

**EDUCATION AND POVERTY
IN AN INTERNATIONAL CONTEXT**

Education and Poverty in an International Context

Spring 2006

Senior Co-Editors

Katherine Martinelli

*Master of Arts Student
Family & Community Education
International Educational Development
Department of International & Transcultural Studies
krm2112@columbia.edu*

Leah Mason

*Doctor of Education Student
Language Policy
International Educational Development
Department of International & Transcultural Studies
lmm2119@columbia.edu*

Editors

Ramatu Bangura

*Master of Education Student
Peace Education
International Educational Development
Department of International & Transcultural Studies
rtb2105@columbia.edu*

Tavis D. Jules

*Doctor of Education Student
International Educational Policy Studies
International Educational Development
Department of International & Transcultural Studies
tdj2101@columbia.edu*

Juan Carlos Calcagno

*Doctor of Education Student
Economics of Education
Program in Economics and Education
Department of International & Transcultural Studies
jcc2111@columbia.edu*

Ying Zhai

*Master of Arts Student
Peace Education
International Educational Development
Department of International & Transcultural Studies
yz2166@columbia.edu*

Cover Design

Aaron Hung

Cover Photo

Nasir Kahn

Copy Editor

Julia Pistell

Publication of this volume was made possible through grants and assistance from the Teachers College Student Senate, the Teachers College Office of Student Activities and the Department of International and Transcultural Studies

© 2006 Society for International Education
Teachers College, Columbia University
New York, New York

CONTENTS

Foreward, <i>Zeena Zakharia</i>	v
Editors' Note	ix

Essays

The Poor Don't Need Another Prophet: A People-Centered Approach to Microfinance and Education in Bolivia, <i>Payal Arora</i>	3
Regional Economic Stratification and its Impact on Women's Educational Access and HIV/AIDS Prevalence in Kenya: A Comparison Between the Nyanza and Central Provinces, <i>Serah Shani</i>	8
The Effects of Early Education on Children in Poverty, <i>Anna D. Johnson</i>	14

Research Papers

Human Rights Based Approaches in State Development Programming: A Selected Survey of Right to Education and Right to Food Programs, <i>Law School Human Rights Clinic</i>	21
Determinants of Child Labor in Thailand, <i>Rubkwan Tharmmapornphilas</i>	39
The Private Direct Costs of Primary Education in Urban China, <i>Yan Shi</i>	51
The Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper and Tanzania's Next Generation, <i>Tavis Jules</i>	65
Notes on Contributors	80

Foreword

Zeena Zakharia

*Doctor of Education Candidate
International Educational Development
Department of International and Transcultural Studies
Teachers College, Columbia University*

The link between poverty and education is a modern construct, rooted in a post-World War II problematization of poverty and emergence of a discourse of poverty-as-deficiency, with development as its antithesis. This 'discovery' of mass poverty on a worldwide scale framed two-thirds of the world as poor, creating a new paradigm for looking at the world (Escobar, 1995). "Thus poverty became an organizing concept" (p. 24), and improving the human condition through the 'development project' (McMichael, 1996) became a necessity, or universal truth – a transnational mission. The incorporation and institutionalization of poverty alleviation into western academic research, national agendas, and international development practice, can be traced to the 1960s and 1970s, when a significant strategy shift occurred within Robert McNamara's World Bank (Finnemore, 1997). By the mid-1970s, poverty had come to be viewed as a condition of people, rather than states.

The conception and treatment of poverty in academic circles and development institutions are continuously evolving, and with these, notions about the role of education in alleviating poverty concerns. Education has been viewed as a panacea for a number of human 'ailments.' This education-as-cure or education-as-intervention perspective has pulled education into the development formula. In addition, human capital theory has tied economic development tightly to education and has continued to be a prominent mainstream framework for poverty eradication.

Concurrently, state and non-state actors, local and international, have approached the provision of educational services from a human rights perspective. In September 2000, the international community reaffirmed its commitment to improving conditions for the poor through the United Nations Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Among the eight key goals, the second is to ensure that, by 2015, all the world's children will be able to complete a full five-year course of primary schooling. This education-as-right perspective is prominent in international development rhetoric and has been used to wrap national economic agendas and geo-strategic interests of donor nations in (the more palatable form of) human rights clothing.

This volume represents efforts by Columbia University graduate students to analyze and understand some of the complex links between education and poverty through different conceptual frameworks and methodological approaches. The papers are organized into two sections and reflect some of the diverse disciplines and fields – human development, anthropology, economics, international development, and law – concerned with these issues at Columbia

University. The first set of papers represents a collection of essays that explore poverty from the perspective of education-as-intervention.

In the first of these essays, "The Poor Don't Need Another Prophet: A People-Centered Approach to Microfinance and Education in Bolivia," Payal Arora questions the ability of microfinance practices to benefit the poorest of the poor. Drawing on the Bolivian context, she explores the limitations of microfinance practices and makes a case for informal networks of self-help groups in advancing a more people-centered approach to savings and lending and self-development, or informal education. Such collective social enterprise, she argues, holds greater promise for engaging the poor in building on their existing social capital, than microfinance practices, which tend to address those living just above or below the poverty line.

Next, Serah Shani illustrates the correlation between regional economic disparities, women's educational opportunity, and the spread of HIV/AIDS in "Regional Economic Stratification and its Impact on Women's Educational Access and HIV/AIDS Prevalence in Kenya: A Comparison Between the Nyanza and Central Provinces." Linking these three factors with the persistence of women's poverty in Kenya since independence, the essay underscores the historicity and complexity of issues. The author suggests that formal schooling may provide the most viable avenue for addressing women's poverty and the spread of HIV/AIDS because of its promise of occupational mobility.

The final essay in this section, "The Effects of Early Education on Children in Poverty," extends the discussion of education-as-intervention by providing an overview of current U.S. research on the role that early childhood programs can play in closing socioeconomic and racial gaps in school readiness. Anna D. Johnson discusses evidence of these gaps among U.S. populations, then reviews the literature on the impact of programs targeting young children from poor socioeconomic backgrounds prior to the start of formal schooling. The research findings provide evidence that such programs can produce lasting cognitive and developmental benefits for children, thus mitigating the potential obstacles to school readiness associated with poverty.

The second set of papers represents empirical studies largely from the education-as-right perspective. They demonstrate the challenges of the poor in gaining an education, as well as the disconnection between human rights discourse and development programming, and local realities and definitions of poverty. The authors approach their studies from various fields, thus reflecting the diversity of methods and approaches for analyzing these significant issues.

The section of empirical papers opens with a critical examination of the links between human rights and development discourses in "Human Rights Based Approaches in State Development Programming: A Selected Survey of Right to Education and Right to Food Programs." By reviewing five selected cases of state-driven initiatives from different continents, the authors from the Columbia University Law School Human Rights Clinic, highlight some of the various ways in which states are employing rights language within development

policy and programming. In doing so, the authors illustrate the consequences and practical challenges to implementing development practices within a rights-based framework, including inadequate mechanisms for evaluation and accountability.

The next two papers employ quantitative analyses of national data sets to explore economic factors linking poverty and education. In "Determinants of Child Labor in Thailand," Rubkwan Tharmmapornphilas investigates factors influencing family decisions regarding children's school enrollment. Drawing on data for youth aged 15 to 17 from the 2003 Thailand Labor Force Survey, the study empirically tests the luxury axiom, which stipulates that a family living below the poverty line will need income from child labor, and thus their children are less likely to attend school. The findings suggest a number of factors influencing the occurrence of child labor, including parental schooling, with no positive support for the luxury axiom.

Next, Yan Shi investigates household expenditure related to a child's public schooling in "The Private Direct Costs of Primary Education in Urban China." Using data from the 1995 Chinese Household Income Project, the author illustrates that, despite the government's commitment to tuition-free primary schooling, in reality, a substantial economic burden persists for households in providing for related costs, such as transportation to and from schools, uniforms, textbooks, and writing supplies. Consistent with previous studies, findings suggest that variations in private costs occur largely along socioeconomic lines, with higher income households systematically spending more on primary education-related costs, than lower income households. However, this economic burden as a percent of household income decreases dramatically with increasing wealth. In short, the poorest families bear the largest burden for primary education, despite the lowest allocation of private resources. In addition, variations in private costs do not appear to be statistically significant along gender lines, ethnicity, or parent educational levels. By investigating private costs to public education, the author contributes to understandings of the persistence of educational inequality, despite universal primary schooling, particularly with new manifestations of poverty brought on by transitions to a market economy. The study thus highlights some of the challenges to realizing Education for All and the Millennium Development Goals for education among the world's poor.

The final paper in this volume takes an interpretive approach to exploring the poverty reduction strategy of Tanzania in relation to education, and how it is understood by various stakeholders in a rural school community of the Kilimanjaro region. In "The Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper and Tanzania's Next Generation," Tavis Jules employs ethnographic methods and document analysis to investigate shared meanings of poverty, and attitudes regarding aspects of the 2002 Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP). Among other things, the findings demonstrate a disconnection between the document and stakeholders' meanings of poverty, which extend beyond PRSP definitions.

In concluding the volume, the final paper reminds us that the ways in which poverty is perceived and measured has a significant impact on how it is

addressed. In expressing the view that quality education is an important avenue out of poverty, and that poverty is a significant hindrance to gaining an education, participants in Jules' study capture a worldwide dilemma and recurrent theme for authors of this volume: that education and its promised benefits are not enjoyed by all of the world's people. Furthermore, the barriers to education remain for the world's poorest, despite international and local commitments to universal primary education as a fundamental human right. The issues raised by the authors in this volume and the analyses and perspectives they provide offer a modest contribution towards envisioning a way forward to breaking past these seemingly cyclical and steadfast problems.

References

- Burde, D. (2005). *Education in crisis situations: Mapping the field*. Washington, DC: USAID.
- Escobar, A. (1995). *Encountering development: The making and unmaking of the Third World*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Finnemore, M. (1997). Redefining development at the World Bank. In Cooper, F. & Packard, R. (Eds), *International development and the social sciences* (pp. 203-227). Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- McMichael, P. (1996). *Development and social change: A global perspective*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Pine Forge.
- United Nations. (2000). *Millennium Declaration A/Res/55/2*. Retrieved September 14, 2006 from <http://www.unmillenniumproject.org/goals/index.htm>

Editors' Note

This research volume has been compiled with the aim of bringing together multidisciplinary and cross-cultural perspectives on the complex relationship between education and poverty by drawing on the most recent graduate student research from across Columbia University. Since both poverty and education are individually so central within the field of international development, it is only appropriate that this journal try to link those two themes. The authors impressively demonstrate the extent to which these issues cut across transnational and academic borders. The world is becoming smaller every day, and increasingly those involved in the field of international development could benefit from an exchange of new viewpoints and timely information such as this.

The themes addressed in the forthcoming articles are particularly relevant within the context of the eight Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) that were outlined in the Millennium Declaration, which was adopted in 2000 by the United Nations General Assembly. The MDGs have become the yardstick by which international development practitioners and researchers measure 'progress' in developing countries. The authors in this volume speak to a number of the specific Goals, including poverty eradication, achieving universal primary education, promoting gender equality, combating HIV/AIDS and developing a global partnership for development. The text of the Millennium Declaration states that, "we believe the central challenge we face today is to ensure that globalization becomes a positive force for all the world's people. For while globalization offers great opportunities, at present its benefits are very unevenly shared, while its costs are unevenly distributed" (2000, p. 2). By examining the intersections of poverty and education, the authors of this volume expose such global inequalities and inequities, and put forth possibilities for future research and action.

We would like to heartily extol the hard work of the masters and doctoral students who spent their summers preparing the articles for publication. Although the authors all responded to the same Call for Papers, we have before us a rich, diverse collection of articles that represent a multitude of geographic and academic perspectives. They demonstrate the range of approaches to the study of education and poverty, and highlight the professional level of writing and research being conducted by Columbia University graduate students.

The publication of this volume was made possible through grants from the Teachers College Student Senate to our sponsor organizations, the Society for International Education (SIE) and the Society for Economics and Education (SEE). The generous support of Teachers College and Columbia University institutions has made it possible for SIE to create opportunities for student publishing since 2004. We would also like to thank Zeena Zakharia and Tammy Arnstein, two of the founding editors of the journal, for their assistance in getting this issue off the ground.

Katherine Martinelli and Leah Mason
Senior Co-Editors

Ramatu Bangura
Juan Carlos Calcagno
Tavis Jules
Ying Zhai

Editors

Teachers College, Columbia University
New York, New York

References

United Nations. (2000). *Millennium Declaration A/Res/55/2*. Retrieved August 26, 2006, from <http://www.un.org/millennium/declaration/ares552e.pdf>

Essays

The Poor Don't Need Another Prophet: A People-Centered Approach to Microfinance and Education in Bolivia

Payal Arora

*Doctor of Education Student
International Educational Development
Department of International and Transcultural Studies
Teachers College, Columbia University*

Introduction

As international aid agencies increasingly embrace microfinance, the darling of international development, questions are beginning to surface. Who benefits from this savings and lending system that claims to target the poor? Does an increase in social capital of the poor lead to an enhancement of human capital in terms of socialization and education; does that in turn contribute to the fostering of microfinance practices? What kinds of linkages do these institutions need to sustain and replicate their practices? While these are pertinent avenues to investigate, in this essay I seek to address that which is of basic concern in terms of the perceived capacity and capability of the poor: can the poorest of the poor build on their existing social capital through microfinance? To address these questions, this article will examine the growing trend of microfinance practices in Bolivia, drawing out some of its pluralities and complexities as it intersects with the poor.

The concept of microfinance was pioneered around 1976 in Bangladesh by Dr. Muhammad Yunus who sought to make financial provisions to clients conventionally excluded from the financial system on account of their lower economic status. Perhaps most distinct from traditional banking is its 'joint liability' feature, which views a group of individuals as a single client to whom the credit is disbursed. While I acknowledge that microfinance as an institution serves as a legitimate and alternative banking system for the marginalized, I argue that it is still limited by its conventional institutional structure. I propose instead for increased targeted attention to the more informal networks of self-help groups, a novel savings and lending method that seeks to validate and leverage on local social capital for sustainable growth of the group and community at large.

Background

Microfinance is a relatively nascent and exponentially growing trend in development in Bolivia. The concept of formalizing banking practices specifically within rural pockets of poverty as a tool for mobility is energizing and innovative. Poverty can be seen as a multidimensional phenomenon of deprivation of basic human dignities (Narayan et al., 2000). Thereby, microfinance has laid the foundation for a new kind of dialogue in development

with an eye on equity. However, new ideas are still trapped in old paradigms. Microfinance settings tend to be highly institutionalized: encased in a legal rubric, top-down approach, catering to people above or just below the poverty line (indicators that determine the minimum provisions necessary to live in humane conditions) and less on the extreme side of the poverty spectrum. In other words, while accommodative in expanding their client base through a restructuring of policies and practices, microfinance as a financial institution continues to adhere to the principles of traditional banking, which draws parameters of lending and borrowing around the risk-averse nature of individuals and groups. The need for efficiency still prevails as a prime measure of success within this fiscal domain. Meanwhile, "united under the banner of microfinance" (Mordoch, 1999, p.1569) lies the ambitious promise of providing new teeth to community development for social change, particularly amongst women who make up a majority of the world's poorest (Narayan et al., 2000). Fringe social benefits and spill-over effects of microfinance show signs of emerging as prime stars as multilateral agencies seek to use this institution as a common platform for adult education on health issues, legal rights, gender roles and other social agendas enmeshed in the development fabric.

For example, large microcredit organizations in Bolivia, such as Bancosol, Caja Los Andes, and the Private Financial Fund (PRODEM FFP), help to reduce some of the economic risks faced by the poor through a formal credit and savings system. These organizations primarily serve as a system of insurance to the poor who often lack collateral, steady employment and a verifiable credit history and therefore struggle to gain access to traditional credit. By offering small loans for housing, fishing or irrigational projects and by providing banking services such as savings accounts, these organizations are able to create alternatives to help the poor manage their financial resources. These services allow for greater predictability and stability in their day to day lives as well as help mitigate exploitation from local money lenders who often have a credit monopoly and thereby charge high interest rates for small loans. Yet, given the geographic, demographic and paralegal status of much of the poor in places such as Bolivia, development initiatives often merely flirt with the margins of poverty. Stretching from the tropical Amazon to the soaring Andes, Bolivia's diverse landscape and population offer amazing contrasts as well as significant challenges to economic and social development. While the Quechua and Aymara peoples reside mainly in the rural areas and make up the majority of Bolivia's population, microfinance institutions are able to serve primarily an urban-based minority.

The arms of microfinance can only go so far. Behind its seemingly unified front, there are budding camps in the approach of building credit and savings institutions for the poor. In the fervor of international discourse, the invisible intermediaries are often ignored. Typically this is evident with the ad hoc grassroots groups that attempt to create linkages between remote communities and microfinance institutions in their efforts to ensure true sustainability. Granted, there has been an evolution in theory and practice from the historic 'microcredit' approach, in which banking for the poor is viewed as a mere loaning mechanism, to 'microfinance,' in which there is a more proactive component in the utilization of savings for development. However, there is now

a need for a new terminology and practice that better encompasses a more participatory approach and people-centered ideology – self-help groups as a means of self-development and (re)education through collective action.

Self-help groups refer to an informal network of banking and lending that seeks to address more successfully the poorest of the poor who tend to fall through the cracks. This first involves the formulation of small groups, which are particularly inclusive of women, followed by the creation of a system of savings and lending within each group. Critical here is the assumption that even the poorest do save and are open to lending among themselves. The appeal of this seemingly simple practice lies in the fact that not all members need to utilize their savings at a given time, thereby allowing for the constant flow of capital amongst their group unit. This fosters a healthy practice of accountability through peer pressure, a greater degree of fiscal autonomy from high interest moneylenders, and better risk management for those who are not eligible for microfinance loans.

While a relative fledgling in the microfinance world, the conceptualization and practice of self-help groups has pervaded health and community development literature since the 1970s, through organizations such as Alcoholics Anonymous (AA), as support groups for social change (Katz, 1981). Much has been borrowed from this domain, including the assumption that group identity is an extension of personal identity and that engrained within the paradigm of self-help is the practice of help-seeking for learning and growth. Thereby, self-directing individuals shape and are shaped by the diffusion of knowledge, ideologies, and cultural practices that circulate and reference the self and the other in tandem. The organizational structure of these groups mirrors that of self-help groups within the microfinance world in that they are characterized as spontaneous entities (not set up by outside groups), non-bureaucratic and self-referencing, organizing, and directing, with common goals aimed at a shared desire for social change. Interestingly, the Western perception of help-seeking as 'dependence' gives way to social enterprise in learning for group self-sufficiency (Nelson-Le Gall, 1985). The unique marriage of self-help and help-seeking is the model within the microfinance world.

Self-help Groups in Practice

Initiatives such as self-help groups can be viewed as a social movement with people taking (co)responsibility: "The days of the prophets are over. People don't want any more prophets coming into their community and telling them what to do," remarks Aaron Ausland, a project manager for a reputable self-help group NGO near La Paz (Interview, May 20, 2004). Since the financial self-help model is primarily based on group savings, members work with their assets and not with loan liabilities owed to an external agency at the initial stage. Members are compelled to educate each other and seek help on accounting practices, and in the process tend to share resources on health, education and other knowledge that benefit the group as a whole. Perhaps the help-seeking of the past has now been reconfigured through the Freirean thinking that involves critical consciousness for co-constructing knowledge with one another as a means for liberation from structures that define and confine. In other words, by seeking to

perceive and expose inherent oppressions and deprivations, individuals can seize upon this 'conscientization' and act upon it to transform and better their lives (Freire, 1994). Thereby, consciousness is no longer the prerogative of the individual. Additionally, interest earned on loans goes to the group and not to an external service provider. Hence, this is the most cost effective and sustainable method to reach the poorest that enables them to take charge of their own development, building the financial and social capital required to address poverty.

"Banking has never been a new concept...it's like bread...it's universal, for everyone knows intuitively how to manage their savings" says Ausland, when speaking of community resourcefulness in his NGO's implementation of self-help groups near La Paz (Interview, May 20, 2004). Hence, the power of harnessing the preexisting informal banking practices for sustainable development seems to be key in this process. With this shift in paradigms, NGOs are compelled to re-examine their role in this development process. From a conventional capital-granting mechanism, NGOs are starting to function more like a catalyst in providing legitimacy to community initiatives of self-development.

Self-help groups, however, cannot be treated as the nirvana pill for development practices. There are genuine challenges these groups must face to attain mobility and sustainability. The reality is that given this practice, the amount available for loans is small, especially at the beginning. This amount is limited by the participant's capacity to save; some consider this an advantage because it prevents over-borrowing, especially in the early stages of a group's life. Yet, the short loan period limits investment in long-term activities and as a result makes development an excruciatingly slow process. Furthermore, loan funds are not always available at the appropriate times.

Maintaining group cohesion requires constant effort. Given the fact that financial self-help groups are based in regions of extreme poverty, they tend to encounter more seasonality in participation and, at times, a perpetuation of existing social hierarchies within the communities. Additionally, the circulation of knowledge can become claustrophobic as referencing the group becomes a closed and insulated practice. The metamorphosis of education to propaganda is after all a real threat and a persistent reality to even the most meaningful solutions to social change. It is also expensive and often unfeasible to measure social change and community participation to gauge the impact of people-centered practices on alleviation of poverty.

Conclusion

To circumvent some of these hurdles, it is necessary to strengthen the linking initiatives made by grassroots NGOs between these self-help groups and microfinance institutions. This is best achieved through the restructuring of formal banking policies and legal frameworks towards a more inclusive space that provides a forum for the poorest of the poor. The idea is to not create a parallel system of finance but rather to expand the existing parameters of legal and fiscal structures to best encompass this neglected and marginalized majority. This is best achieved through genuine participation and dialogue

among various stakeholders, (community members, local NGOs, microcredit institutions and international aid agencies), to provide legitimacy and scalability to these grassroots initiatives. Similarly, social learning within self-help is best achieved through simultaneous vertical and horizontal sharing and help-seeking from within and from outside of the group. While not asocial in nature, genuine change requires a constant dynamism of the social and the individual that allows for reframing and reexamining parameters of popular discourses and practices in knowledge production and consumption.

In the end, true success of NGOs in the development field needs to be measured by their ability to form relationships within the community they choose to serve. The rationalization, impartiality, and reduced opportunities for corruption introduced by formal organizations tend to be viewed as desired developments. Yet informal social groups do have the capacity to do a better job at allocating resources and the dynamism for seeking current knowledge for contextual practices. In essence, the aim is for equity to achieve scale, where efficiency and equity are two sides of the coin rather than diametrically opposed paradigms. After all, when people become their own prophets, prophets will cease to be.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Dr. Michael Woolcock from the World Bank and Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University for his valuable comments and feedback.

References

- Freire, P. (1994). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York: Continuum.
- Katz, A. H. (1981). Self-help and mutual aid: An emerging social movement? *Annual Review of Sociology*, 7, 129-155.
- Grameen Foundation. (2005). Microfinance: An effective poverty reduction strategy. Retrieved August 26, 2006, from <http://www.gfusa.org/strategy/>
- Morduch, J. (1999). The microfinance promise. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 37(4), 1569-1614.
- Narayan, D., Patel, R., Schafft, K., Rademacher, A., & Koch-Schulte, S. (2000). *Voices of the Poor: Can anyone Hear Us?* New York: Oxford University Press.
- Nelson-Le Gall, S. (1985). Help seeking behavior in learning. *Review of Research in Education*, 12, 55-90.

Regional Economic Stratification and its Impact on Women's Educational Access and HIV/AIDS Prevalence in Kenya: A Comparison Between the Nyanza and Central Provinces

Serah Shani

*Doctor of Education Student
Anthropology and Education
Department of International and Transcultural Studies
Teachers College, Columbia University*

Introduction

Following independence in 1963, the Kenyan government embarked on a program of national development with the aim of eradicating poverty and communicable diseases, and providing education for all. Today, four decades after British colonialism, fulfillment of these aspirations are being challenged as young, able-bodied and educated Kenyans fall prey to HIV/AIDS, with women suffering the greatest impact. Regional disparities, such as different rates of education, economic growth, and HIV/AIDS, continue to persist and weigh heavily on women in particular. School access for women has followed uneven patterns of economic development throughout Kenya. This has further influenced the differing rates of HIV/AIDS, not only of men to women, but also among Kenyan provinces.

In this essay, I will explore Kenyan regional economic disparities and their interrelation with women's educational opportunity and the spread of HIV/AIDS within the Nyanza and Central Provinces. I will begin with a description of the scope and magnitude of HIV/AIDS in Kenya and a brief historical background of women's education. This is followed by an overview of regional disparities between the Nyanza and Central Provinces of Kenya in terms of economic and educational development. I will then discuss women's access to education and the rates of HIV/AIDS in the Nyanza and Central Provinces. Finally, I will conclude with a discussion of how education can provide a vehicle for reducing women's poverty and the spread of HIV/AIDS.

The Scope and Magnitude of HIV/AIDS

According to the UNAIDS Report (2004), the number of women who are HIV-positive is steadily increasing. This report states that for Kenya alone, with a population of about 32 million, there are 45 infected women for every 10 infected men. Of the sub-Saharan countries discussed, only Mali equals Kenya's ratio of men to women. Among the 1,100,000 adults aged 15-49 with HIV/AIDS in Kenya, 720,000 are women. The same report also says that there were 150,000 orphans in the year 2003, and indicates that 57% of the infected adults are women and young people, while 75% of the total are women and girls.

Historical Background and Regional Disparities in Women's Education

During the onset of colonial and missionary education in Kenya, women were not generally included in mainstream schooling programs. The home was seen as the woman's domain, while the man was the head of the household. The missionaries who came to Africa further emphasized this idea by insisting that "all authority came from God through the image of the father...the Christian way called for the father to dominate his children and family head to dominate the private farm...considering it indecent for women to work out doors" (Coquery-Vidrovitch, 1997, p. 144). Women were taught only that which would be useful at home as they took care of their families. Skills such as housekeeping, as well as the ability to maintain a docile temperament, were encouraged. The curriculum favored men at the expense of women, while male superiority was elevated (Bowie, Kirkwood & Ardner, 1994; Coquery-Vidrovitch, 1997; Ipensburg 1992).

Education has become a determining factor for economic and social mobility in Kenya after independence. Men increasingly gravitate toward cities and urban centers, leaving families behind and forcing women to act as the sole caretakers. Women rarely qualify for better paying jobs due to a lack of knowledge and skills that white collar jobs require. This has also prevented them from participating in the political arena, which is run primarily by the educated male elite. Lack of education frequently relegates women to lower poverty levels and contributes to their economic dependence on men (Schech & Alwy, 2004).

While the Kenyan government argues that women are central to the agenda for economic development, it is difficult for women to effectively influence such policies. According to the US Department of State's Country Report (2005), women represent 70% of Kenya's illiterate population. Poverty among women may be associated with lack of educational and job opportunities.

When looking at educational attainment and HIV/AIDS among women in Kenya, it is imperative to consider regional disparities and the unequal distribution of resources that renders many parts of the country poverty-stricken while a few privileged regions flourish. The social, political, economic, geographic and historical backgrounds of many parts of Kenya have shaped the 'have and have not' dynamic that is also visible in other parts of Africa. The regional inequalities can be traced to the British colonial system where educational, political, and economic resources were unevenly distributed throughout the country. The contemporary Kenyan government seems to have perpetuated these regional disparities. Therefore, following independence there have been more qualified teachers, well-equipped schools, lower drop-out rates, and better exam performances in the economically and politically stable regions, in contrast with poorer, far removed semi-arid areas of the country such as the North Eastern Province and the coast (Ipensburg, 1992; Schech & Alwy, 2004).

Abagi (1997) argues that "regional differences in the provision of education opportunities for girls corresponds with regional variations in economic and political development in the country" (p. 42). Education for women in Kenya

has differed greatly in regional indicators from the past 40 years, such as the number of girls enrolled per year in primary schools, the number of those who move on to secondary school, and female drop-out rates (Abagi, 1997; Schech & Alwy, 2004). The highest drop-out rates for women can be found in the rural areas such as in the Nyanza Province, while high retention rates and transitions to secondary school are mainly in the largest municipalities and highly agricultural regions such as the Central Province. Areas like the Central Province are highly fertile and are, therefore, the locations where the colonial government and missionaries originally set up schools, churches and hospitals (Ipensburg, 1992; Vavrus, 2003). The Central Province in Kenya was privileged in this way and after independence the schools there were taken over by the government.

A Comparison Between the Central and Nyanza Provinces

The Central Province is located in the middle of Kenya and is characterized by highly fertile soils and cooler climatic conditions as compared to other parts of the country. As mentioned in the previous section, this region was home to many of the colonial settlers, who gave it the nickname 'the White Highlands.' The land is known for its production of coffee, Kenya's key export crop. After independence, many of the homes and farms were bought by the Kenyan elite, most of whom had attended mission schools in the same area (Burch, 1992).

The economic status of the Central Province is higher than that of Nyanza Province due to the high levels of agricultural production and its proximity to the capital city of Nairobi. The Kikuyu, who are the majority in central Kenya and make up the largest ethnic group in the country, primarily live in the farms providing most of the fruits and vegetables in Nairobi; they also grow coffee, sisal, and pyrethrum. Jommo Kenyatta, the first president of Kenya, was from the Kikuyu tribe. He stressed the importance of education from the beginning for both girls and boys. Influenced by President Kenyatta, the Kikuyu people have been at the forefront of educating their children, as evidenced by their occupation of a majority of the positions in the city as accountants, lawyers, teachers, as well as in many political and government positions (Schech & Alwy, 2004).

The importance placed on education in the Central Province is further demonstrated by the fact that they have the best national schools in Kenya, such as Gandu Girls' High School and Mangu Boys School, which rank highest in the Kenyan examination results. The Province also has access to the best universities, which are located in the Nairobi vicinity. Due to a stable economic status, people of the Central Province are often able to educate both girls and boys, and the dropout rate for girls is lower than that of the Nyanza Province. In the Central Province women not only attend school, but the education they receive is of a very high quality (Burch, 1992; Schech & Alwy, 2004).

The Nyanza Province is located in western Kenya near Lake Victoria; it is further inland and the climate is mostly tropical and humid. The main source of economy is the fishing industry around Lake Victoria. There are not many national schools or universities compared to the Central Province and the

economic status is significantly lower. Most men migrate from inland to the shore of Lake Victoria to work in the fishing industries, and sometimes to bigger cities such as Nairobi and Mombassa. Women mostly stay at home while men look for income elsewhere. With an economic system where men have more prospects than women for attaining white collar jobs, most parents tend to educate boys rather than girls (Burch, 1992; Schech & Alwy, 2004).

Women's Access to Education and HIV/AIDS Prevalence in the Nyanza and Central Provinces

The Nyanza Province has the highest percentage of HIV/AIDS infection among women in Kenya; at least 30% of females in the region are infected. The area also has a noticeably low rate of school enrollment, retention in primary schools, and transition to high school for girls. Cultural widow practices such as 'wife inheritance' (where the brother of the deceased man 'inherits' his wife) and sexual cleansing of the widow may have accelerated the spread of HIV/AIDS among women in Nyanza Province. High rates of HIV/AIDS leave many children without one or both parents. As the number of orphans increases, so too does the need for money to maintain the extended family. Women may be forced into prostitution to provide for the family, which perpetuates the spread of HIV/AIDS.

In the Central Province, the high levels of education amongst both women and men as compared to Nyanza may have played a role in reducing the spread of HIV/AIDS. According to the UNAIDS/WHO epidemiological fact sheet (2004), the infection among women in the Central Province ranges from 5% to 15%, which is half that of Nyanza's rate of 30% or more. The agricultural industries in Central Province also offer many jobs, which results in less labor migration to bigger cities.

While lack of sufficient education among women in Kenya has perhaps contributed to poverty among females, HIV/AIDS infection may have further exacerbated the situation. Many young and economically viable women continue to die and leave behind a large number of orphans to be taken care of. Money is often used for medical and funeral expenses; frequently personal assets must be sold to provide for the growing extended family brought about by adopting orphans and sickly relatives. Women, whose role often includes caring for the sick, are further burdened and overwhelmed by the amount of time and money that they must invest.

With more than 80% of the Kenyan population dependent upon agriculture as their main economic activity, HIV/AIDS infection has affected production by reducing the labor force; many people continue to die, thus leaving the very young and the very old to struggle on their own. Less production in the agricultural sector may ultimately affect food security in Kenya. Investment in poverty eradication amongst women through development of the agricultural and educational sectors has been undercut by the need to care for those infected and affected by the HIV/AIDS epidemic.

Conclusion

This paper provides an overview of Kenyan regional economic disparities and their correlation with women's educational opportunity and disparities in HIV/AIDS prevalence between the Nyanza and Central Provinces. Just as these territories differ in their economic and educational development, so too do they differ in the prevalence of HIV/AIDS among women. The area with the highest rates of educated women and the lowest poverty rates also has lower rates of infection, while the region with the lowest number of educated women has the highest rates of infection. Two factors common to both provinces are that women's education lags behind that of men and women are leading when it comes to HIV/AIDS.

Kenya has used various methods to reduce the spread of HIV/AIDS. However, efforts such as awareness campaigns promoting the use of condoms and abstinence may not have changed people's behavior, as shown by the increase in the number of those affected by the disease. Educating women through formal schooling is the most promising solution because it may pave the way for economic independence. The occupational mobility associated with education may provide women with opportunities for better paying jobs and an avenue for preserving family cohesion, as both husband and wife may be able to migrate together for jobs. Education as a source of social and occupational mobility could therefore be a good place to start in addressing women's poverty and the spread of HIV/AIDS in Kenya.

References

- Abagi, O. (1997). *Status of education in Kenya: Indicators for planning and policy formulations*. Nairobi, Kenya: Institute of Policy Analysis and Research.
- Bowie, F., Kirkwood, D., & Ardener, S. (1994). *Women and missions: Past and present: Anthropological and historical perceptions*. Oxford, England: Berg Publishers.
- Burch, J. (1992). *Kenya: Africa's tamed wilderness*. New York: Macmillan Publishing Company.
- Coquery-Vidrovitch, C. (1997). *African women: A modern history* (B.G. Raps, Trans.). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- Ipensburg (1992). *All good men: The development of Lubwa Mission, Chinsali, Zambia, 1905-1967*. Berlin, Germany: Pater Lang Publishers, Inc.
- Schech, S. and Alwy, A. (2004). Ethnic inequalities in education in Kenya. *International Education Journal* 5(2), 266-274.

South African Regional Office of the Food and Agricultural Organization of the United Nations. Retrieved August 25, 2006, from http://www.sarpn.org.za/_documents/d0000147/P143_Impact_of_HIVAIDS.pdf

UNAIDS. (2004). *Report on the global HIV/AIDS epidemic: 4th global report*. Geneva, Switzerland: Author. Retrieved August 25, 2006, from http://www.unaids.org/bangkok2004/report_pdf.html

UNAIDS/WHO. (2004). *Epidemiological fact sheet 2004 update*. Retrieved August 29, 2006, from Http://data.unaids.org/publications/fact-sheets01/Kenya_EN.PDF

U.S. Department of State. (2005). *2004 Country Report on Human Rights Practices: Kenya*. Washington, DC: Author.

Vavrus, F. (2003). *Desire and decline: Schooling amid crisis in Tanzania*. New York: Peter Lang Publishers, Inc.

The Effects of Early Education on Children in Poverty

Anna D. Johnson

*Doctor of Education Student
Developmental Psychology
Department of Human Development
Teachers College, Columbia University*

Introduction

Social scientists have posited that education can make a significant and long-lasting difference on the lives of children who experience poverty (Barnett, 1995; Brooks-Gunn, 2003; Karoly, et al, 1998). In recent years, policymakers and researchers in the United States have reexamined the role that quality early education can play in the lives of young children growing up in poverty (Rouse, Brooks-Gunn, & McLanahan, 2005). Specifically, some have argued that high quality education and care programs that begin early in life have the potential to close gaps in school achievement that often exist between poor and minority children and their middle-class, mostly White, counterparts (Magnuson & Waldfogel, 2005). Based on these conclusions, U.S. policymakers and practitioners interested in improving the lives of poor children have considered the possibility that early education programs may contribute to solving the myriad of problems that growing up in poverty poses. This paper will examine the most recent American research on socioeconomic and racial gaps in school readiness. Additionally, early childhood intervention programs in the form of quality early education and care will be discussed, and the effects of successful early educational intervention programs for children in poverty will be reviewed.

For the purpose of this paper, the terms *intervention programs*, *early childhood education programming* and *early care* refer to programs offered to young children prior to the start of formal schooling. These programs share the goal of enhancing early learning and development through cognitively stimulating activities. An intervention is a program that is targeted towards children who experience environmental risk, namely poverty, which likely interferes with normative, healthy development in a number of developmental domains. They are offered with the expectation that such programs can buffer the negative effects of poverty on the development of a child. The term intervention is used to distinguish early education programs offered to poor children from those that families with greater financial resources can afford.

School Readiness

The extensive body of developmental research suggests that school readiness is a key foundational element and indicator of later life success. This information has led to a number of US-based studies examining the early educational experiences of poor children. The concept of school readiness recognizes that children enter school with varying degrees of preparedness for

learning. Because these differences can persist throughout schooling, concerns have arisen regarding how ready children are to learn when they arrive at school. Findings from studies examining the link between socioeconomics and school readiness have largely concluded that poor children are less likely than their more privileged peers to arrive at school ready to learn, and that children who start school with a disadvantage are unlikely to catch up to their classmates unless educational intervention programs are made available (e.g., Duncan & Magnuson, 2005; Magnuson & Waldfogel, 2005).

Researchers have posited that the proportion of kindergarteners who enter school without basic literacy and numeracy skills could be substantially higher in poor and minority communities than that of children from middle-class backgrounds (Brooks-Gunn, 2003). Given the historical racial and ethnic inequalities in the United States, the socioeconomic circumstances of Black and Hispanic families tend to be strongly associated with gaps in their children's test scores and achievement. Moreover, because of unequal educational opportunities, failing public schools and the inability of many poor families to pay for a higher quality private education, children of poor and minority parents are more likely to struggle in school than are their wealthier White peers (Wells & Crain, 1997). For instance, findings from the US-based Early Childhood Longitudinal Study (ECLS-K) reveal that the mean socioeconomic level of Black children in kindergarten was significantly lower than that of White kindergarteners, and that the average socioeconomic level of Hispanic children was lower than both Black and White children (Duncan & Magnuson, 2005).¹ As such, increased attention has been paid in recent years to closing the gaps in school readiness, with the greater goal of reducing disparities in achievement and life success.

Early Education

While many researchers have turned their attention to reducing the achievement differences between students by making early intervention programs available, interest in the effects of early care and education on young children from poor families has also been heightened. Increases in the use of early care and education for the nation's youngest children are due in part to the marked swell in female labor force participation. Specifically, this relatively recent surge, which is as a result of changing family structure and welfare reform legislation, has led to a dramatic rise in the number of young children who are left in the care of someone other than their parents (Phillips & Adams, 2001). This may come in the form of day care, child care, or early education arrangements. Although research suggests that income is clearly associated with the cognitive development and achievement of children during their preschool years, studies have likewise found that the poorest children benefit the most from a high quality early education program (Brooks-Gunn, 2003; Yoshikawa, 1995). Thus, for the large numbers of young children from poor backgrounds who are enrolled in early education, such education has the power to truly impact their developmental trajectories. For youngsters growing up in poverty, which in the United States means that the family's income is below the federal poverty level, quality early education programming can improve school

readiness and subsequent chances for school success, financial independence, and social stability.

Literature in the area of early childhood education suggests that high quality early education programs can exert positive effects on a child's cognitive outcomes, as well as on skills beyond general cognitive ability and intelligence quotient (IQ) (Campbell & Ramey, 1994). Indicators of high quality early education programming are those dimensions of an early education or care program that are recognized to promote healthy learning and development. These dimensions include well-trained teaching staff, a small number of children per classroom and an enduring intervention that begins early. Reviews of effective early education strategies conclude that programs that combine early childhood education with services to support families can produce lasting positive social benefits, and can result in decreased rates of antisocial and delinquent behavior (Yoshikawa, 1995).

Early Education: Model Programs

The Perry Preschool and Abecedarian projects are two early education intervention programs that have positively impacted the lives of those children who participated. Evidence from these programs supports the argument that education-centered early intervention programs can combat the negative effects that growing up in poverty can have on child development. The Perry Preschool Project placed an experimental group of preschool-aged children in an intense, high quality intervention program. A high quality intervention program is one that includes many of the theoretically recognized elements of quality education programs, such as regular academic-oriented activities for children, a rich learning environment, qualified teachers, and home visits to enhance parenting strategies for adults. The Perry Preschool program included a weekday morning preschool routine combined with weekly home visits by program staff. The teacher-child ratio in the intervention program classrooms was one adult for every five or six children, the teachers were professionally trained and qualified in early childhood education, and the program extended over two calendar years (Schweinhart, 2003). In a 15-year follow-up study, children who had participated in the intervention program demonstrated increased IQs in the years following the intervention. Children who participated in the program had, on average, higher scores on standardized school assessments, spent fewer years in special education programs, and demonstrated fewer conduct and behavior problems than demographically similar children who did not participate in the program (Consortium for Longitudinal Studies, 1983). Additionally, the positive effects of the intervention have persisted through age 40, more than 30 years after the program ended, in the form of lower rates of crimes committed and higher monthly earnings on average when compared to adults with the same background who did not participate in the program as children (Schweinhart, 2003).

The Carolina Abecedarian Project is another example of an early education intervention program administered to low-income children in America, with encouraging results. In this program, children were randomized at birth into one of four groups. Of these four groups, only participants in one group received

the most intense intervention, which consisted of both preschool and school-age early education. The intense treatment group, along with the other three less intense treatment groups, also received child-care and health services at a center with enriched resources. Additionally, home visits were conducted for the school-aged groups. A follow-up study of program children more than a decade after the program had begun found positive effects for cognitive and academic achievement in children who received preschool and school-age education services (Campbell & Ramey, 1994). Children who received the intervention from infancy into elementary school demonstrated an IQ and achievement score advantage over those who did not participate in the early section of treatment. This suggests that education interventions that begin in infancy and continue into the later school years can produce positive cognitive effects that are long-lasting.

Both the Perry Preschool and Abecedarian projects began when children were very young, lasted over a substantial period of time, and were intense and comprehensive in the nature of services administered. As a result, children born into households of poverty entered school more prepared to learn and experienced greater cognitive gains overall and later life success along a variety of indicators when compared to their peers of the same economic background who did not receive an intervention. These findings offer powerful support to the assertion that educational interventions that occur early in life can produce long-lasting positive benefits for children in poverty who may otherwise face many obstacles to school success.

Conclusion

This paper has presented evidence to substantiate calls for the widespread implementation and funding of quality early education-based interventions for children in low-income families. When programs are administered early and comprehensively, and meet recognized standards of quality, early education programming can produce lasting gains in a variety of developmental domains for children who otherwise may fall behind in school as a result of growing up in poverty with families who cannot provide the necessary resources and support for school success. This paper has identified the negative effects that growing up in poverty can have on young children, and has recognized that early education and specifically early education interventions, such as the model programs highlighted here, can make a lasting, positive difference for children. Now we must make such successful programs must be made available to all poor youth so that every child enters school on equal ground, ready to learn and continue on to successful, independent lives.

Endnotes

1. The Early Childhood Longitudinal Study is an ongoing research project with two cohorts, birth and kindergarten. The study focuses on children's early experiences and includes information on a range of individual, family, school, and community factors that influence development. For

more information, see the National Center for Education Statistics website, available at <http://nces.ed.gov/ecls/>

References

- Barnett, W. S. (1995). Long-term effects of early childhood programs on cognitive and school outcomes. *Future of Children, 5*(3), 25-50.
- Brooks-Gunn, J. (2003). Do you believe in magic? *Social Policy Report, 17*(1), 3-16.
- Campbell, F. A., & Ramey, C.T. (1994). Effects of early intervention on intellectual and academic achievement: A follow-up study of children from low-income families. *Child Development, 65*, 684-698.
- Consortium for Longitudinal Studies. (1983). *As the twig is bent . . . lasting effects of preschool programs*. Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum.
- Duncan, G. J., & Magnuson, K. A. (2005). Can family socioeconomic resources account for racial and ethnic test score gaps? *Future of Children, 15*(1), 35-54.
- Karoly, L. A., Rydell, C. P., Hoube, J., Everingham, S.S., Kilburn, R., & Greenwood, P.W. (1998). *Investing in Our Children: What we know and don't know about the costs and benefits of early childhood interventions*. Santa Monica, CA: Rand.
- Magnuson, K. A., & Waldfogel, J. (2005). Early childhood care and education: Effects on ethnic and racial gaps in school readiness. *Future of Children, 15*(1), 169-196.
- Phillips, D., & Adams, G. (2001). Child care and our youngest children. *Future of Children, 11*(1), 35-52.
- Rouse, C., Brooks-Gunn, J., & McLanahan, S. (2005). Introduction to school readiness: Closing racial and ethnic gaps. *Future of Children, 15*, 5-13.
- Schweinhart, L. J. (2003, April). *Benefits, Costs, and Explanation of the High/Scope Perry Preschool Program*. Paper presented at the biennial meeting of the Society for Research in Child Development, Tampa, FL.
- Wells, A. S., & Crain, R. L. (1997). *Stepping over the color line: African-American students in White suburban schools*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Yoshikawa, H. (1995). Long-term effects of early childhood programs on social outcomes and delinquency. *Future of Children, 5*(3), 51-75.

Research Papers

Human Rights Based Approaches in State Development Programming: A Selected Survey of Right to Education and Right to Food Programs

Ximena Casas
Joy L. Chia
Grace H. Cho
Kate Cronin-Furman
Tiffany M. McKinney
Mayur R. Suresh
Amanda L. Wetzel

Under the Guidance of Doctor Peter Rosenblum

*Doctors of Jurisprudence
Human Rights Clinic
Law School, Columbia University*

Introduction

Human development and human rights are close enough in motivation and concern to be compatible and congruous, and they are different enough in strategy and design to supplement each other fruitfully. A more integrated approach can thus bring significant rewards, and facilitate in practical ways the shared attempts to advance the dignity, well-being and freedom of individuals (UNDP, 2001, p. 19).

In 2000, the World Bank articulated the groundbreaking acknowledgement that the international development and human rights disciplines had complementary agendas, and pronounced the need for further work in understanding this fledgling partnership. However, six years later, as much as the catchphrases linking human rights and development have gained popularity, it appears that neither community has attempted an effective engagement with both discourses to create an integrated agenda. The United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, Louise Arbour, admitted that in spite of the apparent congruity between human rights and development challenges, "there remains a chasm between theory and practice," where there is a need to ensure that "the objectives, policies and processes of development are channeled more directly and effectively towards human rights goals" (UNHCHR, 2006, p. iii).

What has happened in the intervening years? Many advocates have assumed that development and human rights goals were fully compatible and that both operated on the idea that development work is human rights work. The 2003 Human Development Report asserted that the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) "mirror the fundamental motivation for human rights" (UNDP, 2003, p. 27) and "reflect a human rights agenda – rights to education, health

care, and decent living standards" (p. 29).¹ This conceptualization fundamentally conflates the human rights and development goals and processes.

On the other hand, there is also an acknowledgement that fundamental differences have led to only minimal actual interaction between the human rights and development projects – an interaction that resembles "two ships passing in the night" (Alston, 2005, p. 755). Alston shows empirically in his analysis of MDG reports that despite assertions of the importance of human rights in development, all but one MDG report contained more than a fleeting reference to human rights. Out of 59 MDG reports, only Bosnia and Herzegovina's contained significant programmatic efforts that were examined in the MDG report. The corollary to the absence of human rights in development reports is the equally notable lack of attention to the MDGs by the United Nations human rights mechanisms. Alston argues that the MDGs have not had much influence on the analytical frameworks used by the Special Rapporteurs and the Human Rights Working Groups, and "there is no sense that the MDG initiative can contribute significantly to the human rights enterprise" (p. 819).²

The discourse of human rights and development is primarily advocacy-driven. Donors, development agencies and non-governmental organizations have embraced and continue to promote the concept that the human rights and development agenda should complement each other, but have not suggested what a substantive rights-based approach would look like. They expound the usefulness of a human rights-based approach, arguing for its ability to influence development goals, but do not articulate the mechanisms by which rights-based programs would achieve these practical differences.

How are development programs affected by the use of a rights-based approach? Is a rights-based approach even relevant to the actual programs that are undertaken by states? The research that is presented in this report is motivated by a desire to explore the substantive links between human rights and development, and to push towards the practical difficulties of creating mechanisms in development programs within a rights-based framework. Towards that end, we have focused on investigating how states and their governments understand the relationship between human rights and development, and how they have translated this conception into programs.

Methodology

The purpose of our investigation is two-fold. First, an empirical survey of selected states will hopefully create a broad-brush picture of the various ways that states have conceptualized their rights and obligations. In examining areas where rights-based approaches are well-recognized - the right to education and the right to food - we will look at five case studies: for education programs, Bangladesh, Kenya, and South Africa; for food programs, Brazil and India. These states have education and food programs that contain elements that 'looked like rights' – where governments create policy in the belief that they are fulfilling an obligation to their people. We will investigate whether the human rights and development framework is meaningful in state programming. Second, we will try to synthesize the features of these case study programs into a

prescriptive model of what a rights-based approach to programming could look like. It is through this second act that we attempt to flesh out what it means to translate rights rhetoric into workable programs.

A few caveats. This report is not a systematic survey of state programs, nor are the states meant to be representative of regions or development standards. The states were chosen because they have reputations for programs committed to effecting development change within a rights framework. They are merely examples of what states have done and are doing in terms of these rights. While more work must be undertaken to create a comprehensive survey of state programs, we consider this research report a valuable starting point in establishing substantive links between human rights and development discourses. We are looking at state programs because states are the central actors in the development process. They are also the main signatories of international human rights instruments, and bear the ultimate responsibility of protecting individuals from rights violations and affirmatively providing for the substance of these rights. It is through state programs that *de jure* rights are transformed into *de facto* rights. Additionally, little research has been done with regards to state programs, and we consider this to be an important piece in bridging the gap between theory and practice.

Case Studies: Right to Education

I. Kenya

Political Context

In the December 2002 presidential election, the National Rainbow Coalition made a pledge to provide free and compulsory primary education. Following inauguration, President Kibaki announced a Free Primary Education Policy, eliminating school fees. The new government argued that the immediate implementation of this policy without prior planning (or budgetary allocations) was required by its campaign promises (Harmon, 2003).³

Impact

Following the announcement of the Free Primary Education Policy, primary school attendance immediately increased by over a million students (Kenyan Office of the President, 2004). This has placed significant stress on school facilities. The Kenyan Human Rights Commission released a statement in April 2005 warning that teacher shortages, particularly in "rural and conflict prone areas" coupled with resource limitations and overcrowding negatively impact fulfillment of the right to education. In addition to these obstacles, students must also contend with the cost of uniforms, books, and school supplies. The Ministry of Education has introduced targeted meal programs and textbooks funds to address these needs but over one million children remain out of school (UNESCO, 2006; "Over a million children still out of school," 2006). These children primarily reside in urban slums and in Arid / Semi-Arid Lands (ASALs) ("Seal loopholes in free primary education," 2006). The rise in primary

school enrollment has increased the cost of learning and resulted in government inability to finance higher education (Otieno, 2006). Currently, more than half of those students who finish primary school cannot be accommodated by secondary schools.

Normative Framework

The Kenyan Government's domestic statements about education have frequently incorporated rights-based language. A month after the program's implementation, Education Minister Saitoti announced the government's belief in the importance of the project, "[n]ot only because it is the right of every child, but because we know in educating the children we are investing in the future of this country" (Salmon, 2003, para. 24). In 2004 the State House in Nairobi released a press statement regarding the Free Primary Education Programme revealing the government's intention "to remove all levies that previously prevented children, especially the vulnerable groups, from accessing education" (Kenyan Office of the President, 2004, para. 2).

Kenya's portrayal of its program to the international community has also been largely rights-based. In its second periodic report to the United Nations Committee on the Rights of a Child (UNCRC), the government discussed its Free Primary Education Policy in the context of the requirement under the *Children's Act* "that every child shall be entitled to education, the provision of which shall be the responsibility of the Government and parents" and that the Act further "entitles every child to free basic education, which shall be compulsory in accordance with Article 28 of the UNCRC" (Government of Kenya, 2005, p. 75).⁴ The report went on to identify the importance of teacher training and adequate physical facilities to fulfilling the right to basic education. In addition, the report emphasizes the rights of young girls through its institution of a policy guaranteeing space to girls who return to school after giving birth, rather than expelling them as was previously the case.

Implementation

The Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (2005) has instituted the Kenyan Education Sector Support Strategy (KESSS) in order to draw investment to fund the push for universal primary education. The KESSS states that its "objective is to give every Kenyan the right to quality education and training no matter his/her socioeconomic status" (p. ii). It articulates this objective as (1) achieving universal primary education by 2015; (2) dramatically increasing rate of continuance to secondary education; (3) improving facilities and teacher quality in primary/secondary schools; (4) improving university education; (5) paying particular attention to the education of girls, and the provision of education to disadvantaged areas (ASAL and urban slums).

In terms of the process of implementation, the KESSS (Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, 2005) includes "Horizontal Accountability Mechanisms" (specifically, locally constituted oversight committees) aimed at ensuring transparency with regard to fund disbursement. The purpose of these

mechanisms is to allow communities to “hold their local service providers accountable for the delivery of quality education services” (p. xxxi).

Current Status

Kenya remains committed to providing free primary education in the face of serious resource and funding shortages. The UK Department for International Development (2006) recently announced a £55 million grant to support implementation of the KESSS. Meanwhile, changes for the educational system may be forthcoming: Kenya’s Education Act is under review, amidst criticism from NGOs and religious institutions that have been left out of the process, and Education Minister Saitoti, faced with corruption charges, has stepped down.

II. Bangladesh

Political Context

In January 2004 at the Twelfth South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation Summit in Islamabad, Bangladeshi Prime Minister Khaleda Zia stated that “reduction of poverty is [the Bangladeshi government’s] foremost objective” (para. 10), placing education for girls in particular as a top priority among several others.⁵ However, although it presents elements of a rights-based approach, little human rights rhetoric has been used in reference to these goals - for example, no public domestic statements about the “right to education” per se have been made, but education programs have been geared towards raising the participation of less represented groups. This case study points out that the apparent lack of an accountability process within these programs could potentially meet the needs of some lesser served groups, but unintentionally neglect other groups.

Normative Framework

These programs are largely based upon government obligations that have been constitutionally created. Article 17 of the 1972 Constitution of Bangladesh states that “the State shall adopt effective measures for the purpose of establishing a uniform, mass-oriented and universal system of education and extending free and compulsory education to all children to such stage as may be determined by law.” Under the Compulsory Primary Education Act of 1990, the government of Bangladesh may “declare primary education obligatory in whatever area.”

Implementation

In attempting to meet its constitutional obligation to extend free and compulsory education to all children, the government’s policy framework has emphasized the inclusion of previously marginalized groups. Several programs, such as the Female Stipend Programme (FSP) and the Primary Education Stipend Project (PESP), target lesser-served groups. While the secondary school

program targets the enrollment and retention of female students, the primary education program focuses on children from poor families in rural Bangladesh.

The FSP was launched in 1994 as a nation-wide stipend program for girls in secondary school, covering grades 6-12 in all 460 upazilas (subdistricts) of Bangladesh. The FSP assists eligible female secondary school students by providing them with free tuition and stipends to attend recognized institutions outside the metropolitan areas. The amount varies by grade level, so that female students in Grade 6, for example, will receive 25 taka per month, while students in Grade 10 will receive 60 taka per month (Mahmud, 2003).

The PESP was initiated in July 2002 to combat the problem of prohibitive education expenses (Tietjen, 2003). Although primary education in Bangladesh is theoretically 'free,' many families incur expenditures of some sort in the form of fees for textbooks, admission/readmission fees, monthly fees, and various subscriptions. The PESP combined the existing incentives programs, Food for Education (FFE) and Primary Education Stipend (PES). The FFE was launched in 1993 to increase enrollment, persistence and attendance rates of children from landless and very poor families, and the PES was initiated in April 2001 to create incentives for the rest of the country. In combining the two projects, the government expanded the coverage of the incentive scheme to the poorest 40% of students enrolled in primary school in the rural areas of all 469 upazillas. It is significant to note that the PESP was partially motivated by the poor targeting of the FES and concern about discrimination.⁶

Impact

While these programs appear to have encouraged a general positive attitude towards female secondary education, increased the reach of the government's incentive program, and increased enrollment in primary schools, the programs have been criticized for not having a mechanism through which they can be responsive to changing definitions of under-represented groups. One criticism is that the FSP benefits only its target group of female students but neglects other vulnerable groups, like boys of poor families. Another is that the selection process for participants in the PESP neglects those children that do not have access to a primary school as eligibility is based on primary school enrollment.⁷ The program does not account for the uneven distribution of poverty throughout rural schools and across student bodies, therefore potentially excluding relatively poor students as each school is only allowed to select the poorest 40% of its students. Moreover, students who are enrolled in non-formal education are not eligible for the stipends, although they are generally known to be from Bangladesh's poorest families. Another serious problem in implementation is that the School Management Committee (SMC), which can add more students for eligibility of the benefits, operates under no clear-cut guidelines or empirical methods for identifying poor students. Parents have complained that there is room for corruption or bias, especially because SMCs are not independent organizations and are therefore subject to outside pressure.

III. South Africa

Political Context

An evaluation of the right to education in South Africa reveals strong rights-based language in political dialogue, government publications, and international and local NGO monitoring reports. Section 28 of the South African Bill of Rights (South African Constitutional Assembly, 1996) specifically targets the rights of children. Section 28(c) provides that children should be provided with basic nutrition, shelter, basic health care, and social services. Section 28(f) states that children should not be required to perform work or provide services that place at risk a child's well-being, education, physical or mental health or spiritual or social development. Furthermore, Section 29 guarantees a right to a basic education, including adult basic and higher education. The state is bound to make education progressively available and accessible through reasonable measures.

The National Education and Policy Act (South African President's Office, 1996) set forth reforms for the ministry of education in order to oversee the educational transformation in South Africa. The statutory provisions for requiring compulsory education until the age of 15 as well as procedures for restructuring the public schools system are contained in the South African Schools Act (1996).

Implementation

Since the mid-1990s, participation rates of young people in education have improved as a result of the South African Schools Act. Many current policies that purport to reduce educational inequalities may fail a Constitutional challenge under the *Grootboom* standard because they have not been satisfactorily implemented by the government.⁸ Key among these programs that target increasing access to school are the School Fee Exemption (SFE) program, curriculum reform programs to reflect the values of education, diversity, social and cultural rights, and increasing teacher training and facilities.

The SFE program was created in the South African Schools Act and is a key prong of the South African poverty reduction strategy. A historic problem with the SFE program is that it has failed to benefit many of the students for whom it was designed. In the Review of Public School Financing Act of February 2003, several changes were proposed including a new national targeting program that will allocate finances nationally to poor learners and provide additional resources for them to attend school; modification of the threshold income; and the ability to receive SFE for both official fees and school imposed costs. To counter widespread problems with notification of SFE eligibility, all schools that levy fees will be obliged to circulate fee exemption application forms to all parents in the school.

The ultimate impact of the SFE reforms remains to be determined. Prior to the reforms, a South African Human Rights Commission report indicated that the SFE policy could be subject to constitutional challenge on the grounds that it is part of the progressive rights realization program discussed in *Grootboom*. In

addition, although the SFE program may comply with South African rights standards, it does not comply with Article 28 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child that calls for universal access to education (UNICEF, 1989/2000). Additionally, the South African Human Rights Council has raised doubt as to whether the country will achieve its MDG targets by 2015 without free access for all children to higher education. In addition, the needs of South Africa's street children are virtually ignored in the SFE's treatment of Article 28.

Impact

To further address gender disparity in historically disadvantaged communities, South Africa has revised its School Funding Norms (SFN) policy, which addresses the unequal allocation of financial resources to schools to ensure that students have an equal opportunity to learn. Statistically, better-resourced schools outperform disadvantaged institutions.⁹ This is important for gender goals because poverty, involvement in income-generating activities, and domestic chores often prevent female children from attending school.

Although spending on education has more than doubled over the past ten years and participation rates have increased at all educational levels, significant improvements in state policies are needed to insure the right to education to all children. In particular, historically disadvantaged groups that are identifiable along race and gender criteria continue to lag behind their more privileged counterparts in both access to and performance in some areas of education. NGOs have criticized the government for failing to effectively integrate farm and street children into the educational system. It is noteworthy that there is no independent and comprehensive monitoring system that focuses exclusively on the rights of children and the implementation of legislation in policies to further their protection (Childline, n.d.; National Programme of Action for Children in South Africa, 2006).¹⁰

Case Studies: Right to Food

I. Brazil

Political Context

In October 2001, President Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva presented for public debate the *Fome Zero* (Zero Hunger) Program. The program's aim is to provide quality food for all citizens, which the president deems "an inalienable right of every citizen" (Citizenship Institute, 2001, p. 1). The Zero Hunger Program is a national policy directed towards combating hunger through economic and social policy reform, which includes (but is not limited to): creating a national food stamp program, enlarging school meal programs, expanding emergency basic food baskets programs, increasing the minimum wage, and instituting agrarian reform. The program aims to "provide food security to those 46 million [Brazilians] that...receive less than US \$1 per day to survive" (Suplicy, n.d., para. 5).

Normative Context

President Lula places the program within the right to food framework, which is "inserted in the Plan of Civil, Political, Economical, Social and Cultural Rights" (Citizenship Institute, 2001, p. 3). Additionally, the President asserts: "This proposal intends to start a permanent discussion process and to promote concrete actions to guarantee the basic right of citizenship: quality food" (p. 2).

Implementation

Following adoption of the Zero Hunger Program, several governmental ministries and projects were created to ensure its implementation. First, the Brazilian government installed the National Council of Food Security (CONSEA). CONSEA's primary goals are to assist with implementation of the Zero Hunger Program, routinely evaluate the program's effectiveness and formulate a national food security policy (Suplicy, n.d.). Second, the Brazilian government aims to gradually implement the Food Card Program, which will provide R \$50 (approximately US \$15) per month to families that receive less than half of the minimum wage per capita and/or experience other financial hardships. Recipient families will be selected by a managing committee, located in their municipality, in which members of the community are represented on the committee. Third, the Brazilian government has expanded its emergency basic food baskets programs to include emergency aid to the 80,000 encamped families waiting to be settled in the national Agrarian Reform Program, Indian communities, comprising approximately 43,000 families and Quilombola communities (descendants of African slave communities), which includes approximately 5,000 families.

Other governmental initiatives related to the implementation of the Zero Hunger Program include: creating a National Movement against Hunger with full involvement from government and civil society; creating mechanisms for corporate and individual donations to the Zero Hunger Program; and examining governmental policies such as clean water supplies, basic sanitation, home construction, nutrition and health educational programs, micro credit lending to small farmers, and agrarian reform within the Zero Hunger Program rubric.

Impact

In reviewing various sources on the program it appears that the program's failures include: (i) overly bureaucratic implementation; (ii) existence of nepotism and corruption by program administrators; and (iii) lack of input from the intended beneficiaries ("Three square meals a day," 2003; Rohther, 2003). The program's successes include: (i) creating a mechanism for the private sector and private actors to partner in securing the program's objectives; (ii) fostering a sense of empowerment and agency among program participants; and (iii) reframing the prioritization of governmental spending.

II. India

India offers a different perspective on the rights-development nexus because its experience with the right to food has been primarily driven by the Supreme Court of India. It is an example of how an activist court has both provided a space for people to challenge state action or inaction, and participated in redirecting the state program to fulfill the rights that the state is claiming to fulfill.

People's Union for Civil Liberties v. State of Rajasthan

In the 2001 case, *People's Union for Civil Liberties v. State of Rajasthan*, the Supreme Court of India intervened to stop the epidemic of hunger facing the Indian population. While government figures reported about 50 million deaths from starvation between 1998 and 2001, Union and State governments reported having excess stocks of food grains (Dreze, 2004; Reddy, n.d.; Ahluwalia, n.d.). The petition points out two aspects of the state's negligence in providing food security. The first is the breakdown of the public distribution system (PDS). The PDS failed at multiple levels: it excluded persons who lived just above the poverty line; the monthly quota per family cannot meet the nutritional standards set by the Indian Council of Medical Research; the PDS is implemented erratically, and identification of beneficiaries was unreliable. The second is the inadequacy of government response as mandated by the Famine Code which provided that in any area affected by a famine, a person would be allowed work at a public works construction site and be paid wages in grain. According to the petition, the Rajasthan government has followed a policy of 'labor ceilings,' which restrict employment to less than 5% of the drought affected population.

The Order

The Court identified eight nutrition schemes initiated by the Government of India (the Union), but whose implementation was left to the States. The Court directed all States and Union Territories to ascertain the degree of implementation of these programs in the States. These schemes linked nutrition with education, employment generation, maternal and infant health, and income levels. Notably, these schemes were previously *not* rights and the denial of these schemes would not amount to a violation of a right. They were distributions of largesse by the government, and were initiated under the aegis of the welfare state. The Supreme Court, in declaring that there exists a fundamental Right to Food, took these schemes and converted them into entitlements (Kothari, 2004).

The Supreme Court located this Right to Food within Article 21 of the Indian Constitution, which reads, "[n]o person shall be deprived of his life or personal liberty except according to procedure established by law," (Indian Constituent Assembly, 1949/1950). The argument was that there is an affirmative right to life and the state must protect that right. The Supreme Court has held in previous cases that the right to life includes the right to live with dignity and all that goes along with it, including the right to food. The petition argues, in essence, that the failure to respond to starvation deaths and malnutrition by central and state governments constitutes a violation of this

right.

Implementation

The Supreme Court adopted a process that calculated need, monitored the provision of benefits, and appointed independent advisors. It adopted two main approaches in setting the standards for the distribution and quality of food: in some instances setting very specific targets (for example the Mid-day Meal Scheme where the court directed all state governments to provide cooked mid-day meals in all government schools by January 2002), and in others, allowing for more flexibility.

Firstly, because the total population that was entitled to benefits under these schemes was unknown, the Court ordered the States to ascertain the number of people who were eligible, and to calculate the amount of food grain and money required. It mandated that its orders be translated into the regional and official languages and be posted in each village. The Court also appointed a Commission to oversee the implementation and monitoring of its orders.¹¹ The Commission set up an administrative structure so that information could be carried from the villages and the districts to the Commission, and eventually to the Court. The Supreme Court has also created a reporting mechanism, where the Commission submits regular reports to the Supreme Court regarding statistics of the amount of food being distributed and consumed in given geographical areas and designated populations. It gives recommendations to the Supreme Court on what orders it should pass in order to make the right to food more efficacious. Significantly, the Commission has also appointed several advisors which include academics, NGOs and a number of rights activists. These advisors play the role of analyzing data, conveying information to the Commission, developing monitoring systems, developing crises responses, and working towards accountability norms for public programs related to food. Thus the appointment of the advisors has provided the space for human rights activists to provide mechanisms of accountability and, more importantly, to frame the policy decisions of the Supreme Court.

Impact

It is difficult to ascertain how much has changed at the national level, as there continue to be reports of starvation deaths and undernourishment of children. Of particular concern is the fact that tribal populations and lower castes are sometimes socially excluded from these programs (Jain, 2005). It is important to note that these reports are not done by the state governments or their officials, but by NGOs and other individuals who form a part of the advisory group to the Commission.

Still, there have been many positive outcomes of the Right to Food campaign. Despite the existence of a fundamental right to primary education, school enrollment only increased dramatically with the introduction of the Mid-Day meal scheme (Dreze & Goyal, 2003).¹² This scheme was initiated to provide meals at noon to students in public schools. It has not only increased nutritional

indicators amongst school children, but has also increased school enrollment and reduced drop-out rates.¹³ Importantly, enrollment of female children and children from the lower castes has also gone up.¹⁴ Thus, the right to food has helped realize the right to education.

Summary of Findings

The case studies demonstrate that many governments are using rights language to conceptualize education and food initiatives. The use of this type of language frequently originates in campaign rhetoric. Brazil's Zero Hunger Campaign and Kenya's Free Primary Education initiative both began as populist campaign promises, articulating the failures of previous governments to meet human needs. Once elected, the fulfillment of these promises becomes an obligation upon the new incumbent government. Consequently, rather than treating these programs as poverty reduction strategies implemented by the government to help its citizens, governments are making the move towards viewing them as steps taken to fulfill a state obligation. This distinction can be seen in the difference between Kenya's institution of free primary education, and the steps the government has taken toward ensuring that the realization of this right is truly universal, and in neighboring Uganda's free primary education program, which guarantees an education to four children in every family.

One of the most prominent uses of rights rhetoric is the move of governments to employ rights language to create demand for rights. South Africa's public information campaigns to notify families of their right to education for their children facilitate the instantiation of the right. Similarly, the Kenyan government's announcement in January 2003 of "free primary education, effective immediately" essentially created the right on the spot; an additional one million children showed up at school almost immediately to claim the right. Brazil's Zero Hunger Program has also been lauded for creating a sense of entitlement among its beneficiaries.

The level of government engagement with rights implicated by its programs can be gauged by the specificity with which the government understands its obligation. India, where previously food aid was conceptualized as a gift from the government, the current understanding of the right to two square meals per day, has taken specific steps, like the Mid-Day Meal Program in government schools, to meet these obligations. Similarly, Kenya's understanding of its obligation to provide a right of education requires it to take steps to ensure gender parity in enrollment. Consequently, it has implemented measures such as ensuring classroom space for students returning after pregnancy. It has also stated that it considers a number of ancillary things necessary to the realization of the right to education, and has instituted programs for school feeding and provision of school-books. This layered understanding of the government's obligation contrasts the situation in Bangladesh, where a right to education is recognized, and primary education is nominally free, but the government does not concern itself with the fact that students still have to pay for textbooks, admission/readmission fees, monthly fees, and subscriptions.

While rights concepts have frequently been present in the development phases of education and food initiatives - particularly with respect to the substantive form of the right - they are less commonly associated with the implementation process. Most of the programs we surveyed had significant gaps around the issues of transparency, accountability, and participation. Brazil's Zero Hunger Campaign has been criticized frequently for failing to consider the input of the intended recipients of food aid. The decision-making process has been vested with government bureaucrats, and can seem disconnected from the stated needs of the populations the aid serves.

India and Kenya have both made some moves in the direction of developing accountability mechanisms. India is the only country where we have found significant involvement of courts in the rights implementation process. In India, the appointment of human rights activists as advisors to the monitoring commission will hopefully result in the creation of formalized accountability processes. Similarly, the Horizontal Accountability Mechanisms, set up pursuant to the Kenyan Education Sector Support Strategy to facilitate local oversight of the disbursement of funds, represents a move toward greater community involvement in the process.

Another area in which rights conceptualization is frequently incomplete is the issue of evaluating results. In many countries, insufficient attention is paid to demographic disparities in the fulfillment of rights. For instance, in Bangladesh, children who live in rural areas where they have limited access to schools do not benefit from government education programs. While South Africa has instituted curricular reform aimed at improving the status of disadvantaged populations, it has also been criticized by human rights NGOs for failing to adequately ensure that the rights of farm children and street children to education are fulfilled. Conversely, in Kenya efforts have been made to target vulnerable populations. The programs aimed at increasing female enrollment are particularly encouraging. Similarly, initiatives specifically tailored to the needs of slum children and of children of nomadic tribes represent a rights-based understanding.

Conclusion

State-run development programs implicate human rights in ways that are both implicit and explicit. Our exploration of development initiatives from five states shows that while rights rhetoric is likely to be strong at the inception of food and education initiatives, there is wide variance in the level to which a rights-based approach is incorporated into implementation processes. We find the incompleteness of accountability mechanisms to be particularly troubling from a human rights perspective, and believe that this is an area where human rights methodologies have a great deal to offer to development programs. In addition, we believe attention to the impacts upon marginalized populations is a crucial component of a truly human rights-based approach of development that must be further researched.

Endnotes

1. Because the MDGs are one of the most important initiatives on the global development agenda, we use in this context the MDGs and the MDG reports as representative of the development enterprise.
2. Alston illustrates this point by discussing the conspicuous absence of MDG references in the reports and resolutions of the Commission and its experts. Despite the fact that 19 of 125 resolutions the Commission on Human Rights had adopted by 2004 contained express references to the MDGs, most of them do not exhibit any substantive links with development goals.
3. Harmon quotes Jimi Wanjigi, adviser to Education Minister George Saitoti, as saying, "We had to make good on promises – we did not have time to plan...[s]o we decided to dive into the deep end and just learn how to swim."
4. In March 2002, Kenya passed a comprehensive *Children's Act*. This law codified a right to free education for all children, creating statutory institutions to ensure delivery of these rights, and imposed remedies for their violation.
5. Zia's national address included a discussion about the importance of providing textbooks to children during the first week of school.
6. Tietjen notes that 50% of the FFE beneficiaries came from households above the lower poverty line.
7. An example of this is that in the Chittagong Hill tracts, an estimated 1/3, or 90,000 of 270,000 students, are not enrolled in school because they cannot access schools.
8. *Grootboom* turned on the right to housing and introduced a standard for progressively realized rights under the South African Constitution that is relevant to all socio-economic rights, including the right to education. No claim to educational rights has been brought under *Grootboom* challenging state initiatives to promote the right to education.
9. In 2002, there was a late distribution of text books in the Eastern Cape region and only 25% of the students had access to learning support materials. Consequently, the Eastern Cape had the lowest overall pass rate of 52% as compared to the 71% and 70% pass rate in KwaZulu-Natal and Limpopo. Id. at 62.
10. Although the South African Law Commission recommended the establishment of an Office of the Children's Protector, the proposal has not been implemented by the government. The SAHRC also has not established a monitoring mechanism at any level of government. The National Programme of Action for South Africa has established a Monitoring Task Group for the purpose of monitoring the implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child and the African Children's Charter.
11. Order of the Supreme Court of India dated May 8, 2002.
12. *Unnikrishnan v. State of Andhra Pradesh* 1993 (1) SCC 645. See Article 21A of the Constitution of India.
13. This study found that Class 1 enrollment rose by 15 per cent between July 2001 and July 2002.

14. According to this study, dramatic jumps in female enrollment have occurred. For example, in the state of Chhattisgarh there was a 17% increase and Rajasthan, a 29% increase. There is a striking break here from the trend increase in school enrollment (about 2 per cent per year in the 1990s), and the bulk of this break is likely to reflect the impact of mid-day meals.

References

- Ahluwalia, P. (2004, November). *The implementation of the right to food at the national level: A critical examination of the Indian campaign on the right to food as an effective operationalisation of Article 11 of the ICESCR*. New York: Center for Human Rights & Global Justice at New York University School of Law.
- Alston, P. (2005). Ships passing in the night: The current state of the human rights and development debate seen through the lens of the Millennium Development Goals. *Human Rights Quarterly*, 27(3), 755-829.
- Childline. (n.d.) *Policy Making: Children's Protector*. Retrieved April 4, 2006, from <http://www.childlinesa.org.za/ChildrensProtector.htm>
- Citizenship Institute. (2001). *Projeto fome zero (hunger zero project)*. Retrieved August 15, 2006, from <http://www.fao.org/Regional/Lamerica/prior/segalim/fomezero/proyeng.pdf>
- Cost of free education. (2003, March 25). *Irin News*. Retrieved August 12, 2006, from <http://www.africafiles.org/article.asp?ID=1477>
- Dreze, J. (2004, April 24). Democracy and the right to food. *Economic and Political Weekly*. Retrieved August 17, 2006, from www.epw.org.in
- Dreze, J. & Goyal, A. (2003). The Future of mid-day meals. *The Frontline*, 20(16). Retrieved August 17, 2006, from <http://www.hinduonnet.com/fline/fl2016/stories/20030815002208500.htm>
- Government of Kenya. (2005, July). *Second periodic report of state parties: Kenya, CRC/C/65/Add.39*. Retrieved August 13, 2006, from [http://www.unhchr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf/\(Symbol\)/CRC.C.65.Add.39.En](http://www.unhchr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf/(Symbol)/CRC.C.65.Add.39.En)
- Harmon, D. (2003, January 21). No fee plan floods Kenya's schools. *The Christian Science Monitor*. Retrieved August 12, 2006, from <http://www.csmonitor.com/2003/0121/p06s01-woaf.htm>
- Indian Constituent Assembly. (1949/1950). *Constitution of India*. Retrieved September 10, 2006, from <http://indiacode.nic.in/coiweb/welcome.html>

- Jain, S. (2005). *The game of targeted public distribution system in the life of tribal communities of Madhya Pradesh: A study*. Bhopal, India: Right to Food Campaign Madhya Pradesh Group. Retrieved September 14, 2006, from <http://www.righttofoodindia.org/data/jain2005-tpdsmp.pdf>
- Kenya Human Rights Commission. (2005, April). *Universal primary education under threat*. Retrieved August 12, 2006, from <http://www.khrc.or.ke/news.asp?ID=28>
- Kenyan Office of the President. (2004, December 9). *Press statement: Free primary education programme*. Retrieved August 13, 2006, from <http://www.statehousekenya.go.ke/commentary/commentary091204.htm>
- Kothari, J. (2004). Social rights and the Indian constitution. *Law, Social Justice & Global Development Journal*, 2. Retrieved August 17, 2006, from http://www.go.warwick.ac.uk/elj/lgd/2004_2/kothari
- Mahmud, S. (2003). *Female secondary school stipend programme in Bangladesh: A critical assessment*. Dhaka, Bangladesh: Institute of Development Studies.
- Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. (2005). *Kenya education sector support strategy 2005-2010*. Retrieved August 13, 2006, from <http://www.education.go.ke/MOESTDocs/KESSP%20FINAL%20PT%201%20JUL%2026TH%202005.pdf>
- National Programme of Action Steering Committee. (1996, May 31). *National programme of action for children in South Africa*. Retrieved August 13, 2006, from www.info.gov.za/otherdocs/1996/chilprog.htm#head6.
- Otieno, S. (2006, February 7). High cost of learning blamed on free education. *The East African Standard*. Retrieved August 13, 2006, from <http://allafrica.com/stories/200602061135.html>.
- Over a million children still out of school. (2006, February 6). *The East African Standard*. Retrieved August 12, 2006, from <http://allafrica.com/stories/200602060542.html>
- Peoples' Union for Civil Liberties v. Union of India. (2001/2002, May 8). Writ Petition No. 196/2001. Retrieved September 15, 2006, from <http://www.righttofoodindia.org/orders/may8.html>
- Reddy, C. R. (2001, September 1). The crime of food surpluses. *The Hindu*. Retrieved September 12, 2006, from <http://www.hinduonnet.com/2001/09/01/stories/05012523.htm>
- Rohther, L. (2003, March 30). Brazil's war on hunger off to a slow start. *The New York Times*.
- Salmon, K. (2003, February 3). Kenya's schools try to accommodate free

- education. *INS News*. Retrieved August 13, 2006, from <http://www.insnews.org/world/focus/2003/02/kenya.free.education.htm>.
- Seal loopholes in free primary education. (2006, February 6). *The East African Standard*. Retrieved August 13, 2006, from <http://allafrica.com/stories/200602060550.html>.
- South African Constitutional Assembly. (1996, October 11). *Constitution of the Republic of South Africa*. Act No. 108 of 1996. Retrieved September 16, 2006, from <http://www.polity.org.za/html/govdocs/constitution/saconst.html>
- South African President's Office. (1996, April 24). *National Education Policy Act*. Act No. 27 of 1996. Retrieved September 16, 2006, from <http://www.polity.org.za/html/govdocs/legislation/1996/act96-027.html>
- South African President's Office. (1996, November 15). *South African Schools Act*. Act No. 84 of 1996. Retrieved September 16, 2006, from <http://www.polity.org.za/html/govdocs/legislation/1996/act96-084.html>
- Suplicy, E. M. (n.d.). President Lula's zero hunger program and the trend toward a citizen's basic income in Brazil. Retrieved August 18, 2006, from http://www1.senado.gov.br/eduardosuplicy/frm_ingles.htm
- Three square meals a day. (2003, February 20). *The Economist*.
- Tietjen, K. (2003, November). The Bangladesh primary education stipend project: A descriptive analysis. Retrieved September 19, 2006, from <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/EDUCATION/Resources/278200-1099079877269/547664-1099080014368/BangladeshStipend.pdf>
- United Kingdom Department for International Development. (2006, January 17). *Press Release: UK announces major support for education in Kenya*. Retrieved August 13, 2006, from <http://www.dfid.gov.uk/news/files/pressreleases/education-kenya.asp>
- UNDP. (2001). *Human development report 2000*. Retrieved August 12, 2006, from <http://hdr.undp.org/reports/global/2000/en/>
- UNDP. (2003). *Human development report 2003*. Retrieved August 12, 2006, from <http://hdr.undp.org/reports/global/2003/>
- UNESCO. (2006) *Education for all – Global monitoring report 2006*. Author. Retrieved August 13, 2006, from http://www.unesco.org/education/GMR2006/full/chapt3_eng.pdf
- UNICEF. (1989/2000). *The convention on the rights of the child*. Retrieved July 26, 2006 from www.unicef.org/crc/convention.htm
- UNHCR. (2006). *Frequently Asked Questions on a Human Rights-Based*

Approach to Development Cooperation. New York: Author.

Zia, B. K. (2004, January 4). *Prime Minister of Bangladesh Begum Khaleda Zia's statement at the 12th South Asian Association for Regional Co-operation Summit in Islamabad, Pakistan*. Retrieved August 13, 2006, from http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/bangladesh/document/papers/SAARC_pak.htm

Determinants of Child Labor in Thailand

Rubkwan Tharmmapornphilas

*Doctor of Education Student
Economics and Education Program
Department of International and Transcultural Studies
Teacher College, Columbia University*

Introduction

According to the National Educational Act of B.E. 2542 (Ministry of Education, 1999), all Thai citizens are entitled to basic, quality education for at least 12 years. While this education is supposed to be free, in reality there are many costs associated with schooling. In addition to the school fees, families also face expenses such as books, uniforms, etc., as well as the opportunity cost of not having income from their children's work. Whether young people go to school depends upon the basic optimization theory, whereby households maximize their utility subject to the budget limitation (Becker, 1964). The effects of free education on household decision are still in doubt as many researchers indicate that the family's income and indirect cost of education play an important role, especially in developing countries.

In this study I consider whether child labor and schooling decisions are made in a rational way, and I explore which factors influence families' decisions. I utilize the 'luxury axiom' (Basu and Van, 1998), which states that when a family is below the poverty level, then they will need income from child labor. In such situations, the children are less likely to attend school. As many households in Thailand are near the poverty line, sizable changes 'in and out of' poverty take place that might increase the probability of having child labor.

Using data from the Thailand Labor Force Survey (National Statistic Office Thailand, 2003), I will test the luxury axiom along with other determinants that might have an influence on the supply of child labor. This study targets children between the ages of 15-17, which is the upper-secondary school age. The paper is organized as follows: I will begin with a review of previous literatures. Then I will go on to describe the theoretical framework and data. Subsequently, I will present the empirical results, followed by the conclusion.

Literature Review and Theoretical Framework

The Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989) adopted by the United Nations defines a child as every person who is below the age of eighteen. In theory, child labor practices are regulated by International Labor Organization (ILO) Convention 29 (1930), which calls for the abolition of forced labor, and Convention 138 (1973), which provides for a minimum age of employment. In practice however, many children are still working in a variety of situations. Some young people work for their families without wages while others work in the labor market with wages. International organizations, governments and

researchers have recently shown a growing interest in the issue of child labor. Many efforts have been made to determine the factors that relate to the supply and demand of child labor.

The major theory of household decision-making with regard to children's schooling and employment has been developed from the neoclassical models of Becker (1964). Becker studied investments in human capital and stated that children will go to school if the benefit from schooling (potential earning) is greater than the cost (direct and indirect) after considering the difference between future and present value.

The question that arises after one accepts the theory of human capital is: who is responsible for making a decision about investment in schooling for the child? The model of household decision-making underlying these studies is the neoclassical, or so-called unitary, household model in which the family maximizes its welfare function subject to a unified budget constraint that pools income from all sources. This model abstracts from the potential conflicts between household members' objectives. Household members are assumed to work together to maximize the welfare of the household as a whole, and the rewards of children's work are shared by all household members in the form of a more relaxed budget constraint.

Most researchers assume that children have no bargaining power in the household that and parents make decisions regarding their own interests (Becker & Lewis, 1973). Becker and Lewis suggest that parents tend to invest more human capital in children who are deemed to be more intelligent and highly skilled. This is because the cost of investing in human capital for a more able child is cheaper than that of a less able child. Moreover, parents anticipate that children with higher skill levels will transfer resources to their siblings, which will decrease the average cost of parental investment.

On the other hand, some researchers propose that children are able to actively make decisions about household activities. Moehling (1995; 2005) suggests that children do have bargaining power but it varies depending on how much they contribute to the household income. Often, working children have the ability to alter the allocation of resources within the household, even though they may not gain equal power with their parents. Using data from the Bureau of Labor Statistics Cost of Living Survey 1917–1919, Moehling (2005) found that expenditures on girls' clothing increased in relation to the income they brought into the household.

In developing countries, one of the determinants that affects household decisions about sending children to school is the opportunity cost of revenue generated from their labor. The more time children devote to working, the less time they have for education. Psacharopoulos (1997) compared the educational attainments of children who work with those who do not in Bolivia and Venezuela. He concluded that child labor leads to two years less schooling on average. Ravallion and Wodon (1999) found that the reduction of child labor in Bangladesh accounts for about one quarter to one eighth of the increase in school attainment rate.

The incidence of child labor is very high in less developed nations as reported in Table 1. The Asian-Pacific region harbors the largest number of child workers in the 5-14 age category with 127.3 million in total (SIMPOC, 2002). Developed and transition economies have the lowest absolute numbers of child workers. Seen in relative terms, sub-Saharan Africa has the highest proportion of working children. The estimates show that almost 1 child in 3 below the age of 15 is economically active in the region. A similar relationship was found in Krueger's study (1996) where he noted a steep cross-country negative correlation between GDP per capita and the employment rate of 10-14 year olds in 1995.

Table 1

Regional Estimates of Economically Active Children, Ages 5-14 in 2000

Region	No. of children ^a	Work ratio ^b
Developed economies	2.5	2
Transition economies	2.4	4
Asia and the Pacific	127.3	19
Latin America & Caribbean	17.4	16
Sub-Saharan Africa	48.0	29
Middle East & North Africa	13.4	15
Total	211	18

Note. From "Every Child Counts: New Global Estimates for Child Labour" by SIMPOC, 2002. ^aIn millions. ^bAs percentages.

The high work ratio of children leads to a lower school enrollment rate as time for education is substituted by working. Table 2 reports the primary education net enrollment rate by region. Sub-Saharan Africa, where the child labor ratio is the highest, has the lowest net enrollment rate. On the other hand, high income countries that have a very small work ratio of children experience the 100% net enrollment rate.

Table 2

Net enrollment ratios of primary education in 2000

Region	Net enrollment rate ^a
High income countries	100
Low income countries	88
Sub-Saharan Africa	51
Middle East & North Africa	87
East Asia & Pacific	99
South Asia	77
Latin America & Caribbean	94
Europe & Central Asia	100
Total	88

Note. From "World Education Report" by UNESCO, 2003.

^aThe net enrollment is the percentage of children at school age who enroll in schools divided by the number of school age population.

As child labor has enormously adverse effects on education, educational economists have investigated the factors that influence child labor using quantitative methods. The frequently used variables in previous empirical research about child labor can be classified into 4 groups: children, household, school, and community characteristics. 'Children' characteristics include gender, age, and birth order. 'Household' characteristics are household income, parental education and the number of children. 'School' characteristics are the distance from home to school and the quality of school. Finally, 'community' characteristics are the location, infrastructure, and neighborhood.

Some determinants' effects are typically consistent in most studies while the impacts on child labor of some characteristics vary among different studies. Sometimes, the influence of economic and cultural environment make the direction of relationship between these determinants and child labor or child schooling differ among regions and countries. In this study I mainly focus on the impact of 'household' characteristics, although I do recognize the importance of other factors and will touch on them as well.

Two of the best known theories behind the influence of family on child labor are the luxury and substitution axioms (Basu & Van, 1998). The luxury axiom indicates that parents withdraw their children from the labor market once the adult wage reaches a critical level. According to this axiom, children from higher income families are less likely to become child laborers. The substitution

axiom states that adult labor replaces child labor. Thus, the probability of child labor decreases when a family has more adult members.

Ray's study (2000) of child labor in Peru and Pakistan can be used as an example of the 'children' and 'household' characteristics that affect child labor. The results show the linear relationship between childrens' labor hours and age in both countries. Children typically work more when they receive higher wages and children living in rural areas tend to work more than those in urban areas. In addition, the higher the level of parental education, the less children will work. This inverse relationship between parental education and child labor was found in many studies (e.g., Brown, Deardorff & Stern, 2001). On the other hand, some determinants show a different impact on child labor. Ray (2000) found a positive correlation between child labor and poverty in Pakistan but this association is insignificant in Peru (similar to what Patrinos and Psacharopoulos (1997) found about Peru's child labor).

Besides the factors that Ray (2000) uses in the child labor supply model, the 'school' characteristics also play an important role in determining child labor and schooling. The poor quality and the deficiencies in school resources reduce the benefit of education and thus adversely affect the household decision to enroll children in schools (Dreze & Kingdon, 2000; Ray, 2000). Another set of determinants is 'community' characteristics. Households naturally behave like their neighbors. It would be unusual if one family let their children to go to school while other households in the same area send their children to work in a farm. However, due to the limitation of our data, the factors related to 'school' characteristics are not included in this study.

Although child labor in Thailand has decreased significantly, many children are still out of school. Tzannatos (2003) has conducted an empirical analysis about why children do not attend school and reported that younger children (below 14) were hindered by the direct education costs while the opportunity costs explains why older children choose to enter the labor force rather than go to school. In addition, Tzannatos suggests that the reduction of family size in Thailand has decreased the ability of households to diversify their members' economic activities and financially insure themselves. As a result, household demand for child work can remain high for a significant time after the household moves out of poverty until a threshold level of income security is achieved. Using the labor force survey of 2003, I will determine whether the opportunity cost continues to be the reason that children go to work and see what kind of 'children' and 'household' characteristics increase the working potential of children and whether the 'luxury axiom' is held in Thailand.

The empirical analysis is based on the Thailand labor force survey and the survey on social security needs, both of which were conducted in 2003. The information in the surveys was obtained through interviews with the heads and members of households. The surveys cover 76 provinces in Thailand and the selection process is a stratified two-stage sampling. There were a total of 211,720 persons from 79,560 households who participated in the survey. Questions were asked about personal characteristics, educational background,

and employment information. However, the employment information was recorded only for person 15 years and over.

Since employment information was collected only from persons aged 15 years or older and the 12 year basic education in Thailand goes from primary to upper secondary school, I focus my attention on children who should be in upper secondary school (15-17 years old). From the entire database, I selected only the information of children aged between 15-17 years old who live in nuclear families and whose parents have records in the survey (some families have information of children but not information of parents). One of the advantages of this labor force survey is that it includes information about persons who work in the labor market as well as those who work as unpaid labor on farms or in homes. As a result, I can investigate the influence of 'household' characteristics on children who were working as family workers without wages. After adjustment, I end up with 6,391 children who either do not work, or who work as paid or unpaid labors.

As many children in the survey work without earning wages, I investigate the issue of child labor in Thailand by examining the number of hours that children worked in the last 7 days before the survey, and use them as indicators of child labor supply in this study. The explanatory variables in this paper are based on the previous study of child labor in Pakistan and Peru done by Ray (2000). The 'children' characteristics are age and wage. The household's monthly income, region of residence, number of children, gender of household head, age of household head, parental education, and occupation of household head are proxies for 'household' characteristics. However, the model does not incorporate 'school' and 'community' characteristics due to the limitation of the dataset.

Results

There are a total of 6,391 children between the ages of 15-17 years old from the selected dataset. Out of these, 1,229 children were working during the last 7 days before the survey, or approximately 20% of the observations. This is an indication of how serious the situation of child labor in Thailand is. Although these children have passed the minimum age of child labor laws in Thailand, it still reduces their opportunities to continue their education, which will arguably affect their income in the future.

Similar to other developing countries, the majority of child laborers in Thailand work without earning wages. Table 3 classifies children who are working according to their employment status. More than half of them classified themselves as unpaid family workers and almost 40% were working as private employees. However, only 453 children reported the amount of wages they received.

Table 3

Number of Children Who Work by Working Status

Working status	Frequency	Percent
Employer	1	0.08
Self employed without employee	57	4.64
Unpaid family worker	723	58.83
Government employee	3	0.24
Government enterprise employee	2	0.16
Private employee	441	35.88
Member of co-operative	2	0.16
Total	1,229	100.00

I compare the key characteristics of children who work and those who do not work by looking at sample means in Table 4. The average age of children who work is slightly higher than those who do not. Girls are less likely to work. On average, households that need assistance from children have about 0.4 more children in their family than households that do not need child laborers. The average income of the household's head whose children are working is substantially lower than that of household's head whose children are not working. The largest difference of sample means between these two groups of children was found in household locations. Most of the working children live in non-municipal (rural) areas, while more than half of the children who do not work live in municipal (urban) areas. The head of household's gender is not significantly different with 0.79 for working children and 0.78 for not working children as Thai culture tends to recognize the male as a household's leader. For working children, both head of household and spouse have lower level of education than children who are not working, similar to previous studies.

Using the number of hours children work in 7 days as the dependent variable, the influence of 'children' and 'household' characteristics on child labor is shown in Table 5. The regressions are done by gender to observe the different impacts on boys and girls. As only a few children receive wages from working, I have created a dummy variable to show the impact of wages on whether a child works. This variable indicates the difference between working with wages, working with no wages, or not working at all. The household income is employed instead of parent's wages as many parents do not report their receiving wages.

Table 4

Children and Household Characteristics (Sample Means)

Characteristics	Working children	Not working children
Age	16.20	15.97
Gender ^a	0.62	0.48
Number of children in household	2.80	2.38
Household income	2,392.27	3,881.36
Living in municipal area ^b	0.39	0.57
Head of household's gender ^a	0.79	0.78
Head of household's education ^c	2.34	3.19
Spouse's education ^c	2.18	2.97

^aGender is divided into 2 levels: 0 = female and 1 = male. ^bMunicipal is divided into 2 levels: 0 = non-municipal and 1 = municipal. ^cEducation is divided into 7 levels: 1 = none; 2 = less than elementary; 3 = elementary; 4 = lower secondary; 5 = upper secondary; 6 = secondary school diploma; 7 = university.

According to Table 5, wage has a very significant impact on the number of hours that children work. Children are prone to work when they receive wages. Wage has a larger impact on girls than on boys. Age has effects only on boys in that the older the boys are, the more hours per week they work; it has no significant effect on girls. The coefficient of age-square in boys is significant, which indicates a non-linear relationship between age and the supply of child labor. Surprisingly, and in contrast to the luxury axiom, the household's monthly income does not have a significant relationship with the working hour of children. This result corresponds with the study of Pakistan by Ray (2000) that failed to find a positive relation between poverty and child labor. Nevertheless, if the parental education is dropped from the regression models, the coefficient of household's monthly income will become significantly negative (this result is not reported in the table).

Table 5 also indicates that boys and girls who live in municipal areas have fewer working hours than children in non-municipal areas and the magnitude of this impact is much larger for boys. Similarly, the number of children in the family has more influence on boys than girls. Children who live in households with more members typically have longer working hours. The coefficients of head of household's gender and head of household's marital status are insignificant. The head of household's age is negatively significant for boys. The education levels of both head of household and spouse strongly reduce the number of hours that children work. The coefficients are larger for boys in both head of household's and spouse's education but the difference in magnitude

between boys and girls decrease for spouse's education. Regarding the occupation of head of household, children tend to work when the head of their household is a farmer, fisherman or other occupation related to agriculture.

Table 5

Regression

Dependent Variable: No. hrs. children work in 7 days			
	Boys	Girls	Total
Wage ^a	37.6044**	42.1608**	39.7120**
	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
Age	42.1179**	12.7712	29.6909**
	(0.038)	(0.440)	(0.025)
Age-square	-1.2515**	-0.3586	-0.8762**
	(0.049)	(0.488)	(0.035)
Household's monthly income	0.0000	-0.0000	0.0000
	(0.657)	(0.701)	(0.842)
Area ^b	-1.5868**	-0.6221**	-1.1973**
	(0.018)	(0.250)	(0.006)
Number of children	1.1871**	0.3893**	0.8016**
	(0.000)	(0.032)	(0.000)
Head of household's gender ^c	-0.1976	1.3054	0.8489
	(0.616)	(0.164)	(0.244)
Head of household's age	-0.1264**	-0.0311	-0.0858**
	(0.006)	(0.407)	(0.004)
Head marital status ^d	-0.1976	4.6364	3.2815
	(0.985)	(0.582)	(0.634)
Head of household's education level	-1.1089**	-0.5660**	-0.8824**
	(0.000)	(0.012)	(0.000)
Spouse's education level	-0.9443**	-0.6285**	-0.7770**
	-0.0010	(0.007)	(0.000)
Occupation ^e			

Table 5, cont.

Dependent Variable: No. hrs. children work in 7 days			
	Boys	Girls	Total
Unskilled	-4.8645 (0.000)	-2.1320** (0.028)	-3.6397** (0.000)
Factory worker	-3.4301 (0.000)	-1.9569** (0.005)	-2.8711** (0.000)
Office worker	0.7265 (0.396)	0.9843 (0.163)	0.9051 (0.107)
Constant	-336.377** (0.039)	-110.201 (0.406)	-241.463** (0.023)
Number of Observations	2,612	2,431	5,043
Adjust R-Square	0.3653	0.3925	0.3750

Note. P-value in parentheses. *10% Significant. **5% Significant

^a1=receiving wages. ^b1=municipal. ^c1=male. ^d1=married. ^eAgriculture is a base variable.

Conclusion

Using a recent dataset from Thailand, I have examined the relationship between child labor and characteristics of children and families. Children, especially girls, consider wages as an incentive to work. Age significantly increases the number of hours boys work but it has no impact on girls. The regression indicates that children born in households residing in non-municipal areas work more than their urban counterparts. The main reason is that rural children assist their parents on the farm. Households with many children are more likely to have child labor in families in order to offset the cost of living. The gender and marital status of household heads do not seem to be related to child labor supply. The head of household's age has a significantly negative relationship with young male laborers but such a relationship has not been found in girls. Of the household characteristics that matter most, results indicate that parental education has a strong negative association with child labor for both boys and girls. In addition, girls are relatively more influenced by the spouse's education. As almost 80% of household heads in the dataset are male, the result implies that the mother's education plays an important role on their daughters' educations. The head of household's occupation coefficients confirm that children whose parents work as farmers or fishermen spend more time working in general.

The most surprising result of this study is that there is no empirical evidence confirming that the 'luxury axiom' exists, after controlling for the effects of parental schooling. It is possible that parents who are well educated tend to earn more income and the influence of poverty has been absorbed into that of parental education. Further research has to carefully consider the correlation between these two variables.

It should be noted that the regression equations in this paper might have endogenous problems since the dependent variable (child's working hour) has some influence on the explanatory variable (household income). But due to missing information, I could not incorporate the instrument variables such as head of household's wage in the regressions. This technical problem could be overcome by using a more complete dataset. Moreover, the analysis could be extended to cover other types of families, not just nuclear ones, and the impacts of school and community characteristics (e.g., distance from home to school, school's quality, electricity access, etc.) should be incorporated into the models.

References

- Basu, K., & Van, P. H. (1998). The economics of child labor. *American Economic Review*, 88(3), 412-427.
- Becker, G. S. (1964). *Human Capital*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Becker, G. S., & Lewis, H. G. (1973). On the interaction between the quantity and quality of children. *Journal of Political Economy*, 81, 279-288.
- Brown, D. K., Deardorff, A. V., & Stern, R. M. (2001). Child labor, theory, evidence and policy. Working paper series 2001-10. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan.
- Dréze, J. & Kingdon, G.G. (2001). School Participation in Rural India. *Review of Development Economics*, 5, 1-24.
- Krueger, A. (1996). International labor standard and trade. In M. Bruno & B. Pleskovic (Eds.). *Annual World Bank Conference on Development Economics* (pp. 281-302). Washington, DC: The World Bank.
- International Labor Organization (1930). C29 Forced Labor Convention. Retrieved July 28, 2006, from www.ilo.org/ilolex/cgi-lex/convde.pl?C029
- International Labor Organization (1973). C138 Minimum Age Employment Convention. Retrieved July 28, 2006, from www.ilo.org/ilolex/cgi-lex/convde.pl?C029
- Ministry of Education (S. Povatong, Trans.). (1999) National Educational Act of B.E. 2542. Retrieved August 23, 2006, from <http://www.moe.go.th/English/edu-act.htm>

- Moehling, C. M. (1995). The intra-household allocation of resources and the participation of children in household decision-making: Evidence from early twentieth century America. Mimeo, Northwestern University.
- Moehling, C. M. (2005). 'She has suddenly become powerful': Youth employment and household decision making in the early twentieth century. *Journal of Economic History*, 65(2), 414-438.
- National Statistic Office Thailand. (2003). Labour Force Survey. Bangkok, Thailand: Author. Retrieved August 26, 2006, from http://web.nso.go.th/eng/stat/lfs_e/lfse.htm
- Patrinos, H., & Psacharopoulos, G. (1997). Family size, schooling and child labor in Peru: An empirical analysis. *Journal of Population Economics*, 10, 387-405.
- Psacharopoulos, G. (1997). Child labor versus education attainment: Some evidence from Latin America. *Journal of Population Economics*, 10(4), 377-386.
- Ray, R. (2000). Child labor, child schooling, and their interaction with adult labor: Empirical evidence for Peru and Pakistan. *The World Bank Economic Review*, 14(2), 347-367.
- Ravallion M. & Wodon, Q. (1999). Does child labor displace schooling? Evidence on behavioral responses to an enrollment subsidy. Policy Research Working Paper Series 2116, The World Bank.
- Tzannatos, Z. (2003). Child labor and school enrollment in Thailand in the 1990s. *Economics of Education Review*, 22, 523-536
- Statistical Information and Monitoring Programme on Child Labour (SIMPOC). (2002). Every child counts: New global estimates for child labour. Retrieved July 28, 2006, from www.ilo.org/public/english/standards/ipecc/simpoc/others/globalest.pdf
- UNESCO. (2003). World Education Report, 2003. Paris: Author.
- UNICEF. (1989/2000). *The convention on the rights of the child*. Retrieved July 26, 2006 from www.unicef.org/crc/convention.htm

The Private Direct Costs of Primary Education in Urban China

Yan Shi

*Doctor of Education Student
Economics and Education Program
Department of International and Transcultural Studies
Teachers College, Columbia University*

Introduction

The People's Republic of China has achieved substantial educational progress since its founding in 1949. The government has successfully improved the access of primary education; by the mid-1990s, China had attained virtually universal enrollment in elementary school. In China, the government is the dominant provider of resources for education, with the public expenditure on education as 16.05% of the total government budgets and the public expenditure on education as 2.46% of the Gross National Product (GNP) in 1995 (National Bureau of Statistics of China, 1996).

However, as education develops quantitatively, its quality varies a great deal in China. Like other developing countries, the fiscal difficulties confronting the government pose significant restrictions to improving the quality of education. Even as the demand on public resources to support education grows, governments also face compelling demands to address issues such as disease, natural disaster, and pollution. It is not realistic to rely entirely on tight government budgets to conduct interventions to improve school quality. This urges education policy makers to seek alternative sources, including private resources, to finance education and to re-examine the allocation of funds for education (Tsang & Kidchanapanish, 1992).

Many important educational decisions are related to the costs of schooling. Information on costs is necessary to monitor resource allocation over time, to diagnose the function status of the education system, and to evaluate the efficiency in resource utilization (Tsang, 2002). Specifically, costs of education refer to the resources used in the production of education services. They include not only public expenditure on education, but also private resources invested in education. According to Tsang (1995), private resources at the school level refer to those provided by household, individuals, and the community to support the production of educational services. Private resources are divided into three categories: direct private costs, private contributions, and indirect private costs. Direct private costs are defined as household educational expenditure related to a child's schooling, including tuition expenditure and non-tuition expenditure (such as spending on other school fees, textbooks and supplementary study guides, uniforms, writing supplies, school bag, transportation, and boarding). Private contributions refer to donations in the form of cash/gifts from parents, individuals, or the community to a school. Indirect private costs refer to the economic value of forgone opportunities of schooling.

In order to improve educational quality, it is important to take private costs into consideration. Schools can use some of the direct private resources to employ interventions that enhance quality. Through examining the components of private costs, the government can encourage parents to invest more on items (reference books and other learning materials) directly related to student learning. Moreover, disparities in private resources to education among social groups may exacerbate educational inequalities among those groups. A better understanding of the variation in private investment to education will help decision makers design policies to mitigate educational inequality (Tsang & Taoklam, 1992).

This paper presents an analysis that reduces part of the knowledge gap in the existing literature regarding the actual direct private costs on primary schooling in developing countries. I calculate the direct private expenditure on primary education in urban China, which sheds light on the actual economic burden level to families in supporting children in primary school. I address four research questions in this study: (1) How much do urban Chinese parents spend on their children's primary education per year? (2) How do the direct private costs differ in terms of students' individual characteristics and family backgrounds? (3) What is the level of economic burden for different social groups? (4) Which individual and family characteristics are the key determinants of direct private costs on primary education?

The rest of this paper is organized as follows: next I will provide a brief literature review on Chinese primary education and some related cost studies. Subsequently, I explain the data set and variables of the study. The econometric results will be presented and discussed in the succeeding portion of the article. Finally, I will summarize my research findings and present the implications of this study.

Literature Review

The development of primary education in China was a formidable accomplishment given the very low-level economic development, the large population and substantial unevenness across regions in China. In contrast to the 20% enrollment rate before 1949, the total enrollment of primary schools was 132 million with an enrollment rate of 98.5% among children of schooling age in 1995.

Under the 1986 Law on Nine-year Compulsory Education (People's Republic of China National People's Congress), primary schools were to become tuition-free and reasonably located for the convenience of the children attending them. Students would attend primary schools in their neighborhoods or villages. The Law stated that the central and local governments should take responsibility for raising the money for all the expenses and construction investments for compulsory education. The central government was additionally required to provide some subsidies to the poor areas in China.

Under the Detailed Rules of Implementing Compulsory Education (Ministry of Education, 1992), students can be charged a small amount of miscellaneous fees by compulsory schools. The Rules indicate that all levels of local government should take charge of financing compulsory education.

In 1993, the government promulgated the China Education Reform and Development Compendium (CPC Central Committee, 1993). It advanced that the public expenditure on education as a proportion of the GDP should be increased gradually and should achieve 4% by the end of the century. Education institutions at various levels were encouraged to generate their own resources and intensify their effort to gather social contributions and those from Chinese living overseas. Furthermore, state enterprises, institutions, and other society sectors were encouraged to establish their own schools.

According to these laws, the actual situation of financing compulsory education in China is that the central government provided very few subsidies and the financing responsibilities were shifted to the lowest levels of local government. In rural areas, villages and peasants (through educational expense add-ons and collected money) bear the greatest financial burden of compulsory education. In urban areas, borough and county governments (through taxes and city educational expense add-ons) take on the most responsibilities for financing compulsory schooling.

Based on data collected by the Chinese State Statistics Bureau from urban households, Chen (1992) reported that education expenditure as a proportion of household income increased from 2.1% in 1987 to 2.4% in 1988 and 2.7% in 1989. He also found that higher income households spent a lower proportion of their income on education. The problem for this study is that the item education expenditure in this dataset only included tuition and other school fees, stationary and writing supplies, and magazines and newspapers. It did not include expenditures on school uniforms, transportation, boarding, etc. Also, part of the expenditure on magazines and newspapers may not be related to schooling.

Tsang (1990) conducted an important study on private costs in the Chinese provinces of Guizhou and Shanxi. The data was collected through interviewing parents and school staff in selected urban and rural areas in these two provinces. He found that for Guizhou province, direct private costs at the primary level constituted 1.2% of household income in urban areas and 2.1% of household income in rural areas. The direct private costs increase with the rise of the educational level for both provinces. Direct private costs were higher in urban areas than those in rural areas at the same education level. Non-fee-related direct private costs as a proportion of total direct private costs averaged 84% at the primary level. In addition, the study found that the burden of private costs of schooling could adversely affect the demand for education, especially in poor areas.

West (1995) found that in 1992/93, households in one of the poorest parts of Guangdong Province devoted 29% of their total income to education, while households in middle-income and rich areas devoted 19% and 14%, respectively.

Data and Variables

The data used in this study is from the 1995 Chinese Household Income Project (CHIP-95), which was conducted by the Institute of Economic Studies in Beijing. The data is the most extensive and representative microeconomic data available to the public in China. The purpose of this project was to measure and estimate the distribution of personal income in both rural and urban areas of the People's Republic of China. To ensure a representative geographic sample, data were collected from various regions of China and in cities and towns of various sizes. Eleven province-level administrative units were selected to represent the whole country. Liaoning and Shanxi provinces were chosen to represent the north; Jiangsu and Guangdong the eastern coastal provinces; Anhui, Henan and Hubei the interior; and Gansu, Sichuan and Yunnan the west. In addition, Beijing was chosen to represent the three large province-level municipalities.

The data collection consists of two distinct samples of the urban and rural populations of the People's Republic of China, which were selected from significantly larger samples (approximately 35,000 urban households and 65,000 rural households) drawn by the State Statistical Bureau. CHIP-95 Urban Individual Data include 21,698 detailed observations from 6,931 households in the urban areas. The urban individual data of the survey contain information on the respondents' employment status, level of education, economic sector of employment, occupation, income and so on. The urban household data of the survey include information on total income, total debt, all kinds of expenditures, etc.

To obtain a proper sample for addressing the research questions, I first merged individual level data and household level data together, and then picked up the individuals for analysis use. The sample has been selected based on individuals enrolled in primary school as full time students in 1995 and excluded individuals with negative or zero private expenditure on education. The sample used in this study consists of 1,468 individuals. The sample size is large enough that we can produce a relatively generalizable statistical analysis.

Table 1 presents means and standard deviations of the main variables. Of all the children, 6% are minorities. The average total household expenditure is 11,711.41 Yuan (U.S. \$1,411), where 1 US dollar is equivalent to approximately 8.3 Yuan. The average household income is 13,318.92 Yuan (U.S. \$1,605) and the household income per capita is 4,268.96 Yuan (U.S. \$514). The average value of net household assets is 33,883.09 Yuan (U.S. \$4,082).

On average, fathers have 10.61 years of schooling and mothers have 10.11 years of schooling. With respect to the fathers' occupations, 31% are white-collar employees (refers to employees who perform knowledge work, such as those in professional managerial or administrative positions). In terms of the mothers' occupations, 35% are white-collar employees.

Table 1

Descriptive statistics

Variables	Mean	Std. Dev.
Total expenditure	11711.41	8259.710
Food consumption expenditure	5833.87	3233.610
Expenditure on education and reference materials	68.59	111.748
Expenditure on tuition and fees	387.14	557.457
Other household expenditure on children's educ.	165.38	749.360
Total private direct costs	621.11	968.250
Female ^a	0.50	0.500
Minority ^b	0.06	0.231
Household income	13318.92	7721.475
Per-capita household income	4268.96	2545.866
Family assets	33883.09	42587.449
Father's years of schooling	10.61	2.734
Mother's years of schooling	10.11	2.608
Father's occupation ^c	0.31	0.461
Mother's occupation ^c	0.35	0.478

^a0 = male and 1 = female. ^b0 = non-minority and 1 = minority. ^c0 = non-white-collar and 1 = white-collar.

Empirical Findings

Variations in Direct Private Costs

To address the first and second research questions outlined in the introduction, Table 2 presents information on the direct private costs for primary education by students' individual characteristics and family backgrounds. The average household expenditure on educational and reference materials for primary school students is 68.59 Yuan (U.S. \$8), the average expenditure on tuition and fees is 387.14 Yuan (U.S. \$47), and the average expenditure on other household expenditure for children's education is 165.38 Yuan (U.S. \$20). These three items have large variations within the sample. Adding the three items together, the direct private cost for the primary school student in urban China amounts to 621.11 Yuan (U.S. \$75) per year.

Consider the students' genders first. For the total direct private costs, differences between the two genders are quite small, less than 10%. In specification, however, parents of female students spend 57.68 Yuan (U.S. \$7) more than parents of male students on other education expenditures (uniforms, transportation, boarding, etc).

With regards to the ethnicity of the student, the average total direct private costs of primary education for majority students are 121.3 Yuan (U.S. \$15) more per year than that for minority students. However, the analysis of variance (ANOVA) comparison analysis indicates that the difference between majority and minority students is not significant (Table 2). ANOVA is the standard technique for quantifying and partitioning sample variance in experimental data.

The sample is divided into five groups according to the quintiles of household income. The four cut-off points for the quintiles are 8416, 10568, 12705, and 16808 Yuan. One obvious pattern shown in Table 2 is that the higher income households systematically spend more on student's primary education. The total direct private costs, the household tuition and fees, and other expenditure on children's education all exhibit an upward trend by family income.

In this study the net value of household assets (subtract total value of debts from total value of assets) was used as a measure of family wealth. It is also divided into quintiles and the four cut-off points for the quintiles are 9000, 17045, 28582, and 49240 Yuan. In general, the results in Table 2 do show the pattern of expenditure by asset groups (except group 4): wealthier families spend more on direct private costs. Note in particular the remarkably large direct private costs invested in education by the wealthiest group (top 20%).

Table 2

Private Direct Costs to Primary Education in China by Family Background^a

Variables	Expenditure on study material	Expenditure on tuition and fees	Other expenditures	Total direct private costs	Econ. burden
Entire sample	68.59	387.14	165.38	621.11	5.53
Gender of student					
Male	69.42	394.22	136.78	600.42	5.01
Female	67.75	379.94	194.46	642.15	4.99
Ethnicity of student					
Majority	69.96	391.10	166.91	627.97	5.05
Minority	45.82	321.02	139.83	506.67	4.24
Household income					
Less than 8416 (<20%)	68.43	270.61	64.96	404.00	6.04

Table 2, cont.

Variables	Expenditure on study material	Expenditure on tuition and fees	Other expenditures	Total direct private costs	Econ. burden
8416-10568 (21%-40%)	55.06	325.40	89.91	470.37	5.40
12706-16808 (61%-80%)	76.00	475.58	140.07	691.65	4.73
Above 16808 (top 20%)	76.94	486.12	401.27	964.34	3.98
Family assets					
Less than 9000 (<20%)	69.60	324.49	113.50	507.60	5.26
9000-17045 (21%-40%)	76.43	387.47	110.19	577.09	5.17
17046-28582 (41%-60%)	62.30	375.99	176.17	614.46	4.85
28583-49240 (61%-80%)	64.79	360.29	148.24	573.32	4.53
Above 49240 (top 20%)	67.13	489.52	278.92	835.57	5.20
Father's Education Level					
University and above	50.77	329.29	140.69	520.74	3.77
Secondary school	69.20	387.32	172.41	629.10	5.06
Primary	77.08	545.60	92.02	714.70	5.90
Mother's Education Level					
University and above	26.85	310.93	138.29	476.07	3.23
Secondary school	67.48	371.80	170.17	609.45	4.88
Primary	109.68	686.79	123.91	920.38	8.07
Father's occupation					
White-collar	67.39	431.30	236.18	734.88	4.93
Blue collar and others	66.42	368.19	133.37	569.97	5.12
Mother's occupation					
White-collar	57.16	399.31	166.20	622.66	4.59
Blue collar and others	67.07	366.40	186.96	620.43	5.11
Number of children					
One	60.71	354.54	152.14	567.39	4.54
Two	49.65	256.08	166.33	422.05	6.98
Three	59.71	317.62	33.81	411.14	12.74

^a Direct private costs on primary education as a percentage of household income expressed as Yuan per student per year, 1995.

There is no consistent pattern between the parents' education levels and direct private costs of education. One possible explanation for this is that China's one-child policy has made parents more invested in their only child and therefore more willing to contribute to the welfare of that child, especially for education, regardless of their own level of educational attainment. Table 2 shows that direct private costs of primary education varies with the number of children in the family. The direct private cost per student per year declines with the increase of the number of children in the family.

On average, fathers working in white-collar jobs spend 164.91 Yuan (U.S. \$20) more on direct private costs for education than fathers in blue-collar and other jobs. The difference in direct private costs by mothers based on their occupations is very small. Mothers working in white-collar jobs spend almost the same on children's education as those engaged in blue-collar or other jobs.

Economic Burden of Direct Private Costs

Information on direct private costs is useful for policy makers to design interventions to improve school quality. However, while attempting to mitigate the inequity among different social groups, it is also important to address the third research question by assessing the level of economic burden of direct private costs for education for different social groups.

There are two measures for economic burden. One is to compare the private expenditure on education with total household expenditure; the other is to compare the private expenditure on education with household income. In this study, I will utilize the latter one. The last column of Table 2 presents information on economic burden by different student backgrounds.

On average, the economic burden amounts to 5.53% in 1995. The economic burden for the lowest 5 percentile families is as high as 7.2% (not reported in the table). Specifically, private expenditure on tuition and fees accounts for more than half (62.33%) of this while other private expenditures on children's education account for about 26.63%.

The pattern of economic burden by household income is remarkable. As the household income increases, the economic burden for the family decreases. The average burden for the highest income quintile amounts to 3.98%, while the average economic burden for the lowest quintile is as high as 6.04%. A similar pattern can also be found between economic burden and household wealth (except for the top quintile). These findings are ironic in that the poorest families bear the heaviest burden, even though they have less direct private resources (Tsang & Kidchanapanish, 1992).

There is no obvious consistent pattern between the parents' education levels and economic burden. However, the findings do show that the least

educated families have the heaviest economic burdens. On average, white-collar families have lighter burdens than blue-collar families. Families with more children have heavier burdens than those with fewer kids.

Determinants of Direct Private Costs on Primary Education

While the above data are very useful in highlighting variations in private expenditure on education, they are nevertheless limited by the fact that comparisons have not been standardized by controlling for all other factors that affect expenditure. To overcome this problem, this study employs the ordinary least squares (OLS) regression model to address the fourth research question, or to find out the key individual and family characteristics that determine the direct private costs.

Direct private costs in natural logarithm form and economic burden were employed as the dependent variables respectively. I also did the regressions with the private direct costs as the dependent variables. In this paper I only present the results for the regression with the private direct costs in logarithm as dependent variables for interpretation purposes. Independent variables were constructed to represent individual socioeconomic and demographic characteristics considered relevant. Among these independent variables, gender, ethnicity, and parents' occupations are all expressed in dummy variable forms. There are two occupation variables, one for the mother, and the other for the father. In both cases the control groups are blue-collar employees. To facilitate the use of linear models, the natural logarithms of household income and family wealth (net assets in Yuan) are used. Parents' educations are expressed by two continuous variables measuring years of schooling. According to the studies previously mentioned, the number of children in a family is also added into this analysis. In addition, one group of province dummy variables is added into the equation to capture the regional fixed effect.

Column 1 of Table 3 presents the OLS estimates for total direct private costs in logarithm form. Household income, parents' occupations, and number of children have a significant effect on direct private costs. Student's gender, ethnicity, family assets, and parents' educations have no independent significant effects. Column 2 of Table 3 shows the estimates where province dummy variables are added (the reference group is the province with the code 62). While most results are consistent with data in column 1 of Table 3, the coefficient for mother's occupation is no longer significant.

In these two regressions, the coefficients on all the variables other than $\ln(\text{household income})$ and $\ln(\text{family asset})$ can usually be interpreted as the percentage change ($e^b - 1$, where b is the coefficient) in direct private costs corresponding to a change in the status of the associated variable. Thus, from the results of column 2, the father's occupation as a white-collar worker as opposed to other jobs raises direct private costs by 18.41%, other things being equal. Families with an additional child will spend 68.54% more on direct private costs.

The coefficients of the Ln(household income) and Ln(family wealth) are estimates of the income elasticity and wealth elasticity of direct private costs on primary education. They measure the responsiveness of direct private costs to changes in household income and family wealth. After controlling the province effect, the income elasticity of direct private costs is 0.274, which is statistically significant. It means that a one percent increase in the household income will lead on average to about 0.274% increase in their direct private costs. Since the wealth elasticity is very small (0.039) and it is not significant, I will not discuss it here.

Column 3 and Column 4 of Table 3 present the OLS estimates of the determinants of economic burden. Partially in line with the findings in previous columns, the results show that after controlling the province effect, student gender and ethnicity, parents' educations and occupations make no significant difference in economic burden for the household.

Household income has a significant negative effect on economic burden. Although wealthier families spend more on their children's primary educations, such resources exert less financial strain on them compared to the poorer families (Tsang & Kidchanapanish, 1992). In contrast to household income, family wealth has a small positive effect on economic burden. The economic burden increases a little with the increase of family wealth. The number of children has a positive effect on economic burden.

Table 3

OLS Parameter Estimates for Direct Private Costs in Logarithm Form & Economic Burden

Explanatory variables	Ln(direct private costs)		Economic burden	
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Constant	0.217 (0.621)	2.099** (0.726)	14.740** (3.728)	22.372** (4.454)
Female	-0.057 (0.056)	-0.065 (0.054)	-0.069 (0.334)	-0.073 (0.333)
Minority	-0.122 (0.124)	0.019 (0.125)	-0.841 (0.743)	-0.238 (0.767)
Ln (household income)	0.534** (0.069)	0.274** (0.082)	-1.535** (0.413)	-2.542** (0.502)
Ln (family asset)	0.024 (0.029)	0.039 (0.028)	0.285 (0.172)	0.358* (0.174)

Father's education	-0.009 (0.013)	-0.006 (0.012)	-.0046 (0.075)	-0.043 (0.076)
Mother's education	0.007 (0.014)	0.009 (0.013)	-0.031 (0.081)	-0.015 (0.081)
Father is a white-collar worker	0.155* (0.069)	0.169* (0.067)	0.681 (0.413)	0.780 (0.414)
Mother is a white-collar worker	-0.151* (0.068)	-0.109 (0.105)	-0.871* (0.408)	-0.661 (0.411)
Number of children	0.501** (0.072)	0.522** (0.073)	2.363** (0.434)	2.531** (0.446)
Province effect	No	Yes	No	Yes
Adj. R^2	0.11	0.17	0.06	0.07

Note. Standard errors in parentheses, $N= 1013$; * and ** indicate significance at the 0.05 and 0.01 levels, respectively

Due to the data limitation, I do not have any information on school characteristics or parental-engagement factors, which have been proven to have an important effect on direct private costs. This results in the low R^2 for all the above models. The estimated F statistics in all regressions are statistically different from 0 at the 1% level.

Conclusions and Implications for Education Finance Policy

This study uses the data from the CHIP-95 to examine the actual direct private spending on primary education in urban China. It shows that the average direct private cost is about 621.11 Yuan (U.S. \$75) per student per year, which constitutes a substantial proportion of the household income. This finding is consistent with the results from previous studies (Tilak, 1985; Tan 1985; Tsang & Kidchanapanish, 1992). This suggests that great financial efforts, which some households are willing and can afford to make, could be encouraged. Government and society should create more incentives such as tax concessions for parents to spend more on items like textbooks and learning materials that directly relate to the education quality.

The income elasticity of direct private expenditure on primary schooling is 0.274. The average economic burden to families in supporting children in primary school is 5.53%. The direct-private-cost burden decreases as household income increases, and goes up as the number of children and family wealth grow. The patterns may shed light on the individual's efficient decision-making and allocation of resources.

It is ironic that although lower income families have fewer resources to spend on their children's educations, they still have a heavier economic burden than high-income families. Primary education in China is tuition-free and the fees are modest, but the results present some idea of the limits to the capacity of low-income households for educational expenditure. The government may want to consider providing financial assistance to needy students and explore the feasibility of a student loan program.

Large variations in private direct costs can increase inequity. The private costs may reduce the demand for education, especially for those from lower socio-economic backgrounds. I estimate that this negative effect will be more serious for higher levels of education, which are not compulsory. To mitigate the negative effects of private financing, the potential of making more use of taxes on income and property instead of flat fees is considerable. Also, the government needs to redirect some public resources for education from the more wealthy people to the poor population. People who can afford the direct private costs should be encouraged to spend more, so that the additional public resources can be used to subsidize the poor families to ensure they have access to quality compulsory education, and that they are adequately represented in post-compulsory education.

China is now in transition from a centrally planned to a market economy, which presents a unique set of challenges. These include new manifestations of poverty and inequality, shortages of counterpart funding, organizational rigidity, limited absorptive capacity, and the difficulties of adapting education and training systems to the market economy (World Bank, 1999). At this time, besides the importance of an appropriate level of public spending on education, it is especially imperative to sufficiently deal with the relationship of efficiency and equity. On the one hand, the government needs to increase the resource mobility and improve the school quality to accumulate high - quality human capital and maintain high economic growth. On the other hand, the government efficiency improvement and resource mobilization will not necessarily make quality basic education more accessible to disadvantaged populations and there is an issue of inequality. In order to deal with this dilemma between quality-improvement objectives and equality objectives, Verspoor and Tsang (1993) suggest targeting a larger proportion of additional public resources at disadvantaged populations and areas, while continuing mobilization of private resources for education in all areas.

Due to the data limitation, I did not include the information on indirect private costs and household contributions. This will result in underestimating the entire private resources and economic burden of education. It would be conceptually wise to examine these categories in the future. Moreover, continuous study is desirable to be conducted over time using the most recent data to track how the private direct costs in China are changing, and therefore used to influence the public policy on financing education and improving quality.

References

- Chen, L. (1992, August). The impact of population growth on education and the potential of family education expenditure in China, presented at Policy Seminar on Financing of Education in China, Dalian, China, (in Chinese).
- CPC Central Committee and the State Council. (1993). China Education Reform and Development Compendium. Beijing, China: Author.
- Institute of Economic Studies (1995). Household Income Survey 1995. Chinese Academy of Social Sciences. Beijing, China: Author.
- Ministry of Education of the People's Republic of China. (1992). Detailed Rules of Implementing Compulsory Education Law of the People's Republic of China, promulgated by Order No.19 of National Education Committee of the People's Republic of China. Beijing, China: Author. Retrieved on August 23, 2006, from <http://www.edu.cn/20050114/3126820.shtml>
- People's Republic of China, 6th National People's Congress. (1986). Compulsory Education Law of the People's Republic of China. Beijing: China. Retrieved on August 23, 2006.
- National Bureau of Statistics of China. (1996). National educational financing implementation statistics bulletin for year 1995. China Education and Research Network..
- Tan, J. (1985). The private direct cost of secondary schools in Tanzania. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 5(1), pp.1-10.
- Tilak, J. (1985). Analysis of costs of education in India. New Delhi: National Institute of Educational Planning and Administration. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 261946).
- Tsang, M. (1990). Financing of primary and secondary education in Shanxi and Guizhou, Report prepared for the China Department, World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Tsang, M. (1995). Public and private costs of schooling in developing countries. In M. Carnoy (Ed.), *International encyclopedia of economics of education* (2nd ed., pp.393-398). Oxford, England: Pergamon Press.
- Tsang, M. (2002). Comparing the costs of public and private schools in developing countries. In Levin, H., & McEwan, P. J. (Eds.), *Cost effectiveness and educational policy: American Education Finance Association 2002 Handbook*. Larchmont, NY: Eye on Education, Inc.
- Tsang, M., & Kidchanapanish, S. (1992). Private resources and the quality of primary education in Thailand. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 17, 179-198.

- Tsang, M., & Taoklam, W. (1992). Comparing the costs of government and private primary education in Thailand. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 12(3), 177-190.
- Verspoor, A., & Tsang, M. (1993). Case studies in financing quality basic education. Washington, D.C.: Education and Social Policy Department, the World Bank.
- West, L. (1995). Regional economic variation and basic education in rural China: McNamara Fellowships Program Report. Washington, D.C.: Economic Development Institute, the World Bank.
- World Bank. (1999). Education sector strategy. Washington D.C.: Author.

The Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper and Tanzania's Next Generation

Tavis D Jules

*Doctor of Education Student
International Educational Policy Studies
International Educational Development
Department of International & Transcultural Studies*

Introduction

Like many other African countries, Tanzania has indulged in heavy monetary borrowing since gaining independence in 1961. When Tanzania could not repay its debt due to higher interest rates, the country underwent Structural Adjustment Programs (SAPs) under the auspices of the World Bank (WB) and the International Monetary Fund (IMF). These SAP policies have included trade liberalization, cost sharing of social services, eliminating consumer and agricultural subsidies, reducing civil service employment, and promoting the privatization of programs in several sectors including education (Vavrus, 2004). This economic reconstruction has resulted in the decrease of governmental expenditures on social services such as health and education. Vavrus (2004) notes that SAPs have failed to alleviate Tanzania's debt burden and argues that the Tanzanian government now spends four times (275 million shillings per year) as much on debt reduction as it does on social services. At the beginning of the new millennium the WB and the IMF, under global pressure from civil society, introduced Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSP). They are designed to act as a partnership between the government and civil society, with the aim of reducing the debt that countries owe to international financial agencies and other countries.

The modern, globalized world depends on knowledge production and a skilled workforce (de Waal, 2002).¹ As Tanzania continues to become more developed it is simultaneously becoming more dependent on external aid from international organizations. Samoff (1994) argues that Tanzania's shift to a greater dependence on non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and international institutions is creating an increased reliance on the development models of Western advisors. It is within this context that Tanzania's PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) was written by the Tanzanian government. The PRSP identifies the government's goals that need urgent attention. The government recognizes that there are three major social problems in the country, "ignorance, disease and poverty," and suggests that the poverty reduction plan will solve these problems over time (p. 3). While the PRSP identifies these problems in its opening paragraph, the rest of the document focuses solely on how the government will combat poverty. The current article will argue that while the Tanzanian government has situated the PRSP in both a local and an international context by citing the importance of poverty reduction for Tanzanians, the Tanzanian government has not adequately involved the local stakeholders that are affected by the PRSP. Moreover, the text of the document

is couched in international rhetoric that is non-reflective of the voices of Tanzanians who reside in the rural areas.

One of the main arguments for the formation of the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) was that civil society would play a significant role in the conceptualization of this document. Moreover, the PRSP is seen as important in combating poverty through education. It is therefore vital to situate the text of the PRSP within the context of education to determine whether or not local stakeholders understand the correlation between poverty alleviation and education. In order to determine the importance of local stakeholder participation, a random site in the Kilimanjaro Region of Tanzania was chosen to find out if residents from the village of Old Moshi knew about the PRSP. In understanding which actors were involved in the formation of educational policies in Tanzania, the research site of Old Moshi was chosen to better comprehend the level of participation that a particular community may have had in the formation of the PRSP. Samoff (1994) argues that educational policy making in Tanzania is not solely a Tanzanian activity. He further contends that most new projects in education are funded externally. Hence, this study was interested in the relationship between poverty reduction and education. The PRSP notes that for the alleviation and subsequent eradication of poverty to take place, drastic changes have to occur in health, education, governance and the environment. However, the government does not specify how these changes will take place.

Literature Review

Like other sub-Saharan African countries, Tanzania is caught up in a process by which previous structural adjustment conditionalities have been replaced by the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002). In understanding the conceptual framework of the PRSP, it is important to be clear on the definition of poverty in the African context. Poverty and poverty reduction are not confined to Tanzania alone. Ali (2002) argues that a paradigmatic shift should take place in the way that poverty is defined. In examining the historical linkages of poverty, Ali contends that two theories have tried to explain poverty in Africa: *radical theory* and *externalist theory*. The radical theorists contend that the failure of African nations to fight poverty is 'just the way Africa is,' while the externalist theorists argue that slavery and colonialism are responsible for Africa's present problems. Ali, however, argues that it is the *environment-geography theory* – nature has been unkind to Africa because of its geographic location – and the *institutional theory* – which is based on tribalism and the failure of state formation – that are the root causes of Africa's poverty problems. Regardless of which theory one finds solace in, when trying to 'solve' Africa's poverty problems one should bear in mind that it is the local people who are suffering.

Ali (2002) explains that there are several ways to measure poverty. He notes that the dominant approach is the *money metric approach*, which measures the standard of living by identifying thresholds of deprivation in which a person is categorized as being poor. Another method is the *cost of basic needs*, which identifies the typical diet of the poor that is necessary for a healthy lifestyle. A third approach is the *fixed poverty line*, which is comprised as a function of the standard of living. The *head-count ratio* measures poverty by

identifying the total population of society and it is used to measure the spread of poverty in any society. Finally, economists contend that because the inequality in distribution of consumption depends on the mean consumption, a relationship exists between poverty and economic growth. Thus, the product elasticity of poverty is calculated by using the mean consumption, which is called the *growth elasticity of poverty* (de Waal, 2002). The way in which poverty is measured in Tanzania is important for the PRSP because that measurement determines whether or not the PRSP is attaining its goals.

While authors, governments, academics and NGOs recognize that poverty is an ongoing issue in Africa, a consensus does not exist on the best way to measure this phenomenon. The people of Tanzania have been trying to eradicate poverty since before independence. Over the last decade, one way of solving the poverty paradox has been to use the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002). According to the IMF (2005), "PRSPs are prepared by member countries through a participatory process involving domestic stakeholders as well as external development partners, including the World Bank and IMF" (p. 1). Progress reports on the PRSPs are submitted every three years to the World Bank. These reports are indicators of whether or not a country's targets are being met. The goals of the PRSPs are to adequately describe a country's macroeconomic, structural and social policies and programs over a three-year or longer horizon to "promote broad-based growth and reduce poverty, as well as associated external financing needs and major sources of financing" (p. 1). Interim PRSPs review the existing data, analyze the country's poverty situation, depict the existing poverty reduction strategy, and outline the methods for producing a fully developed PRSP in a participatory manner.

An Interpretative Approach to Policy

While the ways in which poverty is measured are important in determining whether poverty exists, they are inadequate in providing a better understanding of how local stakeholders participate in the PRSP process. Moreover, these measurements do not adequately address the *text* of the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) and the goals of the document. Secondly, the various measurements of poverty do not speak to education as a panacea, which the PRSP puts forward as the way to reduce and subsequently alleviate poverty. It is therefore important to situate the text of the PRSP within the context of education to determine whether or not local stakeholders understand the correlation between these two variables.

Therefore, given the limitations of these measurements, this study focuses on the impact of poverty from different positional perspectives - parents, teachers, and students. Coupled with these positional perspectives, and emphasis has been placed on the difference between *policy as discourse* and *policy as text*. Policy as discourse emphasizes the constraints imposed by discourse and policy as text focuses on how readers interpret the document (Bacchi, 2000). Ball (1990), in describing policy as discourse, concedes that the meaning of the policy can change over time. Citing Codd (1988, p. 339), Ball contends that policy as text is always 'becoming,' or 'never was' and 'not quite' textual discourse (p. 16). Ball further claims that "for any text a plurality of

readers must necessarily produce a plurality of readings" (p. 16). He continues to contend that the texts of policies are not clear, closed or completed, but are instead the product of compromises at various stages of the policy making process. Because policies are used at different times to represent different actors, they will have different interpretations at different stages in the process (Rizvi & Kemmis, 1987; Ball, 1990; Yanow, 2002). Yanow argues that policies use a 'spatial design' – the physical experience it engenders – to communicate the desired behavioral response. Rizvi & Kemmis refer to this as an 'interpretation of interpretations' that is used to represent or re-represent a policy sentiment; thus the physical text of a policy is an interpretational and representational history that is done outside of a social and institutional vacuum. The interpretations that may be derived from reading the PRSP by one community of meaning may be different in another community of meaning.

Text as discourse allows meaning to be embodied in the words of the text. Therefore, various stakeholders or 'communities of meaning' can be derived from the text of policies (Yanow, 2002). Communities of meaning - values, beliefs and feelings - bind people together through cognitive, linguistic, and cultural practices that reinforce each other to a point in which a shared sense becomes common through 'interpretative communities' sharing speech practices and their meaning (2002). Ball (1996) argues that policy as discourse may "redistribute voice" while maintaining people's cognitive, linguistic, and cultural practices (p. 22). The redistribution of voice is done without interfering with what people say or think. While it does not obstruct speech and thought patterns, the redistribution of voice does privilege certain voices as being more meaningful and authoritative over others.

In order to understand how the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) may redistribute voice to local stakeholders and the relationship between education and poverty reduction, the text of Tanzania's PRSP was reviewed. This study was interested in understanding how the text of this policy engaged in the "authoritative allocation of values" (Ball, 1990, p. 3). An analysis of the PRSP was done to identify how the PRSP "projected images of an ideal society" (Ball, 1990, p. 3) as it dealt with the alleviation and subsequent eradication of poverty in Tanzania. In situating the PRSP in the broader context of education, the role that institutions - political, social and cultural - played in producing this document was scrutinized. Moreover, emphasis was placed on the official meanings that were provided in the document and how they differ from the unofficial meanings not explicit in the document. With these considerations in mind, the researcher embarked to the Kilimanjaro region in Tanzania to understand how various stakeholders understand the PRSP.

Research Setting and Questions

If a community in rural Tanzania is chosen at random, will its citizenry know what the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) is and what it says about education? Interviews and school observations were conducted at the KSS secondary school and MPH and SMP primary schools to determine whether communities of meaning – parents, teachers and students – know that the PRSP exists. Additionally, the following two sub questions were put forward: a) does

the PRSP adequately address the challenges of schooling? And: b) is poverty linked to a lack of schooling within a specific community? These questions were asked to assess the implications of this document on the rural population since its conception. This is of particular interest because the Tanzanian government ties the PRSP to several other developmental policy documents. From a policy discourse perspective, inquiries were made as to how definitions are attached to meanings and what voices, if any, are enshrined in the policy making process. From an ethnographic perspective, inquiries were made about the PRSP in order to understand stakeholders' attitudes towards the content of the PRSP. Finally, how do students define poverty and what are the pedagogical approaches used in educating them about the PRSP? In other words, do teachers teach about poverty in rural communities?

Methods

Data collection took place in the Kilimanjaro region of Old Moshi in Tanzania over a four week period in June 2005. Before going to Tanzania to collect data, a document analysis was conducted on the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002). Documental analysis is an interdisciplinary approach to the study of texts, which views written and spoken "language as a form of social practice" (Fairclough, 1989, p. 20) and attempts "to unpack the ideological underpinnings of discourse that have become so naturalized over time that we begin to treat them as common, acceptable and natural features of discourses" (Teo, 2000, p.1). There are several broad categories that are defined in the PRSP. Yannow's (2000) notion of a category analysis – creating categories that entail and reflect ideas about the subject matter – was used to decipher the data from the document analysis. The categories of Urban and Rural, and Income and Non-income were created and then subjected to a document analysis in order to understand how the PRSP was presented to public, whether or not the PRSP adequately address the challenges of schooling, and whether poverty is linked to a lack of schooling within a specific community.

In Tanzania other methods included participant observations, interviews, follow-up interviews, interaction-based analysis, and journaling. During the first two weeks, semi-structured interviews were conducted with 10 (7 males and 3 female) fifth and six form students at the KSS secondary school, 4 (2 male and 2 female) KSS teachers, and 2 (1 male and 1 female) freshman students who attend the University of Dar es Salaam and were in Old Moshi for their summer break. The purpose of these interviews was to understand whether or not communities of meaning knew about the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) and the role it plays in Tanzanian society. While the official language of Tanzania is Swahili, all 5th and 6th form students are taught in English and therefore all interviews were conducted in English. Also, all teachers (primary and secondary school) are fluent in English.

Participants in the focus group interviews included 35 (20 male and 15 female) 5th and 6th form students. Fifth and sixth form students were selected at random and placed into the focus group. Focus groups were held with 5 (1 male and 4 female) primary school teachers at the MHP primary school and the 5 (2 male and 3 female) SHP primary school teachers. Primary school teachers

had an average of six years teaching and were fluent in English. All teachers who work at the MPH and SHP primary schools were included in the focus group. Also 4 (1 Geography, 1 Math, 1 Science and 1 Economics) classroom-based observations of sixth form students was done at the KSS secondary school and 2 (1 Social Studies and 1 English) classroom-based observations were conducted at the MHP primary and SHP primary schools, respectively.

During the third week interviews were conducted with a male community elder. He was chosen because he is highly respected within the community and several teachers had mentioned that he is very influential when it comes to making decisions about the community. The community elder has gained prominence because he is able to trace his heritage back to the indigenous Chagga tribes of the Kilimanjaro Region.² In the fourth week, interviews were conducted with the director of an International Nongovernmental Organization (INGO) and the director of a local NGO. A focus group was held with 15 (10 male and 5 female) faculty members of the University of Dar es Salaam. Notes of interviews were made and then they were transcribed for memory.

Findings

Using the multiple methods outlined earlier, findings illustrate that different interpretive communities – parents, guardians, teachers and students – assess the challenges of schooling in light of the persistence of poverty differently. Findings show that interpretative communities recognize that Tanzania's children need to be prepared for the new world economy. One interviewee argues that because there is a "lack of social resources in their community, children are disadvantaged." They further contend "that larger cities get most resources and this causes their children to be marginalized and therefore their children are more likely to migrate to urban centers." In an interview with a secondary principal he notes that the resources that students need to provide them the skills for the twenty-first century are absent due to lack of funding and government corruption. Moreover, teachers also note that textbooks are so obsolete that they do not reflect the current economic paradigms. One educator argues that "unless a teacher is widely read, students may not have current and timely information outside of textbooks."

Participants note that it is the Tanzanian government's responsibility to prepare children for the new world economy. Students argue that because of infrastructural problems in rural areas they are being further stratified by the digital divide. A student cautioned, however, that the "digital divide is not so digital in that in Tanzania there is a digital divide between the urban and rural areas."

Findings show that more than four-fifths of the 35 interviewees in the structured interviews did not know about the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002); the resounding answer from the students was "no, we have never heard of the PRSP. What is that?" This is surprising given that the government states that they held Zonal workshops and met with various local stakeholders. Also, 98% of the teachers in the focus groups have never heard about the PRSP. Of those who know that the PRSP exists, they know only the acronym and "do not

teach about it because it is not part of the curriculum." What is surprising is that none of the primary school teachers who were interviewed know of the PRSP or its purpose. While it was not expected that everyone would have knowledge about the PRSP, results show that only one sixth form teacher out of 10 knew about the document. This study found that interviewees did not know what the aims of the PRSP were, how poverty is defined by the government, how the Tanzanian government plans to solve this dilemma or the role of Tanzania's children in this paradox.

While these responses illustrate the disconnection between students, teachers, and the government about the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002), they are troubling in that they show that the Zonal workshops did not reach every community. The PRSP argues that Zonal workshops were held and that a number of representatives from poor communities participated. In other words, the 'voices of the poor' were supposedly heard and taken into consideration when the PRSP was conceptualized. The point is that it was surprising to find out that Zonal workshops were not held in this region and that teachers, who are considered the most educated people in a village, did not know about such an important document. Moreover, this disconnection further reiterates the fact that disparities exist in the allocation of resources in poor rural and urban areas. In stark contrast, the two directors of NGOs in Dar es Salaam who were interviewed and academics at the University of Dar es Salaam knew about the document.

Interviews and focus groups with children in Old Moshi indicate that they define poverty based on their present situation. Definitions used by children are often broad and vary from that of the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002). The PRSP says that "for the purposes of the PRSP, poverty is defined to include 'income' and 'non-income' human development attributes" (p. 6). Interviews reveal that children often describe poverty as a "state of being...I am in poverty when I know that I cannot provide for my family member." Another student defines poverty as "not having a job to make ends meet." A third student notes that "poverty was caused by government corruption, misallocation of resources, ignorance, prejudice, and our forefathers." Thus, their definition goes far beyond that of the PRSP.

Discussion and Analysis

Document Analysis

In doing a cursory glance at the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) using document analysis, terms such as 'cost sharing' and 'stakeholders' are common. In understanding what is meant in the PRSP by concepts such as *local stakeholders*, *poverty* and *education*, a document analysis was conducted. There are several broad categories that are defined in the PRSP, however, for the purpose of this study the categories of Rural and Urban, and Income and Non-Income, were used. These categories were replicated from broader categories that exist in the PRSP. In understanding what is meant in the PRSP by local stakeholder participation, poverty and education, the categories of Rural and Urban, and Income and Non Income were subjected to a textual analysis.

In examining the Rural and Urban categorization, rural is always followed by keywords – sector, population and areas – to make the distinction that urban areas do not experience the same challenges as rural communities. In highlighting the lack of resources and the importance of poverty alleviation in rural areas, the term rural is cited 78 times in the document whereas the term urban is used 18 times. Similarly, income is cited 32 times and non-income 4 times. The relationship between rural, urban, income and non-income is a close one. Rural is often cited in the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) to denote areas in which poverty is thought to be rampant; it is also strongly associated with the term non-income. Therefore, if a community has non-income, then that community is likely to be rural and in poverty. The PRSP argues that poverty is a rural phenomenon that is less widespread in urban centers because incomes are often lower in rural areas. The PRSP notes that “according to the 1991/92 Health Service Board (HBS), basic needs rural poverty incidence is estimated at 57 percent, and the food poverty incidence is about 32%” (p. 53). It further speculates that tentative estimates from the year 2000 suggest that the incidence of poverty in the rural areas may increase.

The distinction between rural and urban is evident in the differing tones that are used throughout the document. Rural is used to denote traditional practices and the lack of access to modern possessions. Moreover, the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) recognizes this gap and argues that the government will elaborate on sound policies that will support the rural sector. Conversely, the category of urban is used to infer that poverty is lower in the developed or urban areas as compared to the underdeveloped or rural areas. However, the PRSP does not address the disparities that exist between rural and urban schools. In making references to schooling the PRSP states that the gross enrollment has declined and that awareness needs to increase with regards to HIV/AIDS. According to the PRSP the decline in gross enrollment is more prevalent among rural or “poor children aged 7-9, and there was a decreased from 82 percent in 1983 to 80 percent in 1993” (p. 8). The PRSP does not mention that the costs and benefits of schooling differ in rural and urban areas and therefore the experiences in these two areas will not be the same.

If one looks at the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) they will find that schooling is nonexistent in the categories of Income and Non-Income, which are used to discuss the status of poverty in Tanzania. For the purpose of the PRSP, poverty is defined to include ‘income’ and ‘non-income’ human development attributes (p. 6). As mentioned before, income is cited 32 times and non-income 4 times. The PRSP notes that the more recent deterioration in the poverty situation warrants immediate attention since it can be “attributable to worsening income inequality and relatively low rate of economic growth, particularly in the rural areas” (p. 8). The document further contends that the agricultural sector, which is located in rural areas, has the largest prevalence of income poverty. In distinguishing between income and non-income disparities the PRSP notes that as much as 50 percent of cash incomes in some areas are derived from the sale of forest products. Moreover, it is the poorest households that are the most dependent on woodland resources.

The PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) purports that since incomes are lower in rural areas, poverty is more extensive. However, in discussing income, the PRSP draws attention to income disparities by noting that "farmers who grow cash crops [in urban areas] have a higher income" (p. 6). It also contends that the worsening income inequality in Tanzania is due to poverty. On the contrary, non-income poverty is identified in the subcategories of education, survival, nutrition, clean and safe drinking water, social well-being and vulnerability. The government's strategy to combat non-income poverty is to rehabilitate the existing infrastructure, such as schools and hospitals. Deeply hidden in the categories of income and non-income is the widening disparity in income levels between men and women, and which gender is chosen to be educated.

Interview Analyses

In interviews that were conducted, respondents were asked to comment on whether not they cogitated that the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) adequately addresses the challenges of schooling and if they thought that poverty is linked to a lack of schooling within their community. As discussed above, a document analysis of the categories of rural and urban, and income and non-income shows that the PRSP recognizes that a gap exists between these two variables. In addressing the challenges of schooling, findings from interviews and focuses groups reveal that girls are usually the people who suffer. In the interview with a community elder, he argues that "although investment in girl's education is warranted...this investment is determined based on the whether or not the girl can be more productive at home or at school." He further contends that "if girl children are seen as having more value at home they are kept home." Vavrus (2003) argues that while poor girls desire schooling, it comes at a financial cost to the parents. She contends that there is a decline in the access that girls have to schooling in Tanzania, especially in rural areas. Results from interviews illustrate that this is evident; as one parent expressed, "it is more financially sound to invest in the education of a male child than that of female child since male children are more likely to get a job prior to completing their formal education." The community elder interviewed argues that "since poverty is intergenerational...then girls' education is vital...and any education that involves girls has to be expanded beyond primary school." Findings show that some parents may be hesitant about educating female children because, as one parent said, "in most instances in rural areas the mother did not acquire a formal education and therefore she does not know the benefits of it." One interview with a teacher reveals that while "mothers are willing to educate their daughters they are faced with many other obstacles." Teachers also argue that once girls in rural areas are given a chance to have a formal education they usually do better than boys in school, especially at the primary level. Observations show that in both primary schools that were observed, there are more girls in attendance than boys. However, as girls continue on to secondary schooling, especially upper secondary school – 5th and 6th form – their numbers decline steadily.

If children are the future, the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) makes little mention of them. Thus questions were posed to determine whether

or not the language of the PRSP is a reflection of the voice of Tanzania's next generation. Given that the informants were 5th and 6th form students with an age range of 18 to 21 years old, the assumption was made that if the Zonal workshops had taken place in their community then at least one of these children would have attended. This assumption was made because in interviews with 5th and 6th form students they note that anything organized by the government in the town of Old Moshi is significant. Moreover, sixth form boys disclosed that all large public events are seen as ways to meet girls.

Research findings, however, illustrate that the voices of youth are almost nonexistent in this document. The PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) notes the importance of primary education and pledges that the government will fund it. However, it does not recognize the importance of children and their future contribution to Tanzania's development. When the PRSP makes reference to children, it is usually within the context of human capabilities of survival and well-being: education, health, social well-being, vulnerability and the environment. Because health and survival are linked together with describing children, the PRSP argues that malaria, HIV/AIDS, anemia, and pneumonia are the leading killers of children in Tanzania. In discussing poverty indicators the PRSP notes that "malnutrition among children is a good indicator of poverty levels or social well-being" (p. 8). The PRSP does not direct attention to the rural and urban disparities, gender gaps and income disparities – all of which can inhibit a child's growth and may hinder their access to educational opportunities.

Poverty can have many effects upon a child. In conducting school observations inquiries were made as to whether communities of meaning – students and teachers – know that the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) exists. Although the people interviewed do not for the most part know about the formal document, they are able to define whether or not they are in poverty or if they consider themselves to be poor. Regardless of which approach we use to measure poverty internationally, findings confirm that parents and guardians in the Kilimanjaro region of Old Moshi determine whether or not they are in a state of poverty based upon the number of times per day they can provide a meal for their children. This is particularly interesting since the PRSP notes that "one half of all Tanzanians today are considered to be basically poor, and approximately one-third live in abject poverty" (p. 3). However, while poverty is defined differently by various stakeholders, all interviewees state that quality education is the only way out of poverty. This shows that it does not take an official document to determine what is best for the people. While both stakeholders and the government are stressing education as a panacea for poverty, the PRSP contradicts itself by arguing that educational provision is not a government service but instead is a cost-sharing endeavor.

In 2002, the PRSP was written with the aid of various stakeholders - ministers, researchers, grassroots organizations, parliamentarians, and donor organizations – "to address the country's economic and social problems" (p. 1). The goals of the PRSP are to address the dilemma that over half of all Tanzanians are considered to be basically poor, and roughly one-third live in abject poverty. The PRSP notes that for the successful implementation of this policy it has to be done in conjunction with other developmental policies - Vision

2025, National Poverty Eradication Strategy (NPES) and Tanzania Assistant Strategy (TAS). In addressing the issue of how the PRSP will be financed, the document pays homage to its international partners – the WB and the IMF - who provide financial support for this project.

In addition to determining the familiarity of local stakeholders with the PRSP, interviewees were asked what they thought the purpose of education is since the PRSP identifies that lack of access to education is a major problem that most Tanzanians face. It was noted to teachers and students that the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) further contends that “broadly based primary school education plays a major role in strengthening human capabilities and reducing poverty” (p. 7). Findings illustrate that while students agree that primary education strengthens human capabilities, during the course of the interviews students shifted from describing human capabilities to talking about the problems facing their primary and secondary educational systems. The first response given by students was that “the hindrance to broad primary education is poverty.” One student argues that “if my basic needs – food, clothing and shelter – are not satisfied then why should [I] even worry about getting an education?” Another student notes that “Tanzania is filled with resources and that it is due to corruption that we [the country] have poverty...as globalization continues it will be a deterrent to Tanzania since the government is allowing foreign companies to take our resources away...especially South African companies...Tanzanians should own and manage their own resources.” These responses by students illustrate that they agree that there is a correlation between education (or lack thereof) and poverty.

The link between poverty and the misallocation of resources was intertwined in every conversation with interviewees. In the interview with an elder in the community he cautions that “because of governmental corruption and kickbacks there is a misallocation of Tanzanian resources.” He continues to note that this misallocation has created Tanzania’s poor - “that’s why we are poor.” The PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) recognizes that corruption exists and argues that the government needs to accelerate the adoption of anti-corruption reforms. However, the government has been slow in adopting the necessary reforms that are needed to combat corruption.

Another point reiterated by interviewees with regards to education and poverty speaks to the internal misallocation of teaching resources. Students that were interviewed argue “that teachers only teach them to pass their examination” and they are not taught how to react to social problems. One interviewee notes that “had we [children] been given the proper resources we would have know about this document...we would not have known what it contained but at least we would have known the name.” The question of the (mis)allocation of school resources also raises questions regarding the quality of the education provided. While students at the KSS secondary school are paying for their education, they note that “some teachers were more knowledgeable and better prepared than others.” Students say that it is important for a teacher to be well read on current affairs so that they can incorporate that knowledge into their lesson plans. Interviewees at NGOs argue that whether a school is public or private, if it is in a rural area then it will lack good teachers, resources,

and the quality of teaching and education will be lower than schools in the urban areas.

Conclusion

What is the key to alleviating poverty in Tanzania? From a positional perspective, different communities of meaning – children, teachers, adults, NGOs, and academics – have given the same answer to this question. They all express that *education* is the way out of poverty and the way forward for Tanzania. Children argue that for poverty to be alleviated the government has to reinvest in social services, especially education. Anyone who wants an education should have access to that education. As one student asserts, education should not confer a price tag – “not because I am educated that means that I am better than anyone else and therefore my marketability is higher.” More importantly, education should not be a preparation for passing examinations but it should be preparation for life itself. Teachers note that while access to good education is still a problem, education is the only way to empower the masses and get them out of poverty. They further contend that people remain in poverty because they “lack knowledge” to overcome this “social disease.” It is this lack of knowledge that makes poverty cyclical and intergenerational. Adults interviewed point to education as a way out of poverty and argue that an uneducated population is an ignorant one who will be exploited by those in power. They further argue that the effective reduction of poverty will stem from proper investment in physical and human resources and also from the government clamping down on corruption and kickbacks.

Experts at NGOs caution that without proper research, government spending will be misappropriated on projects that are intended to alleviate poverty. They agree that educating the children of Tanzania can correct the ills of the country but warn that any investment should stem from the government and should not be stimulated by international pressure. Therefore, educational investment should not be a cost-sharing mechanism, but rather the sole responsibility of the government to provide the service of education to the masses in both the rural and urban centers equally. In assessing the validity of the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002), NGOs state that without this document Tanzania would still have a positive economic growth rate and that the document itself has done nothing to improve the state of poverty in Tanzania. Finally, academics from the University of Dar es Salaam argue that poverty is everywhere and is not confined to the rural setting alone. They contend that education is warranted, but they caution that Tanzania has to put its affairs in order before it can effectively address poverty.

The foregoing communities of meaning are not saying anything different from what the PRSP (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002) has enshrined in its conceptual framework. Some of the communities of meaning know that the PRSP exist and others do not, but regardless of the document they all arrived at the same conclusions about the necessity of education for development. Their analysis is similar to that of the PRSP, which states that “broadly based primary school education plays a major role in strengthening human capabilities and reducing poverty” (p. 7). While both the PRSP and communities of meaning note

that there are limitations to the present educational system, they both emphasize that lack of access is the biggest hindrance to a good education.

This study shows that although Zonal workshops did not reach the villages in Old Moshi, communities of meaning see the PRSP as a utopian document that does not address their immediate concerns (United Republic of Tanzania, 2002). Moreover, interviewees, although ignorant about its existence, do not feel that the PRSP adequately addresses the challenges that children in rural communities face. Interviewees contend that if this document addressed these challenges then the government would not have cut spending in their community and that the notion of "cost-sharing" would be removed from the official government rhetoric on education. Secondly, interviewees contend that there is a correlation between poverty and schooling. They argue that if a person is poor than that person cannot lift themselves out of poverty unless they are given the necessary resources. Furthermore, they note that poverty is intergenerational; education is the only way out and more government spending is needed in rural areas rather than 'utopist polices' that are simply 'band-aid' solutions for the problem. The question remains, four years later on the eve of a new PRSP, why have the children of Tanzania not seen the benefits of the PRSP in the form of an improved educational system, gender parity and better access for rural children? More importantly, is the PRSP rhetoric or reality?

Acknowledgements

I am indebted to Lesley Bartlett and Fran Vavrus for very helpful comments on an earlier version of the manuscript and the Adrianus C. Visser Research Fund, which facilitated the writing.

End Notes

1. The International Monetary Fund defines globalization as "the growing economic interdependence of countries worldwide through increasing volume and variety of cross-border transactions in goods and services, free international capital flows, and more rapid and widespread diffusion of technology" (Köhle, H., 2002). On the other hand, the International Forum on Globalization defines globalization as "the present worldwide drive toward a globalized economic system dominated by supranational corporate trade and banking institutions that are not accountable to democratic processes or national governments" (International Forum on Globalization, n.d.)
2. The Chaga (also referred to as Wachaga, Chagga, Jagga, Dschagga, Waschagga, Wachagga) are a Bantu speaking indigenous African tribe and the third largest ethnic group in Tanzania. They live on the southern and eastern slopes of Mount Kilimanjaro and Mount Meru, as well as in the Moshi area.

References

- Ali, G. (2002). Africa children and Africa development: A duration of development framework. In A. de Waal and N. Argenti (eds.), *Young Africa: Realising the Rights of Children and Youth*. Trenton, NJ and Asmara: Africa World Press
- Bacchi, C., (2000). Policy as Discourse: what does it mean? Where does it get us? *Discourse*, 21 (1), 45-57.
- Bernard, H. R., (2001). *Research Methods in Cultural Anthropology*. California: Altamira Press.
- Ball, S.J. (1990) *Politics and Policy Making in Education: explorations in policy sociology*. New York: Routledge.
- Codd, J.A. (1988) The construction and deconstruction of educational policy documents, *Journal of Education Policy*, 3(3), pp. 235–247.
- de Waal, A. (2002). HIV/AIDS and young Africans. In A. de Waal and N. Argenti (eds.), *Young Africa: Realising the Rights of Children and Youth*. Trenton, NJ and Asmara: Africa World Press.
- Fairclough, N. (1989). *Language and Power*. London: Longman.
- GRIPS Development Forum. (2000). Tanzania: PRSP as a primary document. Retrieved on September 7, 2006 from <http://www.grips.ac.jp/module/prsp/TanzaniaPRSP.htm>
- IMF. (2005, September). Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSP). Retrieved on September 7, 2006 from <http://www.imf.org/external/np/exr/facts/prsp.htm>.
- International Forum on Globalization. (n.d.) Retrieved on August 31, 2006, from <http://www.ifg.org/analysis.htm>.
- Köhle, H. (2002, January 28). Working for a Better Globalization. Retrieved August 31, 2006, from <http://www.imf.org/external/np/speeches/2002/012802.htm>.
- Rizvi, F., & Kemmis, S. (1987). *Dilemmas of reform - An overview of issues and achievements of the Participation and Equity Program in Victorian schools 1984-1986*. Victoria: Deakin Institute for Studies in Education.
- Samoff, J., Ed. (1994) *Coping with crisis: Austerity, adjustment and human resources*. Paris: UNESCO.

- Teo, P. (2000). Racism in the News: A Critical Discourse Analysis of News Reporting in Two Australian Newspapers. *Discourse & Society*, (11), 7-49.
- The United Republic of Tanzania (October, 2002), *Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP)*, Retrieved on September 7, 2006 from <http://poverty.worldbank.org/files/TanzaniaPRSP.pdf>
- Vavrus, F. (2003). *Desire and decline: Schooling amid crisis in Tanzania*. New York: Peter Lang Publishing.
- Vavrus, F. (2004). The referential web: Externalization beyond education in Tanzania. In G. Steiner-Khamsi (Ed.), *The Global Politics of Educational Borrowing and Lending*, New York: Teachers College Press
- Yanow, D. (2000). *Conducting interpretative policy analysis*. California: Sage Publishing Inc.
- Yin, R. K. (2003). *Case study research: Design and methods*. 3rd ed. London: Sage.

Notes on Contributors

Payal Arora holds a masters degree in International Education Policy from Harvard University and an English Teaching Certificate from the University of Cambridge. She is currently in the doctoral program in International Educational Development at Teachers College, Columbia University. Payal has been and is currently being published in peer-reviewed journals including the Association of Advancement in Computing in Education Journal, Information Communication and Ethics in Society journal, and the IJEDICT Journal. Her research interests include information and communication technology for educational development, public-private partnerships in emerging markets and critical policy discourse analysis.

Columbia Law School's **Human Rights Clinic** exposes students to the practice of law in the cross-cultural context of international human rights litigation and advocacy. Working in partnership with experienced attorneys and institutions engaged in human rights activism, both in the United States and abroad, students contribute to effecting positive change locally and globally. In recent semesters, clinic students have engaged in transitional-justice research and participated in sessions of the U.N. Commission on Human Rights. In the aftermath of the 9/11 attacks, students were involved in petitioning the Inter-American Commission to protect the rights of detainees at the U.S. naval base at Guantanamo Bay, Cuba. Students have also worked with Human Rights Watch and other groups to focus the attention of the U.N. Working Group on Arbitrary Detention on whether the U.S. Immigration and Naturalization Service is complying with international standards in its "war on terrorism" detentions. The students who collaborated on the article in this volume received their Doctors of Jurisprudence in May, 2006 and took the Bar Exam in July.

Anna D. Johnson is entering her third year as a doctoral student at Teachers College, Columbia, pursuing a Ph.D. in Developmental Psychology under the advisement of Dr. Jeanne Brooks-Gunn. As a graduate research fellow at the National Center for Children and Families, Anna works on a variety of large, longitudinal, and multi-site studies that aim to inform policy decisions that impact children and families. Anna oversees data collection for the Fragile Families and Child Wellbeing Study's kindergarten survey, and has worked on the Head Start Quality Project, part of the Head Start Quality Research Center Evaluation. Prior to coming to Columbia, Anna worked at the Manhattan District Attorney's Office as a Trial Preparation Assistant in the Child Abuse and Family Violence Bureau, where she assisted in the investigation of over 300 cases of child abuse and neglect. After leaving the District Attorney's office and before beginning her doctoral work, Anna taught English in Bari, Italy.

Tavis D. Jules is a Doctorate of Education (Ed.D) student in the Department of International and Transcultural Studies at Teachers College, Columbia University. His concentration is in International Educational Development with a specialization in International Education Policy Studies. He received his Masters of Arts in Peace Education and his Master of Education in Policy Studies from Teachers College, Columbia University. Tavis has done research on the

implications of international policies on education in Brazil, South Africa and Tanzania. His present research and intended dissertation is on how a regional organization (CARICOM) influences educational policies within the Anglophone Caribbean as the region moves towards regional integration. Tavis' other research interests include borrowing and lending, convergence, human rights and gender parity.

Serah Shani is a PhD student at Columbia University's Teachers College, concentrating in Anthropology and Education. She also holds a Masters in Sociology with a specialization in health and medicine, and a Bachelors degree in community development and music. Serah has worked as a primary school teacher, a lecturer in teacher training colleges in Kenya, an HIV/AIDS counselor for the infected and the affected, and as a special education teacher for the physically handicapped. Her current research interests include examining how learning takes place in different cultural contexts, how social/cultural, political and economic situations impact learning processes, and on HIV/AIDS in sub-Saharan Africa. At present, Serah is doing research with African immigrants in New York City.

Yan Shi received a B.A. in Economics from Peking University, Beijing, China in 2002, and a M.A. in Management from Tsinghua University, Beijing, China in 2004. Currently she is pursuing her Ph.D. degree in Economics and Education at Teachers College, Columbia University. Her scholarly interests include education finance, education program evaluation, educational development and reform in China.

Rubkwan Tharmmapornphilas is a third year Ph.D student in the Economics and Education program at Teachers College, Columbia University. She received her Bachelors Degree in Economics from Chulalongkorn University, Thailand. After graduation she worked in the HSBC banking corporation for a few years. In 2004, Rubkwan received the Thai Royal Government Scholarship to study in the U.S. under the condition that she will return to Thailand and serve her country as a government officer in the Ministry of Education. Rubkwan's academic interests focus on the factors that influence child work and school enrollment, particularly in developing countries.

**Volumes of Graduate Student Research
Published by the Society for International Education**

Teachers College, Columbia University

Education in Emergencies and Post-Conflict Situations, Volume 1
Spring 2004

Education in Emergencies and Post-Conflict Situations, Volume 2
Spring 2005

Languages, Communities, and Education
Spring 2005

Education and Poverty in an International Context
Spring 2006

Copyright © 2006 Society for International Education
Teachers College, Columbia University
All Rights Reserved