TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface v

PART A
INTRODUCTION AND DEFINITIONS

Chapter 1 – Introduction, aim of the thesis and research methods 3

1.1. A variety of stars 3
1.2. Performances are business activities 3
1.3. Special taxing rules for artistes (Article 17 of the OECD Model Tax Convention) 6
1.4. Aim of the study and delimitation 9
1.5. Structure of the study and research methods 11

Chapter 2 – History of non-resident artiste taxation 15

2.1. Income taxation of non-residents 15
2.2. International double taxation 16
2.3. Double (and multilateral) tax treaties 17
2.4. Oldest tax treaties; income from the “practice of art” 19
2.5. The League of Nations: no special rules for artistes 21
2.6. The 1939 United States–Sweden tax treaty 24
2.7. The 1945 United States–United Kingdom tax treaty 26
2.8. US treaties with other countries in 1951 29
2.9. German tax treaties in the 1950s and 1960s 31
2.10. The 1963 OECD Model Tax Convention; introduction of Article 17 33
2.11. The object and purpose of Article 17(2) in 1977 36
2.12.1. Mistrust, tax avoidance schemes 40
2.12.2. Equal treatment as principle, but still expanding the deviating treatment 41
2.12.3. Gross taxation, no deduction of expenses, appropriate tax rate 42
2.12.4. Tentative conclusions, suggested improvements 43
2.13. Implementation in the Commentary to the 1992 OECD Model 44
2.14.1. Article 17 for artistes and sportsmen 46
### Table of contents

3.6. Minor adjustments in the 1977 OECD Model Tax Convention 72
3.7. More description of the “artiste” in the 1987 OECD report 73
3.8. Continuation in the 1992 OECD Commentary 75
3.9. Little help in the wording in the 1996 US Model Tax Convention 76
3.10. Klaus Vogel on double taxation conventions 77
3.11. Daniel Sandler and IFA Seminar in 1995 79
3.12. Articles and court cases in various countries 81
   3.12.1. Germany 81
   3.12.2. Austria 83
   3.12.3. Canada 85
   3.12.4. United Kingdom 86
   3.12.5. United States 87
   3.12.6. Netherlands 88
   3.12.7. Belgium 90
   3.12.8. Australia 90
3.13. General definition of “who is an artiste”; list of examples 91
3.14. General discussion and conclusions 93

Chapter 4 – What is performance income? 95
4.1. Different types of (performance) income 95
4.2. The Commentary on Article 17 of the OECD Model and the 1987 OECD Report 96
4.3. Practical implications for different types of performance income 99
   4.3.1. List of examples 99
   4.3.2. Performance fee versus rehearsal fee 99
   4.3.3. Production expenses for a performance 100
   4.3.4. Inducement payments, options, retainers and restrictive covenants 102
   4.3.5. Cancellation fees and insurance cover 103
   4.3.6. Advertising and commercials 104
   4.3.7. Sponsorship 104
   4.3.8. Endorsement by suppliers of equipment 105
   4.3.9. Subsidies 107
   4.3.10. Royalties for record or movie sales 108
   4.3.11. Tour support from record companies 110
   4.3.12. Publishing copyright 111
### Table of contents

4.3.13. Neighbouring rights 111
4.3.14. Sales of merchandising 112
4.3.15. Pensions and other insurance benefits 113

4.4. The “territoriality” principle 115
4.5. General discussion and conclusions 117

---

**PART B**

PRESENT INTERNATIONAL SITUATION – BILATERAL TREATIES

**Chapter 5 – Tax treaties: allocation with Article 17** 121

5.1. Allocation according to Article 17(1) and (2) 121
5.2. No special artiste clause in tax treaties 124
5.3. Limitation to only business activities, exceptions for artistes/employees 126
5.4. The use of Article 17(2) and its limitations 128
5.5. The additional Article 17(3) 130
5.5.1. Exception in the Commentary 130
5.5.2. More frequent use than expected 131
5.5.3. Germany: example of a country using Article 17(3) in tax treaty practice 133
5.5.4. Variations in the content of Article 17(3) 135
5.5.5. Undefined conditions 136
5.5.6. Defending the state’s budget? 138
5.5.7. Chances of unequal treatment 138

5.6. Two examples of country’s tax treaties:
the United States and the Netherlands 139
5.6.1. Variations in tax treaty policy 139
5.6.2. Tax treaties: United States 139
5.6.3. Tax treaties: Netherlands 142

5.7. Triangular situations 146
5.7.1. Resident in different countries 146
5.7.2. Decision in the Netherlands in 1983 146
5.7.3. Article by Rijkele Betten and Marco Lombardi in 1997 148
5.7.4. Change in the 2000 OECD Commentary 150
5.7.5. Double taxation problems in triangular situations 151
5.7.6. Pension benefits 152
# Table of contents

5.7.7. Reference to Article 1 of the OECD Model Tax Convention 152  
5.8. General discussion and conclusions 153  

## Chapter 6 – Non-resident artiste tax rules in performance countries  
6.1. Similarities and differences 155  
6.2. Survey of the non-resident artiste tax rules in performance countries 156  
6.3. Almost complete coverage 158  
6.4. The deduction of expenses 159  
6.5. The (withholding) tax rate 162  
6.6. Income tax return after the taxable year 163  
6.7. Concurrent taxation, other charges or levies 165  
6.8. Unilateral exemptions 167  
6.9. General discussion and conclusions 169  

## Chapter 7 – Elimination of double taxation  
7.1. Exemption or credit: history in general 171  
7.2. Explanation of tax exemption and tax credit methods 174  
7.2.1. Two different systems, with two variations 174  
7.2.2. Full exemption 175  
7.2.3. Exemption with progression 175  
7.2.4. Full credit 175  
7.2.5. Ordinary credit 176  
7.2.6. Summary of the figures 176  
7.2.7. Conclusions from example; recommendations in Article 23 of the OECD Model Tax Convention? 177  
7.2.8. Differences in taxable income 179  
7.3. Recommended relief of double taxation under Article 17 179  
7.3.1. No recommendation in 1963, introduction in 1977 179  
7.3.2. Example: the Netherlands 181  
7.3.3. Exceptions in other countries 184  
7.3.4. Clearer position in the OECD Model Tax Convention? 184  
7.4. Basket/overall method versus per-country method 185  
7.5. Tax credit problems 187  
7.5.1. Tax exemption method is easier to apply 187
# Table of contents

7.5.2. Tax certificate 187  
7.5.3. Qualification of foreign tax 187  
7.5.4. Final and compulsory payments 189  
7.5.5. The person of the artiste 189  
7.5.6. Triangular situations 191  
7.5.7. Net deals: transfer of the tax burden to the organizer 192  
7.5.8. Differences in taxable base 192  
7.5.9. Year of tax credit (or exemption) 192  
7.5.10. Creditable domestic tax in the residence country 193  
7.5.11. Complexity of the system of foreign tax credits 193  
7.6. Excess tax credits 195  
7.7. Deduction of foreign tax as an operating expense 195  
7.8. General discussion and conclusions 196

## Chapter 8 – The deduction of (production) expenses

8.1. Expenses seem to be difficult 199  
8.2. Non-deductibility of expenses for non-resident artistes in most countries 199  
8.3. The amount of expenses 201  
8.3.1. Survey in the Netherlands 201  
8.3.2. More information about the earnings 202  
8.3.3. Expenses in the database 204  
8.3.4. Total earnings and expenses period 2001-2003 205  
8.3.5. Confirmation with survey of the Dutch tax authorities over 2002 206  
8.3.6. Specified earnings and expenses for the year 2003 207  
8.3.6.1. Figures for 2003, explanation of the two graphs 207  
8.3.6.2. First graph: variance of percentage of production expenses 208  
8.3.6.3. Second graph: number of applications, brackets of expenses 209  
8.3.6.4. Conclusions from the figures and the graphs 209  
8.3.6.5. Information about individual performances 210

xv
### Table of contents

10.3.3. Australia 247  
10.3.4. New Zealand 247  
10.4. A weighted average of tax revenue for the four countries 248  
10.5. Tax credits or tax exemption in the residence country 249  
10.6. Administrative burden 250  
10.7. General discussion and conclusions 251

### PART C  
PRESENT SITUATION WITHIN THE EUROPEAN UNION

Chapter 11 – Unequal treatment in the European Community 257  
11.1. Market integration in the European Community 257  
11.2. Obstacles for international performing artistes within the Community 260  
11.3. The role of the European Court of Justice 261  
11.4. The *Arnoud Gerritse* decision (C-234/01) 262  
11.4.1. First case about artiste taxation 262  
11.4.2. The facts and the preliminary question 262  
11.4.3. Discussion while the case was pending 263  
11.4.4. Decision by the ECJ, after conclusion of the Advocate-General Léger 265  
11.4.5. Reactions and changes after the decision 267  
11.4.6. Ambiguity following from the second answer 269  
11.5. New cases pending before the European Court of Justice 270  
11.6. *FKP Scorpio Konzertproduktion GmbH* (C-290/04) 271  
11.6.1. The facts of the case and the preliminary questions 271  
11.6.2. Discussion and action while the case is pending 275  
11.6.3. Official reaction from the German authorities 275  
11.6.4. Reactions by the European Commission and some Member States 276  
11.6.5. Oral hearing 277  
11.7. *Centro Equestre da Leziria Grande Lda* (C-345/04) 277  
11.7.1. The facts of the case and the preliminary question 277  
11.7.2. Administrative obstacles 280
Table of contents

11.7.3. Changes by the German tax authorities in November 2003 282
11.7.4. Comparison with transfer pricing and allocation of head office expenses 282
11.7.5. Comparison with other ECJ decisions 283
11.8. Solutions through permanent establishment(s)? 283
11.9. Can gross taxation of non-resident artistes be a (forbidden) VAT? 284
11.10. Actions in the cultural field 288
11.11. General discussion and conclusions 289

Chapter 12 – Conflicts between OECD Model and EC Treaty 293

12.1. Community law supersedes treaty law, unless it provides otherwise 293
12.2. The (non-)deductibility of expenses and the position of the Commentary 295
12.3. Interpretation of Article 17(2): limited or unlimited approach 298
12.4. Exemptions from corporation tax (*Stauffer – C-386/04*) 300
12.5. Unequal treatment following from Article 17(3) 302
12.6. Deviating treaty provisions and most-favoured-nation treatment 304
12.7. Is Article 17 of the OECD Model permissible under Community law? 309
12.8. European law and the tax credit problems in the country of residence 310
  12.8.1. The limitation of the ordinary tax credit 310
  12.8.2. Tax credit problems 312
  12.8.3. Mutual assistance, exchange of information 313
  12.8.4. Developments towards a full tax credit in the European Union 316
12.9. General discussion and conclusions 318

PART D
DISCUSSION OF THE PRESENT SITUATION

Chapter 13 – Discussion and conclusions after the study 325

13.1. End of the study 325
13.2. Conclusions based on the nine criteria defined in 1.4. 325
Table of contents

13.3. Considerations of tax avoidance and non-compliance 331
13.4. Awareness at the OECD in 1987, but lack of action since then 333
13.5. Conclusions 334

PART E
FUTURE

Chapter 14 – How to improve Article 17 of the OECD Model 339
14.1. Problems with international artiste taxation need solutions 339
14.2. Reintroduction of the limited approach for Article 17(2) 339
14.3. Change in Paragraph 10 of the Commentary 340
14.4. Normal income (or corporation) tax returns 342
14.5. Special provisions for small artistes (the de minimis rule) 342
14.6. Restrict Article 17 to business activities, exempt employees 344
14.7. Exemption for equivalent part of fixed salaries 346
14.8. Addition of Article 17(3) to the official text of Article 17 347
14.9. Change to tax exemption or full credit would give a better balance 348
14.10. Conclusions 349

Chapter 15 – Can Article 17 of the OECD Model radically be changed? 353
15.1. Is more possible than just modifications? 353
15.2. A radical change may be considered 353
15.2.1. Turnaround of Article 17 of the OECD Model 353
15.2.2. Still countering tax avoidance behaviour 355
15.2.3. Exchange of information and compliance 355
15.3. Comparison with the nine criteria from the aim of the thesis 356
15.4. Conclusions 359
## Table of contents

**PART F**  
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

### Chapter 16 – Summary and conclusions

16.1. Introduction and definitions 365  
16.2. Present situation – bilateral treaties 367  
16.3. Present situation within the European Union 372  
16.4. Conclusions for the present situation 375  
16.5. Future 377

### Chapter 17 – Summary and conclusions in Dutch

17.1. Introductie en definities 381  
17.2. Huidige situatie – bilaterale belastingverdragen 383  
17.3. Huidige situatie binnen de Europese Unie 387  
17.4. Conclusies voor de huidige situatie 389  
17.5. Toekomst 391

### Bibliography

395

### Legislation and case law

409
Table of contents
PART A

INTRODUCTION AND DEFINITIONS