborated upon.

Strengthening NPA(HQ) capacities in RP

121 The current shortage of staff impedes NPA to assume its role. It prevents staff designated for the RP tasks to effectively engage in these responsibilities and learn more about regional development aspects as they are required to attend to other responsibilities. At the same time the Research Division has potential for doing relevant policy research.

122 It is suggested that the RP division be formally designated and its staffing strengthened to at least 3 planners, one of whom is the Chief Regional Planner.

123 The RP capacity of NPA (HQ) can be improved by means of various forms of formal and informal training and research. Suggestions in this field are discussed in the report on that subject which has been prepared by Dr D.R. Gasper.

Strengthening NPA presence in the provinces

123 The effective implementation of the above suggestions require the posting of a CPPO in each of the provinces. In view of the tasks to be carried out by the CPPO, it seems furthermore advisable to provide the CPPO with additional professional assistance. Certainly in case it would prove not possible to have all eight CPPOs in place within the next few months (a minimum of four appears the absolute minimum), then certainly additional professional assistance needs to be actively considered.

The number of additional staff to be assigned to each CPPO would depend on the volume of work in each province. The research on the regionalization of PSIP, proposed in the Report on Regional Policy Preparation, will give some indications on the actual volume of work in each province.

124 NPA has correctly decided that the CPPOs need to be experienced planners and need to have a high civil service rank (almost equivalent to a PA) for them to be effective. In order to do their work effectively each CPPO needs to have the minimum administrative resources (incl. CSSP, office equipment (incl. a Personal Computer) and transport).

125 The main (recurrent) tasks of the CPPO will be:

- a) to coordinate the preparation of the APP; by virtue of this the CPPO would chair the Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation SubCte of the PDC;
- b) to monitor projects from RDCs, UCs, SMs and NGOs and prepare annual provincial development projects overviews;
- c) monitor economic trends of the province;
- d) to assess projects to be included under the GPA in terms of the Reg Dev Strategy of the province. Since this strategy has an economic and spatial component, this would have to be done jointly with the PPO (DPP);
- e) participate in PSIP deliberations at NPA/FEPD.

PSIP procedures and Global Provincial Allocation

126 The suggestion to investigate the possibility of the Global Provincial Allocation, if considered feasible, needs to be i) followed up within FEPD (Budget Cte and PSIP administration); ii) examined for its administrative implications, and iii) discussed with planning units of SMs and PCs prior for it to become a draft policy proposal to be considered by Cabinet.

Clarify division of labour between NPA and DPP

127 The DPP has been one of the key, if not most central, agency which has provided technical support for the generation of district and provincial Five Year Development Plans as well as for the annual plans of districts and provinces.

128 As pointed out in earlier paragraphs, DPP and NPA have complementary roles to play. It is of considerable importance that NPA and DPP establish very good working relationships at the professional planners level in the interest of the development of the planning system in Zimbabwe. From this point of view it is suggested that NPA prepare a position paper on how it sees the functions of regional planning and the role of NPA in it and work out a working relationship with DPP.

Clarify relation between FEPD and LGRUD viz. RP

129 During interviews we have obtained indications of considerable differences of opinion between DPP, DERUDE and the Rural & District Councils Section of LGRUD as to the the future direction of RP, the 5YPDP as well as the respective roles of LAs, LGRUD field Administration (PA, DA), DPP and of DERUDE. The delays in the discussion of the DPP proposals within LGRUD appear to confirm this.

130 The Provincial Councils and Administration Act has given the responsibility for the Provincial Councils and PDC to the Minister of LGRUD. The suggestions contained in this report all point to the need to a joint MLGRUD & FEPD responsibility.

Publicise and debate NPA's position viz. RP with SMs, LAs and PCs/PDCs

131 There appears to be a lack of information, knowledge and awareness as to what is/will be the role of NPA in regional planning. Some interviewees readily accept a primary role of NPA at the provincial level, wihle others need to be educated about the role(s) and potentials of NPA.

P A R T II

PREPARATION OF BACKGROUND MATERIAL  
FOR THE FORMULATION OF A  
NATIONAL POLICY OF REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT

## 5. BASIC INFORMATION REQUIREMENTS AND POTENTIAL POLICY AREAS

132 The preparatory work was divided into two parts:  
 a) identification of materials needed for an analysis of long term trends of regional development;  
 b) the exploration of policy issues in regional development.

133 For several reasons, it was considered desirable to involve NPA staff in these efforts. Not only has this field of policy been virtually unexplored by NPA, but also NPA staff would, through their direct involvement, better appreciate the regional dimensions of economic development in general and of the various sectors in particular.

134 Five NPA staff were seconded to take part in this preparatory work, namely Mr S. Nhando, Mr E. Nhara, Ms S. Tazibona, Mr Mangwende and Ms A. Ziso. In addition, Mr E. Chigudu would take responsibility for two policy areas, identified below, while Mr Nyathi would oversee the completion of the work. A number discussion were held, first with Mr Nyathi, Deputy Director Research, and subsequently with Mr Chigudu and this group of 5 NPA staff. Follow-ups with each individually took place during the course of the last two weeks of the mission.

Analysis of long term trends in regional development

135 In first instance the analysis would best be limited to two main areas, namely, the demography of regional development and regional economic trends.

Demographic trends

136 The preparatory work focussed on identification of sources to describe provincial demographic trends and to analyse inter- and intra-provincial patterns of settlement and migration.

- population growth, density and composition by age and sex by province
- migration: rural/urban and by province (residence by birth, by residence 12 month ago)
- urbanization patterns

137 The most recent population census is of 1982. The Central Statistics Office has released a number of reports on the results of the census (see section 6). In addition it has produced population projections for the period 1982-2032 under three different scenario conditions. These population projections are national ones and have not been made for provinces or main urban areas.

138 The first 5YPDP in as far as they contained population projections relied on simple projections based on the 1969-1982 intercensal growth rate. These intercensal growth rates need to be used with caution, not only because of the effects of the independence struggle in particular areas (refugees), the insufficient coverage in 1982 of other areas because of dissident activity but also because of the post-independence upsurge in migration (both rural-urban and rural-rural).

139 In 1989 the results were published of a demographic and health sample survey, which gives, among other new estimates of age-specific

fertility rates. These rates are considerably lower than those generated by the 1984 Reproductive Health Survey and come closer to the 1982 census findings.

140 Over the last two years the CSO has produced reports on the demographic features of all provinces based on the 1982 census. These reports contain migration tables and fertility statistics. These would enable the NPA to make more reliable provincial population estimates using the cohort-survival method.

141 Since independence some studies have appeared on the urbanization pattern, produced by geographers of the Department of Geography and of the Department of Rural & Urban Planning of the University of Zimbabwe.

#### Economic trends

142 The study of regional economic trends could best be approached in two stages. One that would analyse overall trends in regional output and employment and another that would examine the regional dimension of the various economic sectors.

#### Aggregate trends in provincial output and employment

143 The Hilhorst report made mention of the intention of the CSO to make available data on provincial gross output and employment. Follow-up discussions with the CSO have revealed that it is unrealistic to assume that such figures would become available within the very near future. It would require changes in the FID code of each entry in the survey database to be able to process the data on provincial lines.

144 A second best solution was considered by requesting the CSO to disaggregate formal employment and earnings figures for the 12 main urban areas. This information is currently collected but only presented in aggregate form and for only 7 urban areas in the CSO Quarterly Digest. It was found feasible to disaggregate this data into main economic activity and to extend it to all 12 urban areas. Mr Mangwende has been assigned to extract this information from CSO archives.

#### Regional studies on sectors

145 The second line of data collection would concentrate on the (inter)regional dimensions of main economic sectors. Studies at this level are best done at the NPA and would enable NPA to place future provincial development strategies and sectoral project proposals in a better perspective.

146 The dualism in agriculture between large (and small) scale commercial farming and communal area peasant farming is reflected in the sources of information. An additional complication is that some agricultural statistics are not immediately available in regionally disaggregated form, while others can only be obtained for spatial divisions other than the administrative ones (e.g. crop statistics of marketing parastatals).

147 Main sources of information are: Crop statistics from the CSO and the Ministry of Agriculture & Resettlement, complemented by crop reports from the marketing parastatals (GMB, CMB, CSC, DMB). Figures on re-

settlement schemes can be obtained from the Census of Resettlement Schemes from DERUDE.

The socio-economic surveys of the Communal Lands, produced under the Zimbabwe National Household Capability Programme, provide valuable material on the land holdings, farm and household assets. Important studies on the peasant sector are those by Callear, Sandford, Whitsun Foundation, Du Toit and Jassat & Chakaodza

148 The industrial sector is generally well documented. The CSO has been requested to provide disaggregated data by manufacturing subsector for all main urban areas covered in the Census of Manufacturing Production. Small and informal industrial activity is not very well captured in the Census of Manufacturing. Selected studies undertaken by researchers of the Department of Rural & Urban Planning and the Department of Economics of the University and of the School of Social Work give fragmented insights on notably rural industrial enterprise and urban informal sector (e.g. Moyo et.al.; Helmsing; Brand).

149 With regard to the regional dimension of services, three important subsectors are public administration and services (education/health); retail/wholesale trade, and tourism. The CSO has recently published the Census of Distribution, which provides disaggregated data. For the other subsectors follow up is needed in order to obtain specific studies.

#### Suggested policy issues in regional development

150 While there has been a growing concern for the regional factor in development both at national and provincial level, there has been very little study of regional development with a view to assist policy formulation. As part of this mission a number of potential policy issues have been identified which are summarised below.

#### Regional/district of development indicators

151 The premisses for regional policy may be based either on an economic growth or on distributional (spatial equity) objective. The study of indicators of economic and social development of the districts and provinces of the country provides a basis for either policy.

152 The CSO has recently published district and provincial data sheets covering a selected range of economic and social indicators which could provide the basis for such a study. The analysis will result in a better appreciation of the provincial and district level development gaps. It was found possible to obtain the data contained in these reports on Lotus Spreadsheets. Follow up is needed with Mr Sidindi of the Demographic Section of the CSO.

#### Regional impact of the Public Sector Investment Programme

153 Research on the regional breakdown of the PSIP is needed for two reasons. The first is a very practical one: the proposal for a Global Provincial Allocation requires an examination of the current relative size of national and provincial projects. By analysing the current provincial breakdown in terms of numbers of projects and resources allocated one is able to examine to what extent alternative GPA distribution formulas depart from the pre-existing patterns.

Furthermore this research would help to establish the potential workload of each of the CPPOs.

154 A study on the regional effects of the PSIP programme would enable the NPA to clarify to what extent PSIP has affected regional imbalances. This would be the second reason. By necessity this type of research is exploratory. Three indicators can be used: i) estimated permanent employment for productive projects; ii) districts served by infrastructure projects; and iii) population served by social sector projects.

Provincial unemployment  
155 If the government is to launch major initiatives to combat unemployment, it is necessary to examine the regional distribution of rural and urban (under-) unemployment. The CSO Provincial Main Demographic Features Reports together with the Labour Force Survey provide the basis for this line of research. The analysis should be complemented by rural and urban informal sector studies.

Environmental & land pressure  
156 Environmental degradation and population pressures are mainly communal area problems but there considerable regional differences in the nature and extent of environmental degradation and of population pressure on the land. Studies by Dr Whitlow of the Geography Department of UZ and by the Natural Resources Board and Forestry Commission are important sources of information. The main justification for inclusion of this line of inquiry is that any new national land reform cum communal area reorganization policy is likely to be geographically differentiated and would have an area focus as land use potentials, LSCF underutilization and CA population pressures and cattle overstocking are geographically very unevenly distributed.

Evaluation of Service Centre/Growth Point policies  
157 A service center policy belongs to the group of basic regional development policies and aims to organise effectively the provision of public services. The growth point concept has been a widely used concept to guide policies aiming to promote regional economic development.

158 There are considerable doubts about the effectiveness and sustainability of the current Rural Service Centre/District Service Centre and Growth Point policies implemented immediately after Independence. The policies were mainly concerned with infrastructural development in the communal areas without considering the wider spatial economy. The economic aspects have received much less attention. Not only with regard to the impacts on the rural economy but also with regard to the financial sustainability of the infrastructural provisions (maintenance). The amalgamation of Rural and District Councils will cause a number of relocations of local authority seats and this calls for a re-examination of the district service centers.

159 If there will be a much greater emphasis on land reform and land reorganization then there is all the more reason to carefully evaluate this rural centre focussed policy.

Informal sector (IS)  
160 The document of the Procedures for the Second Five Year National Development Plan states that "One way of increasing ownership by Nationals is to expand informal sector, medium and small scale enterprises" (P.9). Although some measures to promote these activities will undoubtedly be of a national scope (e.g. access to foreign exchange and credit;) others are more local (e.g. removal of some local authority measures). The main justification is that the informal sector operates at localised scales and as a result spatial access is likely to be an important factor to be considered.

Resource potentials for regional development  
161 While some areas/provinces have a poor natural resource base (e.g. Matabeleland South and the communal areas of Masvingo) others have considerable untapped resources in game, tourism and mining (e.g. Mashonaland West, Matabeleland North) or can intensive their resource use, notably in areas of irrigation agriculture, agro-industry (Manicaland). A national policy of regional development is likely to emphasise the need to develop these province specific resource potentials. There is a need to make an inventory of currently ongoing and proposed projects and programmes. The Planning & Development Section of ADA and the relevant sector ministries (Natural Resources & Tourism, Mines) are the primary sources of information.

Financing local and regional development  
162 One of the key constraints on viable decentralized development and planning is the availability of financial resources. Studies have shown the declining resource base of local authorities (Helmsing, 1987, 1989). The provincial level is handicapped by absence of any budgetary resources. At the same time Central Government is under severe fiscal stress and increasingly determined to reduce the budget deficit. This drive to reduce the budget deficit may partly be realised by 'squeezing' local authorities, i.e. reducing central government transfers.

163 These considerations together with justified calls for greater local/regional resource availabilities point to the need to study the issue of financing of local and regional development, both from the point of view of expanding local fiscal bases as well as of central government transfers. A number of studies have been identified in this area (Tax Commission, 1986; Helmsing, 1987, 1988, 1989)

Summary of agreed tasks of NPA staff  
164 Below a summary is given of the tasks which NPA staff agreed to initiate. The overall coordination is carried out by the Deputy Director Research, Mr V. Nyathi.

Person (a) = Mr Mangwende (d) = Ms Tazibona  
 (b) = Mr Nhando (e) = Ms Ziso  
 (c) = Mr nhara (f) = Mr Chigudu

Person	(A)	(B)	(C)	(D)	(E)	(F)
Task						
Demographic studies						
- provincial profiles			x			
- migration & growth			x			
- urbanization			x			
- pop. projections			x			
Ag. economic trends	x					
Regional dimensions of						
- agriculture	x					
- industry		x				
- trade/pers. serv.	x	x				
- transport	x		x			
- informal sector		x				
Development indicators			x			
Impact PSIP	x		x			
Regionalization PSIP	x		x			
Provincial unemployment	x					
Environment	x					
Evaluation GP/RSCs		x		x		
Resource potentials						
Financing Reg Dev			x			

## 6 GUIDE TO REGIONAL STATISTICS AND STUDIES

### Demography

Central Statistics Office, 1984. The 1982 Population Census A preliminary assessment Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1985. Main demographic features of the population of Zimbabwe: an advance report on a ten per cent sample. Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1989. Zimbabwe demographic and health survey 1988 Harare/Westinghouse: CSO/DHS

Central Statistics Office, 1986. Population projections of Zimbabwe: 1982 to 2032 Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1988. Main demographic features of the population of Manicaland province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1988. Main demographic features of the population of Matabeleland North province Harare: CSO  
 Central Statistics Office, 1989. Main demographic features of the population of Matabeleland South province Harare: CSO  
 Central Statistics Office, 1989. Main demographic features of the population of Mashonaland Central province Harare: CSO  
 Central Statistics Office, 1989 Main demographic features of the population of MASHONALAND EAST Province Harare: CSO  
 Central Statistics Office, 1989 Main demographic features of the population of Mashonaland West Province Harare: CSO  
 Central Statistics Office, 1989. Main demographic features of the population of Masvingo province Harare: CSO  
 Central Statistics Office, 1989 Main demographic features of the population of Midlands Province Harare: CSO  
 Mutizwa-Mangiza, 1985. Rank-size distribution of urban centres in Zimbabwe: inter-censal changes 1962-1982. Geography, 1985.

### Employment, unemployment and occupation

Central Statistics Office, 1989. Main results of the labour force survey 1986-1987 Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1988. Main demographic features of the population of Manicaland province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1988. Main demographic features of the population of Matabeleland North province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1989. Main demographic features of the population of Matabeleland South province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1989. Main demographic features of the population of Mashonaland Central province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1989 Main demographic features of the population of MASHONALAND EAST Province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1989 Main demographic features of the population of Mashonaland West Province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1989. Main demographic features of the population of Masvingo province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1989 Main demographic features of the population of Midlands Province Harare: CSO

### Agriculture

Central Statistics Office, 1989, Quarterly Digest of Statistics. Harare: CSO. Provides main agricultural indicators (crops, livestock, employment, capital formation), also available for preceding years.

Department of Rural Development, 1989. Census of Resettlement Schemes Harare: CSO

AGRITEX, annual report on livestock in communal areas

GMB/CMB, various years, crop marketing report (internal reports)

The reports by GMB and CMB and those by AGRITEX use their own geographical subdivisions which do not coincide with the political-administrative one

### Communal Area economy and development issues

Central Statistics Office, 1988. The economy of households in Zimbabwe 1985 Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1988. Agriculture and livestock survey Communal Lands 1985/6 Harare: CSO

Jassat, E & B. Chakaodza, 1986 Socio-economic baseline study Rushinga District ZIDS Consultancy Reports No. 3 Harare: ZIDS

Callear D. 1982. The Social and Cultural Factors involved in Production by Small Farmers in Wedza Communal Area, Zimbabwe, of Maize and its Marketing. UNESCO, Paris.

Republic of Zimbabwe. 1982. Study for the Agricultural\Rural Development of the communal Areas of Mashonaland East Province. Baseline Survey and Development Strategy. PTA Consulting Services, Harare. Volume IV.

Sandford Stephen. Livestock in the Communal Areas of Zimbabwe. A report prepared for the Ministry of Lands, Resettlement and Rural Development. ODI, London.

Whitsun Foundation. 1983. Land Reform in Zimbabwe. Harare

Du Toit, R.F. et.al. 1984 Wood usage and tree planting in Zimbabwe's communal lands A baseline study of knowledge, attitudes and practices. Harare: Forestry Commission

Jackson, J & Collier, P. 1988. Incomes, poverty and food security in the Communal Lands of Zimbabwe. RUP Occasional Papers No. 11. Department of Rural & Urban Planning, University of Zimbabwe.

Helmsing, A.H.J. 1987. Non-agricultural enterprise in the Communal Lands of Zimbabwe. Preliminary results of a survey. RUP Occasional Papers No. 10. Department of Rural & Urban Planning, University of Zimbabwe.

#### Industry

Central Statistics Office, 1985/86 The census of production Mining, manufacturing, construction, electricity and water supply. Harare: CSO.

Similar survey available for preceding years.

Maya, R.S. & H. Tongona, 1989 Ownership structure of the manufacturing enterprises in Zimbabwe. Vols 1 and 2 ZIDS Consultancy Reports No.9 Harare: ZIDS

#### Wholesale/retail trade

Central Statistics Office, 1980/1 Census of distribution report Harare: CSO

#### Informal sector

Moyo, N et.al. 1983 The informal sector in Zimbabwe. Harare: ILO

Brand, V. 1988. One-dollar workplaces. Journal of Social Development in Africa.

#### Regional and District Development Indicators

Central Statistics Office, 1989 District population data sheets Mashonaland West Province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1989 District population data sheets Mashonaland Central Province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1988 District population data sheets Masvingo Province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1988 District population data sheets Midlands Province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1987 District population data sheets Manicaland Province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1988 District population data sheets Matabeleland North Province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1989 District population data sheets Mashonaland East Province Harare: CSO

Central Statistics Office, 1988 District population data sheets Matabeleland South Province Harare: CSO

Provincial demographic reports mentioned above

#### Service Centers and Growth Points

Ministry Local Government & Town Planning, 1985 Planning and development of growth points and service centres Harare: Dept of Physical Planning

Ministry of Finance, 1979 Urban development in the main centres Salisbury: Government Printer

Wekwete, K.H. 1987. Growth center policy in Zimbabwe. A focus on district centres. RUP Occasional Papers No. 7. Department of Rural & Urban Planning, University of Zimbabwe.

Gasper, D.R. 1989. Growth points and rural industries: ideologies and policies. RUP Occasional Papers No. 18. Department of Rural & Urban Planning, University of Zimbabwe.

#### Financing Regional Development

Kavran, D., 1989 Report of the Public Service review Commission of Zimbabwe 2 vols Harare: Government Printer

Chelliah, R.J. 1986 Report of the Commission of Inquiry into Taxation Harare: Government Printer

Mutizwa-Mangiza, N.D. 1986. Local government and planning in Zimbabwe. An examination of recent changes with special reference to the provincial/regional level. Third World Planning Review, 8, 2, 153-175.

Mutizwa-Mangiza, N.D. 1989. Decentralization in Zimbabwe: problems of planning at the district level. RUP Occasional Papers No. 16. Department of Rural & Urban Planning, University of Zimbabwe.

Helmsing, A.H.J. & Wekwete, K.H. 1987. Financing district councils. Local taxes and central allocations. RUP Occasional Papers No. 9. Department of Rural & Urban Planning, University of Zimbabwe.

Helmsing, A.H.J. 1989. Transforming rural local government: Zimbabwe's post-independence experience. RUP Occasional Papers No. 19. Department of Rural & Urban Planning, University of Zimbabwe.

Helmsing, A.H.J. 1989. Amalgamation and beyond. Thoughts on functions and finance of rural local government. Paper presented at the Fifth Congress of the Association of District Councils, held at Victoria Falls, 8 - 11 February 1989.

#### Environmental

Campbell, B.M. et.al. (eds) 1989. The Save Study. Relationships between the environment and basic needs satisfaction in the Save catchment, Zimbabwe. Supplement to Zambezia, 1988. Harare: University of Zimbabwe

Du Toit, et.al. 1984. Wood usage and tree planting in Zimbabwe. A baseline study of knowledge, attitudes and practices. Harare: Forestry Commission.

#### Other references

DPP, 1989. Draft report on the 1989 Planners Conference, Masvingo August 1989. Harare: DPP (mimeographed)

Mellors, D.R. & Conyers, D. 1989. Review of the provincial and district planning system. Background paper for the Evaluation Workshop on the Provincial and District Planning System. KweKwe, August 1989

Mellors, D.R. & Conyers, D. 1989. Report on the Evaluation Workshop on the Provincial and District Planning System. KweKwe, August 1989

Swedeplan, 1988. Challenges to regional development planning in Zimbabwe. Swedeplan.

Hilhorst, J.G.M. 1989. Assistance in regional planning to National Planning Agency, Zimbabwe. ISSAS Harare/The Hague: ISSAS.

Helmsing, A.H.J. 1989. Planning and the financing of plans. Reflections of subnational practice in Southern & Eastern Africa. In: Helmsing A.H.J. & Wekwete, K.H. (eds) 1989. Subnational planning in Southern & Eastern Africa. Harare: University of Zimbabwe (mimeographed)

## APPENDIX 1

## List of persons interviewed

## Agricultural Development Authority

Mr. C. Mbwanda - Planning Controller  
Mr. F. Shamu - Land Use Planner

## Central Statistics Office

Mr Jambwa - Deputy Director  
Mr Tendere - Deputy Director  
Mr F. Sidindi - Statistician Demographic Section  
Mr A. Muzanenhamo - Employment Section

## Ministry of Finance, Economic Planning and Development

## (1) National Planning Agency

Dr. S. Mahlahla - Director  
Mr. A. Nyamatore - Dep. Director (Planning/Projects)  
Mr. V. Nyathi - Dep. Director (Research/Macro)  
Mr. E. Chigudu - Chief Planner (Regional)  
Mr. J. Mabenge - Chief Provincial Planning Officer (Mashonaland Central & Mashonaland West)  
Mr. S. Magonya - Chief Provincial Planning Officer (Matabeleland North & Matabeleland South)  
Dr. V. Rajkovic - UNDP Chief Technical Advisor  
Dr. R. Bhargava - UNDP Technical Advisor  
Mr. S. Nhando - Asst. Chief Planner (Research);  
Ms. S. Tazibona - Planner, Projects Section  
Ms. A. Ziso - Planner, Projects Section  
Mr. F. Mangwende - Planner, Research division  
Mr. E. Nhara - Planner, Research division  
(2) Deputy Minister Dr. T. Masaya  
(3) Treasury  
Ms. L. Chitauro - Under Secretary (PSIP Administration)

## Ministry of Lands, Agriculture and Rural Resettlement

Mr. N. Masoka - Deputy Secretary (Planning)  
Mr. Musindo - Assistant Secretary (Planning)

## Ministry of Local Government, Rural and Urban Development

(1) Rural District Councils Section  
Mr. Matumbike - Deputy Secretary  
Mr. M. Matongo - Assistant Secretary  
(2) Department of Physical Planning  
Mr. A. Mlalazi - Deputy Director (Rural/Regional)  
(3) Department of Rural Development  
Mr. F. Gonese - Deputy Director  
Mr. S. Mhishi - Chief Planning Officer  
(4) Pilot District Support Project  
Dr. D. Conyers - Technical Assistance Officer

## Parliament

Mr. D. Mutasa - Speaker

## UNDP

Mr. A. Klap - Assistant Res. Rep.

Zimbabwe Institute of Public Administration & Management  
Dr. J. Gapara - Director  
Dr. I. Cormack - Head, Development Planning section  
Mr. W. Bhule - Lecturer