The glass ceiling in European football

Levels of representation of visible ethnic minorities and women in leadership positions, and the experiences of elite level ethnic minority coaches

Executive Summary

Report by Dr Steven, with Jacco Van Sterkenburg and Professor Patrick Mignon

www.farenet.org
The glass ceiling in European football

Levels of representation of visible ethnic minorities and women in leadership positions, and the experiences of elite level ethnic minority coaches

Executive Summary

Dr Steven Bradbury (Loughborough University, England)

with, Dr Jacco Van Sterkenburg (Erasmus University Rotterdam, Netherlands)
Professor Patrick Mignon (INSEP, France)
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction from the Fare network</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction from UEFA</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Headline Findings</strong></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Levels of representation in leadership positions in football in Europe</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key explanations for the under-representation of ‘visible’ minorities and women include:</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Levels of representation in senior coaching positions in football in Europe</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key explanations for the under-representation of ‘visible’ minority coaches include:</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Executive summary</strong></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research methods</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership positions in football in Europe</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coaching positions in football in Europe</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The experiences of elite ‘visible’ minority coaches in England, France and the Netherlands</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for future action: addressing under-representation</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Acknowledgements</strong></td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction from the Fare network

Albert Einstein is quoted as saying that if he had an hour to save the world he would spend fifty-five minutes defining the problem and five minutes finding the solution. One could see this report as part of what has become a very long fifty-five minutes.

The findings of this research set out some of the issues facing European football in regard to diversity and inclusion. For the first time we have a statistical overview of the disproportionately low numbers of women and ethnic minorities in administration, and the small number of ethnic minorities in coaching and management roles.

Both figures show a sport that celebrates the ideal of the level playing field, but does not seem to offer the same to women or ethnic minorities.

The moral argument for recruiting diverse leaders is powerful but perhaps the bigger issue is the loss of talent - football cannot afford to exclude or ignore talented individuals because of their background or gender.

We know that Europe is changing. Ethnically we are becoming more diverse and we see women more commonly taking up leadership roles across business and the public services.

The situation of ethnic minority players, who are the bedrock of some of the greatest European football clubs but are rarely given the opportunity to coach and manage, is almost perverse. This is a group of people who have the talent, qualifications and experience to manage and improve on-field performance but are being ignored.

We cannot leave this issue to take care of itself; change through natural evolution has been slow. The first step is recognition, the need to see the lack of diversity as a core issue for European football; the second will be to find creative, sometimes unique, solutions.

The contribution of Fare to this process does not stop here, we are already engaged in the business of helping and supporting this change through our network partners and our work with UEFA. The question is how quickly can we together stop the loss of talent and bring football to the position of being a leader and an exemplar?

Piara Powar
Executive Director
Introduction from UEFA

As the governing body of European football UEFA takes seriously our duty to work for a sport that is competitive, well governed and socially responsible.

We know that people look at football and give it more attention than other areas of life, and therefore we are judged according to higher standards. This extra focus may be unfair at times, it poses additional challenges, but we also know that it provides us with an opportunity to show leadership within sport and within society.

When it comes to ensuring fair opportunities within football we know that we can do better. The research findings of this report show an industry that under-utilises some of the best resources at its disposal. We can see that the under-representation of both women and ethnic minorities within leadership positions is stark, and the numbers of ethnic minorities that are employed within elite level coaching positions simply does not reflect what we know to be the levels of talent and experience amongst former players.

We digest this report on the eve of a seminar in Amsterdam, hosted by the Royal Netherlands Football Association and held in conjunction with UEFA and the Fare network, where we will look at the issues in detail and continue to find solutions.

Transforming attitudes and bringing about change is never a simple process. We may be judged in a unique way but we do not operate in a bubble, attitudes are created within society and are not easily undone. We are committed to moving this agenda forward and showing that football can seek to be an exemplary force in offering equality of opportunity.

We are pleased to have worked with the Fare network in commissioning this report and will continue to work with them and others in finding solutions to the challenges that face us all.

William Gaillard
Advisor to the UEFA President
Headline Findings

Levels of representation in leadership positions in football in Europe

Senior governance positions: 95.8% of all presidents, vice-presidents and executive committee members at elite level clubs, national leagues, national federations and UEFA are White men

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>White men</th>
<th>White women</th>
<th>Minority men</th>
<th>Minority women</th>
<th>Overall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Elite level professional clubs</td>
<td>95.7%</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National league associations</td>
<td>98.4%</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National federations</td>
<td>97.5%</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UEFA</td>
<td>92.7%</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total:</td>
<td>95.8%</td>
<td>3.6%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Senior operations positions: 87.7% of all CEO’s and Heads of Unit at elite level clubs, national leagues, national federations and UEFA are White men

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>White men</th>
<th>White women</th>
<th>Minority men</th>
<th>Minority women</th>
<th>Overall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Elite level professional clubs</td>
<td>88.1%</td>
<td>11.4%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National league associations</td>
<td>88.7%</td>
<td>11.3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National federations</td>
<td>84.6%</td>
<td>15.4%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UEFA</td>
<td>95.6%</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total:</td>
<td>87.7%</td>
<td>11.9%</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key explanations for the under-representation of ‘visible’ minorities and women include:

- Cumulative impact of wider racial and gender inequalities and the generational distribution of leadership positions to older (white, male) candidates
- Operation of institutionally closed mechanisms of recruitment premised on personal recommendation, patronage and sponsored mobility, and the tendency to recruit from within the dominant (white, male) social and cultural networks of the football industry
- Continued existence of negative stereotyping of ‘visible’ minorities and women in terms of their ‘insufficient skills’, ‘lack of competence’, ‘unsuitability’ and ‘risk’
- Lack of problem awareness or non-acknowledgement of the processes and outcomes of institutional discrimination and an unwillingness to surrender accrued rewards and decision making powers at a personal and professional level
- Lack of commitment to ‘open-up’ access to leadership positions to more a more diverse range of groups through processes of positive action such as target setting, co-option, and quotas
Levels of representation in senior coaching positions in football in Europe

National teams: 99.6% of senior coaching positions at men’s national first teams and under 21’s, under 19s and under 17s national teams across Europe are White men.

Elite level clubs: 96.6% of senior coaching positions at men’s elite level clubs in England, Germany, Spain, France, Italy, Belgium and the Netherlands are White men.

Key explanations for the under-representation of ‘visible’ minority coaches include:

- Limited opportunities for identification, selection, mentoring and financial support from key football bodies to undertake and complete high level coach education courses
- Negative experiences of overt, culturally coded, and institutional forms of racism and discrimination at high level coach education courses
- Over-reliance of elite level clubs and national federations on networks based rather than qualifications based methods of coach recruitment and the tendency to recruit from within the dominant (white, male) social and cultural networks of the football industry
- Conscious and unconscious racial bias and stereotypes in the coaching workplace and negative perceptions of key decision makers regarding the attitudes, behaviours, abilities and authority of ‘visible’ minority coaches
- Cumulative impact of negative experiences and the consequent lack of ‘visible’ minority coach role models in limiting motivations towards pursuing career pathways in football coaching and management
Executive summary

Research methods

The findings in this report illustrate the levels of representation of ‘visible’ minorities and women in senior governance, senior operations and senior coaching positions in football in Europe. The findings are based on documentary and web-based analysis of the demographic background and occupational status of 4,608 individuals in positions of this kind at national league associations, national football federations and UEFA, and at a sample group of elite level professional clubs in seven countries: England, Germany, Spain, Belgium, France, Italy and the Netherlands. This analysis was conducted between October and December 2013.

The findings in this report also illustrate a series of individual, cultural and structural factors which have enabled and/or disabled the career progression of ‘visible’ minority coaches in England, France and the Netherlands. The findings are based on analysis of semi-structured interviews conducted with 40 highly qualified ‘visible’ minority coaches with significant experience of working within professional and semi-professional football in each of the countries under review. These interviews were conducted between May 2012 and December 2013.

The term ‘visible’ minority is used in this report as a broad descriptive marker to refer to ethnically distinct populations drawn from non-European heritage who reside in countries in Europe in which they make up a numerical minority. These ‘visible’ minorities include generationally settled and new migrant populations drawn from Asia, Africa, the Caribbean, and the Middle East. They also include the ‘special case’ of migrant Turkish population’s who’s ethnic, cultural and religious ‘visibility’ seems heightened in many countries of settlement in Europe.

In the limited context of this report, the term ‘visible’ minority does not apply to ethnic, cultural, national or religious minorities such as Basques, Jewish or Roma populations. Nor does it apply to economic in-migrants drawn from EU accession countries in Central and Eastern Europe, where such minorities could broadly be described as white.

Leadership positions in football in Europe

Levels of representation in leadership positions in football in Europe

Senior governance: key statistical findings

The findings in this section are based on analysis of the demographic background and occupational status of 2,195 individuals in senior governance positions (such as president, vice-president and executive committee members) at elite level professional clubs, national league associations, national football federations and UEFA.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>White men</th>
<th>White women</th>
<th>Minority men</th>
<th>Minority women</th>
<th>Overall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Elite level professional clubs</td>
<td>95.7%</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National league associations</td>
<td>98.4%</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National federations</td>
<td>97.5%</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UEFA</td>
<td>92.7%</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>95.8%</strong></td>
<td><strong>3.6%</strong></td>
<td><strong>0.5%</strong></td>
<td><strong>0.1%</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall, 95.8% of all senior governance positions at elite level clubs, national league associations, national federations and UEFA were held by white men. The remaining 4.2% of positions of this kind were held by white women (3.6%), ‘visible’ minority men (0.5%) or ‘visible’ minority women (0.1%).
Senior governance: additional analysis

- **Elite level clubs**: Overall, 95.7% of senior governance positions were held by white men. The highest positions of this kind held by women were vice-president positions: at two clubs in Italy. Women executive committee members featured most strongly at clubs in England, Spain and Italy. A small number of ‘global’ rather than local ‘visible’ minority men held presidential and executive committee positions at elite level clubs in England, Spain, Belgium and France.

- **National league associations**: Overall, 98.4% of senior governance positions were held by white men, including all president and vice-president positions. Only 14% and 7% of national league associations respectively featured women or ‘visible’ minorities at executive committee level.

- **National football federations**: Overall, 97.5% of senior governance positions were held by white men. The highest positions of this kind held by women were vice-president positions: in Estonia, Norway and Sweden. In total, 28.6% of all national federations featured women at executive committee level, accounting for 3.7% of all positions of this kind.

- **UEFA**: Overall, 92.7% of senior governance positions were held by white men. In total, 48% of all UEFA organs, committees and panels featured women delegates. In total, 41.9% of all women delegates were involved in one committee: the UEFA women’s football committee. Only the UEFA Professional Football Strategy Council featured ‘visible’ minority delegates, both of whom were representatives of FIFPRO.

Senior operations: key statistical findings

- The findings in this section are based on analysis of the demographic background and occupational status of 1,741 individuals in senior operations positions (such as CEO or head of unit positions) at elite level professional clubs, national league associations, national football federations and UEFA.

- Overall, 87.7% of all senior operations positions at elite level clubs, national league associations, national federations and UEFA were held by white men. In total, 12.3% of positions of this kind were held by white women (11.9%), or ‘visible’ minority men (0.4%)

| Table B: demographic background of staff in senior operations positions across organisations |
|-------------------------------------------|-----------------|----------------|---------------|---------------|----------------|
|                                           | White men | White women | Minority men | Minority women | Overall |
| Elite level professional clubs            | 88.1%     | 11.4%       | 0.5%         | 0%            | 100%    |
| National league associations              | 88.7%     | 11.3%       | 0%           | 0%            | 100%    |
| National federations                      | 84.6%     | 15.4%       | 0%           | 0%            | 100%    |
| UEFA                                      | 95.6%     | 2.2%        | 2.2%         | 0%            | 100%    |
| **Total**                                 | **87.7%** | **11.9%**   | **0.4%**     | **0%**        | **100%** |

Senior operations: additional analysis

- **Elite level clubs**: Overall, 88.1% of senior operations positions were held by white men. The highest positions of this kind held by women were CEO positions: at two clubs in England. In total, 63% of elite level clubs featured women in senior operations positions. At these clubs, women tended to be employed in finance, marketing, or media/communications positions. In total, 4.5% of elite level clubs featured ‘visible’ minorities in senior operations positions, in mainly ticketing and stadium/security positions.

- **National league associations**: Overall, 88.7% of senior operations positions were held by white men including all CEO positions. In total, 30.8% of national league associations featured women in senior operations positions. At these associations, women tended to be employed in finance or media/communications positions. No ‘visible’ minorities were employed in senior operations positions at national league associations across Europe.

- **National federations**: Overall, 84.6% of senior operations positions at national federations were held by white men. The highest position of this kind held by women was a CEO position: in Estonia. In total, 38.9% of national
federations featured women in senior operations positions. At these federations, women tended to be employed in legal, finance or media/communications positions. No ‘visible’ minorities were employed in senior operations positions at national federations across Europe.

- **UEFA**: Overall, 95.6% of all senior operations positions at UEFA were held by white men, including all Director positions (100%). Head of unit positions at UEFA were held by white men (94.6%), white women (2.2%) and ‘visible’ minority men (2.2%). In total, senior operations staff at UEFA were drawn from 13 different nationalities, including; Swiss, French, British, Dutch, German, Greek, Romanian, Swedish, Spanish, Italian, Belgian, Irish and Korean.

**Explanations for the under-representation of ‘visible’ minorities and women in leadership positions**

- Explanations for the under-representation of ‘visible’ minorities and women in leadership positions in football in Europe, include;
  - The cumulative impact of wider racial and gender inequalities and the limited ‘diversity pool’ of suitably qualified candidates
  - The generational distribution of leadership positions to older (white, male) candidates
  - The operation of institutionally closed mechanisms of recruitment premised on personal recommendation, patronage and sponsored mobility
  - The tendency to recruit from within the dominant (white, male) social and cultural networks of the football industry
  - The stereotyping of ‘visible’ minorities and women in terms of ‘risk,’ ‘unsuitability’ and ‘lack of competence’
  - A lack of problem awareness or non-acknowledgement of the concept, processes and outcomes of institutional discrimination
  - An unwillingness to surrender accrued rewards and decision making powers at a personal and professional level
  - A lack of commitment to ‘open-up’ access to senior governance and senior operations positions to more a more diverse range of groups through processes of positive action

**Coaching positions in football in Europe**

**Levels of representation in senior coaching positions in football in Europe**

**Senior coaching: key statistical findings**

- The findings in this section are based on analysis of the demographic background of 672 individuals employed in a range of senior coaching positions in the men’s and women’s national game across Europe, and at a sample group of men’s elite level professional clubs in England, Germany, Spain, Belgium, France, Italy and the Netherlands

- Overall, 90.8% of all senior coaching positions at (men’s) elite level clubs, and men’s and women’s national teams were white men.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table C: Demographic background of staff in senior coaching positions across organisations</th>
<th>White men</th>
<th>White women</th>
<th>Minority men</th>
<th>Minority women</th>
<th>Overall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Elite level clubs senior coaches (men’s)</td>
<td>96.6%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3.4%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National team senior coaches (men’s)</td>
<td>99.6%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National team senior coaches (women’s)</td>
<td>66.3%</td>
<td>33.7%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>90.8%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Senior coaching: additional analysis

- **Elite level clubs**: Overall, 96.6% of senior coaching positions at elite level (men’s) clubs were held by white men and 3.4% were held by ‘visible’ minority men. In total, 2.3% of first team head coaches and 4.5% of first team assistant head coaches were from ‘visible’ minorities: at clubs in England, Germany, Spain, Belgium, France, Italy and the Netherlands.

- **National team (men’s)**: Overall, 99.6% of all senior coaching positions at men’s national first teams (head and assistant), under 21s, under 19s and under 17s teams were held by white men. One ‘visible’ minority male was a national team head coach: at under 19s level in England.

- **National team (women’s)**: Overall, 66.3% of senior coaching positions at women’s national first teams (head and assistant), under 19s and under 17s teams were held by white men. In total, 33.7% of positions of this kind were held by white women. Women holding national senior coaching positions were most apparent in; Germany, Slovakia, Sweden, Belarus, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Cyprus, Czech Republic, England, Scotland, and Switzerland.

The experiences of elite ‘visible’ minority coaches in England, France and the Netherlands

Coach education

**Levels of representation of ‘visible’ minority coaches in coach education**

The overall level of representation of ‘visible’ minorities undertaking coach education in England, France and the Netherlands is around 5-10%. This compares unfavourably with levels of representation within national populations (11-15%) and as professional players (25-40%) in each of these countries. There is also a general drop-off in the numbers of ‘visible’ minorities undertaking coach education across the transition from lower level to higher level awards.

**Experiences of accessing and undertaking coach education qualifications**

Interviews with elite level ‘visible’ minority coaches revealed a series of individual, cultural and structural factors which were perceived to have enabled or disabled opportunities to access and complete coaching qualifications. The following five key themes emerged strongly from analysis:

(I) **Personal and professional motivations**

- **Key enabling factors**: Interviewees cited strong motivations, drive and commitment to access coaching qualifications in order to stay within the game after playing careers had ended and to translate prior playing success to the professional coaching environment.

- **Key disabling factors**: Interviewees cited a lack of personal drive and commitment to access coaching qualifications; different generational and financial priorities of more affluent players; increased post-playing business and employment opportunities outside of football; financial responsibilities of ‘new migrant’ players towards extended families in countries of origin; and strong cultural expectations to play for as long as possible to maximise economic reward.

(II) **Lack of ‘visible’ minority coach role models**

- **Key enabling factors**: Interviewees cited historically limited opportunities to develop post playing careers outside of football; personal determination to succeed ‘despite the odds’; and the positive psychological driving force of the ‘pioneer effect’.

- **Key disabling factors**: Interviewees cited a strong awareness of the historically negative experiences of some highly qualified black coaches and the impact of this on limiting aspirations, ambitions and motivations to undertake coach education.
(III) Access, opportunities and networks

- **Key enabling factors:** Interviewees cited the delivery of subsidised programmes of lower level coach education in deprived, urban, locales, and the impact of this on alleviating financial barriers and enabling the first steps on the coaching ladder. Interviewees also cited the benefits of being pre-positioned within ‘insider’ football networks as coaches at clubs with reference to increasing the likelihood of identification, selection and support by key mentors, ensuring practical coaching experiences requisite for achieving high level coaching awards, and enabling access to mentoring and financial support from players unions, clubs, and federations.

- **Key disabling factors:** Interviewees cited the lack of delivery of subsidised provision for lower level coach education in ‘minority heavy’ locales and the impact of this on limiting access to courses of this kind. Interviewees also cited the negative impact of being positioned outside of ‘insider’ football networks with reference to limiting opportunities for identification, selection, mentoring and financial support from key football bodies. Organisational support for coach education was also felt by interviewees to be culturally narrow and unequally focused towards supporting high profile, white, former professional players.

(IV) Content, delivery and outcomes

- **Key enabling factors:** Interviewees cited the professional delivery and strong applicability of the content of coach education and the positive impact of this on increasing personal development skills, technical understanding and expertise, encouraging reflection on career pathways and preferences, enabling opportunities for information sharing, and raising the profile of ‘visible’ minorities within coaching networks in the professional game.

- **Key disabling factors:** Interviewees cited the perceived favouritism shown by coach educators to high profile, white, ex-professional players and tendencies to accord less status to ‘visible’ minorities from non-professional playing and coaching backgrounds. This was felt to engender additional pressures in building confidence, proving competence and gaining acceptance within the coach education environment. Interviewees also felt courses tended to be delivered in relatively formalised ‘white’ frames of reference. This was felt to impact negatively on ‘new migrants’ with limited language and literacy skills and ‘visible’ minorities who lacked the confidence to engage fully and productively in these formalised pedagogical environments.

(V) Racisms, stereotypes and discrimination

- **Key enabling factors:** Interviewees cited the inclusive and welcoming learning environment of coach education courses. Practices of equitable treatment were felt to be most apparent for ‘visible’ minority coaches with high status and strong ‘credibility’ in the professional game.

- **Key disabling factors:** Interviewees recounted experiences of intentional and unintentional racism in the coach education environment including explicit racist name calling and subtle and nuanced racial ‘banter’. They also alluded to the apparent lack of recognition of – or willingness to address – racism amongst coach educators and officials. These practices of inequitable treatment were felt to have heightened a sense of cultural isolation amongst ‘visible’ minorities and to have lessened the likelihood of continuing along the coach education pathway.

**Coach employment**

**Levels of representation of ‘visible’ minority coaches in coach employment**

- The overall level of representation of ‘visible’ minority coaches across the professional club coaching infrastructure in England, France and the Netherlands is around 2-5%. This figure compares unfavourably with the representation of ‘visible’ minorities within national populations (between 11-15%) and as professional players (between 25-40%) in these countries.

**Experiences of accessing and undertaking coach employment**

- Interviews with elite level ‘visible’ minority coaches revealed a series of individual, cultural and structural factors which were perceived to have enabled or disabled opportunities to access coaching roles at professional clubs. The following five themes emerged strongly from analysis:
(I) Personal and professional motivations

- **Key enabling factors:** Interviewees cited strong motivations, drive and commitment to develop as coaches in familiar club environments in countries of settlement or familial origin; to stay within the game and to pursue a paid career path in coaching at professional clubs.

- **Key disabling factors:** Interviewees cited a lack of personal drive and commitment to access coaching employment and increased post-playing opportunities to pursue business and employment interests outside of football, especially in the sports media. These new media opportunities were felt to offer avenues for career advancement in ways which had been denied across the transition from playing to coaching in the professional game.

(II) Lack of visible minority coach role models

- **Key enabling factors:** Interviewees cited historically limited opportunities to develop post-playing careers outside of football; personal determination to succeed ‘despite the odds’; and the positive psychological driving force of the ‘pioneer effect’.

- **Key disabling factors:** Interviewees strongly referenced the lack of ‘visible’ minority role coach role models as a key factor in limiting aspirations, ambitions and motivations to pursue coaching careers. In some cases, the lack of paid coaching opportunities in countries of settlement had informed decisions to take-up posts in countries of familial origin or to pursue careers in the broadcast media where opportunities for occupational advancement seemed little less limited.

(III) Qualifications, experience and employability

- **Key enabling factors:** Interviewees cited positive linkages between achieving high level coaching qualifications, the shift towards a qualification based framework for coach employment, and the increased employability of ‘visible’ minority coaches. These factors were felt to have enabled a gradual opening up of employment opportunities at clubs, especially at youth academy level. Interviewees also cited the beneficial impact of being pre-positioned within ‘insider’ football networks as coaches at clubs. This was felt to have enabled opportunities to show commitment, establish competence, increase visibility, and strengthen applications for positions at clubs.

- **Key disabling factors:** Interviewees felt strongly that ‘visible’ minorities remained positioned disadvantageously within the qualifications, experience and employability matrix. To this end, interviewees alluded to the low numbers of ‘visible’ minorities achieving high level coaching qualifications and the ‘catch 22’ situation of lacking the relevant experience for consideration for coaching posts whilst simultaneously being denied opportunities to gain experience of this kind at clubs. Interviewees also felt that key power brokers continues to exercise a series of networks based – rather than qualifications based – practices of coach recruitment at clubs.

(IV) Access, opportunities and networks

- **Key enabling factors:** Interviewees reflected on their own experiences and identified a series of conduits through which ‘visible’ minorities had been able to break into ‘insider’ football networks and access senior coaching positions at professional clubs. These included:
  - Building and maintaining friendships with (white) playing colleagues over time who later assumed senior coaching positions with powers to appoint other coaches and support staff
  - Accessing coaching positions at clubs at which they had a prior strong connection with as a player. This was especially the case where players had exhibited loyalty and trustworthiness
  - Holding captaincy positions and exhibiting competence, authority and leadership qualities as a player and building networks through increased contact with key power brokers at clubs
  - Building relationships with coaches and coach educators at coach education courses. This was felt to help to increase profile and heighten visibility within the coaching market-place

- **Key disabling factors:** Interviewees cited the mainly negative impacts of commonly practiced networks based approaches to coach recruitment in limiting opportunities for ‘visible’ minorities to make the transition from playing to coaching in the professional game. These included;
The lack of equitable racial mixing and tendency for ‘visible’ minority players to remain marginal to key power dynamics within team settings. This was felt to limit chances to build relationships with white colleagues who may enable coaching opportunities over time.

The lack of appointment of ‘visible’ minorities as team captains and limited opportunities to formally exhibit key qualities of leadership and authority. This was felt to position ‘visible’ minorities as marginal to commonly practiced ‘captain to coach’ pathways in the game.

The tendency for coach recruitment to be premised on personal preference, patronage and sponsored mobility of key power brokers at clubs. This was felt to gravitate against ‘visible’ minorities positioned outside of dominant (white) social and cultural networks in football.

This tendency of elite level clubs to appoint high profile, white, former players as coaches whilst excluding appropriately qualified and experienced ‘visible’ minority coaches from consideration for posts of this kind.

The frequency with which white coaches moved from club to club in contrast to numerical and status limited opportunities for ‘visible’ minorities. It was felt that ‘visible’ minorities had to work twice as hard for fewer and less high profile opportunities and were less likely to be offered second chances to become coaches at other professional clubs.

The role of the sports media in framing discussions around coaching appointments in ethnically narrow terms. Interviewees referred to tendencies of sports journalists to focus on the assumed merits and suitability of older, white, players to become good coaches, whilst ‘visible’ minorities remained notably absent from these powerful media narratives.

(V) Racisms, stereotypes and discrimination

Key enabling factors: Some interviewees reported they had not experienced any forms of racism or discrimination at the clubs at which they worked. This was especially the case at semi-professional clubs in urban, multi-ethnic, locales and at professional club youth academies.

Key disabling factors: Interviewees referred to the continued incidence of subtle, nuanced and codified racisms in the coach employment environment. This included; the use of inappropriate language to describe different cultural groups; questioning ‘visible’ minorities competence in ways which were not applied to similarly qualified white coaches; and denying opportunities for promotion within club infrastructures. Interviewees also felt that key power brokers at clubs continued to hold physical and cultural stereotypes about ‘visible’ minorities. These included;

- Misplaced cultural perceptions of ‘visible’ minorities in relation to aspirations, attitudes, behaviours and intellectual capacities to successfully coach in the professional game.
- Questioning the suitability, authority and competence of ‘visible’ minorities to successfully manage teams made up of predominantly white players.
- Negatively conceptualising ‘visible’ minorities in terms of perceived ethnic and cultural traits rather than in terms of their qualifications, experience and abilities as coaches.
- Negatively conceptualising the appointment of ‘visible’ minorities with ‘uncertainty’ and ‘risk’ and recruiting white coaches with whom they had more familiarity and social comfort.
Recommendations for future action:
addressing under-representation

Leadership

Professional clubs, national leagues, national federations and UEFA might consider:

- Appointing specific units with a key focus on increasing the representation of ‘visible’ minorities and women in senior governance and operations positions across key organisations and nation states. Key responsibilities might include: collecting baseline data, target setting, implementing positive action measures, and monitoring the progress of work of this kind over time.

- Conducting a full audit of the demographic background of staff involved in senior governance and operations positions. Data collection might be standardised to encourage comparability of findings across key organisations and nation states. This might provide a comprehensive benchmark figure against which progress can be measured over time.

- Conducting a review of existing practices of recruitment to senior governance and operations positions. This review might seek to examine the implementation of – and adherence to – equality legislation in employment and the extent to which recruitment practices ensure an open and transparent process for identifying, selecting, interviewing and recruiting candidates.

- Implementing a range of positive action approaches to increase the representation of ‘visible’ minorities and women in senior governance and operations positions. This might include: target setting, quotas, co-option and committee expansion at senior governance level. It might also include: target setting and ensuring that at least one suitably qualified ‘visible’ minority and/or women candidate is invited for interview for all senior operations positions.

- Educating and informing key power brokers within the game about the structural and cultural barriers which have contributed to the under-representation of ‘visible’ minorities and women in senior governance and operations positions. This might include information which refers to processes of stereotyping, racially closed practices of recruitment, and tendencies to recruit from within dominant (white, male) social and cultural networks.

- Educating and informing key power brokers within the game about the benefits of gender and cultural diversity in football governance and operations. This might include information which refers to harnessing under-used talents, freshening up outlook and profile, enabling connections with more diverse constituents, and improving organisational functioning and legitimacy.

Coach education

Professional clubs, national leagues, national federations and UEFA might consider:

- Appointing specific units with a key focus on increasing the representation of qualified ‘visible’ minority coaches and coach educators. Key responsibilities might include: collecting baseline data, target setting, implementing positive action measures and measuring the progress of work of this kind over time.

- Delivering subsidised lower level coaching courses in ‘minority heavy’ locales. Courses of this kind might seek to provide a safe and supportive learning environment, increase self-esteem and confidence, and enhance motivations to pursue coaching careers in the professional game.

- Reviewing and amending racially closed processes of identification, selection and support for high level coach education. Work of this kind might include the implementation of targeted initiatives designed to increase the qualifications, experiences and employability of ‘visible’ minority coaches from within and outside of the professional game.

- Delivering subsidised coach educator training courses targeting highly qualified ‘visible’ minority coaches. Courses of this kind might increase the levels of ‘visible’ minority coach educators and establish a cohort of positive role models to deliver coach education across a range of locales.
Publicising the achievements of ‘visible’ minority coach and coach educator role models. This publicity might refer to the range of coaching roles being undertaken within football and be used as a key motivational tool to attract ‘visible’ minorities to pursue professional coaching careers.

Establishing a programme of cultural awareness training for all coach educators and introducing a cultural diversity element into coach education courses. Work of this kind might pay attention to the use of appropriate language and behaviours, discouraging processes of physical and cultural stereotyping, and better dealing with the demographic diversity of coaches and players.

Establishing clear mechanisms for reporting and dealing with racism in all its forms in the coach education environment. These might include; stronger measures against perpetrators of racism and clear and transparent practices for informing victims of the process and outcomes of inquiry.

Providing additional literacy, language and educational support to ‘visible’ minorities to help them to complete high level coaching qualifications. Attention might also be paid to ensuring delivery styles, learning techniques and methods of assessment in coach education are practiced in equitable and culturally relevant ways.

**Coach employment**

**Professional clubs, national leagues, national federations and UEFA might consider:**

- Appointing specific units with a focus on increasing the representation of qualified ‘visible’ minority coaches in employment across the professional coaching infrastructure. Key responsibilities might include; collecting baseline data, target setting, implementing positive action measures, and monitoring the progress of work of this kind over time.

- Ensuring that all professional clubs and national federations adhere to legally binding equality legislation with regard to the open recruitment of coaching staff. This might include ensuring that all paid coaching positions be publicly advertised and feature a clear and transparent interview and feedback process for all candidates.

- Implementing the Rooney Rule across the professional coaching infrastructure. This might include ensuring that all professional clubs and national and regional federations invite at least one suitably qualified ‘visible’ minority candidate for interview for all advertised positions.

- Establishing a comprehensive national database of highly qualified ‘visible’ minority coaches from which candidates for coaching appointments can be put forward and then selected for interview by professional clubs or national and regional federations.

- Educating and informing key power brokers within the game about the structural and cultural barriers which have contributed to the under-representation of ‘visible’ minority coaches in employment. This might include information which refers to processes of stereotyping, racially closed processes of coach recruitment, and tendencies to recruit coaches from within dominant (white) social and cultural networks.

- Educating and informing key power brokers within the game about the benefits of cultural diversity in football coaching. This might include information which refers to the qualifications and experiences of ‘visible’ minorities and the potential for improved social connectivity with players from a diverse range of ethnic backgrounds, especially at youth academy level.
Acknowledgements

Thanks are due to Dr. Bradbury and his colleagues Dr. Jacco van Sterkenburg and Professor Patrick Mignon for their research. It was a pleasure working for the Fare team to work with them as they shared dilemmas, methodologies and anecdotes over the course of the project.

Our thanks also go to Patrick Gasser and his team in the FSR department at UEFA, without whom this research would not have been possible.